

# Bunga Rampai Tesis/Disertasi

## SPIRIT

Scholarship Program  
for Strengthening  
Reforming  
Institutions

Tema:

# Sosial dan Politik

Project Coordinating Unit (PCU) SPIRIT  
Pusbindiklatren-Bappenas



# Bunga Rampai Tesis/Disertasi

---

## **TEMA: SOSIAL DAN POLITIK**

---

### **Program Beasiswa SPIRIT**

---

Editor:

**Dr. Nur Hygiawati Rahayu, ST, M.Sc, dkk.**

Project Coordinating Unit (PCU)  
SPIRIT Pusbindiklatren Bappenas



**Bunga Rampai Tesis/Disertasi**

**Tema: Sosial dan Politik**

**Kelompok Ilmu Sosial**

©2017 oleh Bappenas

**Editor**

Dr. Nur Hygiawati Rahayu, ST, M.Sc.

Wignyo Adiyoso, S.Sos, MA, Ph.D.

Ali Muharram, SIP, MSE, MA.

Rita Miranda, S.Sos, MPA.

Wiky Witarni, S.Sos, MA.

**Kontributor**

Adkhillni Mudkhola Sidqi, Agatha Arvi Fembrianita, Alferia Riedatina,  
Antonius Prawira, Anthonius Prawira Yudianto, Arief Ilham Ramadhan, Chellya  
Triwijayati, Diah Eka Palupi, Eka Fitri Laeli, Etty Racmawaty, Friezca Rara Juta, Hayu  
Dika Paramita, Ida Ayu Komang Yetri Citraseni, Kurniawan Wibowo,  
Ni Nengah Yuni Ariastiti, Noviandri Wibowo, Rangga Yudha Nagar, Ratih Dewi, Rendy  
Hadiputra Hadi, Dian Setyawati, Galuh Chandra Kirana, Gina Anggraini, Muhammad  
Iqbal, Rikha Hnadayani, Abdul Rhaman, Arif Widodo, Ervan Armansyah, Ika Retna  
Ningrum, Riska Rinjaya, Yogi Suwarno, Yudiantarti Safitri, Hasna Azmi Fadhilah, Reza  
Reflusmen Junior, Teguh Ilham, Karim

Cetakan I, November 2017

ISBN: 978-602-1154-92-2

Diterbitkan oleh

**Project Coordinating Unit (PCU) SPIRIT, Pusbindiklatren**

**Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional (Bappenas) Republik Indonesia**

Jalan Proklamasi Nomor 70 Jakarta Pusat 10320

# KATA PENGANTAR

Prioritas utama target pembangunan nasional seperti yang tertuang dalam Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional Tahun 2010 - 2014 (RPJMN 2010 - 2014) Indonesia adalah reformasi birokrasi dan penguatan tata laksana pemerintahan. Untuk mencapai hal ini, sebelas institusi pemerintah yang memiliki peran penting dalam sektor publik dipilih sebagai Participating Agency (PA) dalam program beasiswa SPIRIT (Scholarship Program for Strengthening Reforming Institutions). SPIRIT dirancang untuk mendukung agenda reformasi birokrasi dengan menyediakan program beasiswa gelar dan nongelar untuk staf kunci di institusi publik pusat selama periode tahun 2011 - 2017.

Tujuan pelaksanaan program SPIRIT adalah untuk meningkatkan kapasitas Participating Agency melalui 1) peningkatan kapasitas sumber daya manusia (SDM) dengan mengembangkan keterampilan teknis, manajerial, dan kepemimpinan aparat pemerintah yang melaksanakan tugas-tugas pokok dan fungsi institusi; dan 2) peningkatan kapasitas SDM dalam melaksanakan reformasi birokrasi di instansi pusat.

Perancangan program SPIRIT dibedakan dengan program beasiswa lainnya di Indonesia melalui upaya pemenuhan kesenjangan kompetensi dan keahlian di tiap-tiap instansi dengan menanamkan program pendidikan gelar dan nongelar dalam *Human Capital Development Plans* (HCDP) di tiap-tiap instansi secara eksplisit. Program SPIRIT didukung melalui kerja sama antara pemerintah Indonesia dan Bank Dunia (*World Bank*) melalui pinjaman IBRD Loan No. 8010-ID.

Buku *Bunga Rampai Tesis/Disertasi Program Beasiswa SPIRIT, Tema: Sosial dan Politik* ini merupakan buku keempat dari sembilan buku yang akan diterbitkan pada tahun 2017, sebagai salah satu upaya mendiseminasikan karya tulis ilmiah yang telah diselesaikan oleh karyasiswa penerima beasiswa SPIRIT. Materi tesis/disertasi dibagi menjadi tiga kelompok, yaitu Ilmu-Ilmu Ekonomi, Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial, dan Ilmu-Ilmu Alam dan Interdisiplin. Dasar pembagiannya adalah disiplin keilmuan (*tree of science*) serta keseimbangan jumlah materi tesis/ disertasi yang ada.

Tujuan dari penerbitan serial buku ini, pertama, menyebarluaskan hasil-hasil penelitian tesis/disertasi, agar dapat direplikasi atau diadopsi di tempat kerja karyasiswa; kedua, sebagai *benchmark* pemanfaatannya di instansi pemerintah lain; dan ketiga, merupakan bagian dari upaya mendokumentasikan



kegiatan SPIRIT, dalam bentuk terbitan ilmiah buku ber-ISBN sehingga dapat disebutkan oleh karyasiswa dalam resume masing-masing. Versi cetak serial buku ini dapat diakses secara *online* [www.pusbindiklatren.bappenas.go.id](http://www.pusbindiklatren.bappenas.go.id)

Serial buku ini diharapkan dapat menggambarkan manfaat dan kontribusi positif Program SPIRIT terhadap peningkatan kapasitas SDM sebagai *participating agencies*, baik dari sisi keterampilan teknis, manajerial, dan kepemimpinan aparat pemerintah, dan dalam melaksanakan reformasi birokrasi di instansi masing-masing. Program SPIRIT juga diharapkan dapat berkontribusi bagi pencapaian sasaran prioritas nasional dalam meningkatkan kinerja instansi pemerintah yang ditandai dengan berkurangnya praktik korupsi, kolusi, dan nepotisme, serta meningkatnya kualitas pelayanan publik.

Jakarta, November 2017

Pusbindiklatren Bappenas

# DAFTAR ISI

## SOSIAL

EXPLAINING THE DIVERGENT EXPERIENCES OF DEMOCRATIZATION IN EGYPT AND  
INDONESIA IN STRUCTURAL TERMS:  
COLD WAR LEGACY, MILITARY-BACKED AUTHORITARIAN REGIMES, AND ISLAMIC  
CIVIL SOCIETY

PAPARAN PENGALAMAN DEMOKRATISASI DI MESIR DAN INDONESIA SECARA  
STRUKTURAL:

WARISAN PERANG DINGIN, REZIM OTORITER YANG DIDUKUNG MILITER, DAN  
MASYARAKAT SIPIL ISLAM

Adkhilni Mudkhola Sidqi.....1

PENERAPAN STANDARISASI DAN SERTIFIKASI OLEH FOREST STEWARDSHIP  
COUNCIL PADA PRODUK KAYU DI DUNIA INTERNASIONAL  
STUDI KASUS: PENERAPAN STANDARISASI DAN SERTIFIKASI FSC DI RUSIA DAN  
BRASIL

IMPLEMENTATION OF STANDARDIZATION AND CERTIFICATION BY FOREST  
STEWARDSHIP COUNCIL ON WOOD PRODUCTS IN THE INTERNATIONAL WORLD  
CASE STUDY: IMPLEMENTATION OF FSC STANDARIZATION AND CERTIFICATION IN  
RUSSIA AND BRAZIL

Agatha Arvi Fembrianita ..... 15

THE ROLE OF GOVERNMENT IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF NATIONAL INNOVATION  
SYSTEM IN INDONESIA

(THROUGH R&D-INTENSIVE FDI)

PERAN PEMERINTAH DALAM PENGEMBANGAN SISTEM INOVASI NASIONAL DI  
INDONESIA

(MELALUI PMA R&D INTENSIF)

Alferia Riedatina .....27

TIMOR-LESTE'S ACCESSION TO ASEAN: ANALYSING THE PUSH AND PULL  
FACTORS OF REGIONAL ORGANISATIONS

BERGABUNGNYA TIMOR-LESTE KE ASEAN: MENGANALISIS FAKTOR PENDORONG  
DAN DAYA TARIK ORGANISASI REGIONAL

Antonius Prawiro Yudianto..... 39

<b>FILM SEBAGAI ALAT DIPLOMASI BUDAYA: STUDI KASUS KEDUTAAN PERANCIS DI INDONESIA</b>	
<b>FILM AS A TOOL OF CULTURAL DIPLOMACY: A CASE STUDY OF THE FRENCH EMBASSY IN INDONESIA</b>	
<b>Arief Ilham Ramadhan.....</b>	<b>51</b>
<b>ANALYSIS THE SUCCESS OF JOINT VENTURES, COMPARING THE CASE OF THE PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA WITH INDONESIA</b>	
<b>ANALISIS KEBERHASILAN USAHA BERSAMA, MEMBANDINGKAN KASUS REPUBLIK RAKYAT CINA DENGAN INDONESIA</b>	
<b>Chellyvia Tri Wijayanti .....</b>	<b>63</b>
<b>KEPENTINGAN EKONOMI DAN POLITIK KOREA SELATAN DALAM IMPLEMENTASI BANTUAN BAGI PROGRAM REFORMASI BIROKRASI DI INDONESIA PERIODE 2006-2012</b>	
<b>ECONOMIC AND POLITICAL INTERESTS OF SOUTH KOREA IN IMPLEMENTATION ASSISTANCE OF BUREAUCRATIC REFORMS PROGRAM IN INDONESIA PERIOD 2006- 2012</b>	
<b>Diah Eka Palupi.....</b>	<b>73</b>
<b>TRANSACTION-COSTS, INSTITUTIONAL PERSPECTIVE AND ENTRY MODE CHOICES: FORD'S MARKET ENTRY IN INDONESIA</b>	
<b>BIAYA TRANSAKSI, PERSPEKTIF INSTITUSIONAL DAN PILIHAN POLA MASUK: LAYANAN PASAR FORD DI INDONESIA</b>	
<b>Eka Fitri Laeli.....</b>	<b>85</b>
<b>THE IMPACT OF FOREIGN DIRECT INVESTMENT ON ECONOMIC GROWTH IN ASIAN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES</b>	
<b>AKIBAT PENANAMAN MODAL ASING LANGSUNG PADA PERTUMBUHAN EKONOMI DI NEGARA-NEGARA BERKEMBANG ASIA</b>	
<b>Eka Sulistiawati .....</b>	<b>95</b>
<b>QUESTIONING THE LONGEVITY OF CHINA-NORTH KOREA ALLIANCE</b>	
<b>MEMPERTANYAKAN KEBERLANGSUNGAN HUBUNGAN ALIANSI CHINA-KOREA UTARA</b>	
<b>Etty Rachmawaty .....</b>	<b>101</b>

<p><b>THE REVITALIZATION OF INDONESIA'S SISTER CITIES/SISTER PROVINCES COOPERATION THROUGH VIRTUAL SISTER CITY DEVELOPMENT CASE STUDY: SISTER CITY COOPERATION BETWEEN DKI JAKARTA AND LOS ANGELES</b></p> <p><b>REVITALISASI KERJASAMA SISTER CITIES/SISTER PROVINCES DI INDONESIA MELALUI PENGEMBANGAN VIRTUAL SISTER CITY STUDI KASUS: KERJASAMA SISTER CITY ANTARA DKI JAKARTA DAN LOS ANGELES</b></p> <p>Friezca Rara Juta.....</p>	107
<p><b>IMPROVING PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT OF LOCAL GOVERNMENTS IN INDONESIA</b></p> <p><b>MENINGKATKAN KINERJA MANAJEMEN PEMERINTAH DAERAH DI INDONESIA</b></p> <p>Hayu Dika Paramita.....</p>	117
<p><b>HOW SIGNIFICANT IS ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT IN DETERMINING PEOPLE'S RESISTANCE TOWARDS CORRUPTION IN EAST ASIA</b></p> <p><b>SEJAUH MANA PEMBANGUNAN EKONOMI MENENTUKAN DAYA TAHAN MASYARAKAT TERHADAP KORUPSI DI ASIA TIMUR</b></p> <p>Kurniawan Wibowo.....</p>	125
<p><b>PERMASALAHAN TANPA KEWARGANEGARAAN ROHINGNYA DAN PROSES TRANSNASIONALISME DI NEGARA-NEGARA TRANSIT: MENILAI PERAN AKTOR NON-NEGARA MELALUI JARINGAN ADVOKASI TRANSNASIONAL</b></p> <p><b>ROHINGYA'S STATELESSNESS PROBLEM AND TRANSNATIONALISM PROCESS IN TRANSIT COUNTRIES: ASSESSING THE ROLE OF NON-STATE ACTORS THROUGH TRANSNATIONAL ADVOCACY NETWORK</b></p> <p>Ni Nengah Yuni Ariastiti .....</p>	137
<p><b>PENDEKATAN PEOPLE-ORIENTED ASEAN DALAM MENANGANI ISU TERORISME DI ASIA TENGGARA</b></p> <p><b>ASEAN'S PEOPLE-ORIENTED APPROACH IN ADDRESSING THE ISSUE OF TERRORISM IN SOUTHEAST ASIA</b></p> <p>Noviandri Wibowo.....</p>	149

**MIGRAN ILEGAL SEBAGAI ANCAMAN KEAMANAN MALAYSIA DAN DAMPAKNYA TERHADAP HUBUNGAN BILATERAL INDONESIA-MALAYSIA**  
**ILLEGAL MIGRANT AS MALAYSIA'S SECURITY THREAT AND ITS IMPACT TO INDONESIAN-MALAYSIAN BILATERAL RELATIONS**  
Rangga Yudha Nagara .....161

**BUILDING THE IDEAL CITIZEN THROUGH CHILDREN: THE NEW ORDER'S DOCTRINES IN INDONESIAN CHILDREN STORY BOOKS**  
**MEMBANGUN WARGA NEGARA IDEAL MELALUI ANAK-ANAK: DOKTRIN ORDE BARU DALAM BUKU CERITA ANAK INDONESIA**  
Ratih Dewi..... 173

**THE EFFECT OF ASEAN ECONOMIC INTEGRATION ON MACROECONOMIC, TRADE AND FOREIGN DIRECT INVESTMENT: BASED ON THE NEW REGIONALISM THEORY**  
**PENGARUH INTEGRASI EKONOMI ASEAN TERHADAP MAKROEKONOMI, PERDAGANGAN DAN PENANAMAN MODAL ASING: BERDASARKAN TEORI REGIONALISME BARU**  
Rendy Hadiputra Hadi ..... 179

**PENGARUH MAJALAH ILMIAH KAMPUS PENGAWASAN TERHADAP PENGETAHUAN, SIKAP APIP TENTANG FRAUD DAN CITRA ORGANISASI**  
**THE INFLUENCE OF SCIENTIFIC MAGAZINE "KAMPUS PENGAWASAN" TO KNOWLEDGE, APIP ATTITUDES ON FRAUD AND ORGANIZATIONAL IMAGE**  
Dian Setyawati.....189

**DEFINING THE COUNTRY IMAGE OF INDONESIA USING MULTIMODAL ANALYSIS OF TELEVISION COMMERCIAL: A CASE STUDY OF BKPM TV COMMERCIAL**  
**MENETAPKAN CITRA NEGARA INDONESIA DENGAN MENGGUNAKAN ANALISIS MULTIMODAL PADA IKLAN KOMERSIAL DI TELEVISI: STUDI KASUS IKLAN TV BKPM**  
Galuh Candra.....201

**EXPLORING THE DIGITAL DIPLOMACY IN THE INDONESIAN MINISTRY OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS**  
**MENJELAJAHI DIPLOMASI DIGITAL DI KEMENTERIAN LUAR NEGERI RI**  
Gina Anggraini.....209



**TAX COMPLIANCE IN INDONESIA: THE ROLE OF PUBLIC OFFICIALS AS TAXPAYERS  
KEPATUHAN PAJAK DI INDONESIA: PERAN PEJABAT PUBLIK SEBAGAI WAJIB  
PAJAK**

**Abdul Rahman.....221**

**CIVIL SERVICE REFORM IN INDONESIA ON HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT  
ASPECT**

**REFORMASI PEGAWAI NEGERI DI INDONESIA DALAM ASPEK MANAJEMEN  
SUMBER DAYA MANUSIA**

**Arif Widodo.....231**

**“IS THE WORLD BANK’S MODEL OF SERVICE DELIVERY APPLICABLE IN  
DECENTRALIZED INDONESIA?”**

**“APAKAH POLA PEMBERIAN LAYANAN BANK DUNIA DAPAT DITERAPKAN DI  
INDONESIA YANG TERDESENTRALISASI? ”**

**Ervan Arumansyah .....243**

**MENGOPTIMALKAN PROGRAM PENILAIAN KEBUTUHAN PELATIHAN UNTUK  
MENINGKATKAN KUALITAS SUMBER DAYA MANUSIA DI KALIMANTAN**

**OPTIMIZING TRAINING NEEDS ASSESSMENT PROGRAM TO IMPROVE THE  
QUALITY OF HUMAN RESOURCE IN KALIMANTAN**

**Ika Retna Ningrum .....251**

**ANALISIS BELANJA MODAL JALAN, IRRIGASI, DAN JARINGAN PADA DINAS  
PEKERJAAN UMUM ENERGI DAN SUMBER DAYA MINERAL KABUPATEN  
MAGELANG**

**ANALYSIS OF CAPITAL EXPENDITURE ON ROADS, IRRIGATION, AND NETWORKS  
AT THE PUBLIC WORKS, ENERGY, AND MINERAL RESOURCES DEPARTMENT OF  
MAGELANG**

**Riska Rinjaya.....263**

**MENANGGAPI PERUBAHAN IKLIM: INTEGRASI KEBIJAKAN DAN SEKTOR  
KEHUTANAN INDONESIA**

**RESPONDING TO CLIMATE CHANGE: POLICY INTEGRATION AND THE INDONESIAN  
FORESTRY SECTOR**

**Yogi Suwarno .....273**

**BUREAUCRATIC REFORM IN INDONESIA: REORGANIZATION OF CENTRAL GOVERNMENT (CASE STUDY)**  
**REFORMASI BIROKRASI DI INDONESIA: REORGANISASI PEMERINTAH PUSAT (STUDI KASUS)**  
Yudiantarti Safitri .....285

**SECULAR PARTY AND RELIGIOUS POLICIES IN INDONESIA**  
**PARTAI SEKULER DAN PERATURAN AGAMA DI INDONESIA**  
Hasna Azmi Fadhillah ..... 297

**BEYOND RHETORIC: EXAMINATION OF THE FEASIBLE AND REALISTIC ASEAN POLITICAL-SECURITY COMMUNITY**  
**MELAMPAUI RETORIKA: PEMERIKSAAN KOMUNITAS POLITIK-KEAMANAN ASEAN YANG LAYAK DAN REALISTIS**  
Reza Reflusmen Junior .....301

**POLITICAL DYNASTY: AN ANOMALY OF DEMOCRACY IN POST-SUHARTO REGIME IN INDONESIA**  
**DINASTI POLITIK: SEBUAH ANOMALI DEMOKRASI SETELAH REZIM SUHARTO DI INDONESIA**  
Teguh Ilham.....311

**LEAVING THE BRIDGE, PASSING THE SHELTERS: UNDERSTANDING HOMELESS ACTIVISM THROUGH THE UTILIZATION OF SPACES WITHIN THE CENTRAL PUBLIC LIBRARY AND THE IUPUI LIBRARY IN INDIANAPOLIS**  
**MENINGGALKAN JEMBATAN, MELEWATI TEMPAT PERLINDUNGAN: MEMAHAMI AKTIVISME TUNAWISMA MELALUI PEMANFAATAN RUANG DI DALAM PERPUSTAKAAN PUBLIK DAN PERPUSTAKAAN UNIVERSITAS DI INDIANAPOLIS**  
Karim.....319



---

**Bunga Rampai Tesis/Disertasi**

---

**SOSIAL**

---

**Program Beasiswa SPIRIT**

---

---

**Explaining the Divergent Experiences of  
Democratization in Egypt and Indonesia in  
Structural Terms:  
Cold War Legacy, Military-backed  
Authoritarian Regimes, and Islamic Civil  
Society**

**Paparan Pengalaman Demokratisasi di  
Mesir dan Indonesia secara Struktural:  
Warisan Perang Dingin, Rezim Otoriter  
yang Didukung Militer, dan Masyarakat  
Sipil Islam**

---

Nama : Adkhilni Mudkhola Sidqi  
NIP : 198608082009121001  
Instansi : KEMENLU  
Tahun Intake : 2013  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : Master of International Relations  
Negara Studi : Australia  
Universitas : Monash University



## ABSTRACT

By comparing popular uprisings in Egypt (2011) and Indonesia (1998), this thesis seeks to answer the question: what conditions made the transition to democracy successful in Indonesia, while failing in Egypt? This thesis argues that, while there are superficial similarities between Indonesia and Egypt, such as Cold War background, oppressive military-backed regimes, civil society limitations, and Muslim majority populations, distinctive structural and historical factors in each country have clearly shaped the different fates of their respective transitions to democracy. Detailed analysis shows that both countries were experiencing extremely different conditions when their sudden transitions occurred. Even though they shared prolonged authoritarian rule against the background of Cold War, Egypt and Indonesia had divergent experiences in post-Cold War world politics.

Egypt was at the forefront of the Cold War, driven by the twin rationales of maintaining peace with Israel and ensuring Arab oil stability. For these reasons, regime change in Egypt would not necessarily mean democratisation, but rather a reproduction of authoritarianism, an anomaly in post-Cold War world politics. By contrast, Indonesia was seen as an abandoned Cold War battlefield where the rationale for supporting authoritarian leaders lost potency. Domestically, the Egyptian military remained strong enough to weather the collapse of the Mubarak regime and then actively move against its unpopular successor, while the Indonesian armed forces, weak and under-funded under Suharto's New Order, used the opportunity provided by Suharto's sudden fall to officially detach itself from Indonesian daily politics and resume their primary function: defence.

Moreover, the role of Islamic civil society in the democratisation processes in these two countries, especially during the last decade or so, is significant. The absence of reliable Islamic civil society during the last years of Mubarak's rule contributed to the debacle of Egypt's transition to democracy as well as to the maturity of the Muslim Brotherhood's leadership post-Mubarak. Conversely, the roles of Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) and Muhammadiyah—the largest Muslim organisations in Indonesia— were significant in transition to democracy. While the post-Mubarak Egyptian election demonstrated extreme polarization which

threatened democracy, in Indonesia the ideological differences between Islamist and secular parties have been steadily diminishing.

Keywords: Indonesia,

## ABSTRAK

Dengan membandingkan pemberontakan populer di Mesir (2011) dan Indonesia (1998), tesis ini berusaha menjawab pertanyaan: kondisi apa yang membuat transisi menuju demokrasi berhasil di Indonesia, sementara gagal di Mesir? Tesis ini berpendapat bahwa, walaupun ada kesamaan yang dangkal antara Indonesia dan Mesir, seperti latar belakang Perang Dingin, rezim pendukung militer yang tertindas, keterbatasan masyarakat sipil, dan populasi mayoritas Muslim, faktor struktural dan historis yang khas di setiap negara telah jelas membentuk nasib yang berbeda. transisi masing-masing untuk demokrasi. Analisis terperinci menunjukkan bahwa kedua negara mengalami kondisi yang sangat berbeda ketika transisi tiba-tiba mereka terjadi. Meskipun mereka memiliki peraturan otoriter berkepanjangan dengan latar belakang Perang Dingin, Mesir dan Indonesia memiliki pengalaman yang berbeda dalam politik dunia pasca-Perang Dingin. Mesir berada di garis depan Perang Dingin, didorong oleh alasan kembar untuk menjaga perdamaian dengan Israel dan memastikan stabilitas minyak Arab. Untuk alasan ini, perubahan rezim di Mesir tidak akan berarti demokratisasi, melainkan reproduksi otoritarianisme, sebuah anomali dalam politik dunia pasca-Perang Dingin. Sebaliknya, Indonesia dipandang sebagai medan perang dingin yang ditinggalkan dimana alasan untuk mendukung para pemimpin otoriter kehilangan potensi. Di dalam negeri, militer Mesir tetap cukup kuat untuk mengatasi keruntuhan rezim Mubarak dan kemudian secara aktif bergerak melawan penggantinya yang tidak populer, sementara angkatan bersenjata Indonesia, yang lemah dan kurang didanai di bawah Orde Baru Suharto, menggunakan kesempatan yang diberikan oleh jatuhnya Suharto tiba-tiba ke secara resmi melepaskan diri dari politik sehari-hari Indonesia dan melanjutkan fungsi utama mereka: pertahanan. Apalagi, peran masyarakat sipil Islam dalam proses demokratisasi di kedua negara ini, terutama dalam dekade terakhir ini, cukup signifikan. Tidak adanya masyarakat sipil Islam yang andal selama tahun-tahun terakhir pemerintahan Mubarak memberi kontribusi pada bencana transisi Mesir menuju demokrasi dan juga kematangan kepemimpinan kaum Ikhwanul Muslimin pasca Mubarak. Sebaliknya, peran Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) dan Muhammadiyah - organisasi Muslim terbesar di Indonesia - signifikan dalam transisi menuju demokrasi. Sementara pemilihan Mesir pasca Mubarak menunjukkan

polarisasi ekstrem yang mengancam demokrasi, di Indonesia, perbedaan ideologis antara partai Islam dan partai sekuler telah semakin berkurang.

Kata kunci: indonesia,

The Egyptian military's response towards Egypt's first democratically elected President in July 2013 not only generated semantic arguments about the difference between a 'coup' and a 'military intervention,' but it also clearly marked the failure of Egypt's two-year attempt to achieve a transition to democracy following 2011's mass uprising against authoritarian rule (Black, 2013; Brown, 2013). Even, MacQueen (2013) acknowledged that the 'Arab Spring' came at the end of a period characterised in the Middle East by the stability of authoritarian regimes.

Many studies consider the Middle East anomalous among world democratization trends as almost all states endure authoritarian regimes as though believing that the seed of democracy cannot grow in these stony and dehydrated regions. Lipset (1994) claimed: 'Moslem (particularly Arab) states have not taken part in the third wave of democratization... Growth of democracy in the near future in most of these countries is doubtful' (Lipset, 1994, p.6). At the same time, while democratic waves rolled through East Asia, Eastern Europe, Latin America and sub-Saharan Africa throughout the 1980s, most of the Arab autocrats survived. Even Iran and Turkey experienced remarkable political change in that time, with a political struggle in Iran and a quasi-Islamist party establishing a democratic system in secular Turkey (Gause, 2011). For that reason, Mubarak's overthrow was one of the most momentous democratic developments of the early twenty-first century (Brownlee, 2012), while post-Mubarak uprisings and political uncertainty have resulted in Egypt's reproducing authoritarianism and strengthening the military's control in Egyptian politics. This has generally reaffirmed the view that democracy is incompatible with Islamic values and with a populous Muslim society. It is often claimed that democracy has no 'natural' roots in the Middle East, or in the Islamic world generally; hence, the growth of democratic institutions in such stony soil cannot and should not be expected.

By contrast, in Indonesia—the largest Muslim country—mass protests in 1998 opened a political space for moderate opposition elites to craft a new democracy (Carnegie, 2010). While it has structural flaws, Indonesia's democratic transformation has been widely lauded as successful, and even cited as an international model. Over the past decade, Indonesia has increasingly been called the world's third-largest democracy after India and the United States.



The resignation of President Suharto, after 32 years in power following the monetary crises in May 1998, brought the introduction of 'liberal' and multi-party democracy: a parliamentary general election in 1999, followed by parliamentary and direct presidential elections in 2004, 2009, and 2014.

By the same token, many scholars identify not only striking similarities between Egypt in 2011 and Indonesia in 1998, but also close affinities between the countries. First, the military support authoritarian regimes in both countries. Much like Egypt's Commander Mubarak, Indonesia's General Suharto was the supreme leader of a large, Muslim-majority, secular, wildly corrupt, and authoritarian state, with strong support from the military (Mercury, 2013).

Second, both authoritarian leaders were forced to step down, after ruling for more than three decades, due to popular uprisings in Egypt's 25 January 2011 Revolution and Indonesian Reformasi (reform) 1998. As in Egypt, a popular uprising in Indonesia arose because of poor representation of the people, a well-orchestrated, fraudulent election, and the absence of strong Islamic civil society. The fall of Egypt's Mubarak, in contrast to that of Indonesia's Suharto, arose from a revolutionary mass uprising rather than from a deliberate strategy of opposition.

Whilst the 'old opposition' did not engineer Mubarak's fall, his authoritarian regime lost control of opposition movements working for change (Albrecht, 2013; Brownlee, 2012). Third, as populous Muslim countries, Indonesia and Egypt share the Islamic idealism that was barely tolerated, even suppressed, under those authoritarian regimes. After the demise of authoritarian leaders in Egypt and Indonesia, there were protracted and bloody sectarian clashes between Muslims and Christians. The emergence of radical and violent Islamist groups bent on terrorism took place against the backdrop of economic depression and political uncertainty (Mercury, 2013).

Recognising that preconditions for the transition to democracy were similar in these countries, this thesis seeks to examine those preconditions by comparing the two Muslim-majority countries. Focussing on Egypt, the most populous Muslim-majority country in the Arabic-speaking world, and Indonesia, the most populous Muslim-majority country in the world, the thesis seeks to identify some of the critical factors contributing to the success or failure of democratisation in these countries.

The thesis is especially concerned with the way in which similarities—such as Cold War contexts, military-backed authoritarianism, and civil society limitations—influenced the transitions to democracy spurred by popular uprisings in Egypt (2011) and Indonesia (1998); however, it should be noted in advance that this research will not discuss whether the July 2013 coup d'état in Egypt was just or not rather it will focus on conditions affecting the fate of the transition to democracy process.

In order to provide a systematic account, the investigation not only probes recent political strategies adopted by relevant players, but also analyses historical and ideational issues. Accordingly, it endeavours to pay due attention to the historical development of, and conflict between, the nationalist-secular and nationalist-Islam identities in order to explore how the polarization of these two influential currents affected national unity and democracy throughout the post-authoritarian era.

In order to keep the research sufficiently focussed and systematic, the study proposes to work on the following hypothesis to guide the research questions: even though there are many common factors behind the transitions to democracy in Indonesia and Egypt, as noted above, those common factors are in fact largely superficial. The study explains why the popular uprising in Egypt had a very different outcome to that of Indonesia.

For instance, the remarkable persistence of Cold War influences in Egypt during 2011 and after, which had generally faded away in Indonesia by 1998, should be noted. Consequently, it was difficult to identify an open and resilient civil society operating as an important driver during the transition to democracy in the Egyptian Revolution 2011 in contrast to the Indonesian experience of transition to democracy. The context shaping culture is a vital factor distinguishing processes and outcomes in each country.

The thesis seeks to test and verify these hypotheses by analysing the conditions that made for success in the transition to democracy in Indonesia, and failure in Egypt. To observe how the conditions compare during the respective transitions to democracy in Egypt, the most populous Arab country, and Indonesia, the most populous Muslim country, this thesis employs a qualitative case study methodology. Despite there may be different temporal and geographical foci, there are certain objective 'preconditions' for the establishment and maintenance

of democracy—the ‘agents’ of democratisation—while external factors help to promote democratic transitions.

With this methodology, the study began with a literature search on Cold War contexts, authoritarian military regimes, civil society, and political Islam in both countries. This thesis uses qualitative research methodology for data collection, processing and analysis. Qualitative research stresses the ‘causes-of-effects’ (Mahoney, 2010) in order to describe variation in a phenomenon, situation and issue (Kumar, 2005). Data collection techniques involve literature searches to prepare analytical tools for observing the correlation between research variables.

The rest of the thesis is organized in the following way: the second chapter critically examines various understandings and definitions of some conceptual frameworks to be used in the analysis, such as the Cold War, military-backed authoritarianism, and Islamic civil society; chapter three examines Cold War contexts and the authoritarian, military-backed regimes in both Egypt and Indonesia; chapters four and five elaborate civil Islam’s contribution during the transition to democracy in Indonesia and Egypt respectively; and the last chapter concludes with a summary of the main findings and discussion of the implications of the study.

## **Civil Islam and the Transition to Democracy in Egypt**

Reliable civil society contributions are crucial in any transition to democracy from authoritarian rule. In the Egyptian context, however, structural factors created conditions in which state-centric authoritarian rule provided limited room for a robust civil society. As a result, Islamic civil society, represented by the Muslim Brotherhood and al-Azhar, remained weak, if not clandestine, before the uprising.

Considered as a source of trouble for every Egyptian ruler, the Muslim Brotherhood was treated as an outlawed and underground organisation. Persevering in their view of ‘Islam as sole solution,’ the Brotherhood was forced to disappear from the Egyptian political arena and withdraw from the democracy debate as well as daily state affairs. The rigid nature of the ideology and activism of the Brotherhood in Egypt made it a poor partner for a democracy. Whilst al-Azhar, since recouping its autonomy in 2012 after more than half a century,

persisted in its role as status quo defender - it endorsed the coup against the first democratically elected Egyptian that spelled the end of Egypt's two-year attempt at democracy.

Despite being a vibrant and durable influence on society's networks, even Islamic civil society did not participate in engineering Mubarak's fall. Due to tough authoritarian repression, their absence in the final year of Mubarak's regime made its contribution to civility questionable during the transition to democracy. Eventually taking the helm, Islamists were arguably too immature to successfully lead a transition to democracy during the turbulent days.

## **Civil Islam and the Transition to Democracy in Indonesia**

In the Indonesian experience, Muslim-based civil society has a long history, dating from the colonial era, in actively contributing during the formative period of nationhood and statehood in Indonesia. The powerful movement for a democratic Muslim politic took shape in the final years of Suharto's authoritarianism. In *Remaking Muslim Politics: Pluralism, Contestation, Democratization*, Hefner (2005) interestingly argued that a tolerant and participatory civil society is not enough to make a transition from an authoritarian regime to work; it also needs partners as democratic actors to work synergistically across the state-society, rather than against society's civil currents. In alliance with secular Muslims and non-Muslims, the movement nevertheless succeeded in May 1998 in toppling the long-lasting Suharto.

In 1998, with a transition from authoritarian rule underway, Indonesia also experienced a burgeoning of political Islam. As the world's most populous Muslim nation, this raised concerns about mainstream Islamist ascendancy; yet, a decade later, Indonesia seems to have accommodated a diversity of Islamic political expression (Hefner, 2011). While Islamist political parties do exist, simple dichotomies appear ill-suited to Indonesia. The majority of Islamic involvement in electoral politics remains of a moderate kind and very far from being associated with the institution of an Islamist state. In fact, the 2004, 2009, and 2014 election results suggest that this moderation is the predominant electoral norm, with a majority of Muslims more interested in a democratic nation-state.

## **Islamic civil society amid the transition to democracy**

As well as testing and verifying a hypothesis on military-backed authoritarian regimes and Cold War contexts, this thesis investigated the empirical impact of substantial contributions by Islamic leaders and Islamic civil society movements on the process of democratisation in Indonesia and Egypt under dictatorships until the onset of uprisings. To this end, the thesis examined the historical evolution of Islamic political principles and the contemporary political developments and structures in Egypt and Indonesia throughout the post-independence era. The role of Islamic political actors and forces in facilitating or hindering the democratisation processes in these two countries, especially during the last decade or so, was the primary focus of the thesis.

The deep involvement of religious leaders and mass religious organisations throughout Indonesian history showed that Islamic civil society has an essential role in Indonesian nation and state building. In particular, the thesis discussed the development and evolution of the Indonesian Islamist agenda (the philosophical basis of the state and sharia). After the first generation of Muslim intellectuals represented by the Masyumi Party struggled for an Islamic democratic state, the Suharto dictatorship cultivated a more accommodative and conciliatory attitude among Muslim intellectuals towards Pancasila that was previously perceived as ‘anti- Moslem.’

Political Islam in Indonesia enjoyed a good relationship with the Suharto regime during its last years in power. The acceptance by Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) and Muhammadiyah—the largest civil Muslim organizations—of Pancasila as an open ideology heralded a new era of opportunity for Muslims to contribute their ideas and preferences to enrich understanding and implementation of Pancasila. In the last years of Suharto, a trustworthy atmosphere built between the state and civil Islam in Indonesia, allowing Islamic organisations and their leaders to engage more deeply in the decision-making process at the national level as well as to embrace a re-flowering of cultural Islam. In other words, civil Islam in Indonesia has become a good partner in democracy for the state on broader Indonesian civility.

After the fall of Suharto, Indonesia’s Islamic civil society was more complete, with good cooperation between NU and Muhammadiyah—two major Muslim organizations which were formerly hostile towards each other. This



is evidenced by the respectful cooperation between Abdurahman Wahid (NU leader) and Amien Rais (Muhammadiyah leader) as well as urban independent Muslim scholar Nurcholish Madjid, acting as champions of the progressive reform forces as well as of civil Islam.

With a transition from authoritarian rule underway, Indonesia also experienced a burgeoning of political Islam, yet a decade later Indonesia seems to have accommodated a diversity of Islamic political expression. While Islamist political parties do exist, simple dichotomies appear ill-suited to Indonesia. By the same token, Indonesian political Islam is no longer equivalent to Islamist aspiration, but characterized rather by a diversity and pragmatism different from the liberal democracy period in the 1950s. As Huntington (1991: 263) rightly points out, these developments take time, that is, at least two successful elections and one transfer of power from incumbent to opposition. In fact, the last four post-Suharto election results suggest that this moderation is the predominant electoral norm, with a majority of Muslims more interested in a democratic nation-state. While the democratic transition is challenged by a resurgence of hard-line groups, the Muhammadiyah and NU remain pillars of Islamic moderation and civic-pluralism.

In contrast, this thesis finds that Egypt tells a different story in relation to Muslim organisations in terms of involvement in state affairs. The dynamic of Egyptian authoritarianism meant Islamic civil society lost many opportunities to be directly involved in state affairs, though its contribution during the formative years of the Egyptian republic should not be underestimated. The banning of the Muslim Brotherhood and Masyumi persisted under Egypt's post-Nasserist regimes of Sadat and Mubarak as well as throughout Indonesia's New Order regime of Suharto; however, structural factors prevailing in Egypt created the state-centric conditions that provided limited room for a robust civil society. As a result, Islamic civil society, represented by the Muslim Brotherhood and al-Azhar, remained weak if not clandestine until the onset of the uprising.

Absent from initial formulation of the January 25, 2011 Revolution, the Muslim Brotherhood regained its momentum in the Egyptian political arena by establishing the Freedom and Justice Party (FJP) that won 37.5% of all seats in the country's lower house of parliament, and won the presidency. From an historical perspective, the rise of Islamist parties in Egypt was helped by the fact

that they were oppressed and became a symbol of 'real' opposition before the Arab Spring (Burhani, 2014). Although the movement maintained the expression of its Islamic identity through its distinctive slogan 'Islam is the Solution,' the Brotherhood's party accepted political pluralism. Nonetheless, fears of an Islamist takeover have not materialized. President Morsi acted more like a status quo president than a revolutionary and the FJP have been domesticated, co-opted by political and electoral engagement.

Post-election Egypt was rapidly polarised between the Islamists, who did not start the revolution yet were elected democratically, and the revolutionary blocs comprising secularists, liberals, left-wingers and Copts. The golden opportunity for the rise of civil Islam in Egypt post-Mubarak stalled because of distrust between the Brotherhood's party and Salafi's party—the two largest Islamic powers holding 65.3% of seats in the Egyptian parliament. Furthermore, the absence of political experience during the last years of Mubarak affected the capacity of the Islamist leadership to preside over the transition to democracy process. Morsi and the FJP are considered to have been more concerned with monopolising and exercising power than with pursuing the common good via an inclusive and progressive economic and political vision.

Al-Azhar symbolizes the mainstream clergy and tends to be pro-government. Since recouping its autonomy after more than half a century in 2012, al-Azhar persisted in defending the status quo. After a long history of struggle with the Brotherhood, it endorsed the coup against the first democratically-elected Egyptian President, marking the failure of Egypt's two-year attempt at democracy.

Finally, in comparing general features of both countries, structural and historical factors should not be overlooked. Sharing an identical international background, Egypt and Indonesia's prolonged authoritarian rules were supported for logistical reasons associated with the Cold War; however, Egypt remain hampered by Cold War legacies, thus reproducing authoritarianism, while the rationale for supporting authoritarian rule become irrelevant in Indonesia—an abandoned battlefield. Correspondingly, in the midst of sudden transition, the Egyptian military remained strong, dealing with a fragile and despondent Islamic civil society. In contrast, the Indonesian military, from a weak position, faced a robust and cooperative Islamic civil society, hence a good partner in democracy for the state.

Consequently, the general conclusion of this thesis must be that even though there are superficial similarities between Indonesia and Egypt, their situations are quite distinctive: structural and historical factors strongly determined the different fates of transition to democracy in Indonesia and Egypt.

---

**Penerapan Standarisasi dan Sertifikasi  
oleh Forest Stewardship Council pada  
Produk Kayu di Dunia Internasional  
Studi Kasus: Penerapan Standardisasi dan  
Sertifikasi FSC di Rusia dan Brasil**

**Implementation of Standardization and  
Certification by Forest Stewardship  
Council on Wood Products in the  
International World  
Case Study: Implementation of FSC  
Standarization and Certification in Russia  
and Brazil**

---

Nama : Agatha Arvi Fembrianita  
NIP : 198502262008082001  
Instansi : BPK  
Tahun Intake : 2014  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : Pascasarjana Hubungan Internasional  
Negara Studi : Indonesia  
Universitas : Universitas Gadjah Mada

## ABSTRAK

FSC adalah lembaga non-profit yang mendedikasikan organisasinya untuk mempromosikan mengenai tanggung jawab pengelolaan hutan di dunia. Sertifikasi yang dimiliki oleh FSC merupakan sertifikasi yang bersifat sukarela. Peningkatan jumlah sertifikasi yang dikeluarkan oleh FSC setiap tahunnya, terutama di Rusia dan Brasil menjadi latar belakang dari penelitian ini. Sebagai sebuah organisasi non negara FSC mampu menerapkan aturan mainnya menjadi standar yang digunakan di banyak negara dan mampu menembus kedaulatan negara-negara tersebut. Dengan menggunakan konsep rezim internasional dan structural power, penelitian ini akan melihat pengaruh yang dimiliki oleh FSC sehingga mampu menerapkan standarnya di tingkat Internasional dengan berfokus pada penerapan standarisasi dan sertifikasi FSC di Rusia dan Brasil. Penelitian dalam tesis ini menghasilkan temuan bahwa pertama, kepatuhan terhadap FSC tercipta karena insentif yang akan diterima bagi pemegang sertifikasi. Kedua, FSC dapat menerapkan standar dan sertifikasinya karena FSC memiliki struktur pengetahuan yang terdapat pada prinsip dan kriteria FSC dan konsep High Conservation Value Forest. Struktur pengetahuan merupakan kekuasaan, bagi siapa yang bisa membangun struktur pengetahuan kepada orang lain dan mampu menciptakan kontrol atasnya maka akan memperoleh struktur kekuasaan.

Kata Kunci: structural power, knowledge structure, FSC, rezim kehutanan bukan negara, sertifikasi kayu.

## ABSTRACT

FSC is a non-profit organization which promoting the forest management responsibilities in the world. Certification by FSC is a voluntary. The background of this research is increasing the number of certifications issued by the FSC year by year, especially in Russia and Brazil. As a non-state organization FSC is capable to apply the rules became the standard in many countries and break through the sovereignty of those countries. By using the concept of international regimes and structural power, this research will observe about the influence of FSC when applying its standard at international level by focusing on the implementation of FSC's standardization and certification in Russia and Brazil. This research is came up with several finding. First, compliance with FSC created by the incentives that will be granted for the certification holders. Second, FSC's standards and certification can be implemented because FSC have knowledge structure which contained in the principles and criteria of the FSC and High Conservation Value Forest's concept. The knowledge structure is power, for anyone who can build and create the knowledge structure to others, they will gain control of the power structure.

Keywords: Structural power, knowledge structure, FSC, forest private regime, timber certification, forest certification

Perdagangan global adalah isu yang paling hangat saat ini. Negara-negara berlomba dalam melakukan perdagangan di dunia internasional. Kebutuhan terhadap barang dan jasa yang tidak dapat dipenuhi pada suatu negara membuat perdagangan semakin mengglobal. Globalisasi ekonomi dan perdagangan ini juga ditopang oleh ketersediaan infrastruktur yang memungkinkan dilakukannya perdagangan lintas batas negara dalam waktu yang relative cepat. Perdagangan jarak jauh sebenarnya telah dilakukan oleh orang-orang selama ratusan tahun, namun perdagangan global yang pertama kali baru dilakukan pada abad ke-19. Gelombang pertama globalisasi ini dikendalikan oleh interaksi antara perubahan teknologi dan politik. Perubahan teknologi dalam hal ini adalah dengan adanya penemuan mesin uap dan mesin telegraf. Sejarah awal perdagangan global tersebut menjadi tonggak dalam perdagangan bebas saat ini.

Dengan semakin intensifnya perdagangan yang dilakukan antar negara di dunia ini, memunculkan kesepakatan untuk membuat standard-standard pada barang yang diperdagangkan. Standard tersebut diterapkan guna menyederhanakan produksi, memperluas pasar dan juga jaminan bagi konsumen pada produk yang dibelinya.

Sertifikasi pada produk hasil hutan seperti kayu merupakan bentuk sertifikasi yang menjadi jaminan atas sebuah produk bagi konsumennya. Sertifikasi ini muncul sebagai sebuah respon pada meningkatnya perhatian internasional pada degradasi hutan secara global, terlebih pada penebangan hutan yang dilakukan secara ilegal. Kekhawatiran tersebut menimbulkan semakin maraknya sertifikasi hutan dan kayu yang dikeluarkan oleh beberapa lembaga standarisasi kehutanan dan produk hasil hutan.

Salah satu sertifikasi untuk produk yang berbahan dasar kayu adalah sertifikasi yang dikeluarkan oleh Forest Stewardship Council (FSC). FSC adalah lembaga non-profit yang mendedikasikan organisasinya untuk mempromosikan tanggung jawab pengelolaan hutan di dunia. Sertifikasi ini merupakan sertifikasi yang bersifat sukarela dan merupakan bentuk jaminan bahwa pemilik usaha yang menggunakan bahan dasar kayu, seperti pengusaha furnitur telah memenuhi standard-standard yang ditetapkan oleh organisasi ini. Standard-standard yang ditetapkan berupa standard eco-labelling dan terutama asal-usul kayu yang digunakan. Aturan main yang dimiliki oleh FSC ini diakui oleh dunia internasional sehingga banyak pembeli yang berasal dari mancanegara

terutama dari wilayah Amerika Utara dan Uni Eropa mensyaratkan sertifikasi FSC ini dalam perdagangan kayu dan produk turunannya.

Sertifikasi pertama yang dikeluarkan FSC pada awal pendiriannya adalah sertifikasi pengelolaan hutan di Mexico dan sertifikasi lacak balak untuk area Amerika Serikat pada tahun 1993. Jumlah sertifikasi terus meningkat setiap tahunnya, hingga pada tahun 1998 sejumlah 10 juta hektar hutan telah tersertifikasi oleh FSC. Peningkatan signifikan pengguna sertifikasi oleh FSC juga meningkat terutama pada tahun 2003. Pada tahun ini, sebanyak 20.000 produk bersertifikat FSC berada di pasar dunia dan 40 juta hektar area juga telah tersertifikasi FSC. Pada tahun 2008, jumlah sertifikasi FSC kembali meningkat, hingga pada tahun ini lebih dari 100 juta hektar area telah tersertifikasi oleh Prinsip dan Kriteria FSC yang terdistribusi lebih dari 79 negara. Hingga pada tahun 2015, telah lebih dari 29.000 sertifikat lacak balak telah dikeluarkan oleh FSC dan lebih dari 1300 sertifikat pengelolaan hutan dengan luas total area 184.798.917 hektar hutan diseluruh dunia telah dikeluarkan.

Sebagai negara produksi kayu di dunia, sertifikasi FSC banyak digunakan di Brasil dan Rusia. Rusia menempati urutan kedua setelah Kanada sebagai negara yang banyak menggunakan standarisasi dan sertifikasi FSC. Pada tahun 2015 jumlah area di Rusia yang telah tersertifikasi FSC sebesar 3.872.897 Ha dengan jumlah sertifikasi 120. Sedangkan Brasil, menjadi negara di Amerika Latin yang memiliki jumlah area yang telah tersertifikasi sebesar 6.559.085 Ha dengan jumlah sertifikasi 106. Di Amerika Latin, Brasil termasuk negara yang memiliki area tersertifikasi FSC paling Luas. Jumlah perusahaan kayu yang menggunakan sertifikasi FSC pun terus meningkat di kedua negara tersebut setiap tahunnya.

Peningkatan jumlah sertifikasi yang dikeluarkan oleh FSC setiap tahunnya, terutama di Rusia dan Brasil menjadi latar belakang dari penelitian ini. Sebagai sebuah organisasi non negara FSC mampu menerapkan aturan mainnya menjadi standar yang digunakan di banyak negara dan mampu menembus kedaulatan negara-negara tersebut. Dengan menggunakan konsep rezim internasional dan structural power, penelitian ini akan melihat pengaruh yang dimiliki oleh FSC sehingga mampu menerapkan standardnya di tingkat Internasional dengan studi kasus penerapan standarisasi dan sertifikasi FSC di Rusia dan Brasil.



Pada tulisan ini menggambarkan mengenai peran penting ahli ilmiah dalam proses mempengaruhi dan mempromosikan HACCP melalui keterlibatan para ahli itu dalam setiap arena dimana pedoman HACCP tersebut dibuat. Mereka disalurkan ke dalam suatu proses yang berkesinambungan dari penyempurnaan dari konsep, mempertahankan dominasinya.

Berkaitan dengan tulisan diatas, penelitian ini juga berupaya untuk menyajikan analisis tentang kekuatan di balik organisasi FSC sebagai pembuat standard produk berbahan dasar kayu sehingga standard-standard tersebut dapat digunakan dan diterapkan di seluruh dunia terutama di Rusia dan Brasil. Berdasarkan latar belakang dan literatur revidu yang telah diuraikan diatas, dan dengan menggunakan studi kasus pada negara Rusia dan Brasil maka penelitian ini merumuskan pertanyaan penelitian sebagai berikut: Mengapa aturan main Forest Stewardship Council menjadi standard dalam perdagangan kayu international?

## **Struktur Pengetahuan dalam Standarisasi Produk Kayu oleh FSC**

FSC bertindak sebagai broker pengetahuan dan norma bagi pelbagai macam aktor yang berbeda, ditengah kompleksnya permasalahan lingkungan dan sosial. Rumusan pengelolaan hutan dan kayu muncul dalam bentuk prinsip dan kriteria FSC yang akan menjadi induk bagi standard-standard yang akan mengatur secara detil mengenai pengelolaan kehutanan dan produk kayu. Selain prinsip dan kriteria pengelolaan hutan oleh FSC, FSC juga merumuskan konsep High Conservation Value Forest (HCVF) yang merupakan implementasi dari kriteria pada prinsip FSC ke 9. Konsep ini juga diterapkan secara luas di tingkat internasional dalam pengelolaan hutan.

Pada tataran berikutnya adalah, How storage. "How Storage" akan menjelaskan bagaimana gagasan mengenai pengelolaan hutan tersebut yang dikemas dalam bentuk prinsip dan kriteria FSC dan konsep High Conservation Value Forest dan disebarluaskan oleh FSC kepada negara-negara lain sehingga gagasan itu menimbulkan kepatuhan dan merupakan suatu kebenaran yang harus diikuti.

1. Prinsip dan Kriteria FSC merupakan pedoman umum yang disusun FSC dan digunakan sebagai pedoman penilaian oleh pihak ketiga atau badan sertifikasi. Seperti telah ditulis dalam bab II, FSC memiliki

10 Prinsip dan 70 Kriteria yang terbagi dalam 10 prinsip tersebut. Prinsip dan Kriteria tersebut akan diturunkan dalam bentuk-bentuk standard sebagai panduan dalam menilai produk kayu. Produksi pengetahuan terutama mengacu pada proses penetapan Prinsip dan Kriteria atau proses standard itu sendiri. FSC bersama-sama menarik pelbagai ahli dan praktisi untuk mengembangkan standard kehutanan nasional, regional, dan global yang merupakan sumber informasi yang unik. Sebaliknya, proses penyebaran informasi meliputi pengetahuan yang dihasilkan oleh FSC dan pengetahuan dari sumber lain seperti Organisasi Buruh Internasional (ILO) telah secara eksplisit dimasukkan ke dalam standard FSC tersebut.

Prinsip dan Kriteria FSC harus diaplikasikan pada unit pengelolaan hutan sebelum sertifikasi FSC diberikan kepada pemohon. Prinsip dan Kriteria yang dimiliki oleh FSC ini dapat diaplikasikan secara luas di dunia dan relevan terhadap pelbagai jenis hutan, ekosistem, budaya, sistem politik dan hukum yang berbeda. Karena Prinsip dan Kriteria ini tidak secara spesifik terhadap suatu negara maupun daerah. Prinsip dan Kriteria FSC tidak hanya mengatur mengenai kehutanan dan vegetasinya melainkan juga mengatur mengenai kondisi yang ada disekitar kehutanan dan industrinya seperti masyarakat adat dan hak-hak pekerja. Hal tersebut merupakan komitmen dari FSC untuk mendukung pengelolaan hutan dunia yang ramah lingkungan dan menguntungkan secara sosial dan ekonomis.

Kehadiran Prinsip dan Kriteria FSC sebagai basis dari segala standards yang dimiliki oleh FSC, merupakan bentuk dari struktur pengetahuan yang dimiliki oleh FSC dalam memperluas pengaruhnya sebagai rezim kehutanan. Kedinamisan yang dimiliki oleh Prinsip dan Kriteria FSC sebagai panduan dalam melakukan penilaian akan kondisi kehutanan menjadi monopoli bagi FSC.

2. Dalam melakukan penilaian/audit hutan dan menterjemahkan prinsip dan kriteria yang dimiliki oleh FSC, dibutuhkan tenaga yang memiliki keahlian khusus, seperti ahli hutan, ahli biologi, arkeologi, ahli lingkungan, dan beberapa ahli lainnya. Prinsip dan Kriteria FSC juga menjadi acuan bagi Standard Nasional FSC. Standard Nasional FSC merupakan standard yang disusun oleh Kelompok

Kerja FSC di beberapa negara. Perbedaan utama dari Standard Nasional dan Standard FSC adalah indikator muatan lokal berdasarkan situasi nasional suatu negara. Penguasaan FSC akan prinsip dan kriteria dalam menilai pengelolaan hutan dan legalitas kayu menjadi kekuatan FSC dalam menerapkan struktur pengetahuan. Oleh karena itu, FSC juga melakukan akreditasi pada lembaga-lembaga yang menerbitkan sertifikasi FSC.

### 3. Konsep High Conservation Value Forest

High Conservation Value Forest atau Kawasan Hutan Bernilai Konservasi Tinggi merupakan konsep yang dibangun oleh FSC dan dipublikasikan pada tahun 1999. Konsep ini telah diadopsi di beberapa negara untuk beberapa tujuan seperti, rencana dan advokasi sumber daya alam, pemetaan, dan pembuatan kebijakan penggunaan lahan.

Konsep HCVF yang didisain dengan tujuan untuk membantu para pengelola hutan dalam usaha-usaha peningkatan keberlanjutan sosial dan lingkungan hidup dalam kegiatan produksi kayu dengan menggunakan pendekatan dua tahap, yaitu: 1) mengidentifikasi areal-areal di dalam atau di dekat suatu Unit Pengelolaan (UP) kayu yang mengandung nilai-nilai sosial, budaya dan/atau ekologis yang luar biasa penting, dan 2) menjalankan suatu sistem pengelolaan dan pemantauan untuk menjamin pemeliharaan dan/atau peningkatan nilai-nilai tersebut.

Penggunaan konsep HCV di luar kerangka kerja FSC dipandang banyak pengamat sebagai membawa banyak risiko, karena proses HCV dalam bentuknya yang kini tidak memiliki pengamanan-pengamanan sosial, legal dan persyaratan yang ada di dalam sistem FSC.<sup>123</sup>Oleh karena itu dalam menetapkan suatu wilayah merupakan HCVF, sebuah negara perlu untuk bekerjasama dengan pihak-pihak yang berafiliasi dengan FSC seperti LSM-LSM yang menjadi anggota FSC.

## **Kesimpulan**

Globalisasi menimbulkan semakin meningkatnya interaksi yang terjadi antar warga dunia, terutama interaksi ekonomi seperti perdagangan. Semakin intensifnya perdagangan yang dilakukan antar negara membuat munculnya pelbagai kesepakatan mengenai standard- standard pada barang yang diperdagangkan. Standard tersebut diterapkan guna menyederhanakan

produksi, memperluas pasar dan jaminan bagi konsumen pada produk yang dibelinya. Salah satu standarisasi tersebut adalah standarisasi pada produk kayu.

Penelitian ini menghasilkan beberapa kesimpulan yaitu: pertama, isu deforestasi dan kerusakan lingkungan telah mendapatkan perhatian sejak tahun 1970an. Sertifikasi pengelola hutan dan produk kayu muncul sebagai respons terhadap meningkatnya perhatian internasional pada deforestasi global dan upaya berkepanjangan dalam kerjasama antar pemerintah untuk mengembangkan perjanjian yang mengikat secara hukum pada hutan.

Kegagalan ITTO dalam melakukan penanganan yang efektif mengenai permasalahan deforestasi yang dipicu kurangnya tindakan yang dipimpin oleh kelompok lingkungan dan beberapa negara maju untuk mengadvokasi ide mengenai konvensi hutan global yang mengikat secara hukum, membuat kekecewaan dari kalangan LSM Lingkungan. Tidak hanya kegagalan ITTO, penolakan sembilan proposal Global Forest Instrument oleh negara-negara selatan karena dianggap akan mengancam kedaulatan mereka, juga menjadi bagian dari gagalnya kesepakatan mengenai pengelolaan hutan.

Kegagalan rezim kehutanan global tersebut memicu munculnya FSC sebagai sebuah rezim kehutanan global bukan negara. Sebagai sebuah rezim bukan negara FSC mampu menembus kedaulatan sebuah negara. Karena sifatnya yang sukarela, standarisasi FSC mampu menciptakan kepatuhan bagi pemegang sertifikasinya. Kepatuhan tersebut tercipta karena insentif yang akan diterima bagi pemegang sertifikasi. Insentif berupa keuntungan dan pasar yang luas bagi produk kayu yang bersertifikat mampu menarik pengguna sertifikasi patuh pada standard yang dimiliki oleh FSC. Ketidapatuhan terhadap rezim ini diatasi dengan tindakan tegas FSC terhadap produsen yang melanggar standarisasi FSC yang telah disepakati. Dengan menggunakan strategi naming and shaming, FSC akan melakukan pengumuman nama perusahaan yang melakukan pelanggaran yang secara langsung akan mempengaruhi pasar dari produk perusahaan tersebut.

Kedua, dalam perdagangan kayu internasional, masih banyak kayu yang tidak bersertifikasi yang beredar dalam perdagangan tersebut. Dari empat milyar hektar luas hutan yang ada di dunia, sekitar 10% atau sekitar 400 juta hektar saja yang telah tersertifikasi. Sertifikasi pada produk kayu

tersebut menimbulkan ketimpangan dalam perdagangan. Ketimpangan tersebut, membuat FSC melakukan *affirmative action* melalui LSM-LSM yang mendukungnya, dengan melakukan kampanye dan tekanan terhadap produk-produk yang belum tersertifikasi. Langkah yang dilakukannya ini mampu memberikan keistimewaan bagi para pengguna sertifikasi.

Ketiga, dalam *affirmative action* yang dilakukan oleh FSC inilah terkandung struktur pengetahuan yang akan memberikan pengaruh terhadap penggunaan sertifikasi FSC. Implementasi struktur pengetahuan tersebut terdapat pada Prinsip dan Kriteria yang dimiliki oleh FSC sebagai basis dari semua standarisasi yang dimiliki oleh FSC. Dalam Prinsip dan Kriteria FSC terkandung pelbagai unsur yang dapat mewakili pelbagai kepentingan seperti kepentingan sosial, ekonomi dan yang utama adalah kelestarian lingkungan. Prinsip dan Kriteria merupakan basis dari standarisasi-standarisasi yang disusun oleh FSC. Kedinamisan prinsip dan kriteria yang dimiliki oleh FSC mempermudah dalam menerapkan aturan tersebut di seluruh dunia.

Struktur pengetahuan tersebut bekerja sehingga batas negara dapat terlampaui oleh FSC ketika menerapkan standarnya terutama di Rusia dan Brasil. Dalam mempengaruhi khalayak untuk menggunakan sertifikasinya, FSC memerlukan waktu yang tidak singkat. Dalam beberapa upaya penerapan standarisasinya, FSC membutuhkan waktu yang cukup lama, hingga mampu membuat pengelola hutan dan produsen yang menggunakan bahan baku hasil hutan mau menggunakan sertifikasi FSC. Kedaulatan negara yang sebelumnya menjadi hambatan dalam melakukan pencegahan deforestasi yang dilakukan dalam kerjasama antar negara, tidak ditemui dalam sertifikasi FSC. FSC dapat menembus kedaulatan negara Rusia dan Brasil dan mampu menerapkan standarnya pada perusahaan-perusahaan pada kedua negara tersebut.

Implementasi struktur pengetahuan juga hadir dalam bentuk konsep High Conservation Value Forest. Konsep ini merupakan konsep yang dibangun oleh FSC dalam melakukan penilaian terhadap pengelolaan hutan. Konsep ini telah diadopsi di beberapa negara untuk beberapa tujuan seperti, rencana dan advokasi sumber daya alam, pemetaan, dan pembuatan kebijakan terkait penggunaan lahan.

Keempat, Branding merupakan strategi FSC dalam menyebarluaskan pengetahuan tentang pengelolaan hutan dan penilaian legalitas kayu. Dengan

memiliki branding yang kuat, maka ketertarikan untuk menggunakan sertifikasi FSC akan semakin kuat pula. Branding FSC hadir dalam bentuk logo dan tagline, oleh karena itu penggunaan logo oleh pemegang sertifikasi FSC diatur dengan jelas oleh FSC. Logo digunakan oleh pemegang sertifikasi sebagai label bahwa produk kayu tersebut telah diverifikasi oleh FSC dan merupakan produk legal dan aman. Dalam label FSC tersebut terkandung informasi mengenai jenis sertifikasi dan kode lisensi sebagai identitas produk.

Kelima, LSM Lingkungan dan Ilmuwan atau epistemic community adalah aktor penting penerapan standarisasi produk kayu oleh FSC di dunia Internasional. Dalam proses mempengaruhi khalayak untuk menerapkan standarisasi FSC dalam produk kayu, FSC menggandeng beberapa LSM lingkungan yang memiliki reputasi internasional, seperti WWF, Rainforest Alliance, dan Greenpeace. FSC juga menggandeng beberapa LSM lokal yang ada di Rusia dan Brasil dalam upaya memberikan pengaruhnya dalam menggunakan standarisasinya pada produk-produk kayu. Peran LSM tersebut begitu besar bagi FSC dalam mendistribusikan informasi mengenai pentingnya standarisasi FSC dalam produk-produk kayu sebagai bagian dari upaya untuk menanggulangi deforestasi yang akan mengancam kelestarian lingkungan. Pengetahuan dan kemampuan yang dimiliki oleh ilmuwan dan ahli membuat mereka mampu memberikan masukan mengenai kebijakan serta mempermudah mereka mempengaruhi masyarakat untuk menggunakan sertifikasi FSC bagi produknya. Para ilmuwan yang dikategorikan sebagai orang yang memiliki pengetahuan tentu juga memiliki kontrol atas isi dalam standard tersebut.



---

# **The Role of Government in the Development of National Innovation System in Indonesia**

**(Through R&D-intensive FDI)**

## **Peran Pemerintah dalam Pengembangan Sistem Inovasi Nasional di Indonesia**

**(Melalui PMA R&D intensif)**

---

Nama : Alferia Riedatina  
NIP : 198509042009012001  
Instansi : BKPM  
Tahun Intake : 2012  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : MSc International Business  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : University of Birmingham



## ABSTRACT

This research investigates the role of government in the development of National System of Innovation (NSI) in Indonesia by observing from the effectiveness of the current institutions and policies. The distinctive characteristics between NSI in developed and developing countries lead to the different approach to manage it. As a supporting element of NSI, R&D activities promote the interaction among government, academic systems and firms. In addition, the R&D-intensive FDI is identified as a one potential source of foreign knowledge that help bringing the technologies and upgrading the local competencies. The reinforcement of NSI is one of the government agendas to help accelerating the long-term target of transforming Indonesia towards the innovation-driven country in 2025. The changing in institutions and policies brought the huge impact of the evolution of NSI in Indonesia. Programs and projects related to innovation, science and technology were proposed by the government and gave the promising result such as increasing the global innovation ranks and establishment of S&T Parks.

## ABSTRAK

Penelitian ini meneliti peran pemerintah dalam pengembangan Sistem Inovasi Nasional (NSI) di Indonesia dengan memperhatikan efektivitas institusi dan kebijakan saat ini. Karakteristik khas antara NSI di negara maju dan berkembang menyebabkan pendekatan yang berbeda untuk mengelolanya. Sebagai elemen pendukung kegiatan NSI, litbang mendorong interaksi antara pemerintah, sistem akademik dan perusahaan. Sebagai tambahan, R & D-intensif PMA diidentifikasi sebagai satu sumber pengetahuan asing yang potensial yang membantu membawa teknologi dan meningkatkan kompetensi lokal. Penguatan NSI adalah salah satu agenda pemerintah untuk membantu mempercepat sasaran jangka panjang untuk mengubah Indonesia menuju negara yang didorong inovasi pada tahun 2025. Perubahan dalam institusi dan kebijakan membawa dampak besar dari evolusi NSI di Indonesia. Program dan proyek yang terkait dengan inovasi, sains dan teknologi diusulkan oleh pemerintah dan memberikan hasil yang menjanjikan seperti meningkatkan peringkat inovasi global dan pendirian S & T Parks.

Knowledge has recently become an important factor in economic growth and productivity. In a knowledge-based economy, countries are no longer competing with each other using the endowment of natural resources or cheap labour (Porter, 1990, 1998). In this type of economy (which is linked to the innovation-driven economy), competitive advantage of one country is measured by knowledge, technology and innovation (Tidd, Bessant, Pavitt, 2005). The investment in knowledge, technology and innovation will support the economic growth in various ways such as through increasing productivity and competitiveness (Ibid; Mansfield, 1984).

Since Indonesia sets a target to become developed country (with innovation as a driver and high GDP) in 2025, as specified in its Long Term Development Plan (Law 17, 2007), the National System of Innovation (NSI) is a pivotal element that should be developed in order to accelerate that target. The government, hence, plays an important role to strengthen the NSI; and one way to reinforce the NSI is through attracting the R&D-intensive FDI. R&D-intensive FDI is invited to come to Indonesia with the expectation to support the economy and innovation system by transferring the knowledge, doing technological collaboration and partnership with local business and also established the good interaction among actors in NSI.

In the NSI, one element that helps to build the innovation system is R&D whether it is conducted through public research or embedded in the firms. Through the foreign direct investment (FDI), R&D by the MNCs becomes the source of external knowledge for a host country. Theoretically, in the well-functioned NSI (most likely in the case of developed countries), R&D conducted by MNCs supports the interaction among other actors in NSI (i.e., government and university), and accelerates the knowledge diffusion in the system (Freeman, 1987; Lundvall, 1992; Nelson, 1993). The government accommodates the supply demand of researchers or R&D personnel between the university and MNCs. This interaction will surge the innovativeness of a country, and in the long term it is expected to stimulate the local industries with gradually transfer the knowledge with or without conscious (Lazonick, 2006).

Moreover, the roles of FDI in the innovation system are creating employment, bringing the technology and knowledge and also as a source of industrial capability advancement (Crescenzi et al, 2012; Ramirez et al, 2014).

Despite those positive impacts, FDI may also harm and replace the local industries that prone to be relatively small, weak, and technologically backward (Blomstrom, 1991; Zilinske, 2010). The government here, therefore, plays an important role to navigate, control, and coordinate through their related policies and regulations in order to gain the benefit and prevent the negative impacts to the country.

According to the background explained above, this research attempts to answer the following questions:

- What can government do to support the development of the National Innovation System in Indonesia and help achieving the transformation towards innovation-driven economy?
- What are the roles of R&D-intensive FDI to benefit the NSI in Indonesia as a developing country since it has a different approach to the NSI in developed economies?
- To what extent the government institutions and policies support the evolution of the NSI in Indonesia?

To answer these research questions, the secondary data will be collected from various sources and will be analysed using exploratory and explanatory approach.

This research uses the qualitative and quantitative secondary data related to government of Indonesia policies, laws and reports; non-government organisation research and reports namely UNCTAD, World Bank, OECD; and previous relevant academic research that aim to answer the research questions.

The qualitative data is non-numerical data such as words and pictures; meanwhile quantitative data is related to the categorical and numerical data for example statistics, graphs and ranks (Saunders, Lewis and Thornhill, 2009).

## **Government Institutions in NSI**

Henceforth, besides the innovative firms, the successful innovation system is also influenced by the effectiveness of the government institutions and their innovation programs. There are some government institutions that have the authority of managing the NSI. The effectiveness and the influence to the NSI. The discussion also covered the programs related to the development of NSI.

According to the table, government has allocated some institutions to manage the innovation system and the other field related to innovation. KIN has the function to directly administer the NSI. While the other institutions have function managing R&D, science and technology and innovation which are still part in innovation system. When formulating the regulations, these institutions adopted how developed countries managing the NSI. KIN, for example, followed how Silicon Valley USA and electronic cluster Taiwan generate innovation.

As a main institution in the NSI, KIN proposed the 1-747 program to help Indonesia transformed to more advanced economies, which is knowledge-based economy with innovation as a driver. The first focus is in the importance of research expenditure 1% of GDP, as a potential input for economic growth.

The realisation include in 7 steps, as follows: Creating the incentive systems and regulations to support innovation and domestic products utilisation culture, improving quality and flexibility of human resource, development of innovation centres to support local SMEs, development of regional innovation cluster, remuneration system for researcher, infrastructure R&D revitalisation, systems and management research funding to support innovation.

Then another step is implementation in the 4 sectors, which are basic industry needs (food, medicine, energy and clean water); creative Industries (culture-based and digital content); local-based industry (S&T park and industrial park); and strategic industries (defence, transport and ICT). The last initiative is including 7 targets for instance increase the number of research and industry patents that directly related to economic growth, increase the number of innovative products and value-added industries from various regions, improve infrastructure in science and technology with international standard, achieve self-sufficiency in food, medicine, energy and clean water, achieve self-sufficiency in the defence industry, transportation and ICT, enhance the creative industry exports, achieve sustainable economic growth and equitable prosperity.

Instead of the 1-747 initiative, government also tried to build and develop Science and Technology Park (S&T park) to facilitate the interaction between actors in the NSI, also create the innovation clusters as a high tech industrial zone. Above all, government intended to create the innovation culture in Indonesia. The Puspiptek<sup>2</sup> and Bandung<sup>3</sup> Raya Innovation Valley (BRIV) are examples of S&T Park and innovation cluster that government developed.

Puspiptek is the largest research zone designed to be a region that synergise well-educated and well-trained human resources, research equipment and technical services in Indonesia (puspiptek, 2014). Since established in 1979 by Ministry of Research and Technology, Puspiptek had created 35 laboratories with the coordination among LIPI, BPPT, BATAN and the Ministry of Research and Technology and two laboratories under the Ministry of Environment Environmental Impact Control Means (Sarpedal), and Environmental Training Centre (ibid). Those laboratories were utilised dominantly for science and technology and have not been widely used for innovation. To stimulate innovation

in Puspiptek, in 1997 in that area was operated the Technology Incubator Board for helping protect the business of the infant industry and technopreneurship and assist them creating the new technologies (puspiptek, 2014).

In 2011, government revitalised the puspiptek into Indonesia – Science and Technology Park (I-STP) in order to provide more benefit to the science and technology in Indonesia (puspiptek, 2014). I-STP acts as facilitator and coordinator of science and technology flow. One recent program of I-STP is to invite students to visit and discuss about knowledge and technology, they also can use the laboratories and get used to how it operates (ibid). This program is good to build the awareness to the importance of knowledge and technology.

For the BRIV, the idea of this creation came from the University City Science Centre in Philadelphia, USA (KIN book, 2012). This innovation valley, projected to finish in year 2017, is expected to trigger the development of technology and innovation-based industry in Indonesia. Bandung was chosen because of many large universities, R & D institutions, and firms operated there. Government set up incentives in the BRIV to attract FDIs and simultaneously develop Indonesian innovators.

Moreover, the government put focus on the several sectors of innovation such as food security, energy security, biotechnology, industrial manufacturing, technology infrastructure, transportation and defence industries, agricultural and fish processing technology, natural disaster management, as well as other science-based innovations (KIN, 2012).

The emergence of new institutions, with the focus on managing the NSI, results to the improved innovation in Indonesia. Since established in 2008 and 2010, BIC and KIN brought many programs related to innovation development. S&T parks effective to build the local innovation. These programs successfully bring Indonesia innovation rank increase 12 position from 99 to 87.

However, disperse and weak coordination among institutions makes the system not working satisfactorily. Some institutions have similar functions and programs that can be maximised if well coordinate one another. For example, ministry of research and technology, LIPI and BPPT have the same function in formulating policies in science and technology sectors. Three of them have own regulations and no single policies established with the collaboration. Additionally, it also causes the overlapping works among institutions. If a firm wants to ask the R&D facilitation, it will go to all institutions related and affect to the effectiveness and slow responsiveness. To avoid that problem, it requires a higher degree of coordination and synchronisation from all institutions.

## **R&D and FDI condition in Indonesia**

As mentioned in the background of the research, attracting R&D-intensive FDI will support strengthening the NSI as it helps to bring the foreign knowledge and technology to Indonesia. That knowledge and technology then absorbed to the local employees, local suppliers, and spread to the system of innovation.

## **Research and Development (R&D)**

R&D is unevenly distributed in some business sectors. The manufacturing sectors mostly composed by SMEs with the low technology capabilities. Upgrading the capabilities needs significant efforts from government to develop the R&D activities. Indonesia is lack of high technology industries due to incompetence local conditions (i.e., expertise, infrastructure and other supporting facilities). Additionally, few large firms and investment by MNCs constrain the development of R&D.

Indonesia also has low quality of scientific research institutions with rank of 46 based on world economic forum 2013-2014. Those issues could be a reason why big multinational firms operated in Indonesia mostly conduct the R&D away from this country.

Although R&D expenditure continues to increase following the crisis of 1998 (figure 10), with mostly to fund the basic research for education, the contribution of R&D on economic growth has insignificantly visible. In 2008, R&D expenditure only 0.08% of GDP with more than half of this figure allocated to government spending such as for pay researchers remuneration and pay for research materials, and only 20% to fund firm's R&D activities (ibid). Because of low R&D expenditure and public investment, government sets up a budget to improve the R&D with the target expenditure approximately 1% of GDP in medium term (1-747 initiative by KIN, 2012) and in the long term plan of 3% of GDP in 2025 (MP3EI, 2011).

In mid-2012, R&D expenditure increase more than double from 0.08% in 2008 to 0.2% in 2012, accountable from the increase in firms' R&D expenditure (LIPI, 2012). To get the maximum result, government added more incentives for firms conducted the R&D in Indonesia. The incentives, for instance reducing the income tax 5% per year for 6 years and get an investment allowance for income gross by 30% (Directorate General of Taxes, 2014). Firms also get tax exemption on import goods or machineries for the purposes of R & D (ibid). Those government incentives are expected to improve the future performance and achieve the target 3% expenditure in 2025.

## **Foreign Direct Investment (FDI)**

Since the 17th century, Indonesia has been involved in foreign trade activities. In the industrial revolution era, Indonesia was a target country of many foreign firms to take raw materials and market the finished products. In 1967, the government published the first law about foreign investment. Those conditions implied that Indonesia open for foreign knowledge and investment since a long time ago. Friedman (1999) argued that open economy is better than the closed economy because it will make the country more integrated into the world network of ideas, markets, technologies and management innovations (p.256).

Indonesia performance as a host country for FDI is quite impressive. Large market, abundant natural resources, low labour cost and continuous improvement in reducing the licensing bureaucracy make Indonesia became the third position of MNC's top prospective host economies after China and United States in 2014 (WIR, 2014). It shows that Indonesia is one of the target countries for doing business.



The improved performance of investment Indonesia is inseparable from the effort of government to BKPM as an investment promotion agency that promotes Indonesia and also by other related government institutions who give incentives. The current Indonesia investment grade from Fitch Ratings is BBB- that indicates satisfactory, stable and acceptable risk (BKPM, 2014). The Fitch Ratings is used by investors to see if the risk of return on investment and BBB rating means good credit quality (Fitch ratings, 2014).

The latest press release by BKPM on 24 July 2014, about investment realisation since quarter I in 2010 until quarter II in 2014, shows that FDI contributes more than half value of local investment. This indicates that FDI is very important for Indonesia's economy, and the fact that inward FDI 55 contributes approximately 25% of the GDP (Oman, 2000). Additionally, the investment realisation always shows positive results with the second quarter of 2014 reach the highest record with total FDI 116.2 trillion and rise 16.4% from the last quarter.

According to FDI statistic of UNCTAD, since 2010 until 2013 Indonesia has maintained an exceptional performance as a top 20 host economies of inward FDI. Previously, in 2009 Indonesia was in the rank 43 from 148 countries and even worse, in 1998-2000 Indonesia was in the bottom 20 (World Investment Report UNCTAD, 2001-2014).

The increasing in the inward FDI has contributed to the developing the innovation in Indonesia in this recent year. As government open more business field to foreign investors (Reg.39, 2014), they tried to refer the MNCs to invest in other sectors that give more direct impact to innovation in Indonesia or persuade them to train local people.

Moreover, government also arranged many win-win agreements for MNCs and Indonesia. For example in the case of American based world biggest mining affiliates of Freeport McMoRan, PT. Freeport Indonesia operates in Papua to mine, process and explore the copper, gold and silver ores (Freeport website, 2014). During operation, government and firms made a memorandum of understanding (MoU) with some points, such as Freeport can explore the natural resources of Indonesia as long as the firm does the divestment of 30% share to government. Freeport also has to the use of local labour and domestic product up to 100 per cent.

## Conclusion

NSI in developing countries acts more absorbing the knowledge and innovation rather than creating it. That is why the knowledge and technology from developed countries help strengthen the innovation system in Indonesia as it pushes the local capabilities and competitiveness. Attracting MNCs to invest and conduct the R&D will benefit the local business, local people and facilitate the interaction among actors of innovation. The interaction happens when firms utilised the research personnel or educated people and equipment from university and government gives incentives to facilitate it.

The development of National System of Innovation (NSI) in Indonesia helped accelerate the target to be innovation-driven economy in 2025. With the infant condition (just started from 2008), NSI fully relied on government supports. The institutions and policies changing foster the NSI with many supporting programs.

Moreover, foreign investment is one of the major contributors to Indonesia economic growth. Not merely pumping the competitiveness, R&D intensive FDI also benefits the country with transfer knowledge and improve to the absorptive capabilities. The role of government to attract the inward FDI and support the R&D development will make NSI effectively produce the innovation. The involvement of local people in the R&D activities is accountable to better capabilities.

However, even though government established the institutions (KIN, BIC), formulated the supporting policies and gave more R&D incentives, the R&D development in Indonesia is still weak and not integrates between basic and applied research.



---

## **Timor-Leste's Accession to ASEAN: Analysing the Push and Pull Factors of Regional Organisations**

## **Bergabungnya Timor-Leste ke ASEAN: Menganalisis Faktor Pendorong dan Daya Tarik Organisasi Regional**

---

Nama : Antonius Prawiro Yudianto  
NIP : 198705052009121001  
Instansi : KEMENLU  
Tahun Intake : 2014  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : MA International Studies and  
Diplomacy  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : SOAS University of London

## ABSTRACT

This study analyses Timor-Leste's decision to join ASEAN after gaining independence in 2002. Initially, during the referendum process in 1999, Timor-Leste decided to align with the Pacific Island Forum. Using the framework of small state, the study explores the push and pull factors that led to the country's preference for the Southeast Asia grouping. The push factors include the country's foreign policy objectives, national interests, and the role of its powerful neighbour which helped it maintains its pursuance of ASEAN; discussion of the pull factors focuses on the attraction of ASEAN for Timor-Leste. The study showcases how these interrelated factors play a role in the decisions of small states to join certain regional groupings.

## ABSTRAK

Studi ini menganalisis keputusan Timor-Leste untuk bergabung dengan ASEAN setelah mendapatkan kemerdekaan pada tahun 2002. Awalnya, selama proses referendum pada tahun 1999, Timor-Leste memutuskan untuk menyelaraskan dengan Pacific Island Forum. Dengan menggunakan kerangka negara kecil, studi ini mengeksplorasi faktor pendorong and daya tarik yang menyebabkan preferensi negara untuk pengelompokan Asia Tenggara. Faktor-faktor pendorong termasuk tujuan kebijakan luar negeri negara, kepentingan nasional, dan peran tetangganya yang kuat yang membantunya mempertahankan ASEAN; Diskusi tentang faktor penarik berfokus pada daya tarik ASEAN untuk Timor-Leste. Studi tersebut menunjukkan bagaimana faktor-faktor yang saling terkait ini berperan dalam keputusan negara-negara kecil untuk bergabung dengan kelompok-kelompok regional tertentu.

Since the vote for independence in August 1999 and the country's first national election in 2002, Timor-Leste has taken a step forward to show its existence on the international stage by expressing its hope to join Association of South East Asian Nations (ASEAN). Its Minister of Foreign Affairs, Jose Ramos Horta, raised this issue during a bilateral meeting with Indonesia in October 2002 ('East Timor asked' 2002). The desire to become an ASEAN member states (AMS) has helped the country shape its foreign policy. As stated by Ramos Horta, 'gaining membership of ASEAN will be the primary foreign policy goal of the future government in Timor-Leste' (ISEAS, 2001).

The country's struggle to become a member of ASEAN is worthy of note. Not only does the process require a large amount of resources and time but Timor-Leste also has to ensure it is capable of hosting ASEAN meetings according to the ASEAN Charter. Minister Ramos Horta has emphasised that to become a member of ASEAN the country has undergone tremendous social, economic, security and political changes (Horta in Palatino, 2011). Although the proposal to include Timor-Leste as the 11th member is still being discussed by the AMS today, Timor-Leste remains committed to ensuring its place in the region.

Timor-Leste's interest in becoming a new member of ASEAN can be said to be a major turn-around. In the early years after the referendum the country showed a desire to join the regional organisation of South Pacific Island countries, Pacific Island Forum (PIF). Minister Ramos Horta emphasised the relevance of the country's characteristics to the South Pacific regional grouping during a meeting in Australia in 2000. However, after the national election in 2002, Timor-Leste changed its focus from the Pacific grouping to ASEAN.

Timor-Leste's commitment to becoming the 11th ASEAN member state shows the importance of the regional organisation to the country. This study analyses the main factors attracting Timor-Leste to join a regional grouping, and in particular ASEAN. It addresses two main questions: why is Timor-Leste eager to join a regional organisation? And why has it chosen ASEAN? Using the framework of small states' behaviour in international systems, this dissertation sheds light on how small states behave in a certain way in regional and multilateral settings as well as scrutinising the importance of regional organisations for small states. The study argues that the decision to join ASEAN

comes not only from Timor-Leste's eagerness to pursue its survival based on its national interests but also from the influence of other factors around it.

## **Timor-Leste's Push Factors**

The motto of the Congresso Nacional da Reconstrucao de Timor-Leste states the country's goal: 'Having liberated our country we must now liberate our people'. In the days of the referendum in 1999, the statement could be seen as seeking to liberate the country from foreign occupants, but today it can be interpreted as wanting to free the Timorese from hunger, poverty and the fear of insecurity. As stated earlier, building a strong and sustainable economy is in the country's utmost interests. For small states such as Timor-Leste, survival in terms of security is indeed important. However, security is not the only trigger for the country's actions on the international stage. National economic interests are also seen as a defining factor driving the country's relations with others. Scholars believe that the changing behaviour of states when adjusting their activities to the international environment cannot be separated from their national interests (Modelski, 1962, p.6; Holsti, 1983, p.19). Therefore the country needs to adjust the direction of its foreign policy to suit its national interests.

In the aftermath of the crisis in 2006 Timor-Leste was ranked among the world's least-developed nations. Job scarcity, uneven growth and low human resources have proven to be the sources of conflict in the country since gaining independence (Kammen, 2009, pp.386-7). However, since 2007 the economy has changed significantly and it is now one of the fastest-growing in the world. Despite a large amount of aid to ensure the process of state-building, the driving force behind Timor-Leste's double-digit economic development is the rising trajectory of government spending made possible by petroleum revenues. According to the World Bank, petroleum revenues in 2010 accounted for 73 percent of Timor-Leste's GDP and the rise in the oil price in 2011 changed its status to a lower middle-income country (Worldbank 2015). Government revenue from petroleum has grown from 0.5 billion USD in 2009 to 1.5 billion USD in 2013 (Edmonds, 2014, p.270). In 2014, petroleum revenues contributed 2.5 billion USD to the nation's wealth. It is no longer surprising that Timor-Leste's economy nowadays depends primarily on oil revenues.



However, with its lack of professionals and infrastructure Timor-Leste must still rely on the assistance of oil companies and foreign developers to help them with the manufacturing process. These symbioses often do not run smoothly because conflicts and disagreements tend to occur with the profit oriented oil companies who are often backed by powerful countries. As an example, the recent case over unequal share of profits and the manufacturing process for developing the Greater Sunrise Field have caused tension between Timor-Leste and Australia (Edmonds, 2013, p.271). The country's foreign policy, to align with ASEAN, is argued to be one way towards more friendly and beneficial cooperation over exploration for and production of oil and gas, as well as promoting other formal private sectors to boost their income (Edmonds, 2013, p.273).

Until today Southeast Asian countries, namely Indonesia, Malaysia, Singapore and Vietnam, remain the country's top four trading partners, with the total value of the trade more than 300 million USD in 2013 (Direcção Nacional de Estatística 2013). Adding to this promising figure, in 2014 79 countries, with the world's major economic powers on board, invested in ASEAN with 17 percent of their investment in the oil and natural gas sector and 52 percent in other small sectors (ASEAN Secretariat 2014). ASEAN serves as 'economic umbrella' for the country in the region (Horta in ISEAS, 2001, p.8). Especially with 2015's declining petroleum production and low energy prices, it is important for Timor-Leste to diversify its economy by encouraging private investment (ADB 2015).

## **Powerful Neighbours**

The ability of outside powers to change small states' decisions and preferences is one of the main arguments of the international level theory scholars, beside the influence of the international system. As stated, given their limited resources small states often surrender to one of only two choices: to bandwagon or to balance the existing power (Labs, 1992, p.385; Walt, 1987, p.114). 'Because small states may suffer grievously, they must choose the winning side'. This assumption is widely used to explain the shift in small states' foreign policy during the Cold War when there were two contending powers, the US and USSR. Nowadays the hypothesis is still relevant to explain the changing behaviour of small states.

The constellation of power is a useful analytical tool to determine the course of small states' action in the international arena. Within the framework of small state studies, this assumption is also relevant for explaining Timor-Leste's preference for a certain regional organisation. However, what makes Timor-Leste unique compared to other countries explained in numerous studies is that it is situated at the crossroads of different major powers in the region and therefore its decision is not only based on which of these is the winning side but also on which will be more beneficial to the country's security and survival. Timor-Leste is clapped between two G-20 nations, Indonesia and Australia, in a region that comprises a number of strong economies, namely Malaysia, Singapore and Thailand. The strong presence of China adds to the dilemma of choices for Timor-Leste.

Therefore besides its foreign policy, another push factor that has stimulated Timor-Leste's decision to join ASEAN is the presence of its powerful neighbours. These actors may shape and influence the country's international approach and responses. Three countries have a role in pushing Timor-Leste towards ASEAN: Australia, China and Indonesia.

## **Good neighbourliness and security**

Security is at the core of ASEAN's existence, both in today's comprehensive concept and in its original conception (Severino, 2006, p.161). Regional peace and stability are its main rationale because with peace, more resources and goods can be channelled into nation-building rather than armaments and conflicts (Achee, 2011, p.61). Over the years, ASEAN has managed to empower regional security through various mechanisms and expanding its relevance outside the region (see figure 4). These forums aim to settle issues of security by including various major players to adhere to ASEAN principles. These forums have succeeded in eliminating conflicts that leads to warfare in the region.

Security and good neighbourliness can be argued to be ASEAN's strongest attraction for Timor-Leste. As mentioned, Timor-Leste is well aware of its position in the region close to Southeast Asian countries, and therefore has to ensure that the environment is stable and secure for its survival. Furthermore, in its quest to pursue its national interests, 'the ASEAN way'<sup>5</sup> of good neighbourliness will stimulate wider interaction with the AMS to help Timor-Leste with its nation-building process.

## **Other Pull Factor**

Besides the political factors, joining the ASEAN regional bloc is an economic decision. This intention was stated by Ramos Horta (in Azhari, 2011, p.53), claiming: 'We want more ASEAN engagement in the process of reconstruction of Timor-Leste...ASEAN membership is more important than other regional options'. ASEAN seems to be the most logical solution for Timor-Leste's future economic integration. Over the past decade (2001-2011), the total GDP of ASEAN members has taken an enormous leap of 1.4 percent to 1,504 billion USD (Minh, 2011, p.10). Even during the global financial crisis in 2008, ASEAN managed to improve its trade by 6.2 percent, although its internal trade remained modest (Minh, 2011, p.10). Free trade among AMS, as one of its prominent elements, has reduced about 99.11 percent of tariff lines. This development has allowed the trading of goods and services between AMS with almost no tariff at all. Besides these figures, Timorese leaders are also well aware that by joining ASEAN, especially with the commencement of the 2015 Economic Community, Timor-Leste will be connected to several strong and outward-looking economies. ASEAN is known as the 'Noodle Bowl' economy due to its ability to engage various strong economies.

## **Pacific Island Grouping: A Comparison**

The South Pacific extends over a vast area from Papua New Guinea (PNG) north of the equator to the Antarctic Circle. It consists of some 16 independent and self-governing states and a number of colonies and territories administered by several metropolitan power (Ross, 1993, p.3). The South Pacific Commission, later called the Pacific Islands Forum and the first regional pacific grouping, was established after World War II in 1947. According to Herr (2015, p.17) the grouping evolved after decolonialisation in the 1970s, but more significantly after the Post-Cold War era, when security and international agenda had a growing affinity.

The type of security issues and regional organisation to be found in the Pacific islands region intersect with those in ASEAN. The Forum has endured over a period of 34 years as club of sovereign states with a similar commitment to non-interference and stability in the region (ADB, 2005, p.46).

However, the Pacific grouping has a long history of unsettled disputes and instability. Coups and civil unrest, particularly in Fiji, the Solomon Islands and PNG have shifted the focus of the traditional security architecture in recent years from regional stability to state protection (Herr, 2015, p.23). Given their lack of resources to sustain their security, these states tend to rely on benign international organisations and major powers for protection. Only three states have established formal defence forces, namely Fiji, PNG and Tonga (Herr, 2015, 24-25). This situation has given prominence to the leading role of major powers such as Australia, New Zealand, China, UK and the US to intervene.

Regional Assistance Mission to Solomon Islands (RAMSI) is the most striking example of a recent intervention and Australia's dominance of the Pacific Island. Similar with the aid to restore justice in Timor-Leste, in Solomon Islands, RAMSI cost Australia over 2.6 billion AUD over a decade, with Canberra funding up to 95 percent of the overall mission (Hayward-Jones, 2015, p.72). The security of the Pacific is also included in its 2013 White Paper as one of Australia's strategic interests (Department of Defence 2013). Australia spends 53 million USD per annum on defence cooperation with the Pacific region alone, and up to 130 million USD on securing the neighbourhood (Hayward-Jones, 2015, p.71-2). Not only Australia but also outside players such as China play a significant role in the Pacific security architecture. After the 2006 coup in Fiji, Beijing is reported to have supported the interim government led by the coup leader, Commodore Frank Bainimarama, with aid up of to 121 million USD, which drew praise from Fiji's military government (Zhang, 2015, p.24).

Timor-Leste has never clearly stated why it moved away from the Pacific Island grouping. Horta only stated that ASEAN never permitted Dili to have double membership of ASEAN and the PIF (Madijah, 2002). However, to view Timor-Leste's preferences according to small states analysis, it is considered strategic to see a shift from Timor-Leste's initial position. First, the involvement of major powers in the internal affairs of a country and regional stability have always been Timor-Leste's strategic considerations. Sahin (2014, p.11) argues that 'by choosing ASEAN rather than the Pacific Island Forum, dominated by Australia and New Zealand, Timorese indicated their interest for a stable regional grouping'. Moreover, with Australia and New Zealand as the dominant actors in the Pacific, it could be argued that a bilateral problem with Australia could also affect Timor-Leste's existence in the region.

Second, in terms of economies, besides Australia and New Zealand the Pacific Island countries' economies show a great dependence on aid which is not promising for Timor-Leste's vision of nation-building. According to the ADB (2005, p.18), economic growth in the Forum Island countries has been generally poor, averaging less than 1.5 percent per year from 1996 to 2001 due to their small domestic markets and governance weakness constraining growth. Growing instability since early 2001 and poor governance in other island states such as Fiji, Tonga, Nauru and PNG have also had an impact on the region's economic growth (ADB, 2005, p.22). Entrusting the country's future under these unpromising conditions will not be beneficial for Timorese economic development, which requires more investment rather than resource extraction.

## **Conclusion**

In the context of push factors, Timor-Leste is well aware of its geopolitical position, which requires it to engage with its Southeast Asian neighbours, due to its strategic importance. The country also puts special emphasis on security and economic growth to help its nation-building process. The study argues that since its independence, Timor-Leste sees a greater possibility of achieving these two vital interests under the umbrella of ASEAN than PIF. The decision to join a regional group is also stipulated in its constitution as the way to overcome the country's limited resources.

Still in the context of push factors, Timor-Leste is positioned at the crossroads of major powers and powerful neighbours. In the small-state framework its relations with neighbouring powers are important in determining the country's decision. In light of this, strategic relations with Indonesia are argued to be one of the strongest push factors for Timor-Leste. Given its geographical proximity and economic dependence, this study identifies that being an ASEAN member will reinforce its relations with Indonesia, which will be very beneficial for Timor-Leste. The growing presence of China is also a leading factor shaping the country's preferences for ASEAN. Disputes between Timor-Leste and Australia add to the dilemma, with Timor-Leste using ASEAN to move away from Australia and closer to the Southeast Asia region.

In the context of pull factors, ASEAN's ability to restrain great powers, thus providing security and stability as well as good neighbourliness for the region,

has become the main attraction factor for Timor-Leste. It sees ASEAN as able to create stability in the region, which it can rely upon for its future wellbeing. Timor-Leste also perceives ASEAN as a resilient market and fertile ground for its economy, as most of the AMS are its major trading partners. Another of ASEAN's strong points is its emphasis on equality among its members through the ideology of 'the ASEAN way'. As argued by various scholars, these factors all together will provide the small state with an environment which is conducive to its survival. Not only Timor-Leste but other new emerging states in Southeast Asia favour ASEAN for these pull factors.

For comparison, this study has also considered the similarities and differences between ASEAN and the Pacific Island grouping, PIF. Although the two regional organisations share the same norms and ideals, to create stability and respect the sovereignty of their members, PIF has failed to achieve the conditions needed for a stable region. The role of major powers is evident in the internal disputes of its members. Coups and civil unrest add to the challenges in the Pacific region and hinder economic growth. In sum, the decisions of small states such as Timor-Leste are strongly connected to external conditions and international constraints, as pictured in the push and pull factors.



---

## **Film sebagai Alat Diplomasi Budaya: Studi Kasus Kedutaan Perancis di Indonesia**

## **Film as a Tool of Cultural Diplomacy: A Case Study of the French Embassy in Indonesia**

---

Nama : Arief Ilham Ramadhan  
NIP : 198506102009011001  
Instansi : KEMENLU  
Tahun Intake : 2012  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : MA International Communications  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : University of Leeds



## ABSTRACT

Film has been a part of foreign policy since the World War I, where countries were using film with “messaging” approach, intended for propaganda. Nowadays, film continues serving countries’ foreign policy and being a part of their arsenal of diplomatic tools. This dissertation examines the French embassy in Indonesia’s practice of film diplomacy. The aim is to find out whether film only can be used for “messaging” kind of diplomacy like in the past, or is it well-adapted to the developments that have happened in the geopolitical landscapes and communication technologies, where “relationship building” approach emerges to the central stage of foreign affairs. The result was generated by analysing two areas: the policy (including in it the goals) and the activities.

It can be concluded from the findings that the French embassy employs both approaches intertwinedly, depending on the goals to be achieved. From the findings also can be seen how film and diplomacy are perfectly compatible, where all aspects of a film (production, distribution and exhibition) can be used for diplomacy.

## ABSTRAK

Film telah menjadi bagian dari kebijakan luar negeri sejak Perang Dunia I, di mana negara-negara menggunakan film dengan pendekatan "pesan", ditujukan untuk propaganda. Saat ini, film terus melayani kebijakan luar negeri negara dan menjadi bagian dari gudang alat diplomatik mereka. Disertasi ini mengkaji kedutaan Prancis dalam praktik diplomasi film Indonesia. Tujuannya adalah untuk mengetahui apakah film hanya dapat digunakan untuk "perpesanan" semacam diplomasi seperti di masa lalu, atau adaptasi dengan baik terhadap perkembangan yang terjadi dalam lanskap geopolitik dan teknologi komunikasi, di mana pendekatan "hubungan membangun" muncul ke tahap sentral urusan luar negeri. Hasilnya dihasilkan dengan menganalisis dua bidang: kebijakan (termasuk di dalamnya tujuan) dan kegiatan. Dapat disimpulkan dari temuan bahwa kedutaan Prancis menggunakan kedua pendekatan tersebut secara intertwined, tergantung pada tujuan yang ingin dicapai. Dari temuan tersebut juga dapat dilihat bagaimana film dan diplomasi sangat sesuai, dimana semua aspek film (produksi, distribusi dan pameran) dapat digunakan untuk diplomasi.

Film is among the form of culture that is used as a tool of diplomacy. Ones might

assume that films can only be used to sell and have no ability to listen. This assumption is considerably weak since it only sees film in terms of its content. Meanwhile film encompasses many aspects besides mere content. Among them are the processes of production, distribution, and exhibition. All those aspects can be used to serve different intentions, whether to tell or to listen. Context is the key to deciding which activities determine which certain conditions and goals.

Film has been transformed into a tool of diplomacy, especially cultural diplomacy. After the Cold War era, many countries, especially the ones that have established film industries, conduct diplomatic activities involving film. Many of them use cultural agencies as a showcase for their films abroad, while some others use their embassies. Some have clear goals to be achieved, while others do not. Some are driven by clear policies, while others are only based on diplomats' initiatives. Some see it as a highly important thing to do, while others do not. Some do it at a low pace, while some others are very aggressive. Interestingly, not many scholars devote attention to this field.

The decision to choose France as the case study is because of its prominence among countries when it comes to cultural diplomacy. The history of French cultural diplomacy spans from the Ancien Régime (from approximately the 15th century until the late 18th century prior to French revolution) where many diplomats were also men of letters (de Raymond as quoted by Lane, p. 7). France also believed as the first nation to establish an official agency of cultural diplomacy, named Alliance Française, in 1883, to promote the French language (Gienow-Hecht and Donfried in Gienow-Hecht and Donfried (ed.), 2011, p. 18). France continues using culture as its tool of diplomacy through its embassies around the world. The Embassy in Indonesia is no exception. The French embassy in Indonesia is chosen for the case study of this dissertation because it is well-known for its film-related activities among Indonesian public, especially among students, cultural and film workers. Besides that, the existence of cultural differences between both countries seems as a perfect condition to see how the French embassy arranges its diplomacy via film against the background of existing cultural filters.

Indonesia for France, as stated in the official website of the embassy, is an important country viewed from its position in regional (a leader country in South East Asia) and international (as a member of G20) political realms.

There are two main focuses of French foreign policy in Indonesia: scientific and cultural cooperations. Those activities are conducted by French embassy through Campus France; Institute Français Indonesia (IFI) that has branches in main cities including Jakarta, Bandung, Yogyakarta and Surabaya; and by Alliances Françaises (AF) that has representatives in Bali, Balikpapan, Medan and Semarang. Film is one out of three main focuses of French embassy cultural diplomacy in Indonesia, besides Printemps Français (Arts and Cultural Festival) and language teaching.

France, besides German and Japan, has been aggressively using film as their tool of cultural diplomacy in Indonesia. Not only limited to film screenings, they also do discussions and workshops, cooperation with universities and local film communities, give scholarships or grants, film competitions, etc. The latest France Film Festival in Indonesia was held in cities across the country. With this scale, there must be serious goals they want to achieve. It is interesting to see how the French formulating film diplomacy strategy at the embassy level in Indonesia to meet those goals.

The main question of this research are: Is film only used for “messaging” kind of diplomacy or also used for “relationship building” kind of diplomacy? This question will be answered by finding out at the first place the French embassy’s goals of films diplomacy and the implementation of film diplomacy by the French embassy.

The main purpose of this study is to see what film can do if it used for diplomacy. Range of film activities will be examined in order to see embassy efforts in articulating France foreign policy via film. By doing so, it can be seen whether film can only be used for “messaging” kind of public diplomacy approach or it also can be used for “relationship building” kind of approach. This examination is in line with Zahrana’s thinking that there are two underlying perspectives of communication in the array of public diplomacy initiatives.

Zahrana contends that “one perspective tends to view communication as a linear process of transferring information often with the goal of persuasion or control. The other perspective sees communication as a social process of building relationship and fostering harmony” (Zahrana, 2009, p. 86). We can easily tell that film propaganda in the past were using “messaging” kind of approach. Content of the film back then played an important role in shaping

opinion of foreign public. But, the case is different today. Content is no longer the only part of film used for diplomacy. Other aspects of film, such as production, exhibition and distribution, are also potential to be used for diplomacy. Hence, film diplomacy can take form in broader activities, and serves any particular goals and under any particular context.

This dissertation aims to:

- Continue the study in the area of film and its relations to foreign policy.
- Find out why film is used by French embassy as one of its tools of cultural diplomacy.
- Find out range of cultural diplomacy activities that can be done by using film.
- Find out how an embassy carries out film-related cultural diplomacy activities.
- Find out the limitations of film and obstacles in doing cultural diplomacy via film.
- As one of the requirements to obtain MA in International Communications from University of Leeds.

## **France Cultural Diplomacy**

As stated in the official website of French Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA), spreading French culture and international cooperation are among oldest and essential components of French external policy (French MoFA, 2013a). With referring to cultural diplomacy the Director of IFI stated that “French diplomacy is always giving a huge part to what the American coined of diplomacy some years ago. We have been doing that for a century”. Historically, culture has been a part of French diplomacy since the ancien Régime. At the time, the sciences, arts and literature were important components of diplomatic relations which facilitated preliminary exchanges in any subsequent negotiations. Thus understandable that the cultural expertise was essential to the profession of diplomat, as Philippe Lane puts on his book, *French Scientific and Cultural Diplomacy*, “at the time, arts and literature were associated with exchanges, political contacts, life in European courts and the preparation of treaties: culture and diplomacy already had strong connections” (Lane, 2013, p. 9). Despite

experiencing changes over time in terms of focus, goal and organizational, culture and French foreign policy are inseparable ever since.

One of the policy developments that given a shape into French cultural diplomacy today happened back in 2010, with the establishment of three new bodies in charge with the promotion of France's presence and influence abroad, in particular by implementing cultural activities, cooperation and partnership (p. 22). Those bodies are Établissement public à caractère industriel et commercial (Epic – to be known as Campus France), France Expertise Internationale and Institute Français. Campus France is responsible in promoting French higher education abroad alongside with promoting professional training opportunities, receiving foreign students and researchers, managing grants, trainee programmes and other form of exchanges for students and researchers. France Expertise Internationale is responsible in promoting French technical assistancy, expertise, and also supervising projects within the scheme of bilateral or multilateral funding. Meanwhile, the Institute Français duties are promoting French culture through partnership initiatives (p. 23-24).

Regarding culture, French MoFA operates a vast cultural network abroad with clearly defined objectives. The first objective is to bring French culture and the work of French artist to a wider audience around the world. The second is to build lasting networks, by doing so the demand from overseas artists and professionals can be heard and responded properly (French MoFA, 2013b). As of 1 January 2012, French Cooperation and Cultural Action Network consists of 8000 people distributed in 161 Cooperation and Cultural Action services, 101 Institute Français, 445 Alliances Français, 486 schools, 5 French National Centres, 26 research institutes and 14 branch offices, 161 Campus France and 98 Environmental Correspondents. This network is responsible for organising some 50.000 events every year.

On 17 July 2013, Laurent Fabius, French Minister for Foreign Affairs, presented what is called as "France's new cultural diplomacy". The goal of this new paradigm is to support France's economic recovery. The directive is to use some methods like promoting France's attractiveness, teaching the language and spreading its culture, and simplifying visa issuance for international students aspiring to study in France. All of the activities onwards must support the sectors with strategic meanings for France, such as tourism, research and

development and the promotion of culture (French MoFA, 2013d).

## **Why Film?**

Since the research was conducted limitedly only by interview and the officials of IFI did not grant access to the documents, it was impossible to dig the historical records of this film diplomacy activity. France has been long using film as its medium of diplomacy in Indonesia, but the exact starting time is unknown. From the interviews revealed that there are three main reasons why French embassy using film as its tool of diplomacy. The first reason is logistical reason. Film is considered an easy media to use. The Director of IFI says that to bring film is not as expensive and as complex as a full orchestra or exhibition. The second reason is because it can illustrate situation of what is happening in all over the world, or in France specifically. The Audiovisual Coordinator says that cinema is a perfect way to promote French culture, since from it you can see the landscape, the culture, and a lot of stuffs. The last reason is because France is one of the most prominence and biggest film producers in the world so it is inevitable not to exploit it potential for diplomacy. Statistically, France is among top ten largest film producers in the world. Between 1995 to 2008.

France produced 240 films annually in average.

Given the range of activities employed, it is understandable that the French embassy's film diplomacy is not only targeting to get more audience for their film screenings, but also to get participants for other kind of activities besides screenings and to make partners with Indonesian entities such as government institutions, schools and universities, film communities, people from film industry, and private company. The Director of IFI explains that the aim of French film diplomacy is not only to show what the French have done or doing to the audience, but also to forge links between Indonesian and French citizens especially the ones in culture and film industry to hand in hand developing Indonesian film industry based on mutual advantage. As stated by the Director of IFI, they have to work with the cinemas, the festivals (such as Jakarta International Film Festival and Indonesia International Fantastic Film Festival), the people who buy French films, actors, directors, producers, and so on, for the whole year in a regular cooperation thus by doing so the presence of France in the field can be felt. So, it is more accurate to say that there are

three categories of French embassy's target in film diplomacy: the audience, the participants and the partners.

Young people between ages 17-27 is the target of French cultural diplomacy in Indonesia. The Audiovisual Coordinator also says that although film can target everybody from all ages, but young people are the main target. Specifically, IFI is targeting the best students from the best schools in Indonesia. The director says that they are the key target, recognizing their potential to shape Indonesia's future. He says "they are coming from the best universities, they will have the best job in Indonesia either in public or in private sectors." The Audiovisual Coordinator also specifically says that students that are taking French language course provided by IFI or taking French language course in their school or as their major in university are the primary target, as they have already had an interest in France. She mentions that these students are the ambassador of French culture in Indonesia.

For partners, IFI is targeting intellectuals, creators, universities, film communities, and professionals in film industry as well as public and private institutions. One of the strategies the French embassy/IFI doing is by coming to every event about cinema, where they can meet with people from the industry and talk to them about potential cooperation in the future. By doing this they can meet the right people to cooperate with. The way IFI chooses and engages the targets as consequence of range of activities offered indicates the kind of approach used in its film diplomacy.

## **Challenges**

Nebiat Assegid contends that the execution of public diplomacy activities is unavoidable from facing challenges, and each challenge is unique depending on the country practicing it and where and how it is practiced (Assegid, 2011, p. 47). The interviews uncovered two main challenges of France film diplomacy in Indonesia, both of them related to Indonesian opinion about French films. The Director of IFI points out that the image of France that most of Indonesian have in mind is the main challenge for them to overcome. For most Indonesian, as Director of IFI has been observed, France is seen as a difficult, sophisticated and complex cultural country. No exception when it comes to films. The Director of IFI tells his story about every time he tried to approach Indonesian film



distributors or theatre operators to buy and show French films in their theatres, the common responses from them usually like: "it is difficult for us to sell French films because people are afraid of French films."

The second challenge is the lack of education about film for most Indonesian. The Director of IFI compares the situation in Indonesia and in France, where he puts that in France it is normal for people to watch film from all over the world. In France's local cinemas they got American blockbuster in this week, but next week people also can see South African, Argentinean or any another country's film with various genres. That is not the case with Indonesia. Based on his observation, the Director of IFI says that many Indonesian films released every year, but only few of them are really good. Besides Indonesian films, Hollywood-made are the main source for Indonesian to watch.

## **Conclusion**

The findings of this research point to the result that the French embassy is able to skilfully juggle film as a medium of diplomacy using both approaches: messaging and relationship building. Film diplomacy is even being conducted using both approaches intertwined within one event. IFI has been cleverly creating initiatives using film that are enabling them not only to sell their country but also to engage and build good and fruitful relationships with Indonesian public. French embassy astuteness in exploiting all aspects of film (production, distribution and exhibition) shows that film and diplomacy are compatible. The range of various activities offered by the embassy is clearly very well planned based on goals they want to achieve and targets they want to touch. Local conditions are also taken into consideration, making it easier for them to win the hearts and minds of their targets.

This study revealed two main objectives of French film diplomacy in Indonesia: economical and cultural. France is aiming to penetrate the market and have more French film to be shown in Indonesian cinema for economical reasons. With respect to cultural, building long lasting partnership with Indonesian public is the ultimate objective. Besides those objectives, French film diplomacy is also aiming to preserve cultural diversity and challenge the well-established Hollywood hegemony in Indonesia, and to promote France expertise.

France has all the modalities to perform film diplomacy not only in Indonesia but in the whole world. First, France already has a historical advantage. Film has a long history in France and has contributed in shaping French culture and identity. French film heritage is also outstanding and recognized as one of the most prominent in the world. Second, French government fully supports its film development domestically and its film promotion abroad. The existence of clear policy with flexibility in implementation gives space to the French embassy to manoeuvre against the background of Indonesian culture. Third, the existence of the operating agency under the embassy has helped the French's cultural diplomacy to run precisely, where film diplomacy is handled by the right people.

Even though this research is not intended to find out the effect of French film diplomacy in Indonesia and the evidence is limited, but from the interviews it can be seen as an early indication that French embassy/IFI generosity to offer space for Indonesian public to perform their film activities and to promote Indonesian film has a positive effect.

However, other works in the field of film diplomacy need to be done in the future. The effects of the film diplomacy and the coordination between internal institutions are among the most important issues to be raised. This topic of film diplomacy is useful for the policymakers since it is practical, thus scholars need to put more attention into this area.



---

**Analysis The Success of Joint Ventures,  
Comparing the Case of the People's  
Republic of China with Indonesia**

**Analisis Keberhasilan Usaha Bersama,  
Membandingkan Kasus Republik Rakyat  
Cina dengan Indonesia**

---

Nama : Chellyvia Tri Wijayanti  
NIP : 198304182009012004  
Instansi : BKPM  
Tahun Intake : 2012  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : MSc International Business  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : University of Birmingham

## ABSTRACT

International Joint Ventures (IJVs) is one path for foreign companies to expand the business worldwide. IJVs also apply in China and Indonesia as part of Asian countries with a wide area and a huge market which will give the potential benefits for foreign companies to invest. However, there are a lot of factors that will be faced by foreign companies doing the partnership with local companies and also will affect the performance of IJVs in both countries. The aims of this dissertation are to identify some of the factors that influence the success and the failures of the IJVs performances, to guide foreign investors being more effective in managing and maintaining IJVs in China and Indonesia, and to explore the differences doing IJVs in both countries.

This study was based on relevant literature review and in – depth case study to give the understanding of some factors that will affect the successful and the failure of IJVs in China and Indonesia. The findings suggest four factors affecting IJVs in China which are: ownership governance and control, mutual advantages of each partner, support from the related authorities, and management and relationship. Furthermore, the findings also suggest four factors affecting IJVs in Indonesia which are: management and relationship with the development of trust, mutual benefits of each partner, ownership and control, and desire to reach goals and objectives. Based on the findings, it also can be explored the differences between IJVs in China and Indonesia.

Key words: IJVs, JVs, China, Indonesia, Factors, Successful, Failure

## ABSTRAK

*International Joint Ventures* (IJV) merupakan salah satu jalur bagi perusahaan asing untuk mengembangkan bisnisnya di seluruh dunia. IJV juga berlaku di China dan Indonesia sebagai bagian dari negara-negara Asia dengan wilayah yang luas dan pasar yang besar yang akan memberi manfaat potensial bagi perusahaan asing untuk berinvestasi. Namun, ada banyak faktor yang akan dihadapi oleh perusahaan asing melakukan kemitraan dengan perusahaan lokal dan juga akan mempengaruhi kinerja IJV di kedua negara. Tujuan disertasi ini adalah untuk mengidentifikasi beberapa faktor yang mempengaruhi keberhasilan dan kegagalan pertunjukan IJV, untuk membimbing investor asing lebih efektif dalam mengelola dan memelihara IJV di China dan Indonesia, dan untuk mengeksplorasi perbedaan yang dilakukan IJV di kedua negara.

Penelitian ini didasarkan pada kajian literatur yang relevan dan studi kasus mendalam untuk memberi pemahaman beberapa faktor yang akan mempengaruhi keberhasilan dan kegagalan IJV di China dan Indonesia. Temuan tersebut menunjukkan empat faktor yang mempengaruhi IJV di China yaitu: tata kelola kepemilikan dan pengendalian, keuntungan bersama masing-masing mitra, dukungan dari pihak terkait, dan manajemen dan hubungan. Selanjutnya, temuan tersebut juga menyarankan empat faktor yang mempengaruhi IJV di Indonesia yaitu: manajemen dan hubungan dengan pengembangan kepercayaan, saling menguntungkan masing-masing pasangan, kepemilikan dan kontrol, dan keinginan untuk mencapai tujuan dan sasaran. Berdasarkan temuan tersebut, juga dapat dieksplorasi perbedaan antara IJV di China dan Indonesia.

Kata kunci: IJVs, JVs, China, Indonesia, Faktor, Sukses, Gagal

Nowadays, International Joint Ventures (IJVs) has been done in many Asian countries including China and Indonesia. China is viewed as one of the BRICS' countries that have abilities and potential factors to do the businesses competently and to attract the markets worldwide. Based on UNCTAD's report (2013), FDI was most frequently located 46% in China, 25% in Brazil, 17% in the Russian Federation and 10% in India. China has already become the world's second largest economic power in terms of Gross Domestic Product (GDP), based on China's rapid growth, a huge population and a large domestic market. As the second world's largest emerging economy and the leading destination of FDI in recent years, China plays an important role in the international strategies of many multinational corporations (MNCs) (Li, 2001). China's Open Door Policy' in 1978 has changed the political and business system. Since the renewing of the policy, JVs have been the most frequent entry mode for foreign companies expanding their business in China (Li et al.,2001:31). Yan (1999) mentioned of Harrigan's writing (1986) that Chinese government encourages IJVs as an ideal form for securing rapid access to capital, technology and export markets within a competitive and rapidly changing global economy. Although IJVs become one of the ways of the foreign companies to enter China, there are a lot of challenges that the companies should be faced. China has its own characteristics of JVs that cover the range of business sectors and the engaging partners of many different foreign nationalities (Yan, 1999).

Besides China, there is also Indonesia as one of the developing countries. Indonesia is known as one of emerging economies which has some potential aspects that will interest foreign companies to invest. Comparing to its neighbors' countries, Indonesia's economy rose by 6.2 percent in 2012 which made Indonesia as the fastest growing G20 economy after China. The rising of GDP growth in 2012 was based on the health of private consumption and a better performance in fixed-capital investment. Based on Indonesia investment law regulation, number 25 of 2007, foreign companies can start up their business in Indonesia by using foreign capital entirely or by doing joint capital with domestic capital. (joint venture with local).

Both of the countries have different characteristics in which should be understood by foreign companies that want to expand their businesses by IJVs. Therefore, it will be useful for the companies to learn how to manage IJVs to be

successful in both of the countries. Li et al. (2001) described the observation of the researchers (Beamish, 1988; Dacin, Hitt, & Levitas, 1997; Kogut, 1989; Lei, Slocum, & Pitts, 1997; Parkhe, 1993) about IJVs which mentioned that IJVs are difficult to manage, often leading to parent dissatisfaction and high failure rates. Douma (1997) mentioned that every company on JVs looks working together, but more than half the JVs are failure. Therefore, establishing successful of IJVs is not easy.

Dymsza (1988) has done the research about JVs in developing countries. JVs in developing countries typically include three parts: the multinational corporation (MNC), the national partner (which is often a local firm) and the host government. Dymsza (1988) explained about some of the key factors involving the success and the failure of JVs which are: the negotiation process determining the basic aspects of the venture, the start-up and learning period involving the principals in the arrangement, the strategic fit of the venture and its achievement, the appropriateness and flexibility of the venture agreement, the character of supplementary agreements, adaptation of the MNC to the country environment and culture, the adjustment of the MNC and national partners to each other's management style and culture, the management and functional conflicts between partners and host government to resolve conflict, the obsolescing bargain, and other changes in fundamental conditions. These factors show the complex relationship that will define the success and the failure of JVs in the developing countries' setting. Besides that, there are other possibilities to measure the performance of JVs.

The analysis of this paper will take the case studies from IJVs companies in China and Indonesia. The major focus for this study will concentrate on some factors that affect the successfulness and the failures of IJVs in China and Indonesia, and compare the difference ways of IJVs that should be done by foreign companies in both of the countries. By using the case studies, some of the factors related to the IJVs performances and development in both of the countries can be detected and studied further.

The purpose of this paper is to reach advance knowledge and more understanding about IJVs, especially for the performances that include successful and failure of IJVs. Specific objectives for this study are to:



- Identify the factors that make International Joint Ventures (IJVs) in China becoming successful and failed.
- Identify the factors that make International Joint Ventures (IJVs) in Indonesia becoming successful and failed.
- Explore the differences between International Joint Ventures (IJVs) in China and Indonesia.
- Formulate conclusion and recommendations for China and Indonesia on IJVs By exploring a variety of JV cases, it is expected that they not only can fulfill the purposes and the objectives of this study, but also give better pictures about JVs performances.

In environment efficiency side, SECCO develops HSSEQ the safety concept from Sinopec and BP. There are professional guidance and technological support for relevant departments as the HSSEQ team. In other condition, if there is a problem in production, the production managers should report and take the actions to handle it. By this safety concept, SECCO aims to increase environmental awareness among of its employees. Besides that, concerning for the environment, SECCO also sets up ambient air monitors which are the advanced technologies of environmental monitoring to monitor main characteristic of pollutants, so these will be useful to analyze abnormal situation. The ambient air monitors have accepted by the authorities and controlled by Shanghai Environmental Monitoring Center and Shanghai Meteorological Bureau. Even though in September 2011, there were an explosion and fire in one of SECCO's district, but there were not any casualties and any actual harm for the local environment.

In social efficiency side, SECCO presented the Social Impact Assessment process to ensure the construction is accepted and can give the advantage or benefit for local community. Moreover, SECCO gives road safety training for transportation contractors to decrease the risks in delivery the product to its customers. SECCO also generates job opportunities for local community. Furthermore, safety is one of the SECCO's core values related to the nature of chemical industry. The designing stage and the integrated safety practices of SECCO are taken from Sinopec and BP's concept. The originated concept of SECCO's HSE (Health, Safety and Environment) is adapted from BP, but it is developed into HSSEQ. In addition, because of the needing of open market

based on World Trade Regulation, Sinopec commits to develop its leaders to lead the organization in a global environment, so its leaders can understand the international business disciplines, ways of working and how to make foreign business and management concepts are acceptable to executives who were already been in Chinese cultures and politics. As a partner, BP gives the chance for Sinopec by sharing information about current business issues that related with the oil industry.

## **Ineffective Management and Relationship**

Dickinson (2007) on the report mentioned that Wahaha was not really comfort to have the relationship with the participants from out of Chinese companies (foreign companies). It became the beginning of ineffective relationship for both of them. Furthermore, in the situation of the JV structure of 51 – 49 equity, it gave not only the effect for the control of the JV, but also the relationship and management between both of the companies. In the structure of 51 - 49, it is important for foreign companies to control all of the JV operations, not only rely on the control to the board of directors.

Dickinson (2007) described that in China, the boards only have little control for the operation of the company. More control for the operation is held by the managing director or representative director and the general manager of the company. They have the power to regulate and act for the operation with little or probably no supervision from the board of directors. Therefore, in the situation of JV's company, it is important for the foreign company having the power to control and balance the managing director and the general manager of the JV's company. So that, the relationship and partnership among the partners will be effective and give the good benefit for the success of JV. Even though Danone was the majority shareholder which also had a majority interest on the board of directors, JV's day-to- day management was controlled by Mr. Zong.

Mr. Zong was the managing director of the JV who selected and directed the general manager and other staffs of the JV. He also filled the management with his family. Therefore, Danone's control of the board of directors became meaningless over the JV's company, even JV became successful under Mr. Zong management which proved by becoming the largest Chinese bottled water or Beverage Company that gaining about 15% of Chinese market. Dickinson (2007)

described that the Chinese thought that based on its works, it was unfair to share the profit with Danone. In the other hand, Chinese can be easier to manipulate the IJV when active supervisor was not in the place.

## **Legal Barrier**

In 2000, Mr. Zong with Wahaha Group created a competing non-joint venture companies. The companies competed not only by selling the same products as the JV's products and using the Wahaha trademark, but also by using the same sales staff working for the same sales company. The profits were divided between the JV and non-JV companies by Mr. Zong's direction. The formation of non-joint venture companies violated the trademark license and the JV agreement. Therefore, Danone learned it and decided that Wahaha breakdown the negotiation. Finally, both of them chose to arbitration and litigation. Both of them against each other which the arbitrations were held four times, in Stockholm, California, Hangzhou and China.

## **Differences of Goals and Objectives**

Besides Wahaha, Danone also built partnership with Bright Dairy for selling Danone brand yoghurt. Danone yoghurt became popular in the middle-eastern and middle- southern part of Chine with 15% share in 2006. Danone permitted Bright Dairy to dell other Danone Brands. Danone still looked another chance to boost its 15% market share. Therefore, Danone separated from Bright Dairy to create IJV with Mengniu to sell Danone's yoghurt and stopped the selling of Biyou youghurt by Bright Dairy. After one year, the JV with Mengniu broke. This experience gave the opportunistic multinational enterprise reputation to Danone. Even though Wahaha was not the competitors of Bright Daiiry and Mengniu, Wahaha worried about the changing from collaborator to competitor.

However, besides that, from the beginning, Wahaha as local partner wanted to learn the technical competencies from foreign companies. Wahaha thought that Danone did not help to improve the brand. Wahaha felt that Danone wanted to enter and learn the culture of local market without transferring technology to local partner. Zhang and Deusen (2010) described about the view from economic commentator (Wu) based on the Chinese version of the

Financial Times on April 10, 2007 that Danone had transferred technology to IJV in a certain degree, but the terms of techniques and knowledge became the grey area that can provoked the conflict between partners.

In the other hand, Wahaha searched for extra capital to develop its product again after losing and failed attracting customers. Because of that, Wahaha accepted to do JV with Danone, when Danone offered cash of \$450 million to become IJV's partner of Wahaha. Moreover, Wahaha also expected to invest in technology to develop its product quality. Therefore, Wahaha expected Danone gaining advanced technology information. Besides that, Wahaha expected to grow up its market leadership position. Wahaha also felt unsatisfied, because of the IJV's focuses only on bottled water and dairy products.

## **Ownership and Governance**

The clarity of ownership and governance of IJVs in both countries are important, because it will reduce the conflict among the local companies and foreign companies. It will be better for the foreign companies to understand about the culture and characteristic of local partners, so the problems of ownership and governance will be cleared from the beginning. The IJVs' agreement among the companies should be clear, to reduce the volatility and misunderstanding of the ownership and controls of IJVs.

## **Support from Related Authorities**

Support from related authorities is also important, especially from the government. Based on the case studies, the state-owned companies get the easiness of IJVs. The government gives more support that will help the IJVs companies develop the business. Furthermore, the government should give more attention to all of the IJVs companies, because it will also increase the investment in both countries. Therefore, the support and attention from related authorities are needed for the successful of IJVs.

## **Management and Relationship**

Effective Management and relationship is needed for the successful of IJVs, because it is the foundation of the relationship and partnership

among the companies. At the beginning, among the companies should manage the companies by giving the clear task of each division and maintaining good communication not only among the companies, but also among the executives and the staffs. Understanding the culture of local partner is also important.

### **Desire to Reach Goals and Objectives**

The same desire to reach goals and objectives is important, because the interests among the companies are different. Therefore, it is important to clear the goals and objectives among the companies starting up the IJVs partnership.

---

**Kepentingan Ekonomi dan Politik Korea Selatan dalam Implementasi Bantuan Bagi Program Reformasi Birokrasi di Indonesia Periode 2006-2012**

**Economic and Political Interests of South Korea in Implementation Assistance of Bureaucratic Reforms Program in Indonesia Period 2006- 2012**

---

Nama : Diah Eka Palupi  
NIP : 198005102008012032  
Instansi : BKN  
Tahun Intake : 2013  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Local  
Program Studi : Hubungan Internasional-Reguler  
Negara Studi : Indonesia  
Universitas : Universitas Indonesia

## ABSTRAK

Penelitian ini menginvestigasi kepentingan bantuan hibah bagi reformasi birokrasi di Indonesia yang diberikan Pemerintah Korea Selatan dan pengaruh bantuan tersebut bagi iklim investasi di Indonesia. Untuk menganalisis hal tersebut, peneliti menggunakan pemikiran A. Maurits Van Der Veen yang mengatakan bantuan digunakan sebagai alat pencapaian kepentingan nasional dan menggunakan teknik analisis metode kualitatif dengan sifat analisis deskriptif. Penelitian ini menyimpulkan adanya kepentingan ekonomi dan politik yang diusung Pemerintah Korea Selatan di balik bantuan yang diberikan dan bantuan tersebut memberi kontribusi bagi perkembangan investasi Korea Selatan di Indonesia. Namun demikian, peningkatan investasi tersebut bukan hanya didorong oleh pembenahan birokrasi di Indonesia tetapi juga disebabkan faktor lain seperti adanya peningkatan pungutan pajak yang dibebankan Pemerintah Korea Selatan kepada para pengusaha sehingga memicu pengalihan modal ke negara lain.

Kata kunci: Grant aid (hibah), enhance governance, bantuan luar negeri, reformasi birokrasi,

## ABSTRACT

This study investigates the interests of grant aid for bureaucratic reform in Indonesia given the South Korean government and the effect of such aid for the investment climate in Indonesia. To analyze this, the researcher used the thought of A. Maurits Van Der Veen who say aid is used as a means of achieving national interests and use qualitative methods of analysis techniques with nature descriptive analysis. This study concludes that there is economic and political interests that brought the South Korean government behind the assistance provided and the assistance contributed to the development of South Korean investment in Indonesia. However, the increase in investment is not only driven by bureaucratic reform in Indonesia but also due to other factors such as an increase in the tax levy charged the South Korean government to employers that triggers the transfer of capital to other countries.

Keywords: Grant Aid (grant), enhance governance, foreign aid, bureaucratic reform, economic interests, South Korea, Indonesia.



Kondisi birokrasi Indonesia yang melayani masyarakat secara efektif dan efisien termasuk dalam perizinan usaha, menjadi kebutuhan sejumlah pihak yang akan melakukan aktivitas bisnisnya di Indonesia. Potensi yang dimiliki Indonesia menjadi daya tarik sejumlah pengusaha untuk melakukan bisnisnya di negeri ini. Jumlah penduduk yang besar merupakan satu dari sekian daya tarik Indonesia karena kuantitas penduduk yang besar memberikan peluang daya serap pasar yang tinggi terhadap produk-produk perdagangan. Pada tahun 2004, penduduk Indonesia berjumlah 238.452.952 jiwa. Posisi tiga besar negara penduduk terbanyak dipegang oleh China dengan jumlah 1.298.847.624, India terbesar kedua dengan jumlah penduduk 1.065.070.607 dan Amerika Serikat menempati posisi terbesar ketiga dengan jumlah penduduk 293.027.571. Potensi jumlah penduduk merupakan daya tarik tersendiri bagi para pengusaha domestik maupun asing untuk melakukan aktivitas perdagangan dan investasi karena tentunya dapat mendatangkan keuntungan ekonomi yang signifikan bagi para pelaku usaha.

Dalam level internasional, salah satu negara yang aktif pada sektor perdagangan dan investasi adalah Korea Selatan. Pada awal tahun 2005, Korea Selatan dan negara-negara ASEAN menggelar perundingan ASEAN-Korea Free Trade Area (AKFTA). Kegiatan tersebut diselenggarakan dengan tujuan untuk memacu percepatan aliran barang, jasa, dan investasi di antara negara-negara anggota sehingga dapat terbentuk suatu kawasan perdagangan bebas. Kerangka Perjanjian Kerja Sama Ekonomi Menyeluruh (Framework Agreement on Comprehensive Economic Cooperation) AKFTA dapat ditandatangani oleh para kepala negara ASEAN dan Korea Selatan di Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia pada 13 Desember 2005.

Kesepakatan tersebut juga dilakukan dalam rangka menekan segala hal yang dinilai dapat menghambat aktivitas perdagangan dan investasi di antara negara Korea Selatan dan negara-negara ASEAN. Pada tanggal 4 Desember 2006 Korea Selatan dan Indonesia menandatangani kerangka utama kerjasama bilateral Indonesia - Korea Selatan yang bernama *Join Declaration Between The Republic of Indonesia and The Republic of Korea on Strategic Partnership to Promote Friendship and Cooperation in the 21st Century*. *Strategic Partnership* yang dimaksud meliputi kerjasama politik dan keamanan, kerjasama ekonomi, investasi dan perdagangan, kerjasama teknologi dan ilmu pengetahuan

serta kerjasama sosial budaya. Salah satu bentuk kerjasama ekonomi, investasi dan perdagangan diwujudkan dalam kerjasama pembangunan yang menempatkan penataan pemerintah sebagai salah satu sektor prioritas. Penataan pemerintahan yang dimaksud diwujudkan dalam bentuk pengucuran bantuan grant aid (hibah) yang dikelola oleh Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade (MoFAT) dan disampaikan kepada Pemerintah Indonesia melalui Korea International Cooperation Agency (KOICA). Bantuan yang diberikan dengan title Capacity Building Program For Public Official for Government Innovation in Indonesia. Program tersebut diberikan untuk mendorong pelaksanaan reformasi birokrasi di Indonesia. Penandatanganan kesepakatan pemberian bantuan Korea Selatan bagi Program Reformasi Birokrasi di Indonesia, terjadi saat Pemerintah Korea Selatan berada dalam kepemimpinan Roh Moo-hyun. Di masa pemerintahan Roh Moo-hyun, pemerintahan dijalankan dengan fokus utama mengembangkan segala potensi baik di dalam maupun di luar negeri untuk mendukung pertumbuhan di sektor perekonomian. Selain itu, pada masa Pemerintahan Roh Moo-hyun, Korea Selatan mencoba untuk mengembangkan diri menjadi pusat perekonomian Asia Timur Laut.

Sementara itu dalam implementasi Program Reformasi Birokrasi oleh Pemerintah Indonesia, sepanjang tahun 2008-2012, sebanyak 36 kementerian dan lembaga negara telah menerapkan reformasi, sementara 25 lainnya masih menunggu persetujuan. Beberapa pemerintah daerah juga mulai melakukan reformasi pelayanan publik mereka. Pemerintah telah mengidentifikasi delapan area untuk perbaikan, antara lain, pemberian layanan publik, refitting organisasi, proses bisnis, pemangkasan regulasi, monitoring dan evaluasi serta akuntabilitas.

Pasca implementasi reformasi birokrasi, iklim investasi dan usaha di Indonesia mulai membaik. Nampak dari menurunnya waktu, prosedur, dan biaya yang ditempuh untuk memulai usaha. Ini merupakan indikasi adanya perbaikan dalam sistem birokrasi Indonesia sehingga tercipta iklim usaha yang lebih memudahkan investor dan pengusaha menjalankan bisnisnya. Salah satu upaya pemerintah menguatkan iklim investasi adalah dengan menyederhanakan perizinan melalui pengefektifan fungsi pelayanan terpadu satu pintu. Pada tahun 2013, telah terbangun 468 Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu (PTSP) di 33 provinsi, 339 kabupaten, 93 kota, dan 3 kawasan perdagangan bebas

dan pelabuan bebas. Selain itu, pada rentang tahun 2012-2013 telah pula dilakukan penyederhanaan prosedur dalam bidang penanaman modal dengan terhubungnya Sistem Pelayanan Informasi dan Perizinan Investasi Secara Elektronik (SPIPISE) di 60 kabupaten/kota dengan Badan Koordinasi Penanaman Modal (BKPM).

Sementara itu dalam sektor investasi, data menunjukkan bahwa realisasi investasi Korea Selatan di Indonesia terus meningkat bahkan hingga pada tahun 2013, nilai investasi dari Korea Selatan mencapai USD 2,2 miliar. Nilai tersebut telah melebihi nilai investasi Korea Selatan pada tahun 2012 dan menempatkan Korea Selatan sebagai investor terbesar ke-4 di Indonesia setelah Jepang, Singapura dan Amerika Serikat. Dalam data di atas tergambar jelas, dibandingkan investasi Korea Selatan saat bantuan bagi program reformasi birokrasi belum digulirkan ke Indonesia oleh Pemerintah Korea Selatan (tahun 2005) mengalami pergerakan positif sejak tahun 2006 hingga tahun 2012 seiring dengan dukungan pembenahan birokrasi yang diberikan Pemerintah Korea Selatan kepada Indonesia. Penurunan nilai investas terjadi pada tahun 2008 dan 2010 sebagai imbas krisis global.

Berdasarkan data-data perkembangan positif dalam sektor perdagangan dan investasi Korea Selatan ke Indonesia pasca ditandatanganinya kesepakatan kerjasama pengucuran bantuan bagi reformasi di Indonesia, penulis merumuskan sejumlah pertanyaan penelitian sebagai berikut:

### **“Mengapa Pemerintah Korea Selatan memberikan bantuan bagi Program Reformasi Birokrasi di Indonesia pada tahun 2006 hingga tahun 2012 ?”**

Pembatasan waktu dalam penelitian ini dimulai pada tahun 2006, yang merupakan waktu digelarnya penandatanganan kesepakatan pemberian bantuan, hingga tahun 2012 yang merupakan akhir dari pemerintahan Presiden Lee-Myung-bak. Pada kurun waktu 2006-2012, Korea Selatan berada di bawah kepemimpinan Presiden Roh Moo-hyun (2004-2008) dan Presiden Lee Myung-bak (2008-2012).

Penelitian ini bertujuan menganalisis apa sebenarnya kepentingan yang menjadi latar belakang antusiasme Korea Selatan dalam pengucuran bantuan bagi penataan birokrasi di Indonesia, apakah hal itu murni sebagai bentuk

kepedulian Korea Selatan sebagai negara maju kepada negara berkembang ataukah memiliki kepentingan tertentu yang menjadi tujuan dari pengucuran bantuan tersebut. Manfaat penelitian ini adalah hasil dari penelitian diharapkan dapat menjadi referensi tambahan yang dapat menjadi pertimbangan dalam menyusun langkah yang tepat menyikapi setiap bantuan yang diberikan negara asing kepada Indonesia.

## **Perubahan Status Korea Selatan dari Resipien Menjadi Pendorong Bantuan**

Seiring dengan pertumbuhan ekonomi Korea Selatan yang berkembang signifikan, pada tahun 1996 Korea Selatan menjadi anggota Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) dan sepuluh tahun kemudian mendaftarkan diri menjadi anggota Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development- Development Assistance Committee (OECD-DAC). DAC kemudian melakukan review atas kerja sama pembangunan yang dilakukan Korea Selatan dengan sejumlah negara untuk kemudian hasilnya menjadi pertimbangan meloloskan atau tidak Korea Selatan sebagai anggota DAC.

Posisi Korea Selatan menjadi anggota resmi OECD-DAC akhirnya diputuskan dalam sidang khusus DAC yang berlangsung pada tanggal 25 November 2009 di Paris, Prancis yang didasarkan pada hasil laporan DAC. Dalam laporan tersebut dinyatakan bahwa Korea Selatan telah memenuhi semua kriteria keanggotaan DAC. Dengan menjadi anggota Komite Bantuan Pengembangan DAC, Korea Selatan menjadi negara pertama yang statusnya berubah dari negara penerima bantuan menjadi negara donor sejak OECD didirikan pada tahun 1961.

Majunya perekonomian Korea Selatan menempatkan Negara tersebut pada posisi negara yang mampu memberikan bantuannya kepada negara lain. Dalam kurun waktu tahun 2000 hingga tahun 2010 Korea Selatan mengucurkan bantuan dengan komposisi paling banyak diarahkan kepada negara-negara Asia terutama Irak, Vietnam, Indonesia dan Srilanka. Pada periode tersebut, alokasi ODA Korea Selatan di Asia diberikan dengan jumlah tertinggi yakni 81%.

Sejumlah pakar sempat mengkritisi alokasi bantuan yang sangat berfokus di Asia di dibandingkan dengan regional lainnya. Padahal sejumlah negara di Asia yang mendapat bantuan merupakan negara dengan pertumbuhan ekonomi terbilang cepat seperti Vietnam, Indonesia dan Srilanka di mana ketiga negara

itu tidak termasuk kategori negara miskin. Bantuan yang diberikan Korea Selatan kepada Irak dan Afghanistan untuk rekonstruksi pascakonflik di wilayah tersebut juga mendapat kritikan dari sejumlah pihak. Para pihak itu menilai bantuan yang diberikan Korea Selatan bukan sekadar komitmen untuk mengurangi kemiskinan di wilayah tersebut tetapi lebih kepada strategi Korea Selatan mempertahankan kemitraan keamanan strategis dengan Amerika Serikat. Sebagai salah satu penyikapan terhadap kritik mengenai kecenderungan alokasi bantuan Korea Selatan kepada Asia, beberapa tahun kemudian Korea Selatan berusaha menyeimbangkan alokasi bantuannya ke regional lain, salah satunya Afrika. Pada tahun 2008, alokasi bantuan Korea Selatan ke Asia berkurang menjadi 50-an% dan alokasi bantuan ke Afrika ditingkatkan hingga hampir mencapai 20%. Alokasi bantuan Korea Selatan ke Afrika terutama diarahkan kepada Angola dan Ghana yang merupakan negara penghasil minyak. Sebagai anggota DAC, Korea Selatan diarahkan untuk memfokuskan bantuannya kepada sejumlah sektor demi mengefektifkan penggunaan bantuan. Atas arahan tersebut, Korea Selatan kemudian berkomitmen untuk memfokuskan bantuannya pada tujuh sektor yakni: pendidikan, kesehatan, tata kelola pemerintahan, pembangunan pedesaan, teknologi informasi dan komunikasi, industri dan energi, serta lingkungan dan gender.

## **ODA Korea Selatan untuk Indonesia**

ODA Korea terhadap Indonesia sebagian dikelola bersama oleh Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade (MoFAT) dan Ministry of Strategy and Finance (MoSF). Pembagian pengelolaan ODA terbagi atas hibah (grant) dikelola oleh MoFAT sedangkan pinjaman (loan) dikelola oleh MoSF. Dalam mengelola hibah, MoFAT menunjuk salah satu lembaga di bawahnya yaitu Korea International Cooperation Agency (KOICA). KOICA adalah lembaga kerjasama pembangunan Pemerintah Korea yang bertanggung jawab dalam mengelola hibah terhadap negara-negara berkembang. KOICA didirikan berdasarkan kebutuhan akan penyaluran program bantuan internasional Korea kepada negara-negara berkembang. Kerjasama yang dijalin berupa kerjasama teknik. Dalam memformulasikan kebijakan dan program MoFAT ke dalam bentuk program kerjasama dan akan diawasi langsung oleh MoFAT sendiri dan kementerian lainnya yang berkaitan dengan pelaksanaan program. Sementara itu pinjaman

EDCF dikelola Korea Export-Import Bank (Koexim) sebagai salah satu unit usaha MoSF. Koexim adalah lembaga kredit ekspor resmi yang menyediakan program kredit ekspor dan memfasilitasi perusahaan Korea dalam melakukan bisnis di luar negeri. Selain mengelola EDCF, Koexim juga bertanggung jawab untuk mengelola kredit ekspor yang merupakan layanan utama lembaga ini.

Dalam skema EDCF, bantuan pertama Korea Selatan untuk Indonesia diberikan pada tahun 1987 yakni berupa dana untuk pembangunan jalan lintas Padang, Sumatera Barat senilai US\$ 13 Juta. Dalam rentang tahun 1987 hingga tahun 2009, Indonesia adalah negara penerima dana bantuan terbesar kedua di antara 47 negara penerima bantuan tersebut, yang mendapat bantuan senilai US\$ 405 juta yang diperuntukkan bagi 16 proyek.

Selanjutnya pada EDCF periode tahun 2007-2008, Korea Selatan memberikan bantuan sebesar US\$149,9 juta yang digunakan untuk pembaruan beberapa rumah sakit dan pembangunan infrastruktur di Padang. Kemudian pada EDCF periode 2010-2013 Pemerintah Korea Selatan memberikan bantuan pinjaman kepada Indonesia sebesar US\$600 juta untuk tiga sektor pembangunan prioritas salah satunya pembangunan waduk Karian di Banten. Sementara itu melalui KOICA, Korea Selatan sudah memberikan bantuan kepada Indonesia sejak KOICA didirikan.

Kerjasama antara Pemerintah Korea Selatan dan Indonesia makin dikuatkan dengan penandatanganan Joint Declaration on Strategic Partnership to Promote Friendship and Cooperation in the 21st Century berdasarkan pertemuan Presiden Indonesia Yudoyono dan Presiden Korea Selatan saat itu Roh Moo-hyun, pada Desember 2006. Salah satu poin yang menjadi bagian dari kesepakatan adalah bahwa kedua negara akan bekerjasama untuk mempromosikan tata pemerintahan yang baik (good governance

Kemudian, mencapai reformasi administrasi dan pemerintahan yang baik juga terdaftar sebagai tujuan pertama dari RPJMN Pemerintah Indonesia. Seiring dengan tujuan proyek ini, sangat diharapkan akan tercipta birokrasi yang lebih transparan dan efektif di Indonesia. Penandatanganan kesepakatan kedua negara dilakukan di Jakarta pada tanggal 4-5 Desember 2006.

## **Kesimpulan**

Bantuan Luar Negeri yang diberikan Korea Selatan bagi Program Reformasi Birokrasi di Indonesia merupakan bagian dari prioritas kerjasama bilateral kedua

negara. Irisan kepentingan kedua negara melandasi kesepakatan pentingnya pembenahan birokrasi Indonesia segera dilakukan. Di satu sisi, Korea Selatan pada masa pemerintahan Presiden Roh Moo-hyun mengusung kebijakan ekonomi sebagai kebijakan utama dan pembenahan birokrasi Indonesia merupakan salah satu solusi atas problematika yang dihadapi para pengusaha Korea Selatan yang melakukan aktivitas bisnis di Indonesia, sementara di sisi lain Indonesia dalam masa pemerintahan Presiden Susilo Bambang Yudoyono periode tahun 2004-2009 berkomitmen melanjutkan agenda reformasi birokrasi yang telah diusung oleh pemerintahan sebelumnya.

Sebagai upaya mempererat kerjasama Indonesia - Korea Selatan, tanggal 4 Desember 2006 Pemerintah Korea Selatan dan Indonesia menandatangani Joint Declaration on Strategic Partnership to Promote Friendship and Cooperation in the 21st Century. Salah satu poin yang menjadi bagian dari kesepakatan adalah bahwa kedua negara akan bekerjasama untuk mempromosikan tata pemerintahan yang baik (*good governance*). Melalui kerjasama tersebut, kolaborasi kedua negara diharapkan dapat membangun birokrasi yang lebih transparan dan efektif di Indonesia.

Dalam implementasinya, kesepakatan Joint Declaration on Strategic Partnership to Promote Friendship and Cooperation in the 21st Century memuat empat pilar kerjasama kedua negara. Kerjasama itu meliputi sektor politik dan keamanan, sektor ekonomi, perdagangan dan investasi, sektor teknologi dan ilmu pengetahuan serta sektor sosial kebudayaan. Kerjasama sektor ekonomi, perdagangan dan investasi salah satunya direalisasikan melalui kerjasama pembangunan menggunakan *grant aid* (hibah) yang dikucurkan Pemerintah Korea Selatan bagi sektor *governance*. *Enhance of Governance* merupakan sektor prioritas kerjasama bilateral Indonesia-Korea Selatan yang kemudian diwujudkan dalam Program Capacity Building For Public Officials in Government Innovation. *Grant aid* ODA Korea Selatan dikelola oleh Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade (MoFAT) melalui KOICA.

Dari analisis yang telah dilakukan, Penelitian ini menemukan adanya kepentingan ekonomi dan politik yang diusung Pemerintah Korea Selatan di balik pengucuran bantuan bagi program reformasi birokrasi di Indonesia. Pengelolaan *grant aid* ODA oleh Kementerian Luar Negeri dan Perdagangan Korea Selatan dan dijadikannya program capacity building sebagai salah satu

implementasi kerjasama pembangunan dari sektor ekonomi, perdagangan dan investasi dalam Joint Declaration on Strategic Partnership to Promote Friendship and Cooperation in the 21st Century, menjadi sinyal pertama bahwa implementasi hibah akan diarahkan pada pencapaian kepentingan ekonomi Korea Selatan. Sementara itu jika berkaca pada agenda liberalisasi yang kini sedang mendapat dukungan dari negara-negara internasional, penelitian ini pun menangkap adanya misi pencapaian agenda tersebut dalam inisiasi Korea Selatan untuk turut mendukung pelaksanaan reformasi birokrasi di Indonesia. Dengan terciptanya birokrasi Indonesia yang efektif efisien khususnya dalam prosedur perizinan usaha, akan memudahkan para pebisnis Korea Selatan melakukan aktivitas investasi dan ekspornya di Indonesia.

Terbukanya pasar Indonesia bagi arus modal dan penyerapan barang-barang produksi Korea Selatan akan mendukung peningkatan pertumbuhan ekonomi Korea Selatan. Jika ini terjadi maka target kepentingan ekonomi Pemerintahan Korea Selatan di bawah kepemimpinan Roh Moo-hyun di mana pada era pemerintahan inilah bantuan Korea Selatan diluncurkan akan semakin mudah terpenuhi. Potensi Indonesia dalam hal jumlah penduduk yang besar, sumber daya alam yang melimpah dan tenaga kerja berkarakter produktivitas tinggi, juga menjadi daya tarik yang menggiurkan bagi para pebisnis Korea Selatan. Penduduk yang besar menyimpan potensi daya serap tinggi terhadap produk-produk Korea Selatan, keberlimpahan sumber daya alam memberikan jaminan suplai bahan mentah bagi Korea Selatan dan tenaga kerja yang berkarakter positif akan mendukung produktivitas industri-industri Korea Selatan yang berdiri di Indonesia. Potensi-potensi tersebut jika dikelola secara maksimal tentu akan memberikan keuntungan signifikan bagi perekonomian Korea Selatan.

Selain adanya kepentingan ekonomi, penelitian ini juga merumuskan adanya kepentingan politik yang diusung Pemerintah Korea Selatan dalam pengucuran bantuan bagi Program Reformasi Birokrasi di Indonesia. Melalui ODA, Korea Selatan ingin menunjukkan komitmennya selaku negara anggota OECD yang mendukung Program Millenium Development Goals (MDG), di mana pada poin ke delapan MDG mengarahkan adanya kerjasama global dalam kerjasama pembangunan. Kepercayaan dunia terhadap keseriusan Korea Selatan dalam menerapkan komitmen MDG tentunya akan meningkatkan



reputasi Korea Selatan di mata negara-negara lain di dunia. Kepentingan ekonomi dan pembentukan reputasi menurut A. Maurits Van Der Veen memang menjadi bagian dari kerangka umum tujuan bantuan luar negeri yang dikucurkan negara donor kepada negara resipien.

Dalam realitas di lapangan dukungan pemerintah Korea Selatan bagi pembenahan reformasi birokrasi Indonesia menunjukkan hasil yang signifikan khususnya dalam perbaikan prosedur pengurusan izin usaha di Indonesia. Pada pantauan tahun 2011 (data per Juli) yang termuat dalam Doing Business di Indonesia 2012, hasil publikasi bersama Bank Dunia dan International Finance Corporation (IFC), prosedur pengurusan izin usaha menjadi lebih ringkas yakni hanya 8 prosedur, padahal pada tahun 2005 para pengusaha harus merampungkan 12 prosedur untuk dapat mengantongi izin usaha. Selain itu proses pengurusan usaha yang pada tahun 2005 memakan waktu selama 151 hari, maka pada tahun 2012 berkurang menjadi 45 hari. Sementara itu sejak laporan Doing Business di Indonesia 2010 diterbitkan (data tahun 2009), hingga kondisi pada tahun 2011 rata-rata waktu dan biaya untuk mendirikan usaha di kota-kota di Indonesia berkurang sebanyak lebih dari 25%. Dalam gambar 4.1 berikut ini terangkum paparan kondisi pengurusan iklim usaha sebelum Pemerintah Korea Selatan memberikan bantuannya bagi pembenahan birokrasi di Indonesia dan bagaimana bantuan tersebut telah mendorong terjadinya pembenahan prosedur birokrasi dalam pendirian usaha di Indonesia.

---

## **Transaction-Costs, Institutional Perspective and Entry Mode Choices: Ford's Market Entry in Indonesia**

### **Biaya Transaksi, Perspektif Institusional dan Pilihan Pola Masuk: Layanan Pasar Ford di Indonesia**

---

Nama : Eka Fitri Laeli  
NIP : 198705192010122001  
Instansi : BKPM  
Tahun Intake : 2015  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : MSc International Business  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : University of Liverpool

Perkembangan teknologi yang canggih disertai dengan persaingan global telah mengubah cara perusahaan-perusahaan multinasional dalam melakukan bisnis. Banyak perusahaan multinasional menggeser basis produksi mereka dari negara maju ke negara berkembang untuk mencari konsumen baru, tenaga kerja serta biaya produksi yang murah. Uppsala Model menyatakan bahwa ketika perusahaan melakukan internasionalisasi, mereka mulai dari negara yang dekat secara geografi dan budaya ke negara yang lebih jauh, dan secara bertahap mulai dari ekspor sampai ke mode operasional yang lebih menuntut seperti pendirian anak perusahaan di luar negeri. Namun, argumen ini tidak sepenuhnya benar, karena *entry mode* adalah fenomena yang kompleks (Kim dan Hwang, 1992). Memilih *entry mode* yang tepat merupakan keputusan yang krusial karena dapat mempengaruhi kinerja perusahaan di masa mendatang. Oleh karena itu perusahaan perlu mempertimbangkan faktor-faktor spesifik terkait perusahaan, industri dan negara target.

Teori tradisional mengenai *entry mode* adalah teori biaya transaksi (*transaction-costs*) yang didasarkan pada karya Williamson (1975). Teori tersebut menyatakan bahwa perusahaan mencari cara yang paling efisien untuk mengatur jalannya suatu kegiatan. Maksudnya ialah perusahaan mendukung struktur organisasi yang meminimalisir biaya ketika melakukan transaksi di luar negeri, seperti biaya untuk pencarian informasi, negosiasi dan pemantauan kinerja mitra bisnis mereka (Agarwal dan Ramaswami, 1992).

Seperti telah disebutkan sebelumnya, internasionalisasi dan penentuan lokasi atau cara-cara ekspansi di luar negeri bukanlah hal yang mudah dan tidak dapat dijelaskan oleh satu teori saja. Pernyataan ini didukung oleh Delios dan Beamish (1999) yang menambahkan variabel kelembagaan (*institutional*). Tidak seperti biaya transaksi yang fokus pada pemanfaatan kemampuan spesifik perusahaan, teori institusional mempertimbangkan kondisi negara tujuan. Kebanyakan literatur memang mengutamakan alasan-alasan ekonomi dan mengabaikan lingkungan negara target (Demirbag dkk, 2008). Padahal terdapat perbedaan institusional yang signifikan antara negara maju dan berkembang (Khanna dan Palepu, 2010).

Mengambil studi kasus Ford Motor Company, perusahaan otomotif raksasa dunia tersebut mengikuti tren internasionalisasi dan berekspansi ke Asia. Asia dianggap sebagai pasar terbuka dan besar. Selain itu, Asia merupakan

pemasok dan konsumen otomotif yang besar. Di Asia, Ford hadir pertama kali di Cina dan kemudian merambah ke Asia Tenggara untuk memaksimalkan potensi pertumbuhannya. Berdasarkan situs Ford, wilayah Asia Pasifik merupakan pasar terbesar kedua bagi Ford setelah Amerika Utara.

Dalam kasus Ford, perusahaan menerapkan strategi yang berbeda ketika memasuki negara tujuan. Di Thailand, misalnya, Ford membentuk aliansi dengan Mazda Motor Corporation dan membangun pabrik manufaktur. Di Myanmar, Ford masuk ke negara itu setelah serangkaian reformasi dan pencabutan pembatasan impor. Sementara itu di Indonesia, Ford membentuk anak perusahaan yang dimiliki sepenuhnya (*wholly-owned subsidiary*) di bawah nama PT Ford Motor Indonesia (FMI). Anak perusahaan ini mendistribusikan produk Ford dan menyediakan layanan purna jual.

Penelitian ini difokuskan pada analisis entry mode Ford di Indonesia. Indonesia dianggap sebagai sampel negara yang baik karena menunjukkan pertumbuhan industri yang signifikan dalam dua dekade terakhir. Selain itu, lingkungan kelembagaan di Indonesia menarik untuk diteliti, yaitu pada periode pertengahan 1990-an sampai ke 2000-an, sebelum Ford memasuki negeri ini. Penelitian sebelumnya cenderung fokus pada negara China dan jarang meneliti negara-negara berkembang seperti Indonesia.

Makalah ini diharapkan dapat memperkaya pemahaman akademis mengenai pengaruh variabel biaya transaksi dan institusional pada pilihan entry mode. Studi teoritis dan empiris didasarkan pada tulisan Williamson (1975) dan Brouthers (2013). Secara khusus, makalah ini akan menjawab pertanyaan-pertanyaan sebagai berikut ;

1. Bagaimana pengaruh variabel biaya transaksi dan institusional pada pilihan *entry mode*?
2. Apakah faktor penentu utama Ford masuk ke Indonesia?
3. Mengapa Ford memilih untuk mengadopsi model anak perusahaan yang sepenuhnya dimiliki (*wholly-owned subsidiary*) daripada usaha patungan (*joint venture*) di Indonesia?

Selanjutnya, makalah ini membahas kajian literatur yang komprehensif yang menyoroti *entry mode* berdasarkan teori biaya transaksi dan teori institusional. Bab ketiga membahas kerangka kerja konseptual sementara bab empat berkaitan dengan metodologi dan data. Bagian analisis dan pembahasan

masuk ke dalam Bab lima, sedangkan Bab enam atau terakhir merupakan kesimpulan dan saran.

## Metode Penelitian

Penelitian ini berdasar pada filosofi *interpretivisme* untuk memperoleh pemahaman mendalam tentang suatu fenomena (Denzin dan Lincoln, 2005). Penelitian ini juga menerapkan pendekatan abduktif, yang memungkinkan penulis untuk mengeksplorasi fenomena secara bolak-balik dan memodifikasi teori yang ada (Suddaby, 2006). Menggunakan review integratif, studi ini merangkum penelitian-penelitian sebelumnya dan menarik kesimpulan dari literatur yang relevan (Beyea dan Nicoll, 1998). Pada akhirnya penelitian ini mencari hubungan sebab-akibat dan keberadaan variabel tertentu untuk menggeneralisasi hasil.

Makalah ini memanfaatkan data sekunder dari jurnal, buku, laporan arsip dan survei yang dilakukan oleh peneliti lain. Data sekunder memiliki kelebihan karena meminimalisasi anggaran survei dan membatasi sumber data, khususnya dalam penelitian dalam waktu terbatas. Namun, pengumpulan data semacam ini memiliki beberapa kelemahan. Kelemahan utama adalah data yang ditemukan tidak sesuai dengan fokus peneliti. Selain itu, dalam pengolahan data kemungkinan terjadi ambiguitas (*bias*). Untuk mengurangi kelemahan tersebut, penulis menggunakan rujukan dari beberapa peneliti kemudian membandingkan hasil-hasil penelitiannya.

Sebagai langkah awal, penelitian ini menggunakan *Google Scholar* dan melakukan pencarian sistematis menggunakan *ISI WEB Science*, menggabungkan istilah pencarian '*entry modes\**' dan '*transaction-costs\**' atau '*institutional\**'. Pendekatan ini menghasilkan 869 publikasi yang kemudian dievaluasi kembali dengan fokus area ekonomi dan didapat 193 penelitian, buku dan jurnal yang relevan. Metode yang sama diterapkan untuk meneliti model perusahaan yang dimiliki sepenuhnya (*wholly-owned subsidiary*) dan usaha patungan (*joint venture*), dan didapatkan total 636 publikasi.

Untuk menjawab pertanyaan terkait *equity mode*, yaitu pilihan antara perusahaan yang dimiliki sepenuhnya atau usaha gabungan, penelitian ini menggunakan klasifikasi karakteristik dari Kumar dan Velavan (1997) yang dibandingkan dengan karakteristik dari Moon (1997).

## Hasil dan Pembahasan Penelitian

Faktor spesifik terkait internal perusahaan dan industri serta perbedaan kelembagaan (institusional) adalah beberapa faktor yang dapat digunakan untuk menilai pilihan entry mode. Dalam kasus dimana industri sangat kompetitif dan terorganisir, perusahaan multinasional lebih memilih untuk membentuk usaha patungan dengan perusahaan lokal. Apalagi jika industri tersebut tidak beresiko. Hal ini dikarenakan perusahaan mengharapkan keuntungan maksimal dengan potensi kerugian seminimal mungkin. Di lain sisi, Nothnagel (2008) menyatakan bahwa jika industri kurang kompetitif serta belum berkembang maka perusahaan multinasional cenderung berinvestasi sebagai satu entitas bisnis (*wholly-owned subsidiary*). Usaha patungan memaksa perusahaan untuk mengubah semua aspek operasional bisnis perusahaan tersebut (Tihanyi dkk, 2012). Sebagai contoh, jika perusahaan merelokasi bisnis di negara yang tidak stabil perekonomiannya.

Dalam kasus Ford, perusahaan mobil tersebut menerapkan strategi yang berbeda di Thailand dan Indonesia. Ford membentuk usaha patungan dengan Auto-Alliance Thailand (AAT) dan Mazda Motor Corporation, mengingat Thailand sebagai *mature market*. Ford terlambat masuk ke Thailand sehingga kesulitan menancapkan kakinya. Untuk mengatasi hal tersebut, Ford membentuk aliansi dengan Mazda untuk mendapatkan aset spesifik perusahaan (teknologi dan *know-how*) serta akses distribusi. Selain itu, Ford membangun pabrik manufaktur untuk memproduksi *spareparts* sehingga bebas pajak (Bangkok Post, 2012). Strategi ini berhasil, terbukti dengan dikeluarkannya 6 tipe kendaraan Ford dan produksi tahunan mencapai 173,000 unit. Keberhasilan ini menjadikan Thailand sebagai hub internasional dan Ford mendirikan kantor cabang di sana.

Sebaliknya, Ford membentuk perusahaan sendiri di Indonesia meskipun industri dalam negeri saat itu didominasi oleh perusahaan Jepang (95%). Ford sepertinya menargetkan *niche market* (pasar khusus) dengan mengeksploitasi aset spesifiknya. Seperti diketahui, sejak tahun 1995 Indonesia berada dalam fase perkembangan yang sangat menarik dimana demografi penduduk menunjukkan peningkatan kelas menengah dengan permintaan kuat akan barang konsumsi seperti mobil (Basri, 2012). Selain itu, kepemilikan mobil di Indonesia termasuk rendah jika dibandingkan dengan negara-negara sekitarnya sehingga menjadi pasar yang menjanjikan. Dalam hal selera, penduduk Indonesia lebih menyukai

kendaraan yang dapat menampung banyak penumpang, mengingat tipikal keluarga Indonesia yang terdiri atas banyak orang (keluarga besar). Dengan potensi pertumbuhan pasar tersebut, Ford menerapkan bentuk usaha sendiri agar mendapatkan balik modal yang tinggi.

Terkait perbedaan institusional, sistem dan kondisi politik dalam negeri menentukan bagaimana suatu perusahaan beroperasi (Tihanyi dkk, 2012). Jika terdapat perbedaan sistem politik yang sangat besar, perusahaan kemungkinan tidak akan membentuk usaha gabungan. Saat Ford memasuki Indonesia di tahun 2000, situasi politik dalam negeri tidak stabil. Pada tahun 1998 terjadi demonstrasi besar-besaran atas kepemimpinan Presiden Soeharto. Situasi ini diperparah dengan kerusuhan etnis di Maluku dan Kalimantan serta gerakan separatis di Papua pada awal 2000-an (BBC, 2016).

Menurut Kirsch (2007), sistem hukum juga merupakan aspek institusional yang mempengaruhi pilihan entry mode. Pada saat itu, Indonesia dianggap sebagai salah satu negara paling korup di dunia (Transparency International, 2005). Meskipun menunjukkan adanya peningkatan pemberantasan korupsi namun posisi Indonesia masih di bawah; peringkat 80 dari 85 negara (tahun 1998) dan peringkat 86 dari 90 negara (tahun 2000). Berdasarkan data tersebut, sangat masuk akal jika Ford memilih usaha sendiri karena usaha patungan memungkinkan terjadinya kecurangan. Korupsi sendiri sangat berbahaya tidak hanya untuk perkembangan ekonomi tapi juga untuk kelangsungan perusahaan (Tanzi, 1998) dan penanaman modal (Mauro, 1995). Selain itu, sebagai perusahaan Amerika, Ford harus mematuhi Undang-undang federal The Foreign Corrupt Practice Acts (FCPA) tahun 1977 mengenai transparansi dan suap terhadap pejabat asing atau konsekuensinya perusahaan akan terkena sanksi. Itulah mengapa Ford mengadopsi bentuk usaha yang dimiliki sendiri untuk meminimalisir korupsi dan perbedaan kepentingan dengan mitra lokal.

Beberapa faktor menjadi alasan utama mengapa Ford masuk ke Indonesia. Sebagaimana dikatakan Sjolholm dan Lipsey, iklim usaha di Indonesia sudah membaik dan negara mengalahi pertumbuhan yang pesat. Di samping itu, Indonesia juga menawarkan pembebasan pajak, konsesi, dan fasilitas lainnya yang tertuang dalam Undang-Undang Nomor 11 Tahun 1970, amandemen UU No. 1 Tahun 1967. Insentif ini menarik bagi Ford, selain fakta bahwa Ford

tidak termasuk pada bidang penanaman modal yang tertutup bagi asing atau diharuskan bekerjasama dengan perusahaan lokal. Seperti yang disebutkan pada Pasal 6, bidang kegiatan yang dikuasai sepenuhnya oleh pemerintah adalah 'bidang yang penting bagi negara dan yang menguasai hajat hidup orang banyak, seperti pelabuhan; produksi, transmisi dan distribusi tenaga listrik untuk umum; pengiriman; telekomunikasi; penerbangan; air minum; perkereta-apian; pengembangan energi atom; dan media massa'. Sebelum masuk secara resmi ke Indonesia, Ford sudah mendapatkan informasi-informasi tersebut sehingga perusahaan mampu membuat keputusan pilihan investasinya.

Lingkungan kelembagaan merupakan faktor selanjutnya yang mempengaruhi pilihan Ford merambah ke Indonesia. Lingkungan kelembagaan Indonesia menjadi sangat menarik sebagai konsekuensi dari serangkaian reformasi struktural pada tahun 1998. Di antara yang paling signifikan dari reformasi kebijakan ekonomi tersebut adalah relaksasi pembatasan investasi asing, serta penyederhanaan prosedur dan pendaftaran (Robison dan Rosser, 1998 ). Situasi ekonomi nasional juga dianggap merupakan aspek penting yang menentukan masuknya Ford ke pasar Indonesia. Sebelum Ford masuk ke Indonesia pada tahun 2000, kondisi dalam negeri dilanda krisis keuangan Asia 1997-1998, dimana nilai mata uang Indonesia menurun secara signifikan. Seperti dicatat oleh IMF (1998), nilai tukar Indonesia jatuh ke level terendah, sekitar Rp 15.000 per dolar AS, dibandingkan dengan Rp 2.500 sebelum krisis. Untuk mengatasi krisis, pemerintah meminta bantuan IMF dan melakukan serangkaian reformasi neoliberal seperti 'penghapusan hak perpajakan untuk proyek mobil nasional yang kontroversial (dimana salah satu dari anak Presiden Soeharto memiliki kepentingan di dalamnya) dan penghapusan perdagangan monopoli cengkeh' (Robison dan Rosser, 1998). Pada awal 2000-an, Indonesia menunjukkan perbaikan ekonomi makro, pemulihan ekspor dan investasi dalam negeri (Singh, 2000). Ford akhirnya memutuskan untuk masuk ke Indonesia. Sangat menarik untuk dicatat bahwa seringnya perubahan kebijakan dan hambatan sistem investasi, selain kurangnya infrastruktur jalan dan lalu lintas, di banyak kota-kota Asia tidak mengecilkan harapan perusahaan asing untuk berinvestasi di masa depan (Abrenica, 1998).

Mengapa Ford lebih memilih perusahaan yang dimiliki sepenuhnya daripada usaha patungan? Pada kenyataannya, perekonomian Indonesia masih



dianggap kecil. Selain itu, perusahaan manufaktur dalam negeri dianggap tidak cocok dan tidak mampu memenuhi standar Ford dalam beberapa aspek penting (Rugman dan Verbeke, nd) seperti level produksi, rendahnya modal dan tingkat pengetahuan teknis (Kirsch, 2007). Sebagai suatu perusahaan Amerika, Ford lebih unggul daripada perusahaan lokal sehingga menyulitkan perusahaan tersebut dalam membuat usaha patungan. Rendahnya tingkat industrialisasi di Indonesia dibandingkan dengan negara-negara tetangga lainnya adalah alasan lain untuk Ford memilih bentuk usaha sendiri. Meskipun Indonesia menjadi negara berpenghasilan menengah, kecepatan industrialisasi dianggap sangat rendah dibandingkan dengan negara-negara lain, seperti Jepang dan Korea Selatan (Lipsey dan Sjöholm, 2011). Ford adalah perusahaan dengan inovasi dan teknologi tinggi sehingga bentuk usaha sendiri lebih tepat agar tidak mengurangi keuntungan yang akan diraih. Perlu dicatat bahwa alasan utama usaha patungan adalah untuk menciptakan sinergi dan meningkatkan produktivitas. Dalam kasus Ford, tidak ada perusahaan manufaktur Indonesia yang mampu menawarkan setiap aspek sesuai kriteria Ford.

Ford memanfaatkan legitimasi kognitif dalam entry mode-nya melalui mimikri internal dan eksternal. Hal ini terlihat pada pola internasionalisasi Ford yang memanfaatkan kehadiran General Motors (GM) di Indonesia. Seperti dikatakan Bordenave dan Lung (2003) bahwa GM dan Ford memiliki pengalaman panjang di pasar internasional dan diakui sebagai secara luas memiliki strategi internasionalisasi kembar (*twin internationalization strategy*). Pada awal 1990-an, GM membuat usaha patungan dengan agen lokal untuk membentuk GM Buana Indonesia sehingga dapat mengakses fasilitas manufaktur. Awalnya GM memiliki saham 60% dan pada awal tahun 2000 berkembang menjadi kepemilikan 100%. Sebagai pendatang baru (*late comer*), Ford sepertinya mengikuti strategi GM mengadopsi bentuk perusahaan yang dimiliki sepenuhnya. Argumen ini didukung oleh Pointet (1997) yang menyatakan bahwa GM dan Ford menampilkan tingkat kemiripan (*imitativeness*) tinggi dalam perilaku organisasi dan proses pengambilan keputusan mereka. Misalnya, Ford membeli Volvo sedangkan GM mengambil alih Fiat. Kedua perusahaan juga berusaha mendapatkan keuntungan dengan menggabungkan skala ekonomi dan menciptakan berbagai produk (Boyer dan Freyssenet, 2000). Namun, beberapa diferensiasi masih ada. Dassbach (1989) menemukan bahwa Ford maju melalui

pertumbuhan internal sedangkan GM mengutamakan pertumbuhan eksternal. Madsen (1999) menambahkan bahwa Ford mengejar pola yang seragam dan universal, sebaliknya GM beradaptasi dengan lingkungan setempat. Di Asia Tenggara sendiri, Ford telah memiliki pengalaman banyak di Thailand, Vietnam dan Filipina, dan sebagai hasilnya perusahaan percaya diri untuk memperluas usahanya di Indonesia.

## **Kesimpulan dan Saran**

Berdasarkan data dan analisis di atas, dapat disimpulkan bahwa teori biaya transaksi dan institusional memiliki kekuatan prediktif terhadap pilihan *entry mode*. Dalam struktur pasar atau industri yang kompetitif, terorganisir dan tidak terlalu beresiko, perusahaan multinasional lebih memilih usaha patungan daripada perusahaan milik sendiri untuk mendapatkan keuntungan yang besar dengan kemungkinan kerugian kecil. Sebaliknya, dalam pasar yang belum berkembang dan tidak beresiko, perusahaan memilih bentuk usaha milik sendiri sebagai kesatuan usaha. Selain itu model perusahaan ini cocok diterapkan jika terdapat perbedaan institusional yang signifikan antara negara asal dengan negara target.

Sehubungan dengan variabel institusional seperti sistem hukum, struktur pemerintahan, sistem kepercayaan, perbedaan budaya nasional dan norma-norma, perusahaan multinasional cenderung untuk membentuk usaha patungan, terutama di negara-negara yang dianggap korup. Selain itu, perlu adanya pertimbangan seberapa dekat hubungan budaya negara tuan rumah dengan negara asal. Berkenaan dengan Indonesia dan Ford, teori biaya transaksi dan institusional terbukti selaras dengan kondisi tersebut. Ford masuk ke Indonesia yang saat itu didominasi oleh produsen mobil Jepang. Meskipun situasi ekonomi Indonesia semakin membaik namun politik dalam negeri relatif tidak stabil sehingga Ford memutuskan bentuk usaha sendiri untuk mendapatkan keuntungan yang tinggi dan meminimalisir konflik dengan mitra lokal. Ford menargetkan pasar anak muda kelas menengah dan fokus pada tipe kendaraan yang dapat menampung banyak penumpang.

Selanjutnya, beberapa faktor yang mempengaruhi keputusan Ford masuk ke Indonesia antara lain perbaikan iklim usaha yang terus-menerus, reformasi sistem hukum dan peraturan Indonesia serta pembebasan pajak dan

insentif untuk perusahaan asing yang berinvestasi di dalam negeri. Meskipun situasi politik dalam negeri kurang stabil, namun kerangka kelembagaan di Indonesia sangat menarik dan Ford memiliki informasi pasar yang cukup sehingga meningkatkan kepercayaan perusahaan untuk masuk ke Indonesia.

Akhirnya, penelitian ini menyimpulkan mengapa Ford memilih bentuk usaha sendiri. Aspek kecil seperti perbedaan tingkat produksi, rendahnya tingkat modal dan *know-how* teknologi, cakupan ekonomi yang kecil serta rendahnya industrialisasi dibandingkan dengan negara-negara tetangga menjadi faktor mengapa perusahaan multinasional mengadopsi bentuk usaha yang dimiliki sepenuhnya. Dalam kasus Ford, perusahaan memilih bentuk usaha sendiri untuk melindungi aset-aset berharga dari potensi oportuniste perusahaan mitra. Selain itu, model ini cocok karena cukup banyak perbedaan antara negara asal dan negara target. Dibandingkan dengan usaha patungan, anak perusahaan yang dimiliki sepenuhnya memungkinkan Ford untuk mengambil keputusan secara cepat dan menghindari potensi konflik dengan perusahaan mitra. Ford meniru pengalaman internal dan eksternal (*mimicry*) untuk melegalkan keputusannya terhadap pilihan *entry mode*. Ford memiliki pengalaman mumpuni di Asia Tenggara dan diakui secara luas, di samping memiliki kemiripan strategi yang banyak dengan GM, yang masuk ke Indonesia lebih awal dari Ford.

Makalah ini diharapkan dapat menjadi batu loncatan bagi peneliti lain dengan memperluas cakupan negara penelitian, tidak terbatas pada satu negara, dan mengadopsi strategi yang lebih komparatif seperti menggabungkan teori eklektik (*eclectic theory*), pandangan berbasis sumber daya (*resource-based view*) dan strategi gobal (*global strategic variables approach*) sehingga mendapatkan pemahaman yang menyeluruh. Data-data dari negara-negara yang tengah mengalami transisi ekonomi perlu dikumpulkan untuk menggeneralisasi hasil penelitian.

---

# **The Impact of Foreign Direct Investment on Economic Growth in Asian Developing Countries**

## **Akibat Penanaman Modal Asing Langsung pada Pertumbuhan Ekonomi di Negara- Negara Berkembang Asia**

---

Nama : Eka Sulistiawati  
NIP : 198605132009042001  
Instansi : BKPM  
Tahun Intake : 2015  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : MSc of International Business  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : Queen Mary University of London

Salah satu pengaruh globalisasi adalah penanaman modal asing (PMA) dari negara maju ke negara berkembang. Tingginya nilai penanaman modal khususnya di negara berkembang menarik untuk diperhatikan. Asia adalah salah satu tujuan penanaman modal asing yang dipandang sangat menarik bagi negara berkembang.

Pesatnya alur penanaman modal di negara berkembang Asia mendorong saya untuk melakukan penelitian mengenai pengaruh penanaman modal asing terhadap pertumbuhan ekonomi di negara berkembang di Asia.

Dalam penelitian – penelitian sebelumnya, terdapat hasil yang beragam. Beberapa penelitian mengungkapkan bahwa alur masuk PMA secara positif mempunyai pengaruh terhadap pertumbuhan ekonomi, di sisi lain pengaruh negatif maupun tidak ada pengaruh terhadap pertumbuhan ekonomi juga ditemukan pada penelitian sebelumnya.

United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) menyatakan bahwa selama krisis ekonomi global negara berkembang mengatasi krisis lebih baik dibandingkan dengan negara maju dikarenakan tidak terkait langsung dengan sistem keuangan dan perbankan Amerika dan Eropa. UNCTAD juga melaporkan peningkatan alur masuk PMA sebesar 17% di wilayah Asia Selatan, Timur, dan Tenggara. Lebih jauh lagi, pada periode 2011-2013, alur masuk PMA ke Asia mencapai 25% dari keseluruhan alur masuk global tertinggi melebihi nilai alur masuk ke negara berkembang di Eropa dan Amerika Latin.

Dalam beberapa penelitian, PMA secara positif mempengaruhi pertumbuhan ekonomi pada suatu negara dengan catatan mempunyai negara tersebut mempunyai kemampuan menyerap faktor – faktor dari PMA seperti pendidikan, infrastruktur, sumber daya manusia, teknologi, dll.

Satu hal yang perlu diperhatikan adalah adanya hubungan endogen antara PMA dan pertumbuhan ekonomi dimana PMA mempengaruhi pertumbuhan ekonomi dan juga sebaliknya. Dalam penelitian – penelitian sebelumnya banyak yang tidak memperhitungkan hubungan tersebut. Li dan Liu (2005) melakukan penelitian di 84 negara dari tahun 1970 – 1999 yang menghasilkan PMA di negara berkembang dan maju mempengaruhi pertumbuhan ekonomi dengan hubungan endogen muncul di pertengahan tahun 1980.

Dengan melihat latar belakang, merujuk pada hipotesis penelitian ini adalah:

- $H_0$  : Tidak ada pengaruh PMA terhadap pertumbuhan ekonomi pada sembilan negara berkembang di Asia.
- $H_a$  : Terdapat pengaruh PMA terhadap pertumbuhan ekonomi pada sembilan negara berkembang di Asia

## **Metode Penelitian**

Penelitian ini menggunakan metode kuantitatif dengan data sekunder menggunakan sample negara berkembang di Asia yaitu Bangladesh, Cina, India, Indonesia, Thailand, Malaysia, Filipina, Korea Selatan, dan Vietnam, penelitian ini menggunakan periode waktu 1990 – 2014. Arus masuk PMA adalah variabel independen dalam penelitian ini, Pertumbuhan ekonomi sebagai variabel dependen. Untuk mengukur pertumbuhan ekonomi, beberapa variabel lain digunakan seperti PDRB (Produk Domestik Regional Bruto), nilai perdagangan, inflasi, Penanaman Modal Domestik, Ukuran pemerintahan, dan sumber daya manusia.

Penelitian ini berdasarkan model endogen pertumbuhan ekonomi Mankiw dkk (1992) dan juga beberapa penelitian sejenis sebelumnya seperti Carkovic dan Levine (2002), Li dan Liu (2005), Makki dan Somwaru (2004).

Penanaman Modal Asing (PMA) diukur dengan ratio nilai PMA terhadap PDRB di tahun 1990, Pertumbuhan ekonomi diukur sebagai PDRB per kapita, PDRB tahun 1990 juga digunakan sebagai salah satu variabel independen untuk mengukur pertumbuhan ekonomi. Nilai Perdagangan diukur sebagai nilai total ekspor dan impor sebagai ratio terhadap PDRB. Penanaman modal domestik diukur dengan ratio terhadap PDRB aliran dana ke sektor swasta oleh perantara keuangan, Ukuran pemerintahan diukur dengan besarnya pengeluaran pemerintah sebagai rasio PDRB, dan juga tingkat keelulusan pada pendidikan tingkat tersier tahun 1990 digunakan sebagai indikator sumber daya manusia.

Untuk memperoleh data, database World Bank digunakan untuk hampir seluruh data serta database Barro – Lee untuk mendapatkan data pendidikan dikarenakan database tersebut sudah terpercaya kredibilitasnya.

Menerapkan metode OLS (Ordinary Least Square) dengan menggunakan software STATA dengan melakukan regresi variabel independen terhadap

variabel independen. Lebih jauh lagi, mempertimbangkan hubungan yang endogen antara PMA dan pertumbuhan ekonomi, variabel instrumen akan digunakan dalam regresi lebih lanjut. Tes regresi dilakukan untuk menguji hipotesis dalam penelitian ini.

## **Hasil dan Pembahasan**

Pada regresi OLS, PMA selalu secara positif mempengaruhi pertumbuhan ekonomi baik secara individu maupun ketika digabungkan atau dikendalikan dengan variabel independen lainnya. Sementara itu, dari segi sumber daya manusia, pendidikan secara mengejutkan hanya menunjukkan signifikansi negatif yang berarti pendidikan tinggi secara negatif mempengaruhi pertumbuhan ekonomi. Hasil ini secara umum bertentangan penelitian – penelitian sebelumnya yang menghasilkan bahwa pendidikan secara positif mempengaruhi pertumbuhan ekonomi. Bahkan di beberapa regresi tidak memberikan signifikansi yang berarti pendidikan tidak mempengaruhi pertumbuhan ekonomi.

Hasil yang bertentangan dengan hasil penelitian sebelumnya juga terjadi pada hasil perdagangan yang secara negatif mempengaruhi pertumbuhan ekonomi serta pengeluaran pemerintah dan penanaman modal yang tidak mempengaruhi pertumbuhan ekonomi.

Mempertimbangkan hubungan yang endogen antara PMA dan pertumbuhan ekonomi serta pendidikan dan pertumbuhan ekonomi, untuk menguji hipotesis lebih lanjut digunakan metode Two Stage Least Square (2SLS) dengan variabel instrumen. Memilih variabel instrumen bukanlah hal yang mudah. Dalam hal ini, dipilih sebagai variabel instrumen adalah nilai tahun terdahulu dari PMA, PDRB, dan nilai total tingkat kelulusan pendidikan primer dan sekunder.

Regresi dengan menggunakan 2SLS yang melibatkan variabel instrumen untuk menguji apakah ada perbedaan yang signifikan dengan OLS. Lebih lanjut, serangkaian test untuk menguji validasi atau keabsahan dari variabel instrumen. Seluruh tes telah menyatakan variabel instrumen valid.

Hasil regresi 2SLS dengan memasukkan variabel instrumen tidak jauh berbeda dengan OLS dimana PMA secara positif mempengaruhi pertumbuhan ekonomi baik secara individu maupun ketika ber-interaksi dengan variabel lain dengan munculnya hubungan endogen. Pengaruh yang sedikit lebih kuat terjadi

di 2SLS. Pendidikan tinggi dari hasil regresi menunjukkan pengaruh yang negatif terhadap pertumbuhan ekonomi. Perdagangan secara negatif mempengaruhi pertumbuhan ekonomi, pengeluaran pemerintah juga secara negatif mempengaruhi pertumbuhan ekonomi. Inflasi secara negatif mempengaruhi pertumbuhan ekonomi dimana semakin tinggi inflasi, pertumbuhan ekonomi cenderung menurun.

## **Kesimpulan**

Tujuan utama dari penelitian ini adalah untuk menguji apakah PMA (Penanaman Modal Asing) mempunyai pengaruh terhadap pertumbuhan ekonomi. Dengan 9 negara berkembang di Asia sebagai sample dan periode 1990 – 2014, penelitian ini menyimpulkan bahwa PMA secara positif mempengaruhi pertumbuhan ekonomi. Dapat dikatakan bahwa semakin tinggi PMA, semakin tinggi kontribusinya terhadap pertumbuhan ekonomi.

Adapun beberapa hasil yang bertolak belakang dengan penelitian sebelumnya bisa disebabkan kurang besarnya sampel penelitian dan adanya sedikit kekosongan data.

Lebih lanjut, beberapa hal dapat dilakukan untuk menarik investasi asing seperti menciptakan iklim investasi yang kondusif dan membuat program promosi investasi oleh pemerintah (UNCTAD, 2006).

Kualitas institusi juga merupakan satu hal penting untuk meningkatkan nilai PMA. Keadaan politik dalam negeri serta korupsi juga merupakan aspek penting bagi investor asing untuk menanamkan modalnya di suatu negara. Lebih lanjut lagi, biaya produksi yang rendah, tenaga kerja, infrastruktur juga menjadi faktor penarik bagi investor asing.





---

## **Questioning the Longevity of China-North Korea Alliance**

## **Mempertanyakan Keberlangsungan Hubungan Aliansi China-Korea Utara**

---

Nama : Ety Rachmawaty  
NIP : 198606062009122004  
Instansi : KEMENLU  
Tahun Intake : 2015  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : MA Korean Studies  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : SOAS University of London

Tiongkok dan Korea Utara telah memulai hubungan sekutu secara resmi sejak ditandatanganinya perjanjian kerja sama dan persahabatan pada tahun 1961, walaupun secara informal hubungan sekutu diantara kedua negara telah dibuktikan dengan keterlibatan Tiongkok dalam Perang Korea di tahun 1950. Seiring berjalannya waktu, hubungan antar sekutu tersebut telah mengalami pasang surut. Meskipun demikian, perjanjian yang ditinjau kembali setiap 20 tahun ini telah diperbarui dua kali pada tahun 1981 dan 2001 (Park 2016).

Sejak Kim Jong Un resmi menjadi pemimpin tertinggi Korea Utara, hubungan aliansi Tiongkok-Korea Utara kerap kali diasumsikan mengalami kerenggangan. Hal ini diindikasikan melalui beberapa peristiwa seperti berkurangnya frekuensi pertukaran kunjungan resmi pejabat tinggi antar kedua negara. Di sisi lain hubungan bilateral antara Tiongkok dan Korea Selatan tampak semakin erat. Ketika Xi Jinping dan Park Geun Hye telah beberapa kali bertukar kunjungan, Xi Jinping dan Kim Jong Un belum sekalipun bertemu secara langsung. Kim Jong Un juga telah menjatuhkan hukuman mati kepada Jang Song Thaek yang diyakini berperan besar sebagai tokoh penghubung Tiongkok dengan penguasa Korea Utara tersebut. Uji coba senjata nuklir yang dilaksanakan oleh Korea Utara juga meresahkan pemerintah dan masyarakat Tiongkok. Salah satu akademisi Tiongkok Deng Yuwen bahkan menulis sebuah artikel di *Financial Times* yang menarik perhatian publik internasional atas pendapatnya bahwa Korea Utara telah menjadi beban yang seharusnya ditinggalkan oleh Tiongkok.

Seiring dengan meningkatnya kekuatan Tiongkok dan berlanjutnya tindakan provokatif Korea Utara, perbedaan pendapat akan kemungkinan terjadinya perubahan kebijakan Tiongkok terkait hubungan aliansinya dengan Korea Utara pun mengemuka (Chung & Choi 2013; Snyder 2016; Taylor 2013). Sehubungan dengan hal tersebut, penelitian tentang keberlangsungan hubungan aliansi Tiongkok-Korea Utara perlu dilakukan mengingat keterkaitannya dengan masalah proliferasi senjata pemusnah massal Korea Utara, reunifikasi semenanjung Korea serta konstelasi politik kawasan dan internasional.

## **Metoda Penelitian**

Penelitian dilaksanakan dengan metoda kualitatif yang umumnya bersumber pada jurnal akademis internasional dan buku. Pidato dan artikel berita baik cetak maupun online juga digunakan sebagai sumber data pada penelitian ini. Teori yang digunakan dalam penelitian ini adalah Perimbangan Kekuatan (Balance of Power), Perimbangan Ancaman (Balance of Threat), Perimbangan Kepentingan (Balance of Interest). Penelitian terhadap perkembangan hubungan diplomatik dan ekonomi antara Tiongkok dan Korea Utara selama 5 (lima) tahun terakhir digunakan sebagai dasar pengambilan kesimpulan akan arah keberlangsungan hubungan aliansi antara kedua negara.

## **Hasil dan Pembahasan Penelitian**

Tiongkok dan Korea Utara memiliki kepentingan bersama yang menjadi alasan mengapa aliansi kedua negara penting untuk dipertahankan. Keberlangsungan Korea Utara diperlukan untuk mendukung kepentingan nasional Tiongkok dan sebaliknya.

## **Perkembangan Hubungan Diplomatik**

Secara umum, telah muncul kesalahpahaman bahwa hubungan aliansi Tiongkok-Korea Utara mengalami keretakan. Hal ini disebabkan oleh pengamatan yang terlalu menyederhanakan pasang surut hubungan bilateral kedua negara berdasarkan laporan media. Misalnya, belum adanya kunjungan kenegaraan tidak dapat dijadikan sebagai acuan akan terjadinya pemutusan hubungan sekutu. Faktanya, yang pertama kali bertemu dengan Kim Jong Un sejak ia memegang tampuk kekuasaan adalah perwakilan Tiongkok dan yang berkunjung ke Tiongkok adalah perwakilan tertinggi Korea Utara (Noesselt 2014).

Selain itu, hubungan Tiongkok-Korea Utara tidak dapat dibandingkan dengan hubungan bilateral negara-negara lain yang pada umumnya dikelola oleh Kementerian Luar Negerinya. Hubungan Tiongkok-Korea Utara dikelola oleh kantor penghubung partai masing-masing. Pengiriman Liu Yunshan untuk menghadiri perayaan hari jadi Partai Buruh Korea Utara yang ke-70 tidak tepat

untuk dipandang sebelah mata. Pada faktanya, Tiongkok telah menaikkan level utusannya pada perayaan tersebut. Liu Yunshan merupakan pejabat tertinggi ke-5 pada Partai Komunis Tiongkok. Sebelumnya, Tiongkok hanya mengirimkan pejabat tertinggi ke-9 Zhou Yongkang untuk menghadiri perayaan ulang tahun Partai Buruh Korea yang ke-65 di tahun 2010.

## **Perkembangan Hubungan Ekonomi**

Dengan kekuatan ekonomi serta posisinya sebagai mitra dagang utama Korea Utara, Tiongkok dapat saja menggunakan kekuatan tersebut untuk mengancam dan menjatuhkan hukuman berat bagi Korea Utara agar menghentikan program uji coba nuklirnya seperti yang selama ini diinginkan oleh Amerika Serikat dan sekutunya. Namun, Tiongkok tetap memberikan bantuan ekonomi tahunan kepada Korea Utara dan neraca perdagangan serta investasi kedua negara tergolong stabil.

Meskipun grafik perdagangan antara Tiongkok dan Korea Utara menunjukkan penurunan sejak tahun 2014, neraca tersebut kemungkinan besar tidak melaporkan perdagangan yang terjadi secara menyeluruh. Kecurigaan ini mengemuka setelah pihak intelejen Korea Selatan melaporkan tidak adanya penundaan kegiatan industri di Korea Utara yang seharusnya terjadi apabila Tiongkok tidak menyediakan minyak mentah bagi Korea Utara (The Korea Times, 2014). Selain itu, Beijing juga menaikkan jumlah bantuannya menjadi \$6,96 trilyun di tahun 2014, lebih dari dua kali lipat dibandingkan bantuan yang diberikan pada tahun 2009 yang hanya \$2,68 trilyun (Gertz 2015). Sementara itu, penurunan volume dagang pada tahun 2015 kemungkinan besar disebabkan oleh menurunnya harga batu bara dan biji besi di pasaran dan kebijakan pemerintah Tiongkok terkait isu lingkungan yang mempengaruhi industri batu bara (Shim 2016).

Tiongkok tidak ingin menjatuhkan hukuman berat yang dapat mengakibatkan ketidakstabilan, reaksi kemarahan Korea Utara, menghancurkan hubungan bilateral serta menghilangkan pengaruhnya pada Korea Utara (Glaser and Billingsley 2012: 19-20). Salah satu kemungkinan terburuk yang dapat terjadi apabila Korea Utara runtuh adalah dibanjirinya perbatasan Tiongkok oleh pengungsi Korea Utara yang tentunya akan menjadi beban masalah ekonomi dan sosial bagi Tiongkok.

## Kesimpulan dan saran

Di antara ketiga teori yang ada, teori *Balance of Interest* merupakan teori yang paling tepat digunakan untuk menjelaskan dasar dipertahankannya hubungan aliansi Tiongkok-Korea Utara. Perkembangan hubungan diplomatik dan ekonomi di antara kedua negara tersebut selama 5 (lima) tahun terakhir membuktikan bahwa hubungan aliansi keduanya tetap terjalin erat. Hal ini menyanggah persepsi yang mengemukakan bahwa terdapat keretakan hubungan yang akan berimbas pada kemungkinan diputuskannya hubungan sekutu kedua negara. Penelitian ini menyimpulkan bahwa hubungan aliansi Tiongkok-Korea Utara akan tetap dilanjutkan karena hingga saat ini manfaat yang diperoleh dengan mempertahankan hubungan tersebut tergolong lebih besar daripada kerugian yang harus ditanggung dengan diputuskannya hubungan aliansi kedua negara. Pada saat penulisan, Korea Utara baru saja melakukan uji coba nuklirnya yang kelima. Sebagai reaksi akan hal ini, Tiongkok masih tetap pada posisinya yang mengutamakan pentingnya dialog antara pihak-pihak terkait. Sebagai salah satu anggota dewan keamanan PBB, Tiongkok belum menyetujui penjatuhan hukuman berat yang dapat mengancam keberlangsungan Korea Utara. Akan tetapi, mengingat reaksi dari Amerika Serikat dan sekutunya masih terus berkembang serta apabila sikap Korea Utara semakin membahayakan kepentingan Tiongkok maka penelitian lebih lanjut perlu dilakukan.



---

**The Revitalization of Indonesia's Sister  
Cities/Sister Provinces Cooperation  
Through Virtual Sister City Development  
Case Study: Sister City Cooperation  
Between DKI Jakarta and Los Angeles**

**Revitalisasi Kerjasama Sister Cities/  
Sister Provinces di Indonesia Melalui  
Pengembangan Virtual Sister City  
Studi Kasus: Kerjasama Sister City Antara  
DKI Jakarta dan Los Angeles**

---

Nama : Friezca Rara Juta  
NIP : 199205152012062001  
Instansi : Kemendagri  
Tahun Intake : 2015  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : Master of International Public Policy and  
Management  
Negara Studi : Amerika Serikat  
Universitas : University of Southern California



Sister city or sister province cooperation is a form of long-term partnership between two cities or provinces that have one or more commonalities in geography, culture, concept of economic development, social-economic potential, and issues. The main purpose of sister city cooperation is to strengthen the relationship between cities in the world through cultural exchange, trade, and tourism. After going through several procedures, both parties then agree to formalize their relationship by signing a formal cooperation agreement in the form of a memorandum of understanding (MoU) or a joint agreement.

In general, Indonesia has approximately 173 sister cities/provinces cooperation only including recent sister city/province relationships. However, if all MoUs that have been signed are included, there will be more than 300 Indonesian sister city/province relationships throughout the world. The reason for the large number of partners is that Indonesia allows any city or province to have more than one sister city. There is no regulation limiting the number of partners as long as the two cities have a similarity and something that they want to cooperate or collaborate on. So, it is possible that a city can have more than twenty cities from all over the world becoming their partner.

The principal of cooperation between cities is voluntary, so there is no punishment if they do not conduct any activities or programs after signing the MoU. As a result, many sister city cooperations are becoming only a symbol of formality even though there are many advantages to be gained from a collaboration. Many cities have not realized that sister city cooperations can be used to forge strategic trade and economic ties between cities, provinces, as well as countries. These relationships can also establish emotional connections between people from different parts of the world, which can contribute to maintain peace.

DKI Jakarta, as an example, is the capital city of Indonesia and has 17 sister city cooperations. Each relationship has a different scope of cooperation that depends on what kind of common potential or issue the cities have. Los Angeles is one of Jakarta's sister cities that agreed to cooperate in cultural exchanges. On December 28th, 1990, DKI Jakarta represented by Governor of DKI Jakarta Wiyogo Atmodarminto, and the City of Los Angeles represented by Mayor Tom Bradley, signed a joint declaration of sister city cooperation between Jakarta and Los Angeles. This collaboration was initiated by business groups in

both cities. In the past, both cities participated in a sister chamber cooperation, which involved their respective chambers of commerce. However, due to the volatility of the economy, some of the companies went bankrupt and the sister chamber cooperation became ineffective.

This shifted the cooperation between Jakarta and Los Angeles towards a cultural exchange program. Several of Jakarta's arts and traditions events have been conducted in Los Angeles, yet they have not strengthened the relationship between Jakarta and Los Angeles, the main goal of the exchange and the spirit of the sister city cooperation. In the last five years, Jakarta and Los Angeles have tried to create 'big projects' together, but have not arrived at the agreements because of technical problems in each city.

Many factors can serve as encouragement between Jakarta and Los Angeles to strengthen cooperation. There is a large number of Indonesians who live in the greater Los Angeles area, as well as an Indonesia office representative, the Consulate General of the Republic of Indonesia, in Los Angeles. Therefore, there is no reason that a sister city cooperation between DKI Jakarta and Los Angeles cannot run smoothly. Moreover, DKI Jakarta and Los Angeles have a lot of shared potential that can help develop this relationship, including the fact that both are big cities and one of the most populated in their countries, as well as being economic gateways and centers and composed of diverse people.

## **Recommendations**

Based on the identification and assessment of the policy options above, I recommend the following policies to revitalize sister city cooperation between Jakarta and Los Angeles as well as policies that can support the accessibility and connectivity between people in Jakarta and Los Angeles.

### **Recommendation 1: The Government of DKI Jakarta collaboration with Jakarta's IT Developers Established 'Virtual Sister City' Website**

The idea of a 'virtual sister city' is inspired by many social media that are evolving rapidly over the past three decades. Besides that, the e-government that has begun to be implemented in the Indonesian government can also

become a supporting factor to change the sister city cooperation framework from the current framework to become IT based. Moreover, the complexities of the components supporting sister city cooperation, especially the large number of stakeholders involved in this program, is expected to become much simpler by creating a one information-exchange-channel, which is called the 'virtual sister city.'

The local government of DKI Jakarta, as the initiator in the collaboration, will create the virtual sister city web page as a tool to strengthen DKI Jakarta's relationship with its partners. It will collaborate with the local Investment Bureau, local businesses, education institutions, and local media, under the supervision of the Ministry of Home Affairs, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and other related ministries. The virtual sister city website will provide services as follow:

- It will become a new platform of cooperation to persuade people from different backgrounds, especially millennials, to participate in sister city partnership programs.
- It will become an official social media – where people from Jakarta can interact directly with people from different Jakarta sister cities in other countries. Through this social media, people from Jakarta and Los Angeles can meet virtually in a 'safe way' and in real-time (there will be ID verification), and this interaction will become a form of cultural exchange.
- People from different backgrounds can join and discuss based on their affiliation:
  - Individual (travelers, students)
  - Business (as an organization or corporation)
  - Education institutions
  - Artists (singers, painters, actors, designers)
- Providing information about events, programs, or activities related to Jakarta sister city cooperation.
- Make a program branding 'Locals go International', where entrepreneurs or local businessmen from Jakarta can promote their product to people from its sister city partners, and they can hold a real-time meeting (virtual meeting) and transaction.

Recommendation 2: The Government of DKI Jakarta collaboration with stakeholders should create a real-time database system of Jakarta potential and opportunities for sister city cooperation.

Finding the uniqueness, potential and opportunities are the first steps that should be done by the government because based on that the potential data they can create a master plan for the city. Particularly for a sister city cooperation, finding similar potential is the initial process before it is decided that two cities can establish a sister city cooperation. Therefore, the government of DKI Jakarta has to create a database to inventory each potential that Jakarta has and categorize them based on cities and scope of cooperation.

Identify every similarity between Jakarta and its sister city based on their scope of cooperation, including resources, geographical conditions, traditions, demography, as well as problems, such as natural disasters, traffic congestion problems, and environmental problems. Create a new system or use the existing application that has been established to record all the potentials and problems of Jakarta. Update the information in the database at anytime because the application will be set as a real-time based application. Use the potential analysis result as a guideline to assess current programs and to create new programs.

### **Recommendation 3: The Government of DKI Jakarta should make a pilot project of Jakarta – Los Angeles Virtual Sister City Cooperation**

The government of Jakarta will launch the first virtual based sister city with Los Angeles as its first partner. As mentioned in recommendation 1, this virtual sister city concept is expected not only to boost cooperation between governments and businessmen in Jakarta and Los Angeles, but it will be able to connect their people in order to achieve sister city cooperation goals in general, which are cultural exchanges, trade, and tourism. In order to create this pilot project, the Government of DKI Jakarta has to go through the following steps:

- Initial data collection: collecting all documents related to sister city cooperation between Jakarta – Los Angeles, listing every programs and activity that has been held between these two cities, contacting and discussing with every stakeholder that will be involved, evaluating programs of cooperation that have been done.

- Initiated by the government of DKI Jakarta and supported by all stakeholders involved in the Jakarta and Los Angeles sister city cooperation using 'Virtual Sister City' concept, they will establish Jakarta – Los Angeles Virtual Sister City Website.
- Hold an internal stakeholders meeting to explain the website framework and each stakeholders' responsibilities in operating the website as well as maintaining the relationship with partner stakeholders from Los Angeles.
- Conduct trainings for each stakeholders' administrator.
- Encouraging more people to participate in this program. It does not mean that they must have a product or brand to sell, however, they can meet, discuss, and interact with people from Los Angeles. One example would be teaching or learning Bahasa Indonesia. People from Los Angeles can learn Bahasa Indonesia directly from Indonesia. They will not only be able to learn Bahasa Indonesia in a formal way, but they can also learn slang or informal language. Through this social interaction, cultural exchange might happen.

Recommendation 4: The Government of DKI Jakarta collaborates with Jakarta's Local TV or Mass Media in Promoting the Sister City Cooperation Program to encourage People to participate

Not all people are familiar with sister city cooperation, and some of them do not have any idea what a sister city cooperation is while others do, but they also do not know how to participate or a benefit from the cooperation. Therefore, it is necessary to promote and make a campaign about sister cities. DKI Jakarta has a number of partners with different scopes of cooperation that need to familiarize themselves people with the cities' partners, the program and its opportunities.

The government of Jakarta, mass media, actors, and other involved stakeholders will create a working group for public relations. This promotion through program will definitely cost a lot of money. However, it will be worth it if a lot of individuals later participate in the cooperation. The promotion of the sister city program will be as follows:

- Creating ads or sign about Jakarta sister city partners at several important points, such as Jakarta's airport, station, terminal, or other public places. The advertisement can be done local TV ads, newspaper, or flyers that mention the city partners, specific programs, opportunities, and of course the website where people can access and find further information.

- The seminar, workshop, and training about:  
 Opportunities to expand local businesses into the international market  
 Opportunities to study and experience life in Los Angeles  
 Regulations regarding international trade,  
 Culture differences between Jakarta and Los Angeles: opportunity and thread
- Make a program branding and slogan to persuade people to participate in the cooperation, especially in a program that can boost local economic development. For instance, a program called 'Locals go International.'

The reasons the virtual sister city program is picked as the priority policy recommendation compared to other policy options is because other policy options, such as sister port cooperation, the Jakarta Day event, student exchange programs, and film industry, can be accommodated and integrated within one virtual sister city website. In other words, the virtual sister city is the grand framework for further sister city cooperation.

## **Evaluation Plan**

In order to measure the successfulness of the Jakarta virtual sister city program with Los Angeles, the first step that the government of Jakarta needs to take is creating a basic matrix which provides baseline data about the number of international tourists to Jakarta (tour packages, hotel occupancy, number of flight between Jakarta and Los Angeles), trade value (export – import), number of local business in Jakarta and the , number and value of foreign direct investment from Los Angeles as well as the United States in Jakarta.

## **Quasi Experimental Design: Interrupted Time Series Design**

After launching the website in the year 2018, there will be a post-treatment evaluation, which compares trends before and after the virtual sister city has been implemented with a Quasi-Experimental Design: Interrupted Time Series Design evaluation method. The time span before and after treatment, which will be investigated, are 5 years before and 5 years after the website launch.

This evaluation is expected to answer three questions:

- Does the policy increase the number of people participating in virtual Jakarta – Los Angeles Sister City Cooperation programs from 0 people in 2018 to 5,000 in 2023?
- Does the policy increase cultural exchange programs between Jakarta and Los Angeles from one cultural exchange per four years to one cultural exchange per year in 2023?
- Does the policy increase the number of tourists from the United States visiting Jakarta from 6,998 visitors in 2015 to 8,500 by 2023?

### **Quasi Experimental Design: Non-Equivalent Group Design**

Besides comparing the differences before and after treatment through ITS evaluation design, in order to ensure that this pilot project can be imitated or benchmarked to another form of sister city cooperation with Jakarta or other cities in Indonesia, there will be also an evaluation with non-equivalent group design. In this evaluation, the Jakarta – Los Angeles virtual sister city cooperation result will be compared with another sister city cooperation that has a similar scope of cooperation with Jakarta and Los Angeles (cultural exchange), but they have not implemented virtual sister city based cooperation yet.

This evaluation is expected to answer question: Does cooperation implementing a virtual sister city have a better performance rather than cooperation with a conventional method in terms of program cost, program benefits to the city, and the number of people participating in the programs under the sister city cooperation framework?

### **Satisfaction Survey**

In order to examine customers' opinion regarding virtual sister city cooperation, there will a customer satisfaction survey. The customers, in this context, are those who register, are impacted, and benefit from this sister city cooperation between Jakarta and Los Angeles. They can be an individual or an entity or organization. Feedback received from the survey will be used to improve virtual sister city performance in the future.

## Conclusions

The shift from conventional cooperation framework to IT and Internet-based sister city cooperation can open new opportunities for both cities to optimize their cooperation. The DKI Jakarta – Los Angeles virtual sister city is an innovation to realize the basic goals of sister city cooperation in order to strengthen the relationship between cities through cultural exchange, trade and tourism by connecting their people. This virtual sister city website will become an instrument for the cultural exchange, boost trade and investments, as well as promote local tourism. Virtual sister cities will also become the answer to the challenge of how to engage people from a different era to participate in government program, particularly the millennials who are currently have become too dependent on internet and information technology.

The government of Indonesia, which is the local government of DKI Jakarta, can be a pioneer in reviving the spirit of sister city cooperation by using information technology and an internet platform in order to answer a worldwide challenge in adjusting to this fast-growing world. In addition, the new innovation of the Jakarta Virtual Sister City website will become a prototype for other cities or provinces in Indonesia, as well as throughout the world, in order to create a sustainable and successful sister city relationship.





---

## **Improving Performance Management of Local Governments in Indonesia**

## **Meningkatkan Kinerja Manajemen Pemerintah Daerah di Indonesia**

---

Nama : Hayu Dika Paramita  
NIP : 198503092009012003  
Instansi : KEMENPAN & RB  
Tahun Intake : 2013  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : Master of International Public Policy and  
Management  
Negara Studi : Amerika Serikat  
Universitas : University of Southern California

## ABSTRACT

After decentralization in 1999, local governments have been given bigger portions to administer their territories to provide better delivery of public service. These additional authorities have to be accountable based on their performance managements. Apparently, after 14 years of being decentralized, the local governments did not manage to perform well, as it was shown in performance accountability's evaluation in 2013. They performed lower than they were expected. This problem is caused by 4 determinants and 5 policy alternatives are proposed to address the problem. Among 5 policy options, 2 of them are chosen as policy recommendations for immediate and long-run policy action based on CAM analysis.

## ABSTRAK

Setelah desentralisasi pada tahun 1999, pemerintah daerah diberi porsi lebih besar untuk mengelola wilayah mereka guna memberikan layanan publik yang lebih baik. Otoritas tambahan ini harus bertanggung jawab berdasarkan pada manajemen kinerjanya. Rupanya, setelah 14 tahun terdesentralisasi, pemerintah daerah tidak dapat berjalan dengan baik, seperti yang ditunjukkan dalam evaluasi akuntabilitas kinerja pada tahun 2013. Mereka menunjukkan hasil lebih rendah dari yang diharapkan. Masalah ini disebabkan oleh 4 faktor penentu dan 5 alternatif kebijakan diusulkan untuk mengatasi masalah tersebut. Di antara 5 pilihan kebijakan, 2 di antaranya dipilih sebagai rekomendasi kebijakan untuk tindakan kebijakan segera dan jangka panjang berdasarkan analisis CAM.

Indonesia is an archipelago country that has 13,466 islands (menkokesra, 2014), located in Southeast Asia. As of 2013, Indonesia consists of 34 provinces, 413 regions, and 98 municipalities (Kemendagri, 2014). Its population in 2014 is approximately 248.82 million people (ADB, 2014)); meanwhile, in 2012 GDP \$878.0 billion and GNI per capita \$8,750 (Worldbank, 2014).

## **Decentralization in Indonesia**

Decentralization in Indonesia was caused by 1997 Asian financial crises and 1998 political crises that lead to dissatisfaction of the public and local governments to central government due to the crises (Green, 2005). According to Green (2005), this decentralization intended to gain local participation and accountability on the citizens' government participation and public service delivery levels. A transformation of government system in Indonesia from centralization into decentralization has affected nation's perspectives and regulations. Decentralization in Indonesia was initiated in 1999 through state law No. 22/1999 (UU 22/1999) then it was revised into State Law No. 32/2004 (UU No. 32/2004). The largest devolution of delegating government's political, administrative, and fiscal function from central to local governments in the world was not smoothly and fully implemented and brought uncertainty of future.

Although decentralization means contingencies of improving public services, local officers are risky of having inadequate national view and capacity building (ILO, 2009). In addition, local governments are not ready to administer additional authorities occurred by autonomy and their local expertise or competence is a problematic (Brodjonegoro, 2000, Green, 2005). Decentralization itself influenced Indonesian government's regulation on performance management system to assess accountability of local governments.

Prior 1998, when new regime fell and Asian financial crisis occurred, performance management system in Indonesia was based on budget allocation as a derivative from 1925 – The Indische Comptabiliteitswet (ICW) (Rhodes et al , 2012). After that era, budgetary and financial management principles were revised to accommodate accountability, transparency, professional managers' empowerment, and audit role significance and duplicated audit function's elimination (ADB, 2004). Indonesia also implemented performance based budgeting (PBB) aligned with 2011 budget and 2010 – 2014 intermediate plan that unified development and recurrent budgets (Rhodes et al , 2012).

## Performance management system in Indonesia

Indonesian government has initiated performance management system in 1999 through Presidential Instruction No. 7/1999 (Rhodes et al , 2012). Transformation of performance management assessment in 2010 – 2012 is on the standardization of documents from planning up to reporting and performance measurement' tools (see table 7. Appendix). This paper will use Minister of Administrative Reform Regulation No. 25/2012 (Permenpan No. 25/2012) as performance accountability guidance and tools. This policy categorizes performance accountability into five components of a system, which are performance planning that contributes 35%, performance measurement that contributes 20%, performance reporting that impacts 15%, performance evaluation that influences 10%, and performance achievements of goals that affects 20%. In total, they are accumulated as performance accountability of management.

Furthermore, this regulation classifies performance accountability based on grading into six levels starting from AA (>85-100), A (>75-85), B (>65 – 75), CC (>50-65), C (>30-50), and D (0-30). This classification is meant to encourage Indonesian governments to achieve their goals as they are stated in Intermediate Term National Planning (Menpan, 2013). Meanwhile, target of local governments' performance accountability for 2013 was 65% (Menpan, 2013).

Meanwhile, performance of personnel has significant issue relates with local government's performance because of 70% of government officers are employed in local governments; therefore, quality of personnel based on education and nature of duties are important (Bappenas, 2008). Furthermore, technical knowledge of local governments' officers is highly related with the understanding and use of performance management and its measurement tools (Akbar, 2012). A competency is also influenced by very fast rotation of local governments' officers that reduce local governments' capability of performance accountability including its reporting (Suryanto, 2014).

Local governments' officers work for 4 – 5 hours per day (Bappenas, 2008); meanwhile, the regulation for working hours is 7.5 hours per day (PP 53/2010) or 37.5 hours per week (Kepmenpan 8/1996 and Keppres 68/1995).

Senior officers or managers are reluctant to delegate their authority to their staffs due to fear of losing control of them, which also concerns about

different perspectives that may occur between staffs and managers (Haning, 2003, Antlov, 2002, Purwasito, 2001, Yudoyono 2001).

Inadequate capacity of local governments' officers has a strong relation with accountability and public spending of assets management and services delivery (World Bank, 2011). Capacity of local governments influences individual performance, which collectively will impact the capacity of local governments as institutions.

## **Policy Alternatives**

To solve four determinants of local governments' low achievements of performance accountability, author uses 3 criteria of effectiveness:

- Sustainability of performance management's implementation
- Ability to increase performance
- Ability to improve accountability

Therefore 5 policy alternatives are offered to improve achievements of all local governments' accountability:

- Open recruitment and open promotion's vacancy at all levels for all positions that is purposed to create transparency from requirements, procedures, tests into position appointment, to engage public participatory, and to generate competitiveness among local governments' officers.
- Strengthen monitoring of disciplinary, particularly working hours by implementing daily working sheet tool of targets and accomplishments to measure daily performance.
- Grand design of competitive career paths for local governments' officers to reduce power syndrome of certain officials who are reluctant to changes and to delegate authority.
- Integrate plan of comprehensive standard operating procedures, targets, and missions of local governments' articulation and publicity. Public officers documented and align the comprehensive organization's procedure, targets, and missions. These documents are guidance for local governments' operation. Documents or procedures that are related with public service should be published as open information and monitoring tool for public.
- Initiate community partnership to encourage public monitoring and public participatory of governance.

## **Policy Recommendations**

Based on CAM analysis above, 2 policy alternatives can be chosen as the immediate and long-run policy action. Policy option number 2, working sheet tool is used as the immediate policy to capture and to improve performance and its accountability. Meanwhile, policy option number 4, integrated plan of comprehensive standard operating procedures, targets, and missions of local governments' articulation and publicity, is used for long-run policy action. The chosen policies should be implemented for all local governments as a standardize tool and guidance.

## **Conclusion**

Indonesian central government has been trying to improve performance management, particularly local governments' performance. Based on the evaluation of performance accountability in 2013, only 27.3% of local governments achieved more than target of 65% performance accountability, and 72.7% others were under target. Data also showed that 51.5% of local governments managed to perform above performance management's average score.

The target's result of performance accountability showed that they performed lower than they were supposed to. This problem generated 4 consequences: low response because of poor performance, high errors, low goals' accomplishments, and poor audit opinions. This issue is caused by non-alignment between the need of local governments' officers with the requirement competencies, reduction of working hours, power syndrome, and low capability of local governments.

Solving this problem, 5 policy alternatives are proposed for all local governments: open recruitment and open promotion's vacancy at all levels for all positions, working sheet tool, competitiveness career path's grand design, integrated plan of comprehensive standard operating procedures, targets, and missions of local governments' articulation and publicity, and community partnership. Among these alternatives, 2 of them are best options for immediate and long-run policy actions. Working sheet tool can be implemented as immediate policy. Meanwhile, integrated plan of comprehensive standard



operating procedures, targets, and missions of local governments' articulation and publicity is used as long-run policy.

---

## **How Significant is Economic Development in Determining People's Resistance Towards Corruption in East Asia**

## **Sejauh Mana Pembangunan Ekonomi Menentukan Daya Tahan Masyarakat terhadap Korupsi di Asia Timur**

---

Nama : Kurniawan Wibowo  
NIP : 198103202007021001  
Instansi : KEMENLU  
Tahun Intake : 2011  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : Master of Art Asia Pasific Study  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : University of Leeds

## ABSTRACT

Corruption is pervasive in many countries despite different background of economic, politic, culture, and historical. However the presence of corruption in some countries seems to be tolerated, while in other is strongly opposed. Recalling that corruption is mostly associated with economy, presumption for people's different perception on corruption is determined by economic factor. It is true that economic development will bring more prosperity to people that will hinder them to look for other illegal resources to satisfy their needs. It is found that if the economy stops growing or even decline for a substantial period of time, people would become intolerant of the problems intrinsic to the system, for it no longer guarantees a higher standard of living. But if the system lasts for a substantial period of time, the participants would, more often than not, become blind to the intrinsic problems of the system, including corruption that infect society. Corruption is a matter of moral degradation. Thus It is more important to maintain morality than gaining sufficient wealth in order to prevent from corruption. The comparison study of four countries: Japan, South Korea, Indonesia, and Thailand, shows that corruption is difficult to be eliminated as it has similarities with Asian cultural traits. Due to different characteristic of corruption found, bribery as found in Japan and South Korea and extortion in Indonesia and Thailand influence how people perceive it. Bribery is more voluntary than extortion and this result in tolerance to corrupt practice. On contrary, extortion is a kind of exploitation which tends to get more resistance.

## ABSTRAK

Korupsi meluas di banyak negara meski berbeda latar belakang ekonomi, politik, budaya, dan sejarah. Namun kehadiran korupsi di beberapa negara nampaknya bisa ditolerir, sementara di pihak lain sangat ditentang. Mengingat bahwa korupsi sebagian besar terkait dengan ekonomi, anggapan bahwa persepsi masyarakat tentang korupsi ditentukan oleh faktor ekonomi. Memang benar bahwa pembangunan ekonomi akan membawa kemakmuran lebih bagi orang-orang yang akan menghalangi mereka untuk mencari sumber daya ilegal lainnya untuk memenuhi kebutuhan mereka. Ditemukan bahwa jika ekonomi berhenti tumbuh atau bahkan menurun untuk periode waktu yang substansial, orang akan menjadi tidak toleran. dari masalah intrinsik ke sistem, karena tidak lagi menjamin standar hidup yang lebih tinggi. Tetapi jika sistem berlangsung selama periode waktu yang substansial, para peserta akan, lebih sering daripada tidak, menjadi buta terhadap masalah intrinsik sistem, termasuk korupsi yang menginfeksi masyarakat. Korupsi adalah masalah degradasi moral. Dengan demikian, lebih penting menjaga moralitas daripada mendapatkan kekayaan yang cukup agar tidak terjadi korupsi. Studi perbandingan empat negara: Jepang, Korea Selatan, Indonesia, dan Thailand, menunjukkan bahwa korupsi sulit untuk dieliminasi karena memiliki kesamaan dengan ciri budaya Asia. Karena karakteristik korupsi yang berbeda ditemukan, penyuapan seperti yang ditemukan di Jepang dan Korea Selatan dan pemerasan di Indonesia dan Thailand mempengaruhi bagaimana orang memandangnya. Penyuapan lebih bersifat sukarela daripada pemerasan dan ini mengakibatkan toleransi terhadap praktik korupsi. Sebaliknya, pemerasan adalah semacam eksploitasi yang cenderung mendapat perlawanan lebih.

Concern about corruption in recent years never goes out. Corruption is often blamed as the main cause of increasing number of poverty in a country. Some other time, it is blamed for the lowering quality of education, health service and public infrastructure and such. But strangely, even though it is detrimental, corruption continue exist in almost any human civilization and seems impossible to be eliminated. As a result of this growing concern, there has been a universal condemnation of corrupt practices, which sometimes grow bigger into removal of some country leaders. However, it is not yet clear the effectiveness of the condemnation, as there is evidence for declining incidence of corruption in significant number, especially in corrupt countries.

Corruption case in Japan occurred repeatedly, involving politicians from the same party, Liberal Democratic Party. This phenomenon is considered to be caused by the electoral system, Single Non Transferable vote in multi member district which made electoral candidate to compete against each other within internal party. Betting on the political campaign then is the most effective way to attract more voters to choose. However such campaign needed for financial support, that candidate could not provide from his own pocket. As the result, there was trade of power between politician, bureaucrat and businessman to get mutual benefit. From this trade, candidate can get ample money politics which he can use to buy votes, as bureaucrat and businessman will be benefited by political position if the candidate is elected. All tough this practice is prone to be caught, however does not discourage candidate to accept the money. Even for the suspected candidate, he still can rerun for the next election, after purifying himself by making a public apology, and further can win the election. Such case is addressed to Tanaka Kakuei who was able to escape from at least three politic scandals in his career. For other common people buying votes is considered as cheating and immoral. However in Japan, such practice has been a common public secret. Everyone knows it is wrong, but still there is less reaction against it.

As compared to Japan, a slight different story is presented in South Korea. Corruption was an attractive issue for regime change. Such wrongdoing had been a social disease in Korea since the 16th century. In modern times, several political transitions between military and civilian used anti-corruption issue to win public support. However, spirit to eradicate corruption was just at the beginning. In the end of tenure, public became to know that the movement

leader's true intention of taking control of the government was not to eliminate corruption but even to preserve for their own sake. So far, few presidents of South Korea or their families are free of bribery scandal. Former president Kim Dae-jung, and Roh Moo-hyun are investigated receiving bribery. While son of the incumbent president Lee Myung-bak, was suspected for bribery case recently. And as in Japan, sadly corruption scandals occurred repeatedly and public seemed passive to accept the truth. The last occasion of public respond strongly toward corruption was during the Masan incidence in 1960, when people of Masan, about 35 kilometers from Busan, clashed with police officers after protesting the electoral corruption practice. This local protest grew wider into national level movement against corruption, and widely known as April 19 Revolution. This movement successfully ousted corrupt Presiden Syngman Rhee from his post in 26 April 1960.

A more recent and open form of people's discontent toward corruption is shown in Indonesia and Thailand. These two countries just experienced a dramatic regime change from corrupt government. Similar to South Korea, military ruled the countries for quite a while. In Indonesia, former President Suharto, climb up to the seat of power through a bloodless coup after a series of demonstrations protesting rampant corruption practices during the ruling of the first President Sukarno. Suharto sit as the ruler for 32 years and during which it was proven that he was not better, in terms of anti-corruption, as compared to his predecessor. Corruption became a social disease and so rampant that even affected the poor people. Public were discontent with his style of ruling which was dictatorship, and his support for corruption to flourish in the country. Under spirit of anti-corruption, people succeeded to oust Suharto out of his post. Thai people in 2006 witnessed another political turmoil. One of the reasons for the coup was accusation of the corrupt government during Thaksin Shinawatra's presidency. In fact, political turmoil often happened in this country, and mostly used anti-corruption issue. Not different from what happened in South Korea, those who hold power in Thailand initially intend to build a clean government but after a while public become realize that the true motive of holding power is to secure resource of wealth.

From the cases above, we can see that people from different countries, histories, and culture, are presented with same growing issue, corruption.

However the way they respond to it is different from one to another. As corruption is mostly associated with economy, this paper will try to analyze relation between degree of people's resistance and economic development toward corruption. The preliminary assumption is when people enjoy low economic development then there will be stronger resistance to corruption. Hence, some research question may arise from this are:

- To what extent people can tolerate corruption?
- Does economic development become main consideration for people to resist corruption?
- In the absence of economic development, will there be stronger resistance that will lead to diminishing corruption from society?

This study will use qualitative methodology with library based research. Resources used are books, journals, reports and conference paper.

## **Japan**

Japanese political system is often associated with political corruption. Since Japan enter a democratic stage and held its first democratic election in 1955, the political system was ruled continuously by a single party, the Liberal Democratic Party (LDP), until its defeat in 2009 election. During that period, political corruption flourished along with the continuing success of LDP to win votes. To win votes was not easy and free. It required a lot of resources, wealth and people, to be selected in competition, not with candidates from other parties, but rather within the LDP itself. Close alliance with bureaucrat and business enable them to gain the resources needed although as the side impact, it led to pervasive corruption. Relationship among the iron triangle is a patron-client, where each needs other help to success. Practice of bribing thus is common to show gratitude for help given by other.

Political corruption in form of money politics was intensified under Tanaka, who was eventually arrested after convicted to receive bribe from Lockheed Aircraft. Prior to the Lockheed scandal, Tanaka had been involved in many money politic scandals in Japan. However, he could always be able to escape and continuing his political career. Tanaka established a money machine through which he collect fund from big business and disbursed to his faction members to ensure longevity of his power. Even though he resigned from prime

minister post, his money machine was still retained by his faction until LDP's defeat in 1993.

The dissatisfaction with corruption and scandal that may influence declining vote for LDP in 1993, although other factors such as new electoral system and urbanization, that change voters field for the party, may also influential. Japanese seem tend to believe that their politics, as in any countries, cannot be immune from money transaction, legal or illegal and that makes them looks alike tolerant to political corruption. There is no open protest to the party, instead Japanese use not to choose option as manifestation of their protest. Another way of protest as observed is through growing number of Japanese involved in informal political activism of NGO. More equal distribution of wealth may be another factor of Japanese silence toward corruption. When all things they need are reachable, people then think how to protect from being taken by other. Under that condition, as long the wrongdoing of political leaders does not have any direct harmful impact toward their life, then that can be tolerated.

## **South Korea**

Practice of corruption was not new for Koreans, as in the past it repeatedly led to regime changes. The Second Republic was overthrown by Major General Park Chung-hee through a military coup in 1961 as the President's Chang had been considered as corrupt. To stop corruption which had infected governmental system, Park declared a fresh and clean government. However, due to ambition for the second term by declaring Yusin doctrine, he was ousted by national rallies led by students. Following presidents also take anti-corruption as one of their main program but mostly in the end of tenure were indicted for corrupt scandals. Curbing corruption in South Korea is not easy as there is realization that Korean might lose what they achieved through economic development unless they can eliminate corruption completely. As it is known, corruption has been living side by side with their economic development, and is believed to support their development. Thus, it is too risky to change the combination. According to the CPI report, Korea sits at number 44 out of 182 countries in 2011. Pattern of corruption in South Korea is not so rampant in the public sector that makes it less experienced by society. Most corruption scandal surrounds the high politicians and businessmen. Due to the fact, corruption in South Korea



can be described as grey corruption. Following Heidenheimer's categorization as discussed earlier, the elites want corruption to be eliminated while majority is ambiguous. Most commonly cited social practices but considered as grey corruption are gift giving for showing gratitude or wedding present, asking favour from relatives for job recruitment or rebates. The practices are voluntarily in characteristic and no act of exploiting other, different from money politics practice which mostly done by politicians. Money politics exist as there is need from politician to win elections and to retain power. Politician has to fund political organization and vote buying through such acts: throwing parties, creating hiking club, and attending holiday.

Money politics derived from need to win elections and retain power. Retaining power requires political organization, and that means political funding. Vote buying is thorough throwing parties, creating hiking clubs, and attending wedding and holidays (99). To gain the money, politicians urge donation from Chaebols in exchange of allocation of bank loans, foreign loans, and import licenses. David Kang explained that such voluntary donation is called by businessmen as "chun chose" or quasi taxes. Sometimes donation is under the cover of humanitarian purpose, although actually act as money politics. The risk for Chaebols if do not provide sufficient funds, "their loans got called by the Bank of Korea, or they suffered audit, or their subsidy application was denied (2002: 102). By this centralistic pattern, corruption in South Korea has less effect toward society and tends to be tolerated by people as it has direct impact more to the domestic politics.

## **Indonesia**

Sukarno and Suharto are known to have close contact with businessmen, mostly were Chinese. Chinese Indonesian, despite was just minority, had long controlled economic of the country. Chinese dominance is shown in what Girling said: "in 1990 from 80 present of companies listed in JEX were Chinese owned, and compose 247 of the top taxpayers" (1997: 44). To ease their way, they approached prominent figures and providing bribery, graft in exchange for their running business. Le Vine described Sukarno's corruption that "during guided democracy during 1958-1965, top powerful business millionaires offered huge bribes for state-guaranteed economic privileges, and for protection of

their black market saes; illegal gambling, smuggling, etc” (1975: 13). Not much different, Suharto was known so close with Liem Sioe Liong, or known as Uncle Liem, a native Chinese tycoon but building his economic empire in Indonesia. From his collusion with the president, Liem benefited economically through “monopoly of some business, such as the farming out of opium, pawnshops, gambling leases and brothels” (Ahmed 2002: 229). The unequal economic level between Chinese and indigenous Indonesian often resulted social envy. Thus, this explain why during people’s anger in 1998 riot, some Chinese became the victims.

In low level of society, practice of bribing is common, as without giving, common people will be difficult to obtain service, rights and privileges. Bribery is seen as grease to transaction in all bureaucracies. Therefore, there is term for public sectors which deal with public interest as “wet” as involving sum of money, such as immigration, custom. While other which does not produce money as “dry”. Besides bribery, practice of extortion is quite common as well. Sometimes the public officer determines the amount of bribery to smoothen administrative process. And in high level, the president once issued decree which “stipulated that all state corporations set aside 5% of their profits to Suharto’s foundations” (Ahmed 233). The practice of nepotism and cronyism is also rampant in all sectors.

Particularly during Suharto’s regime, it would be difficult to get a job in state offices if did not have a relative who hold a strong influence in the office. “All the personnel in one particular office belonged to a single family group; that is of the office chief’ (Ahmed 2005: 231). Suharto himself was obvious in using his power and position for benefit of his family and cronies. In 14 March 1998, Suharto announced the appointment of eldest daughter, Siti Hardijanti Rukmana, as Minister for Social Affairs and his long time crony, Bob Hasan to handle Trade and Industry portfolio, both are wet sectors. Before that, Suharto already gave his concession to his wife, six children, and cronies to control business interests: from banking, cooking oil, to vehicle assembly.

Although regime has changed, practice of corruption still flourishes although in the lesser degree as compared to Suharto’s era. Since the establishment of Commission for Corruption Eradication (KPK) in 2005, people perceive the seriousness of government to eradicate corruption, of which was handled by attorney and police, that is shown from increasing CPI index.

## Thailand

Thailand important economic player in Southeast Asia, as it becomes production hub, particularly for several major automotive industries, and during 1985-1995 it was one of the highest economic growth countries in the world. The economics of the country continue to show positive sign but not for its politics. Since 1932, the country has been experiencing many regime changes in the country, in total 21 Prime Ministers from military and civilian. Military dictatorship has ruled for 40 years and 17 times of bloodless coup has occurred. The frequent change of regime in Thailand is due one of the reason is for corruption issue. However corruption seemed was just justification for coup. At the beginning, military leaders convinced public as honest and determined leader to eradicate corruption, injustice and underdevelopment. However it then was revealed that true motive for coup was to acquire wealth and power and to secure source of wealth. For example, although General Sarit's coup in 1957 marked Thailand's turning point in development, soon after his death in 1963, it was revealed that the General hold immense assets | banking, real estate and other. High friction and competition among army leaders also force the frequent occurrence of coup in Thailand. Not much different from earlier time General Praphat, who replaced general Sarit, was found more corrupt and even manipulated an anticorruption agency into an instrument for systematic destructing rival faction. The last military coup in 1991 was not different in motive from the previous ones.

Corruption indeed a serious problem in Thailand, as shown in table CPI in 2010 (3.50) was not better than in 1996il (3.53) although it has enacted constitutional reform toward democratic society in 1997. Thus it always becomes a good issue to evoke spirit of domestic change. Besides corrupt military, politicians are fond sing various means with impunity to acquire wealth and prestige. Black money, government project, diversion of government fund and extortion of business elites are some of means politicians use (Ahmed 2005: 211). Collusion between politician and businessmen make project bidding as formality process since the winner has actually been decided. The existence of Chinese businessmen influences the flourishing corruption in economy of Thailand. Chinese has involved in Thailand's commercial activities since the 17th century and by the 20th century they have grown as the largest business power in export import, rice milling, shipping, banking, and large scale retail (Scott (Ahmed 2005: 212). At the beginning Chinese, as minority, was exploited

by indigenous rulers. To overcome their weakness, the Chinese paid bribery in return for protection of their business and political power. Another tactic employed by Chinese is to include top Thailand's officials in their company's board of directors, entitled with share of profit of the company.

To achieve power, politicians rely on the power of money. As in many corrupt democratic countries, the practice of vote buying and illegal funding for electoral campaign was rampant in Thailand. Thaksin Shinawatra, former Thailand's Prime Minister, in an interview admitted that the money politics is needed as long does not go beyond degree that prevent from creation of good government. In fact, he was ousted from his position for corruption accusation. Corruption practices in Thailand seems already become a common fact that does not have direct effect toward society. Regime change in the name of corruption eradication will be likely repeated as long there are still ambitious people who want to manipulate power to fulfil private benefit.

## **Conclusion**

Corruption is a multifaceted phenomenon that needs to be observed from many different angles. Although it is often associated with economic motive, corruption can happen when there are other motives accompany, those are opportunities and sanction. From the personal factor, the presence of morality is importance. Individuals, as are endowed with envy and tendency to imitate other success, without morality they will be likely to use all means to pursue their self-interest, even if they have to against the law. To hinder from corruption, there should be gap in society controlling so that inequality of wealth and before law will not arouse envy. Strong leadership is important to prevent governmental system fall into corrupt.

Observing corruption practice in Japan, South Korea, Indonesia, and Thailand, there are some particular characteristics of corruption practice in each country. In Japan and South Korea corruption is dominated by practice of bribery, which Westerners often associates with tradition of gift-giving, to show gratitude or asking for other's favour as both need each other. But this tradition can turn into extortion when the patron has the power to exploit the client as can be found in Indonesia and Thailand. The rampant corruption practice is likely due to big gap of inequality of wealth and before law that put the client

in weak position as they do not have resource to be equal with the patron. The figure leader much respected in most Asian countries that make people tend to trust the leader rather than the governmental system.

From the case study it is shown that when individuals' self-interest is not disturbed by corrupt practise done by other, they will tolerate others to do what they want to. But when the misbehaviour is too rampant which disturb everyday life of individuals, finally that triggers dissent toward corruption. In relation with economic development, if the economy stops growing or even decline for a substantial period of time, people would become intolerant of the problems intrinsic to the system, for it no longer guarantees a higher standard of living. But if the system lasts for a substantial period of time, the participants would, more often than not, become blind to the intrinsic problems of the system. In the worst case, even illegal money transactions would be perceived as normal. Corruption will never be able to be diminished, but it is controllable. When economic development is nil, corruption will still exist, but will be more subtle to detect to avoid resistance.

Using the theoretical framework analysis, resistance to corruption arises when the class involved are differentiated by multi factors, such as ethnicity, wealth, justice, and economy. As we can see in homogenous society as Japan and Korea, tolerance to corruption is quite high as the determining factor is just economic matter. Besides, the level of economic development which enables Japanese and Korean to fulfil their interest without need to resort to corruption also matters. But as in Indonesia and Thailand, where society is heterogeneous, people is likely to resist any inequality among races or ethnicity. Recalling to history, it is proven that no revolution is spurred by the exploitation or corruption. The exploited group do not have resource to lead such movement. The use of anti- corruption issue, to start revolt is likely just as cover to conceal the true corrupt intention. It is more a way to avoid competition among corruptors. The comparison study of four countries: Japan, South Korea, Indonesia, and Thailand, shows that corruption is difficult to be eliminated as it has similarities with Asian cultural traits. Due to different characteristic of corruption found, bribery as found in Japan and South Korea and extortion in Indonesia and Thailand influence how people perceive it. Bribery is more voluntary than extortion and this result in tolerance to corrupt practice. On contrary, extortion is a kind of exploitation which tends to get more resistance than bribery.

---

**Permasalahan Tanpa Kewarganegaraan  
Rohingnya dan Proses Transnasionalisme  
di Negara-Negara Transit: Menilai Peran  
Aktor Non-Negara melalui Jaringan  
Advokasi Transnasional**

**Rohingya's Statelessness Problem and  
Transnationalism Process in Transit  
Countries: Assessing the Role of Non-  
State Actors through Transnational  
Advocacy Network**

---

Nama : Ni Nengah Yuni Ariastiti  
NIP : 198506172009012002  
Instansi : KEMENLU  
Tahun Intake : 2014  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : Master of Arts in Law and Diplomacy  
Negara Studi : Amerika Serikat  
Universitas : Tufts University

Our world today is characterized by technological revolutions in transportation and communication, resulting in increased connectedness across borders, promotion of social integration, as well as expansion in mobility and networks. In other words, our era has been strongly linked to the concept of transnationalism, which Steven Vertovec defines as “sustained linkages and ongoing exchanges among non-state actors based across national borders – business, NGOs, and individuals sharing the same interests (such as religious beliefs, common cultural and geographic origins)”. Similarly, International Organization for Migration (IOM) defines transnationalism as “migrations across international borders in which persons establish and maintain activities and connections in both the polity from which they originated and the new state in which they live, and includes actors that are not states”. Migrants are closely attached to transnational activities because they are able to maintain their connectivity across geopolitical borders, such as sending economic remittances, forming migrants associations, engaging in political movements at home and in the host communities, as well as sharing social values absorbed in places of migration to their places of origin. Realizing the many benefits that migrants could bring to the country, many governments nowadays also increasingly encourage migration and actively engage their diasporas abroad.

Taking note of the definition of transnationalism mentioned above and its connection with migrant’s life, the question is whether the concept of transnationalism is relevant to stateless persons who migrate either voluntarily or forcibly. What are the implications of statelessness for transnationalism? What makes stateless status different from other types of undocumented migrants related to doing transnational activities, such as in the social, economic and political aspect? How can stateless people benefit from transnationalism and its related activities considering the fact that they have no recourse to state representation and protection, lack of freedom of mobility, and have no political power? What are the impeding challenges? With all the shortcomings of becoming stateless, who can help in channeling them to carry out transnational activities especially in transit countries?

This paper aims to understand the concept of transnationalism when it comes to statelessness issue, and how statelessness could have an effect on transnational processes. It will specifically delve into the possible transnational

processes and strategies carried out by Rohingya, a Muslim minority group in Myanmar who are currently residing in several countries in Southeast Asia to 'transit' before continuing their journey to an expected country of destination. The paper will also discuss transit migration and try to figure out how it makes a difference for stateless people to be 'in transit' rather than in other circumstances.

Experiencing continued discriminatory practices and structural violence committed by the Government of Myanmar, as well as constant oppression from the Buddhist-majority society, hundreds of thousands of Rohingya have been forced to flee their homes to other countries seeking sanctuary. Unfortunately, Rohingya's forced migration has often times ended bitterly. Countries in Southeast Asia like Thailand, Malaysia and Indonesia have been harshly implementing a 'push-back-boat' policy signaling their rejection of the refugees. In this situation, states that should have protected those unfortunate people have turned a blind eye and even worse, states themselves have become violators of human rights. In the meantime, human traffickers – with the connivance of callous officials – are also maliciously exploiting Rohingya's weaknesses by asking for ransom. Unable to pay the ransom, Rohingya are tortured and held hostage for months in some hidden camps. Some of the women have also been gang-raped by the human traffickers.

No longer able to rely on the protection of the state, Rohingya must find other actors to facilitate their transnationalism processes in order to claim their rights. In this situation, non-state actors (NSAs) – such as non-governmental organizations, religious organizations, civil society, as well as regional and international organizations – fill in the gap and become the saviors, which Rohingya could strongly rely on. In this paper, NSAs are referred to as institution, entity or organizations that have non-violent movements and are respectful to morality and human rights principles, as stipulated in article 3 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, asserting that "everyone has the right to life, liberty and security of person". Therefore, armed groups are not included in this paper even though scholars in international law also categorize them as NSAs.

Following this introduction, this paper will be divided into three main sections. First, it will explain the cause of Rohingya's statelessness, which is the Government of Myanmar's new citizenship policy that intentionally excludes



Rohingya, and how this situation creates adverse implications and leads to vulnerability of Rohingya. It is also salient to provide brief account of Rohingya's displacement and the places they intend to go, which is the country of destination, as well as transit countries where they get stranded or temporarily reside. The concept of transit migration will also be explored.

Second, this paper will elaborate on the relationship between statelessness and transnationalism, especially by looking at the economic, social and political aspects of Rohingya in transit countries. This segment will also examine factors that could affect the ability of Rohingya to carry out transnational activities, as well as attempt to explain the possible opportunities available for them despite the disadvantages of being transient and undocumented. This section hopes to answer the following questions: How do Rohingya connect with their relatives and friends at home? Can they send economic and social remittances? Do they have associations or network abroad to help voice their rights? What is Rohingya's strategy for claiming their rights in countries of transit? This section will elaborate the strategy used by Rohingya to participate in transnationalism despite all of the obstacles they may encounter.

The third section will discuss the role of NSAs, who are operating under the so-called Transnational Advocacy Networks, as well as explain about the Boomerang Pattern which is very useful to understand Rohingya's overall movement and strategy for transnationalism. With the absence of states protection, NSAs might be very crucial in assisting Rohingya to put pressure on the targeted government, incorporate into the host society and participate in transnational activities in order to connect them with their compatriots back home.

Having all of the points mentioned above which will be elaborated further in the upcoming sections, I shall argue that statelessness obstructs the process of transnationalism because it curbs the freedom to exchange ideas and values, impedes economic contribution and limits political mobilization, but does not completely eliminate it. Statelessness and the condition of uncertainty also affect the strategy for claiming rights and carrying out transnationalism activities for Rohingya in transit country in particular. The circumstances they face play a role in determining the actors who can influence the attainment of their expectations. The opportunity to succeed lies in the role and active

participation of NSAs which, given their extensive links could establish a network consisting of important actors including states, international organizations, media and other stakeholders that have influential decision-making power. A strong advocacy network could meet the demands and needs of Rohingya who cannot participate in the transnational activities at the minimum level, and strive to help these stateless people in claiming their rights in a higher political platform.

## **Role of Transnational Advocacy Network**

Advocacy network has the ability to mobilize information, to persuade, pressure, and gain leverage over much more powerful organizations and governments with the ultimate goal being to change the policies and behavior of the state. Networks could be formed and strengthened by using international conferences and other forms of international contacts. Opportunities for network activities have increased significantly thanks to the advance of communication technology that expedites the flow of information. Keck and Sikkink explain that transnational advocacy network works strategically as follows: First of all, it moves information quickly to where it will have the most impact, also known as 'information politics'. In this step, the media are essential partners because they can help to show refugees' grievances to wider audiences, to attract international attention and eventually to mobilize the mass for a coordinated political action. However, it needs to be noted that many information exchanges are relayed informally, such as through telephone calls, e-mail, newsletters, pamphlets and bulletins, which purpose is to persuade people and stimulate them to take action. For example, Rohingya youths created a media channel called RVision (Rohingya Vision) which mission is to raise awareness of the Rohingya issues and address their problems. The Youtube-broadcasted RVision's programs are mostly viewed by the Rohingya people all over the world, which serves as a bridge among them to strengthen their identity, to exchange information and ideas as well as to motivate them to take action. This media channel could become an avenue to promote the spirit of cooperation and interactions among Rohingya and the international community, as well as to educate Rohingya on human rights.

Secondly, advocacy network should be able to call upon symbols, actions or stories which in turn become catalysts for the growth of networks, or also known as symbolic politics. Advocacy network could use the victory of National League for Democracy (NLD) Party in the 2015 election in Myanmar as an opportunity to encourage the new government to resolve the Rohingya problem without sparking new conflict in the society. The victory gives strong hope for the peaceful transfer of power from military-dominated parliament to civilian, to form government and push through legislation that could benefit Rohingya. Furthermore, Aung San Suu Kyi, as a Nobel Laureate in the field of human rights should be pressured to pay more attention to the uprooted rights of Rohingya in Rakhine state. Unfortunately, none of the above achievements has resulted in positive impact or progressive change for Rohingya's situation. Aung San Suu Kyi is still reluctant to speak out on the issue, with reason that her opinion will only exacerbate the tension between Buddhist and Muslim, and also due to the fear that her attention toward Rohingya will damage her popularity among Buddhist citizens.

The third one is leverage politics. Due to the lack of power and influence, weak groups are less able to act on their own in order to affect state's policies. Therefore, they can use advocacy network to call upon powerful actors and ask for support. In this regard, leverage can take the form of material and moral leverage. For example, EU is using material leverage in the form of the extension of arms embargo against Myanmar until 2016. The US also sanctions Myanmar by restricting US companies to do business in the country until there is significant progress to democracy. Meanwhile, the US was also committed to resettle more than 3000 Rohingya in 2014, with over 13,000 people have been resettled in the US since 2002. Moreover, the US House of Representatives has also passed a Resolution 418 urging the Government of Myanmar to end the persecution of Rohingya and to recognize them as citizens, as well as to call on other governments and international community to put consistent pressure on the Government of Myanmar to end discrimination toward this minority group. Moral leverage, also called the 'mobilization of shame' will be useful when states place a high value on its prestige in international arena, which is not a quite effective strategy since Government Myanmar places its national interest above its international image.

Fourth, advocacy network could oblige more powerful actors to act on vaguer policies or principles they formally endorse, or known as accountability politics. Once a government has publicly committed itself to a human rights principle, advocacy networks can use those positions, to expose the distance between discourse and practice. For example, in accordance to the human rights principles stipulated in the ASEAN Charter, advocacy network can ask for the commitment of ASEAN member states through the ASEAN Intergovernmental Commission on Human Rights (AICHR) to take action on Rohingya issue. Networks can ask for the commitment of governments to provide places of refuge for fleeing Rohingya and to stop towing back Rohingya boats to the sea.

## **The Boomerang Pattern**

When the links between state and domestic actors are disturbed, domestic NGOs may directly seek international allies to try to bring pressure on their states from outside. This transnational advocacy network links activists in developed countries with others in less developed countries with the primary purpose to change the behavior of targeted actor, which is state. This is when the boomerang pattern may occur, which is most common in human rights campaigns. The diagram below will provide a clear illustration of how transnational advocacy network may become involved in this kind of rights-claiming pattern.

The interaction among different actors through Boomerang Pattern indicates that linkages are important, not only for the less powerful third world actors, but also for the developed countries. For the former, networks provide access, leverage and information (and often money) they could not obtain by themselves. While for the latter, their involvement can be seen as their commitment to struggle with the less developed countries and their actors.

One of the examples of the success of network's pressure is that Thailand, Malaysia and Indonesia have agreed to take thousands of stranded Rohingya refugees until they are resettled in a third country or repatriated within 12 months. In the Joint Statement issued during the 2015 Ministerial Meeting on Irregular Movement of People in Southeast Asia, Indonesia and Malaysia offered temporary shelter to thousands of migrants; Malaysia launched search-and-rescue missions for stranded migrant boats stranded; and Thailand has agreed to halt push-backs. This is a surprisingly positive move

since these countries have previously had a vicious policy toward boat people. The success of transnational advocacy networks is due to continued pressure by international aid groups, who together with media have put state's 'game of human ping-pong in the sea' under international spotlight. Organizations like International Organization for Migration and Human Rights Watch also keep pushing ASEAN Governments especially those who agreed to offer solutions for Rohingya under the Joint Statement, to 'walk the talk'.

Another example is the issuance of the UN General Assembly Resolution urging Myanmar to provide full citizenship to its Rohingya Muslim minority and to allow them to move freely throughout the country. Even though the Burmese authority has rejected this international demand due to strong refusal from its people, this Resolution shows positive attention and seriousness from the international community which indicates the success of the work of the advocacy network.

### **Rohingya's Transnationalism through the Partnership with Non-State Actors**

As explained above, in order to be able to carry out transnational activities and to voice their desires, Rohingya need a beneficial partnership with non-state actors. Volker Heins calls this situation "non-governmentality" that is based on the belief that "the welfare of the population and the improvement of its condition can best be served by non-state actors". However, it should be noted that the transnational efforts could be better enjoyed by Rohingya who already settled down in the host country for a longer period of time. This is because, over the years they could get together at a place where information exchange is likely to occur, and finally they could voice their demand more freely in the public space, an opportunity that is not likely to be available to the 'newcomers' due to their limited resources and connection.

The first example of Rohingya's engagement in transnationalism is the ability to establish an association where they can fight for their rights. Establishing association is important because it means that Rohingya can build social network which is very helpful in coping with the difficult experience of settlement in a new society among other things. For instance, a group of Rohingya migrants who live in Thailand has established an organization called

Burmese Rohingya Association in Thailand (BRAT) since August 2004. Another example is Burmese Rohingya Community in Australia (BRCA) established by Rohingya residents in Australia since 1999. BRCA is very active in voicing the plights of Rohingya in Australia, through meeting with Ministers and other high-level Australian politicians, while BRAT is actively engaged in seminars, photos exhibition and other activities alike that are aimed to raise people's awareness. These Rohingya associations aim to engage international communities, civil society and individuals to advocate the plights of Rohingya and to restore democracy and human rights in Myanmar. In this regard, Rohingya organizations may function as transnational community because they belong to two or more society at the same time, and maintain identification with the homeland. In other words, Rohingya is not able to conduct transnational relations (maintain the relationships across borders) directly as individual persons, but rather through the intermediation of various organizations. In this case, the rise of networks and institutions is an evidence of transnationalism as a social formation which enables Rohingya to create new forms of social relations and action across national borders.

Secondly is the ability of Rohingya to conduct social and political activism in the host society. The experience of exclusion and trauma has shaped Rohingya's political identity and consciousness which consequently lead them to social and political activism. Their horrible experience of torture committed by the authority and Buddhist community, as well as remembrance of their family and compatriots back home, serve as a catalyst for their political engagement. Undoubtedly, getting involved in an activism in a country of transit will be difficult without the support of local civil society organizations. In other words, the partnership between Rohingya and local NGOs is compulsory to make activism efforts plausible. The best example is when in 2015, hundreds of Rohingya refugees in Malaysia staged a protest outside the Myanmar Embassy in Kuala Lumpur, demanding for full citizenship and return of their assets and properties. Protesters were joined by several Malaysian NGOs and members of the opposition Islamic party, urging Malaysia as the 2015 ASEAN Chair to pressure Myanmar Government to stop atrocities against Rohingya. Rohingya refugees in Malaysia are participating more actively in an activism which illustrates their ability to voice their demands directly in an open space, a situation that is impossible if Rohingya have to act on their own.

## Conclusion

The concept of transnationalism is strongly related to migrants' ability to maintain their connectivity across geopolitical borders, which is indicated by, among other things, the ability to send economic remittances, to establish an association, or to engage in political movements both at home and at places of reception. However, when it comes to the case of stateless Rohingya, who are forcibly migrating to other countries because of continued persecution and structural violence from the Government of Myanmar, the aforementioned ideal notion of transnationalism is no longer fully relevant. Due to their state of illegality as a consequence of the absence of citizenship, Rohingya are not able to fully engage in transnational activities. This is exacerbated with the fact that they encounter significant challenges, not only in Myanmar, but also along the fleeing journey as well as in the places of transit and destination. Being in transit places also means that Rohingya's transnationalism efforts are more complicated because of the characteristics of uncertainty as well as the tentativeness of the route and long duration of the journey.

The condition of being stateless obstructs transnationalism process because it curbs the freedom to exchange ideas and values, impedes economic contribution, and limits political mobilization. It is even worse because Rohingya have to confront the situation of immobility due to the fact that many of them are incarcerated in the immigration detention centers. However, statelessness does not completely abolish the chance to carry out transnationalism. Rather, transnational activities are likely to occur when Rohingya are encouraged by the feeling of 'shared grievances' and negative experience they received committed by the states or human traffickers. This situation, known as 'reactive transnationalism', has generated Rohingya's aspiration to conduct activities that can provide solutions for their problems. Because they are powerless to act by themselves, Rohingya need the assistance from actors other than the states.

In the situation of inability to seek redress through states, Rohingya need the support and assistance from non-state actors (NSAs) such as NGOs, faith-based organizations and civil society in order to be able to participate in transnationalism. NSAs are very significant for Rohingya because unlike state actors which follow a hierarchical and rigid system within a given territory, NSAs are more flexible and unrestrained in carrying out their activities across

borders. With this capability, NSAs could more easily build an advocacy network involving different actors in the region or internationally with the hope to establish a fruitful policy to address Rohingya's plights, as well as to put pressure on the Burmese Government. The presence of NSAs is very significant to prevent the disappearance of the ability to do transnationalism. Instead, they help to make transnationalism efforts possible for Rohingya.

This Transnational Advocacy Network is able to prove that Rohingya's ability to carry out transnational activities is not completely eroded. Rather, transnationalism may become possible, even though it is limited to a certain degree. For example, with the facilitation of NGOs, Rohingya might be able to establish an association, build an alternative media channel, and engage in political activism. However, they are still not able to be in contact and send money to family members back home due to high restriction from the domestic government. The Transnational Advocacy Network has also proven successful in bringing concerned states together in cooperation to address the flow of Rohingya into the region. Thailand, Malaysia and Indonesia, the countries that enforce callous exclusion policies toward Rohingya, have agreed to receive stranded Rohingya and bring the notorious 'push-back' policy to an end. As a result of NSAs' advocacy network that is able to link the interests of domestic actors with their international allies, international community has also paid serious attention to the issue of Rohingya, resulting in the issuance of UNGA Resolution urging Myanmar to provide full citizenship to the stateless group. In this regard, Transnational Advocacy Network which consists of different types of non-state actors that have different degree of power and flexibility could play a complementary relationship and do harmonious approaches. NGOs, faith-based organizations and civil society that have less influence on governments could utilize on their flexibility to carry out activities across borders, while regional and international organizations that are more restrained in doing their work could use their power to influence other states to take actions. In other words, NGOs and other non-state actors can maximize their roles in certain area where state actors are not able to do so.

To end Rohingya's misery is not impossible, but it needs relentless efforts and serious commitment from concerned actors, especially NSAs and their extensive network. Transnational network of organizations have proven



to be capable of making progressive steps for the betterment of Rohingya in third countries in terms of doing transnational activities. The establishment of Rohingya associations in several countries is clear evidence that stateless people might still be able to engage in transnational activities. Despite all the possible success of NSAs relationships with Rohingya and other actors, more cooperation is still required to improve the situation of Rohingya in Myanmar. It is plausible that state and non-state actors alike could pressure the Burmese Government to revoke its citizenship policy, one of the many goals that need to be achieved to improve the condition of the Rohingya.

---

## **Pendekatan People-oriented ASEAN dalam Menangani Isu Terorisme di Asia Tenggara**

### **ASEAN's People-oriented Approach in Addressing the Issue of Terrorism in Southeast Asia**

---

Nama : Noviandri Wibowo  
NIP : 198511042009121001  
Instansi : KEMENLU  
Tahun Intake : 2013  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : Master of Arts in International Security  
and Terrorism  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : University of Nottingham

## ABSTRAK

Disertasi tersebut mencoba untuk menyelidiki pertanyaan sentral sejauh mana ASEAN telah mempromosikan pendekatan '*people-oriented*' dalam menangani isu terorisme di Asia Tenggara. Penyelidikan ini sangat penting karena terorisme telah berdampak negatif terhadap kehidupan masyarakat di wilayah ini sementara pada saat yang sama, ASEAN telah berkomitmen untuk membawa diri menuju Komunitas ASEAN yang berorientasi pada rakyat. Untuk mendapatkan jawabannya, penelitian kualitatif dilakukan dengan menggunakan metode analisis kausal dan wacana. Cara ASEAN menangani isu terorisme di wilayah tersebut akan dinilai dengan kerangka konseptual keamanan manusia yang terdiri dari unsur-unsur perlindungan dan pemberdayaan. Disertasi tersebut berpendapat bahwa pendekatan '*people-oriented*' dalam mempromosikan isu terorisme oleh ASEAN terbatas pada kerangka pembentukan norma dan kerangka kelembagaan tanpa mekanisme pelaksanaan yang solid di tingkat regional. Diharapkan bahwa studi ini berkontribusi pada perdebatan akademis dan pelajaran kebijakan mengenai realisasi '*people-oriented ASEAN*', terutama bagaimana organisasi menangani isu terorisme.

## ABSTRACT

The dissertation attempts to investigate the central question of to what extent ASEAN has promoted a 'people-oriented' approach in addressing the issue of terrorism in Southeast Asia. This inquiry is crucial since terrorism has negatively affected the lives of the people in the region while at the same time, ASEAN has committed to bringing itself towards a people-oriented ASEAN Community. To find the answer, a qualitative research is undertaken using the methods of causal and discourse analysis. The way ASEAN addresses the issue of terrorism in the region will be assessed with the conceptual framework of human security consisting of the elements of protection and empowerment. The dissertation argues that the promotion of 'people-oriented' approach in addressing the issue of terrorism by ASEAN is limited to norms building and institutional framework setting without any solid implementing mechanism at the regional level. It is expected that this study contributes to the academic debate and policy lesson on the realisation of 'people-oriented ASEAN', especially in how the organisation deals with the issue of terrorism.

For the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN), 2015 is a critical year. By the time, the regional organisation will have established an ASEAN Community that has long been envisioned since 1997 as enshrined in the ASEAN Vision 2020 (ASEAN 1997). This commitment was reinforced by the adoption of the Declaration of ASEAN Concord II (Bali Concord II) in 2003, suggesting that an ASEAN Community shall comprise three pillars, namely political and security cooperation, economic cooperation, and socio-cultural cooperation (ASEAN 2003). Four years later, through the 2007 Cebu Declaration, the establishment of an ASEAN community was decided to be accelerated by the year of 2015 (ASEAN 2007).

Building an ASEAN Community is actually a regional integration project of Southeast Asian countries with the objective of 'ensuring durable peace, stability and shared prosperity in the region' (ASEAN 2003). For that reason, one major step has been taken. In 2007, the ASEAN Leaders signed an ASEAN Charter that has come into force since 2008. The Charter is deemed as 'a firm foundation in achieving the ASEAN Community' because it has turned ASEAN from a loose association into a rules-based organisation with 'legal status and institutional framework' (ASEAN 2014a). Apart from it, in 2009 ASEAN also adopted three ASEAN Community Blueprints, which serve as roadmaps and timetables to establish an ASEAN Community by 2015. Each of the three blueprints is designated for each pillar of the community and contains multiple lines of actions that shall be implemented by the ASEAN member states.

One interesting notion that ASEAN recurrently emphasises within the context of community building is the commitment to orient ASEAN towards people. Since the adoption of the ASEAN Vision 2020 in 1997, the idea of 'people-oriented ASEAN' has been part of ASEAN's rhetoric. This phrase is even incorporated in the ASEAN Charter as one of the purposes of the organisation. The Article 1(13) of the Charter states that ASEAN is aimed at 'promoting a people-oriented ASEAN in which all sectors of society are encouraged to participate in, and benefit from, the process of ASEAN integration and community building' (ASEAN 2008: 5). What makes this notion appealing is that ASEAN has often been perceived as an elitist association. A scholar once argued that 'a cursory examination of ASEAN's history reveals the centrality of state security and specifically the safeguarding of the state elite' (Collins 2008: 314). Nonetheless,

all ASEAN member states today have committed to bringing the organisation to engage their people in the ASEAN process.

Against this backdrop, this dissertation intends to study ASEAN's endeavours in fulfilling its desire to be a 'people-oriented' community. The main focus is on ASEAN's efforts in dealing with regional security issues, especially non-traditional security challenges. Since ASEAN's inception in 1967, the dominant security discourse in Southeast Asia has been characterised by state-centric view of security. The pervasive use of several security concepts, such as 'cooperative security' and 'comprehensive security', reflects the security perspective of ASEAN countries which have focused primarily on the security of states (Nishikawa 2010: 31). In fact, what the region has also been facing are non-traditional security challenges, such as climate change, infectious diseases, natural disasters, irregular migration and some forms of transnational crimes (Caballero-Anthony 2010: 1). These types of challenges have undermined not only ASEAN countries' sovereignty and territorial integrity, as the state-centric security perspective suggests, but also the survival, well-being and dignity of the people in the region.

The existence of non-traditional security issues in Southeast Asia has been acknowledged by ASEAN. It can be observed in the section B.4 of the ASEAN Political- Security Community (APSC) Blueprint, which embodies action lines on non-traditional security issues (see ASEAN 2009b: 12-13). In addition, the phrase of 'people-oriented ASEAN' also appears in the second section of the Blueprint (see ASEAN 2009b: 2). This evidence shows that ASEAN's commitment to realising 'people-oriented' community also applies to the APSC which is full of political and security agenda.

## **ASEAN and Terrorism in Southeast Asia**

One major non-traditional security issue that has received special attention by ASEAN is terrorism. As indicated in the APSC Blueprint, one separate section has been dedicated only to regulating ASEAN regional counterterrorism efforts. Meanwhile, the rest of non-traditional security issues, including trafficking in persons, people-smuggling, and drug trafficking, are covered together in another section (see ASEAN 2009b: 12-13). Terrorism is indeed an existential threat in Southeast Asia. Although respective ASEAN countries have been facing

terrorism for decades within their own territories, but the regional concern to the issue just grew, mainly after the terrorist attack of 11 September 2001 (9/11). The magnitude of 9/11 and the U.S. global war on terror have increased ASEAN's attention towards the existence of terrorist activities in the region and the importance to address them through international cooperation. This concern was gradually intensified after the occurrence of the 2002 suicide bombings in Bali, Indonesia, which was followed by a series of other major terrorist attacks in the subsequent years, including the Australian Embassy bombing in Jakarta (2004), the Bali bombing II (2005) as well as the J.W. Marriot and Ritz-Carton hotels bombing in Jakarta (2009).

In this context, Indonesia is not the only ASEAN country that confronts the issue of terrorism within its territory. Terrorist activities also exist predominantly in Singapore, Malaysia, Thailand and the Philippines. In 2002, for instance, Singapore successfully captured 36 people who were accused of planning to attack some targets in the city-state (Singapore's MHA 2003: 2). Most of the detainees were the members of *Jemaah Islamiyah (JI)*, the same group behind a number of major terrorist attacks in Indonesia. In the Philippines, there is Abu Sayyaf Group (ASG) which relies on the techniques of 'ambushes, bombings, kidnappings and executions' when targeting their victims, especially the Filipino Christians (Niksich 2002:3). The JI, ASG and some other terrorist groups in Southeast Asia do not operate in isolation. In fact, they are interconnected to each other since they are parts of an extensive transnational terrorist network across the Middle Eastern, South Asian and Southeast Asian regions. An investigation revealed that these terrorist groups even have links to Al-Qaeda, which is responsible for the 9/11 terrorist bombing (Tekwani 2005: 233).

Being encountered with the existential threat posed by terrorism, ASEAN has been committed to taking serious measures to address the issue. It is shown by the signing of the ASEAN Convention on Counter-Terrorism (ACCT) during the 12th ASEAN Summit in Cebu, the Philippines in 2007. Moreover, the implementation of ACCT has become one of the action lines of the APSC Blueprint that shall be carried out by all ASEAN members. The establishment of ACCT is highly important to the regional effort of combating terrorism mainly because it is legally binding to every ASEAN member state. At the same time, ACCT also has served as the only legally-binding document which ASEAN

can achieve in addressing non-traditional security issues. This fact indicates that ASEAN cooperation in countering terrorism is the most advance one compared to any other ASEAN cooperation on non-traditional security issues.

Despite the fact that terrorism is an existential threat to ASEAN countries and ASEAN has advanced its endeavours to address the issue, it is important to underline that terrorism has also affected the lives of people in Southeast Asia. The Bali Bombing I, for instance, has caused 202 people died, including 88 Australians and 24 Britons, and more than 300 people injured (Gunaratna 2012: 1). In addition, there were at least 9 died and 161 injured at the Australian Embassy bombing (Moore and Rompies 2005); 20 died and 129 injured at the Bali Bombing II (Kencana 2005); and 8 died and 50 injured at the Jakarta hotels bombing (Glendinning and Weaver 2009). The number does not include the lost lives of suicide bombers that should be also taken into account. Considering that terrorism in ASEAN has posed threats not only to states, but also to people in the region, this dissertation, thereby, intends to focus its study on to what extent ASEAN has focused on its people in dealing with the issue of terrorism.

For the purpose of dissertation writing, a qualitative research is conducted through detailed investigation of a particular phenomenon with the emphasis on the researcher's subjectivity. (Hammersley 2013: 12). The object under study is the way ASEAN promotes people-oriented approach in addressing the issue of terrorism in Southeast Asia. This kind of research design relies on 'relatively unstructured data' and 'the use of verbal forms of analysis' (Hammersley 2013: 12). In this regard, two methods of analysis are employed: causal analysis and discourse analysis.

Causal analysis is aimed at identifying causes and seeking patterns of causation (Hammersley 2013: 50). It involves the technique of process tracing defined as a 'systematic examination of diagnostic evidence selected and analyzed in light of research questions and hypotheses posed by the investigator' (Collier 2011: 823). The method attempts to 'uncover unknown relations between factors' and to build an analytical explanation between variables based on a theoretical framework (Porta and Keating 2008: 234). In the meantime, discourse analysis is aimed at explaining the works of language, contexts and interactions in a particular circumstance under research (Gee 2013: 136). This kind of analysis relies on 'the details of speech or writing that are



arguably deemed relevant in the said context and to the arguments the analysis attempting to make' (Gee 2013: 143). In addition, discourse analysis also enables the researcher to reveal 'what and how social activity and socially-situated identity are being enacted or recognised in the data' (Gee 2013: 144).

The dissertation applies the concept of human security since it is relevant to the topic in question. Human security is people-centered approach of security, locating individual human being as the main referent object of security. This notion is considered useful to assess the ASEAN's approach in handling terrorism within the context of building a people-oriented community. In relation to both methods of analysis, the dissertation treats human security concept in two ways. First, it explores the theoretical underpinning between human security and counter-terrorism policy. Borrowing the idea of Andrej Zwitter, this study maintains that people-oriented counter-terrorism policy entails addressing the root causes of terrorism and promoting preventive measures. In this context, causal analysis is employed to identify the root causes of terrorism in ASEAN as well as to seek patterns of causation between those underlying factors and terrorism. Second, it elaborates the concept of human security as offered by the Commission on Human Security (CHS) that outlines two important variables of human security, namely 'protection' and 'empowerment.' A people-centered security policy should meet these two criteria. In this regard, discourse analysis is utilised to examine the works of language, contexts and interactions in the way ASEAN promotes people-oriented approach in addressing the issue of terrorism.

## **Conclusion**

After scrutinising the collected evidence with the conceptual framework of human security, the study results in several main arguments and findings. Firstly, the issue of terrorism has posed threat to human security in Southeast Asia in two ways: threatening the personal security (physical and mental) and economic security (livelihood). The increasing number of terrorist incidents in the region has made civilians as the most widely-attacked entities, compared to other popular targets, such as governments and military units. Due to terrorism, thousands of people have died, physically injured, suffered from mental illness and lost their livelihood. The threats are mainly posed by the existence of old

and new terrorism movements that constitute an intertwined relationship. The activists of both movements are interconnected with mutual support to each other. Although the threat of terrorism is existential, this study sees it as derivative threat, not fundamental threat to human security. In this regard, what are meant by fundamental threats to human security in Southeast Asia are the root causes of terrorism.

Secondly, the root causes of terrorism in Southeast Asia can be traced from the forms of marginalisation experienced by the terrorist and insurgent groups operated in the region. Those forms of marginalisation have posed threats to the three components of human security, namely political, economic and community security. They consist of, among many others, the political systems that inadequately accommodated the aspiration of radical groups, unequal economic policies that caused some areas underdeveloped, and identity-based tensions due to some forms of discrimination. Each factor does not stand in isolation. In many cases, they are interconnected and overlap with each other. The collection of threats to human security has induced the extremist movements to flourish and resort to terrorism for achieving their ultimate goals. It is argued that to address the issue of terrorism with people-oriented approach, the root causes of terrorism should be addressed.

Thirdly, to examine the promotion of 'people-oriented' approach by ASEAN in dealing with the issue of terrorism, the study observes the element of 'protection' and 'empowerment' in ASEAN's efforts to address the root causes of terrorism. In terms of 'protection', the evidences suggest that ASEAN actually has established sufficient norms and institutional frameworks to deal with the underlying factors of terrorism in Southeast Asia. It can be seen from the establishment of ACCT and ACPOA on CT, several forms of cooperation under different ASEAN sectoral bodies and collaboration with external partners. The provisions on dealing with the root causes of terrorism have been incorporated into those established norms and institutional frameworks. Nonetheless, the concrete realisation of the norms, which was done directly under the established mechanisms, remains limited. Most of the implemented cooperative activities are not related to addressing the root causes of terrorism, but pertaining to functional cooperation in dealing with the symptoms of terrorism. In addition, the ASEAN countries are more in favour of

counter-terrorism measures that focus on the elimination of the symptoms of terrorism at the national, bilateral or trilateral levels.

Two main reasons are provided. First, the leading ASEAN sectoral bodies that directly handle the issue of terrorism do not have full capacity and authority to execute all plans of action related to addressing the root causes of terrorism. The focal points of the bodies primarily come from national agencies in the security sector. In the meantime, dealing with the root causes of terrorism requires multi-sectoral approaches. Second, the ASEAN principles and practice of national sovereignty and non-interference have constrained regional efforts to effectively address the root causes of terrorism since those efforts are under the domain of member states' internal affairs.

Despite the fact that ASEAN mechanisms responsible for dealing with the issue of terrorism have lack of concrete implementation, measures to address the root causes of terrorism are taken under other ASEAN mechanisms. In order to institutionalise democratic values and civil liberties, ASEAN has set up an ASEAN human rights body (AICHR) and adopted regional human rights instrument (AHRD). Meanwhile, to achieve economic development and poverty reduction, ASEAN has been working to establish the AEC for a prosperous ASEAN community. Under these mechanisms, numerous activities and programs are implemented so that it can contribute to the efforts to address the root causes of terrorism. In addition, similar measures are also taken by individual ASEAN countries at the national level. It is apparent in the case of the Philippines through the implementation of conflict resolution and development program in its southern region.

Fourthly, in terms of 'empowerment', ASEAN has institutionalised the notion of people's participation in countering terrorism as enshrined in the ACCT and ACPOA on CT. Apart from engaging people in the formulation of ACCT, ASEAN has no other solid mechanism that involves people's participation in the decision making and implementing process of ACPOA on CT at the regional level. Similar to the element of protection, people's participation in addressing the root causes of terrorism exists outside the established mechanism, for example, in the AICHR's consultation with CSOs in drafting AHRD and in other AICHR's activities. Through this involvement, civil society contributes to building states' capacity to prevent terrorism. It is attained by respecting human rights and the

rule of law as well as the promotion of democratic accountability. Moreover, people's engagement in addressing the root causes of terrorism is also evident in the involvement of religious leaders and related actors in the interfaith dialogues as convened either by governments or by civil society. In some cases, interfaith dialogues are even utilised as a strategy for conflict resolution.

All of these findings and arguments suggest that the promotion of people-oriented approach in addressing the issue of terrorism by ASEAN is limited to norms building and institutional frameworks setting. ASEAN is lack of solid implementing mechanism for dealing with the root causes of terrorism and engaging its people in the process. Efforts to address the root causes of terrorism in the region rely on other ASEAN and non-ASEAN processes that have indirect procedural connection with the established ASEAN mechanism directly responsible for dealing with the issue of terrorism. It is fully realised that addressing the root causes of terrorism requires long-term, sustainable endeavours and the results are difficult to evaluate within a short term. Therefore, in the context of community building, ASEAN should continuously ensure that the promotion of 'people-oriented ASEAN' turns into practice so that people of ASEAN can benefit from and participate in addressing the root causes of terrorism.

For future research, it is worth to explore a study on how the ASEAN norms and institutional frameworks for addressing the root causes of terrorism are translated into practice at the national levels. In this regard, a case study on one particular ASEAN country or comparative study on two or more ASEAN countries could be undertaken. It is expected that the kind of research can elucidate the question of to what extent ASEAN countries are committed to realise the norms set up at the regional level as their contribution to the ASEAN Community building process.



---

**Migran Ilegal sebagai Ancaman  
Keamanan Malaysia dan Dampaknya  
terhadap Hubungan Bilateral Indonesia-  
Malaysia**

**Illegal Migrant as Malaysia's Security  
Threat and Its Impact to Indonesian-  
Malaysian Bilateral Relations**

---

Nama : Rangga Yudha Nagara  
NIP : 198311022008011001  
Instansi : KEMENLU  
Tahun Intake : 2011  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : Master of Art International Studies  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : Newcastle University

## ABSTRAK

Umumnya hubungan Indonesia dan Malaysia sudah baik sebelum isu pekerja migran ilegal menjadi sekuritisasi di Malaysia. Sejak sekuritisasi isu tersebut, ketegangan antara kedua negara sering muncul.

Disertasi ini bertujuan untuk mempelajari dampaknya terhadap hubungan bilateral antara Indonesia dan Malaysia yang disebabkan oleh ketidakamanan Malaysia dengan kehadiran sejumlah besar migran ilegal di negara mereka.

Temuan disertasi ini menyimpulkan bahwa sekuritisasi masalah pekerja migran oleh Malaysia memiliki implikasi yang luas terhadap hubungan bilateral Indonesia-Malaysia. Kesalahan sekuritisasi yang menyebabkan pelanggaran hak asasi manusia terhadap pekerja migran merupakan faktor utama yang dapat merusak hubungan. Kemungkinan cara imigran yang sekuritisasi di Malaysia terbukti mendasar dalam menjelaskan asal mula konflik

## ABSTRACT

Generally, the relation between Indonesia and Malaysia has been good before the issue of illegal migrant workers became securitized in Malaysia. Since the securitization of that particular issue the tensions between both countries often arise.

The dissertation aims to study at the impact to the bilateral relations between Indonesia and Malaysia that caused by Malaysia's insecurity by the presence of large number of illegal migrants in their country.

The findings of this dissertation conclude that the securitization of migrant workers issues by Malaysia have wide implication to Indonesia – Malaysia the bilateral relations. The misconduct of the securitization that caused human rights violations to the migrant workers is the main factor that could damage the relations. It is likely that the way which immigrants are securitized in Malaysia is proven to be fundamental in explain the origin of conflicts



For centuries the relations between the people of Indonesia's archipelago and Malaya peninsula has been tight. The long history of migration and intermingle made the people from the two regions shares identical social and cultural values including the language. The close relations continue to modern era including in economic field although there was armed conflict once between Indonesia and Malaysia in the 1960s.

There is large economic interdependency between Indonesia and Malaysia. This interdependency is apparent through millions of Indonesian working in Malaysia and Malaysia enjoy economic development through the foreign workers services whose most of them is Indonesian.

Sadly, the close bilateral relations between Indonesia and Malaysia started to get bumpy when the Malaysian felt insecure by the growing presence of Indonesian –especially the illegal migrants-- in Malaysia. The migrants were considered able to threaten Malaysia's public order and social fabric. The insecurity made Malaysia launched securitization against the illegal migrants.

It is evident that the securitization implemented through harsher policy and heavier punishment to the illegal migrants which majority of them is Indonesian. The rougher measures like mass deportation, thousands raids, heavier fines, and even caning punishment to illegal migrants quickly catch Indonesian public attention. Moreover, the Malaysian measures which involved civilian force often inhumane and degrading when treating the detainees or arrestees.

The bad treatment to their fellow nationals during the securitization by the Malaysian added with cases from rapes, abuses, to murders that suffered by Indonesian maid every year has burning Indonesian public's resentment feeling to Malaysia. Since then Indonesia-Malaysia bilateral relations is fluctuating and colored by the issue of migrant workers and this issue is likely to have a big impact to the relations of both states.

## **Objective**

The dissertation aims to study the issue of securitization of illegal migrant by the host country and its impact to their bilateral relations with migrants' origin countries in the case of relations between Malaysia and Indonesia. Therefore, the dissertation is discusses international migration as a concern of security and

international relations and then analyzed the effects of Indonesian's migration to Malaysia to the relationship between both countries.

## **Research Question**

The research question is: to what extent the securitization of illegal migrant issue in Malaysia has influenced the bilateral relations dynamic between Indonesia and Malaysia?

It is likely that the answer for this question is that the securitization of illegal migrant by Malaysia can deteriorate bilateral relations between Indonesia and Malaysia if the securitization is not exercised carefully by considering many aspects of human rights and involving migrant's country of origin. The effects caused by this issue also can be big and widening to other issues of bilateral relations like economy and territorial dispute. For example, the recent measures taken by both Governments in search for solutions to their territorial dispute indicated a connection with securitization of migrant problems where military forces are involved to back up the negotiation process.

## **Methodology**

The research problem of this dissertation is to explore the bilateral relations of two sovereign states which have been affected by migration from and to those two states. In this regards, the dissertation uses case study method because it can be used for support or challenge a hypothesis or theory, to explore an issue, and give explanation of a situation. The case study result also related to daily life of common readers so it may facilitates comprehension of a complex situation or phenomenon (Soy, 1997).

In order to explain the research problem the dissertation employs deduction method in which a hypothesis is tested in the case of Indonesia-Malaysia relations and some findings were resulted from the test. In this regards, the findings in this dissertation corroborate the previous works in this field which said that international migration can burden bilateral relations between migrant's country of origin and migrant's host country.

The hypothesis that being used is developed in Lohrmann's (2000) study that argues the international migration can affect the national security agenda

of the receiving country therefore tend to create tensions in bilateral relations between the origin and host country of the migrants thus comprehensive cooperation needed to make international migration benefited all sides rather than occurred as a problem that can disturb international relations.

## **Literature Review**

Several literatures were used in this dissertation to test the hypothesis and conduct the research. To explain that the concept of security has been expanded to various subjects outside military and political sphere, the book from Buzan, Waever, and de Wilde (1998) provide some convincing arguments. The book also gives explanation of the features of securitization including on how the process of securitization is made. Thus it can be use to show the nexus between international migration and security and provide basis for analytical framework of the dissertation.

To explain international migration with its implication to security and international relations the study from Lohrmann (2000) is the main source of this dissertation. In his study Lohrmann argues that international migration tend to creates tension and burden in bilateral relations between the country of origin and the destination country (including the transit country) so it have potential to destabilize international relations. He suggested that the problem caused by international migration should be addressed with comprehensive manner of international cooperation.

In explaining the sequence of Indonesia-Malaysia relations in its connection with Indonesian's migratory to Malaysia this dissertation get benefited from Spaan, Naerssen, and Kohl's (2002) study and Liow's book (2005) regarding the politics of Indonesia – Malaysia relations. Their works describe the history of Indonesian migration to Malaysia including the problematic matters for Malaysia domestic sphere that occurred in the recent waves of migration. The securitization of illegal migrant issue by Malaysia explained in the dissertation mainly sourced from Azzizzah and Mat Zin's research in 2011 that studied the effectiveness of policy applied by the Malaysian government in handling illegal migrants. Another important literature related to this matter is Liow's (2004) paper that studied the discourse of security regarding Indonesian migrants in Malaysia.

The explanation of the effects of securitization to the relations between Indonesia – Malaysia was composed through previous studies and recent situation of both countries relations. Liow's (2002) study was referred to cover illegal migrant issue in Indonesia – Malaysia relations a decade ago and the paper by Nesadurai (2011) was used to illustrate the more recent development of Indonesia – Malaysia relations. However, Liow and Nesadurai's paper are not sufficient to give clearer illustration of Indonesian's reaction to particular issue regarding migrant worker cases in Malaysia. In addition, the dissertation use mass media sources to update with contemporary problems related to the context of Indonesia – Malaysia bilateral relations that affected by migrant workers issues.

### **Possible critics to the sources**

The dissertation use decent amount of data from the internet sources. This might cause criticism because the quality of data from internet often considered below the academic material that have been published. Being aware of this problem, the dissertation only accessed and used data from official websites, reputable research institutions, reputable news agency websites that have accessible author names of the published materials, and also prominent persons' writings in trustful websites.

### **Inhumane Securitization in Malaysia, Reaction in Indonesia**

The securitization of illegal migrant issue by Malaysia has heightened Indonesia's concern regarding its citizens' safety in Malaysia that threatened by the treatment of the host country. The concern was rise because bulk of evidence likely to show that the securitization seems to justify Malaysia to violate certain human rights of Indonesian citizens in Malaysia.

In explaining why the execution of the securitization by Malaysia tend to appears like the impingement of their hatred toward Indonesian immigrant by numerous excessive use of force, coercion and violence, Bandoro (2007) argue that the continuing influx of Indonesian created negative perception and fear among Malaysian, the Indonesian migrants seen by Malaysian as a threat toward their societal fabric and this background has led to violent actions by Malaysian authorities when they handle Indonesian illegal migrants.

This chapter attempts to demonstrate that securitization implementation through harsh measures can create an unsympathetic attitude toward the immigrants. Therefore, it results in human rights violations to the immigrants. Indonesian migrants were felt the hardest hit by this Malaysian hostility. In return, the securitization also produces a deeply negative view from the Indonesian public to Malaysia, thus affecting bilateral relations between the two countries.

## **Unilateral Action by Malaysia**

Despite the fact that a securitization of the domestic issue is an absolute right of Malaysia as a fully sovereign state, the embarkation of a securitization which related to a large number of other state's citizens seems will be better conducted if a consultation or negotiation was made with the related countries, this was something that Malaysia did not do during the initial securitization campaign, although they later do it after the campaign sparks a negative reaction by its counterparts (the origin countries of the illegal migrants).

In this regard, Malaysia once failed to deliberate diplomatic sensitivity in this issue (Liow, 2002). In the background that the Indonesian Government is in view that they should be informed if there is any policy change or action that will be taken that might impact Indonesians in Malaysia because since many Indonesian lives overseas the protection of them is become one of the priorities in Indonesia's foreign policy.

Malaysia's negligent unilateral decision in that securitization which without prior informed or consulted Indonesia was risked the good relations with Indonesia, moreover with the cases of Indonesian's death during the deportation.

## **Reaction of Indonesia**

The information of terrible and humiliating treatment to Indonesians in Malaysia that constantly received by Indonesian public through media since a few years ago made Indonesians generally have a negative view toward Malaysia. The Indonesian opinion was inflamed because of solidarity to their fellow nationals who being treated badly and inhumane by the Malaysian.

The forms of solidarity to the victims of Malaysian cruel treatment are vary from donations, prayers, writings, to large protests in many cities, burning

of Malaysian flag in front of their diplomatic compounds, and sweeping of Malaysian citizens, calling for boycott of Malaysian products, and even cut diplomatic ties (Bandoro, 2007; Tempo, 2012).

Furthermore, the protests few times turned to uglier hostile acts toward Malaysian diplomatic mission like the throwing of rotten eggs and human feces to Malaysian embassy in Jakarta and the attempts to attack the embassy (Jakarta Post, 2010; The Star, 2012).

The feeling of dislike is not only shown by Indonesian grass-root level but also by Indonesian top politicians, parliament members, and public figures. This added the magnitude of public opinion power in directing Indonesia foreign policy toward Malaysia (Liow, 2002; Kompas, 2012; The Star, 2012).

The Indonesian's resent sentiment to Malaysia even growing bigger by arrogant gesture of Malaysia in responds Indonesian's protest. At elite level, Malaysian Prime Minister Najib Razak once warned Indonesia to stop the demonstration against Malaysian embassy to evade Malaysian wrath, this was considered very arrogant statement that only undermine the relations (The Star, 2010; Vivanews, 2010). At common people level, it is a norm that Malaysian and their mass media calling the Indonesian with 'Indon' a derogatory calls for Indonesian given by Malaysian which in their view always associated with problems and bad things, similar to 'nigger' calls for African origin people. Although this 'Indon' calling thing is cannot be classified as racism because it is not conducted by a people from different race but morally it is similar to racism, most Indonesian people are offended by this calls. Indonesian Embassy in Kuala Lumpur already repeatedly requested Malaysian government and media to stop the use of the phrase. Even the urge to stop this calling has agreed by the two Head of states but until today this practice of 'racism' is still common in Malaysia and even wider to Bangladeshi nationals by calling them 'Bangla' (Martin, 2012; Antara, 2011).

Since dislikes has been embedded in wide Indonesian public's mind toward Malaysia that caused by the plight of Indonesian migrant workers regarding the Malaysia's securitization, the reaction of Indonesian to other issue related to Malaysia are always hard. The issue of national dignity said to be at stake with the relations with Malaysia.

## Conclusion

The issue of international migration has significantly colored international relations in these recent decades especially because international migration is likely able to impact the security of receiving country. The increasing number of international migration to certain host countries can change host country perception about the presence of migrants in their home even in situation that the migrants used to be welcomed due to their identical culture, socio-historic, religion, and ethnicity. The immigrants can be easily blamed and responsible for the hike of crime rates, social disruption, source of disease, and economic problems.

The immigrants that used to be perceived by the host country as harmless people by this changed of perception they were considered as potential threats to the receiving country societal order. In the peak of host country's insecurity the calls to securitize trans-boundaries migration may become popular in the domestic level of that particular country.

In the case of Malaysia's securitization of Illegal/Indonesian migrant issue, Malaysia in its implementation has launched harsh approaches to get rid illegal migrants off Malaysia, heavier punishment, and sadly including their unanticipated inhumane treatment to illegal migrants that were arrested. They also seems likely not anticipated that the securitization implementation will affect Malaysia's relations with its biggest foreign workers supplier, Indonesia.

In the wake of massive inhumane treatment to Indonesian by Malaysia when conducting their securitization, Indonesian responded it in anger and since then anti-Malaysia sentiment growing well in Indonesia. The resent feeling now already developed for almost two decades thus creates strained in bilateral relations between the two nations. This tension between the worker-sending country and worker-receiving country has created mistrust and suspicion in their relations that spilled to other issue of bilateral relations such as border dispute issue.

In spite of dislike against each other at people to people level, both governments realized the relations need to be repaired for the sake of their national interests. Efforts were made to knit tight the relations such as cooperation in joint border patrol to curb illegal migration and the protection of migrant workers rights. However, the sincere relation is not yet created again

and still need extra effort to build the damaged relations at people to people level. Therefore, in the meantime the tension between Indonesia and Malaysia will still remain and may increase whenever a big case of Indonesian worker suffering happen and a big case of protest follows.

In sum, this dissertation displays that the securitization of the issue of migrant workers have large and far reached implication to the bilateral relations of the migrants' origin country and the host country. There is indication if the problem occurred by the securitization not well managed by the host and origin country it could wreck their relations.

The lesson from the case of Malaysia – Indonesia relations that strained by this situation is that securitization must be properly and carefully prepared before the execution so it will not violate certain aspect of human rights or endangered human security of the migrant workers because the way which immigrants are securitized in Malaysia is proven to be fundamental in explain the origin of conflicts or at least tension between Indonesia and Malaysia.

Furthermore, although security matters is domestic affairs, if the securitization related with other state's interest --especially a close neighbor-- it will be better if the particular state know its neighbor view first before fully implemented the securitization to avoid negative respond from that other state. Malaysia seems not considered of how Indonesia will respond when Malaysia launched initial massive securitization actions since then it deteriorating bilateral relations at people to people level. At Government to Government level the economic interdependence seems still able hush the tension, but it may not be forever if Indonesia's economy is going better and better meanwhile the abuse of Indonesian workers continues in Malaysia so Indonesian public demand sturdier action, Indonesia's government approach to Malaysia may be harder than ever. To avoid further conflict and repair the relations, it is can be said that the human security of migrant workers should be always carefully protected when a securitization of migrant issue being implemented.





---

**Building the Ideal Citizen through  
Children:  
The New Order's Doctrines in Indonesian  
Children Story Books**

**Membangun Warga Negara Ideal melalui  
Anak-Anak:  
Doktrin Orde Baru dalam Buku Cerita  
Anak Indonesia**

---

Nama : Ratih Dewi  
NIP : 198512042009122003  
Instansi : KEMENLU  
Tahun Intake : 2015  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : M.A. Asian Studies (specialization South  
East Asian Studies)  
Negara Studi : Belanda  
Universitas : Leiden University

## Latar Belakang

Pemerintah Indonesia pada masa Orde Baru antara periode tahun 1970 dan 1980-an meluncurkan proyek pendidikan yang dikenal sebagai Inpres SD (Instruksi Presiden Sekolah Dasar), yakni salah satu proyek pembangunan sekolah dasar terbesar dalam sejarah guna memberantas buta huruf dan meningkatkan jumlah pendaftaran murid sekolah dasar. Proyek tersebut mencakup pengadaan buku-buku cerita anak sebagai pelengkap buku teks pelajaran sekolah.

Seiring dengan prioritas pertumbuhan ekonomi, Pemerintah turut memberikan pengaruh terhadap cerita dan karakter anak dalam buku-buku tersebut yang bertujuan untuk pembangunan bangsa. Doktrin kepahlawanan dan nilai-nilai didaktis ditanamkan dalam cerita anak-anak; sedangkan karakter tokoh anak dalam cerita disesuaikan berdasarkan ideologi negara Pancasila guna menciptakan warga negara Indonesia yang ideal di masa depan menurut pandangan negara. Pelaksanaan program indoktrinasi Pancasila melalui buku anak bertujuan untuk membentuk dan membina prilaku anak sebagai generasi baru yang akan membangun bangsa di masa depan. Hal ini juga merupakan salah satu strategi politik Pemerintah untuk memelihara hegemoni kekuasaan terkait pembentukan generasi yang patuh dan mendukung Pemerintah.

Penelitian ini merupakan kajian atas hegemoni kekuasaan Orde Baru Indonesia yang diejawantahkan dalam cerita anak yang terbit dalam rangka proyek SD Inpres. Selain itu, penelitian bermaksud melihat adanya perbedaan dalam pengembangan karakter tokoh anak dan cerita anak antara cerita anak yang diterbitkan Pemerintah melalui Balai Pustaka dan cerita anak yang diterbitkan penerbit swasta melalui Gramedia dalam periode 1973-1985. Sejalan dengan kajian mengenai konsep warga negara ideal dan konsep nasionalisme menurut rezim Orde Baru, penelitian ini akan membahas pesan dan makna politis yang terkandung dalam buku cerita anak tersebut.

## Metode Penelitian

Sumber utama dalam penelitian ini adalah 29 buku cerita anak untuk anak berumur 9-12 tahun yang diterbitkan oleh Balai Pustaka dan Gramedia pada periode 1973-1985, terdiri dari 15 buku Balai Pustaka dan 14 buku Gramedia.

Buku dari Balai Pustaka seluruhnya merupakan bagian dari proyek SD Inpres, sedangkan buku dari Gramedia merupakan terbitan independen dan tidak termasuk proyek SD Inpres. Studi dilakukan dengan peninjauan literatur melalui analisis tekstual. Penelitian dibatasi pada cerita anak yang terbit di Indonesia dan bukan karya terjemahan asing. Cerita anak dipilih berdasarkan cerita yang masuk dalam kategori fiksi realistis untuk anak-anak sekolah dasar dan dinarasikan dari sudut pandang tokoh anak dalam cerita.

## **Hasil dan Pembahasan Penelitian**

Rezim Orde Baru yang dikenal otoriter selama lebih dari tiga dasawarsa mewariskan dua peninggalan doktrin, yaitu doktrin politik Pancasila dan doktrin pembangunan. Keduanya ditanamkan secara sistematis melalui pendidikan dan media, termasuk buku cerita anak. Pemerintah Orde Baru memandang pendidikan sebagai cara utama untuk membentuk Manusia Pancasila yang mengabdikan pada negara dan sebagai "investasi" untuk mencapai tujuan pembangunan ekonomi demi terciptanya persatuan, stabilitas, dan keamanan negara. Konsep asas kekeluargaan diterjemahkan dalam dua lingkaran konsentris kehidupan anak, yakni keluarga dan sekolah dengan orangtua dan guru sebagai patron guna membina dan mengarahkan pemikiran anak hingga dewasa agar tidak melenceng dari ideologi dan nilai-nilai Pancasila. Selain itu, nilai-nilai moral dan kepahlawanan juga ditegaskan agar anak dapat merepresentasikan dirinya menjadi pahlawan pembangunan, yaitu berkontribusi pada negara melalui peran aktif dalam ekonomi.

Dalam buku cerita anak terbitan Balai Pustaka, hanya tersaji satu tema cerita, yaitu anak yang mengalami kesulitan hidup akan berhasil pada saatnya dengan kerja keras, bimbingan dan pertolongan dari orangtua dan guru sesuai dengan nilai moral yang terkandung dalam Pancasila. Terdapat lima variasi tema yang ditemukan dalam 15 buku cerita anak Balai Pustaka, sebagai berikut:

- Anak dari keluarga miskin di desa yang berupaya membantu/meringankan beban keuangan orangtua dan berusaha untuk membuat keluarganya bangga/bahagia dengan kepatuhan dan pencapaiannya di sekolah atau kehidupan sosial;
- Anak yang bercita-cita untuk mengabdikan pada negara/masyarakat;
- Generasi muda sebagai generasi yang melanjutkan perjuangan generasi tua dengan semangat baru untuk membangun bangsa;

- Anak yang menjadi teladan bagi teman-temannya atau keluarganya
- Anak yang mengidentifikasi dirinya dengan mengikuti bimbingan orangtua atau patron.

Terkait dengan pengejawantahan nilai-nilai Pancasila dalam cerita anak, terdapat empat fitur nilai ideologis yang mendukung misi Pemerintah dalam membangun karakter ideal anak Indonesia, sebagai berikut:

- Pendidikan sangat penting dalam pembangunan bangsa;
- Pelaksanaan nilai-nilai Pancasila dalam kehidupan wajib dilakukan untuk membentuk karakter anak yang baik guna menjadi orang yang berhasil saat dewasa nanti;
- Konsep pahlawan nasional diartikan sebagai pahlawan kemerdekaan pada masa revolusi dan pahlawan pembangunan pada era modern atau pasca kemerdekaan;
- Cinta tanah air atau nasionalisme merupakan kewajiban setiap warga negara, termasuk anak-anak.

Adapun temuan lain dalam cerita anak terbitan Balai Pustaka, yaitu:

- Dominasi penanaman nilai moral yang disampaikan oleh orangtua dan patron dalam cerita;
- Adanya kegiatan sosial untuk anak di sekolah yang didukung oleh program pemerintah seperti pramuka dan paskibraka, serta kebijakan populer pemerintah, seperti program transmigrasi dan pemberantasan buta huruf sebagai latar cerita;
- Terdapat kemiripan antara plot cerita dan tokoh anak dengan kehidupan nyata Presiden Soeharto ketika masih anak-anak;

Anak digambarkan secara subordinatif dan pasif, wajib menghormati orangtua, guru dan para senior, sopan dan taat aturan dengan kewajiban sebagai anak dalam keluarga (membantu orangtua), murid di sekolah (belajar dengan rajin dan berprestasi), dan individual muda/warga negara di masyarakat (mengabdikan dan berkontribusi pada negara/melayani masyarakat).

Di sisi lain, terdapat tema yang beragam dalam buku cerita anak terbitan Gramedia. Cerita berkisah seputar pengalaman anak yang menarik atau mengubah hidup mereka. Cerita realistik tentang kehidupan keluarga dan perjuangan masih muncul, namun ragam cerita modern seperti petualangan dan misteri/aksi detektif juga tampak. Cerita ditulis dari sudut pandang tokoh anak

yang apa adanya, polos, dan riang dengan alur dan akhir cerita yang terkadang tidak umum. Lebih lanjut, aspek yang paling menonjol dari cerita anak Gramedia, yaitu penggambaran tokoh anak yang apa adanya dengan beragam asal dan latar, serta tanpa perilaku ideal. Tokoh anak tetap digambarkan secara positif, namun tentunya bukan tokoh anak yang sempurna dan tanpa cela—mereka berbuat salah dan belajar dari kesalahannya untuk berkembang menjadi pribadi yang lebih baik secara mandiri. Selain itu, cerita anak Gramedia juga mengembangkan karakter tokoh anak dari waktu ke waktu guna menemukan identitasnya secara dinamis.

Adapun perbedaan utama terkait tema dan penceritaan dalam cerita anak Gramedia dari cerita anak Balai Pustaka, sebagai berikut:

- Kurangnya pengaruh politik ideologi Negara
- Tokoh orangtua dan guru tidak mendominasi narasi cerita
- Meskipun keluarga dan sekolah masih menjadi lingkaran pertama kehidupan anak, persahabatan dalam lingkaran sosial umumnya muncul dalam cerita dan menjadi bagian penting dari kehidupan tokoh anak
- Cerita menggambarkan area abu-abu (bukan hitam putih) dan perspektif berbeda dari tokoh anak yang terkadang menghasilkan perasaan dilematis tokoh anak ketika berhadapan dengan konflik atau situasi yang sulit.

## **Kesimpulan dan Saran**

Rezim Orde Baru merupakan tatanan pemerintahan yang mengacu pada konstitusi dan pembangunan dengan menjunjung ideologi Pancasila dan pendekatan ekonomi. Kedua prinsip tersebut menghasilkan pemikiran akan pentingnya menciptakan dan membina warga negara ideal, Manusia Pancasila yang mengabdikan dan berkontribusi pada pembangunan negeri sebagaimana persatuan, stabilitas keamanan dan kesejahteraan merupakan tiga prioritas pemerintah. Pengaruh militer yang besar pada masa Orde Baru telah mendorong adanya konsep kepahlawanan yang identik dengan nasionalisme.

Lebih lanjut, Orde Baru menaruh perhatian pada generasi muda, khususnya anak-anak untuk membangun masa depan bangsa, sehingga praktik yang mendukung pertumbuhan rasa nasionalisme atau cinta tanah air ditanamkan di sekolah melalui bacaan anak. Sejalan dengan tujuan ini, cerita anak yang diterbitkan oleh instansi pemerintah, seperti Balai Pustaka dipenuhi

dengan nilai kepahlawanan dan nilai moral sesuai dengan kepentingan negara guna terbentuknya Manusia Pancasila, warga negara yang setia pada negara dengan standar moral yang tinggi berdasarkan nilai Pancasila di masa mendatang.

Pandangan Orde Baru terhadap karakter seorang anak adalah anak yang taat, patuh, dan menghormati orangtua/guru/patron, sehingga anak yang tumbuh dewasa nantinya diharapkan untuk menjadi warga negara yang patuh dan taat aturan. Asas kekeluargaan dan nasionalisme berperan penting dalam membentuk karakter anak untuk menumbuhkan kecintaan anak kepada keluarga menjadi kepada negara, yaitu generasi yang mendukung kebijakan pemerintah.

Kedua konsep ini diterjemahkan ke dalam bacaan anak, khususnya buku cerita anak terbitan Balai Pustaka. Meskipun baik Balai Pustaka maupun Gramedia mendukung kebijakan Pemerintah, keduanya memaknai dan melakukan pendekatan yang berbeda. Balai Pustaka mendorong anak untuk mendukung Pemerintah dengan sikap setia dan sumbangsih tanpa pamrih (berupa kewajiban) melalui jalan yang “disediakan” atau diarahkan, sedangkan Gramedia menawarkan jalan alternatif bagi anak untuk berpikir kreatif dan “mencari jalannya sendiri”. Hal ini dapat dianalisis lebih lanjut dalam kaitan apakah cerita anak Gramedia merupakan suatu resistensi atau “perlawanan” terhadap cerita anak yang disponsori Pemerintah yang sarat muatan ideologi.

Penelitian ini merupakan upaya pendahuluan dalam lingkup antarbidang, yaitu kebijakan Pemerintah yang berkaitan dengan politik kebudayaan pada masa Orde Baru. Studi ini dapat diperluas untuk mengidentifikasi tren dalam bacaan anak di Indonesia dan dampaknya terhadap perkembangan anak-anak Indonesia. Penelitian lanjutan yang komprehensif dalam bidang sastra anak juga diperlukan untuk memperdalam pemahaman tentang sastra anak di Indonesia yang masih belum mendapat perhatian maksimal serta manfaatnya terhadap perkembangan anak di masa depan.

---

# **The Effect of ASEAN Economic Integration on Macroeconomic, Trade and Foreign Direct Investment: Based on the New Regionalism Theory**

## **Pengaruh Integrasi Ekonomi ASEAN terhadap Makroekonomi, Perdagangan dan Penanaman Modal Asing: Berdasarkan Teori Regionalisme Baru**

---

Nama : Rendy Hadiputra Hadi  
NIP : 198607272009121001  
Instansi : KEMENLU  
Tahun Intake : 2015  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : International Relations (International  
Political Economy)  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : University of Birmingham



Integrasi ekonomi merupakan salah satu upaya bersama negara-negara untuk menciptakan sebuah kawasan dengan ekonomi yang kuat. Para akademisi sering menggunakan Uni Eropa sebagai acuan contoh integrasi ekonomi yang berhasil (Robson, 1998). Dengan keberhasilan Uni Eropa dalam menciptakan integrasi ekonomi kawasan, banyak kawasan di belahan dunia yang berupaya beranjak dalam integrasi ekonomi. ASEAN (Association of Southeast Asia Nations) yang terdiri dari 10 negara merupakan salah satu kawasan yang secara berkelanjutan berupaya meningkatkan proses integrasi ekonomi dalam rangka mendukung perkembangan ekonomi kawasan yang berkesinambungan. Meskipun integrasi Uni Eropa dipandang sebagai contoh kesuksesan integrasi ekonomi, namun proses integrasi ekonomi yang dilakukan ASEAN merupakan proses yang berbeda dari model Uni Eropa. ASEAN tidak berupaya meniru proses yang telah dilakukan oleh Uni Eropa, namun hanya sebatas menggunakan integrasi di Uni Eropa.

Proses integrasi ekonomi di dunia yang dipicu kesuksesan Uni Eropa menunjukkan hasil yang berbeda-beda, khususnya bagi kawasan negara berkembang yang lebih banyak kurang berhasil dalam upayanya mendorong pertumbuhan ekonomi melalui integrasi. Akan tetapi bagi ASEAN proses integrasi merupakan upaya berkesinambungan yang dipandang cukup penting dan memiliki potensi yang besar bagi penguatan ekonomi di kawasan. Negara anggota ASEAN secara berkesinambungan berupaya untuk mengimplementasi kebijakan integrasi ekonomi dalam rangka memberikan dampak positif kepada perdagangan, investasi asing FDI (*Foreign Direct Investment*), serta memperkokoh ekonomi kawasan melalui proses integrasi (ASEAN Secretariat, 2015).

Upaya ASEAN tersebut, merupakan kerja sama negara-negara di kawasan yang di dominasi oleh negara berkembang untuk dapat meningkatkan daya saingnya di kancah global baik secara kelompok dalam satu organisasi ASEAN maupun sebagai negara masing-masing. Upaya integrasi ASEAN perlu digarisbawahi adalah sebuah upaya yang berkelanjutan sejak lima dekade.

Dalam literatur integrasi ekonomi telah dibahas dampak dari proses integrasi terhadap negara anggotanya. Dari dua teori integrasi ekonomi di literatur secara umum manfaat dari integrasi terbagi dalam dua yaitu "*static effect*" yang dibahas dalam teori *old regionalism* dan "*dynamic effect*" berdasarkan teori *new regionalism* (Hosny, 2013; Plummer 1997). Dampak dari

static effect dalam proses integrasi lebih sering dikaitkan dengan teori integrasi yang dianggap klasik mengingat penilaian efek dari integrasi hanya didasarkan kepada terciptanya *trade creation*. Namun, seiring dengan perkembangan ekonomi global maka faktor lain juga perlu menjadi dasar penilaian apakah proses integrasi kawasan memberikan manfaat. Hal ini yang dijabarkan dalam *dynamic effect* dari integrasi dimana selain peningkatan perdagangan intra-kawasan antar negara anggota terdapat faktor lain seperti perdagangan extra-kawasan, peningkatan FDI, serta stabilitas ekonomi kawasan yang juga perlu diperhatikan sebagai manfaat proses integrasi ekonomi. Oleh karena itu, disertasi berupaya membahas lebih dalam dampak integrasi ekonomi ASEAN melalui sudut pandang teori *new regionalism* yang berdasarkan pada *dynamic effect* integrasi.

Proses integrasi yang dilakukan oleh ASEAN antara lain dilakukan melalui tahapan untuk membuka ekonomi kawasan serta membentuk basis untuk memfasilitasi proses kerja sama ekonomi di kawasan. Pada perkembangan terbaru proses integrasinya di bidang ekonomi melalui pembentukan ASEAN Economic Community berupaya menciptakan kawasan yang berdaya saing tinggi di kancah global, mengintegrasikan dengan ekonomi global, serta memberikan manfaat bagi 10 negara anggotanya (Das, 2012).

Untuk mencapai tujuan ASEAN tersebut maka hambatan bagi arus perdagangan dan investasi secara bertahap telah dikurangi bagi terciptanya kegiatan ekonomi yang efektif dan efisien (Petri et al., 2012). Proses mengurangi dan menghapus hambatan untuk aktifitas ekonomi tersebut dilakukan melalui berbagai inisiatif kebijakan di level regional sebagai langkah integrasi di regional ASEAN. Dalam kaitan tersebut, disertasi akan berupaya membahas apakah proses integrasi yang dilakukan oleh ASEAN selama ini telah memberikan manfaat bagi kawasan tersebut berdasarkan *dynamic effect* yang dijabarkan dalam teori *new integration*.

## **Metodologi**

Untuk melihat sejauh mana integrasi ekonomi ASEAN akan menguntungkan kawasan, disertasi ini akan menggunakan sumber literatur sekunder, laporan dan jurnal sebagai sumber pandangan akademisi tentang manfaat integrasi ekonomi di ASEAN. Sebagaimana teori integrasi ekonomi dalam literatur yang

disampaikan pada bagian sebelumnya terdiri dari dua aliran teori integrasi, maka fokus dari disertasi adalah untuk mengevaluasi dampak dari integrasi ASEAN dengan sudut pandang teori regionalisme baru. Perkembangan ekonomi global saat ini menjadikan lebih tepat untuk mempertimbangkan efek dinamis dalam integrasi regional (Plummer, 1997). Selanjutnya, integrasi ekonomi ASEAN telah menjadi ukuran untuk memperkuat perekonomian daerah dengan munculnya daya saing ekonomi global yang dapat disejajarkan dengan teori regionalisme baru.

Fokus integrasi tidak hanya berada di penciptaan perdagangan statis melainkan pada berbagai besar dari faktor ekonomi termasuk perdagangan, investasi, jasa dan lingkungan ekonomi makro. Oleh karena itu, menggunakan teori regionalisme baru dibahas beberapa efek dinamis dari integrasi ekonomi regional, namun terbatas pada dampak perdagangan integrasi regional dan ekonomi makro dari ASEAN, serta investasi asing langsung di kawasan ASEAN setelah prosesnya integrasi. Efek ekonomi terhadap kriteria tersebut telah dipilih karena pentingnya kriteria tersebut bagi negara-negara berkembang, seperti kebanyakan negara anggota ASEAN, dan untuk pertumbuhan ekonomi dan pembangunan dan hubungan antar terkait antara kriteria tersebut.

Studi kasus yang dibahas dalam disertasi adalah pada isu-isu yang memiliki korelasi dengan proses integrasi ASEAN. Pertama, disertasi melihat pada efek dinamis dari perdagangan kawasan ASEAN dan dampak ekonomi makronya. Karena proses integrasi berkaitan erat dengan pengurangan tarif di kawasan, hal ini akan menawarkan pemahaman tentang apakah integrasi ASEAN akan memperoleh manfaat ekonomi dari peningkatan perdagangan, sebagaimana dijelaskan dalam teori regionalisme baru. Selain itu, teori regionalisme baru menunjukkan bahwa negara-negara yang mengejar integrasi regional kemungkinan akan memperoleh manfaat ekonomi melalui stabilitas makroekonomi. Keterkaitan antara perdagangan intra-industri dan integrasi regional juga dapat membantu dengan adanya stabilitas ekonomi makro dan sebaliknya.

Disertasi juga membahas isu investasi dalam proses integrasi ekonomi ASEAN, karena semakin pentingnya investasi bagi negara-negara berkembang seperti kebanyakan negara-negara anggota ASEAN dalam rangka mendorong pertumbuhan ekonomi. Selain itu, dengan tekanan globalisasi kebutuhan untuk

menjadi lebih menarik sebagai destinasi investasi cenderung menjadi manfaat potensial jika ASEAN berhasil dalam proses integrasinya (Hosny, 2013). Seperti yang dijabarkan dalam teori regionalisme baru, alasan untuk integrasi juga timbul dari kebutuhan untuk meningkatkan arus investasi di kawasan ini dari investasi intra-regional serta investasi asing yang berasal dari luar kawasan. Namun, Robson (1998) menyampaikan bahwa dalam integrasi ekonomi terdapat potensi polarisasi investasi di negara-negara tertentu, yang dapat menghalangi manfaat ekonomi yang merata antara negara anggota. Ini merupakan salah satu tantangan yang juga dihadapi ASEAN, mengingat kondisi ekonomi yang berbeda dari negara anggotanya sehingga manfaat ekonomi dari aliran FDI tidak dapat dinikmati secara merata.

## **Hasil Pembahasan**

Akademisi seperti Jarvis (2012) berpendapat bahwa upaya ASEAN untuk meningkatkan intra-ASEAN FDI melalui integrasi ekonomi selama periode dari tahun 1995 hingga 2004 mencapai kemajuan yang kurang signifikan. Jarvis menunjukkan bahwa meskipun pelonggaran hambatan investasi di antara para anggota ASEAN, intra-ASEAN FDI tetap tidak berubah selama periode itu. Namun, setelah 2009 intra-ASEAN FDI mulai menunjukkan tren yang signifikan. Data menunjukkan bahwa pada tahun 2014 intra-ASEAN FDI sebesar \$ 24,4 miliar dibandingkan dengan intra-ASEAN FDI pada tahun 2004 hanya \$ 3,2 miliar (ASEAN & UNCTAD, 2015). Dampak integrasi ASEAN melalui penandatanganan ACIA pada tahun 2009 dan pembentukan AEC meningkatkan kepercayaan diri untuk bisnis di negara-negara ASEAN untuk memperluas investasi ke negara-negara tetangga. Peningkatan intra-ASEAN FDI juga dapat menunjukkan bahwa negara-negara ASEAN memiliki pertumbuhan ekonomi yang menjajikan dan mampu mencari peluang lebih lanjut melalui pelonggaran investasi di wilayah tersebut. Bahkan inflasi yang tinggi di negara-negara anggota yang ditemukan memiliki sedikit efek pada investasi lintas batas antara negara-negara anggota ASEAN, yang tetap tinggi karena efek integrasi (Nwosu et al., 2013). Oleh karena itu, berdasarkan munculnya intra-ASEAN FDI itu dapat diindikasikan bahwa upaya ASEAN untuk integrasi lebih lanjut menghasilkan catatan positif bagi pembangunan ekonomi di wilayah itu sebagai peningkatan faktor produksi seperti dari modal dan teknologi transfer yang akan menyertai masuknya FDI.

Meningkatnya investasi intra-ASEAN adalah salah satu penyebab bagi peningkatan FDI inflow ASEAN secara keseluruhan pada tahun 2014 (ASEAN & UNCTAD, 2015). Pada tahun yang sama ASEAN juga tercatat menjadi investor terbesar kedua di wilayah sendiri, terhitung sebesar 18% dari total FDI yang masuk ke ASEAN, setelah Uni Eropa. Hal ini dapat membuktikan kepentingan yang lebih besar dari komunitas bisnis dalam memiliki kehadiran di kawasannya sendiri, yang pada gilirannya menunjukkan keberhasilan integrasi wilayah dan optimisme tentang kebijakan dan lingkungan investasi di kawasan ini. Namun demikian, FDI yang berasal dari luar kawasan masih tetap menjadi sumber investasi terbesar. Karena kawasan ini sedang mengejar strategi yang berorientasi ke luar, kemungkinan akan bahwa intra-ASEAN FDI tetap lebih kecil dibandingkan dengan FDI yang berasal dari luar kawasan ASEAN. Selain itu, terdapat perbedaan aliran investasi intra-ASEAN di antara anggota, karena tingkat perkembangan ekonomi yang berbeda.

Pada periode 1995-2004, dari 10 negara anggota hanya tiga negara (Malaysia, Singapura dan Thailand) mendominasi penyerapan intra-ASEAN FDI. Malaysia tercatat menerima rata-rata 22,86%, Singapura 24% dan Thailand 22,9% dari semua arus masuk investasi ASEAN intra pada periode 1995-2004 (Jarvis, 2012, p. 238). Sementara dalam hal sumber investasi intra-ASEAN di kawasan, Singapura dan Malaysia mendominasi dengan hampir 80% aliran investasi bersumber dari kedua negara tersebut (*ibid.*). Demikian pula, studi oleh Masron dan Yusop (2013) dari data yang mencakup periode 1998-2009 menunjukkan bahwa ada perbedaan besar intra-ASEAN FDI antara anggota ASEAN, dengan beberapa negara anggota mendominasi sebagai penerima serta sumber intra-ASEAN FDI. Perbedaan ini menunjukkan bahwa aliran yang tidak merata pada aliran FDI intra-ASEAN masih merupakan tantangan bagi ASEAN meskipun inisiatif untuk liberalisasi investasi di kawasan telah di implementasikan. Diantara alasan untuk hasil ini antara lain adanya korelasi kapasitas kelembagaan dan infrastruktur yang tidak merata diantara negara anggota sebagai fondasi kesiapan dalam menangkap peluang investasi serta menarik investasi (Jarvis, 2012). Namun demikian, karena ketergantungan negara-negara anggota ASEAN di FDI yang berasal dari negara-negara maju, perhatian utama akan berhubungan dengan FDI yang berasal dari luar daerah, yang akan dibahas dalam bagian berikut.

## Investasi Extra-ASEAN

Data aliran FDI ASEAN menunjukkan bahwa terdapat beberapa periode perlambatan arus masuk FDI yang terlihat pada tahun 1997-1998 selama krisis keuangan Asia dan krisis global tahun 2008-2009. Namun, pada tahun 2014 ASEAN total *FDI inflow* mencapai \$ 136,2 miliar yang naik 16% dari total FDI \$ 117,7 miliar tahun sebelumnya (ASEAN Secretariat & UNCTAD, 2015). Hal ini juga dapat dicatat bahwa pada tahun 2014 ASEAN melampaui China sebagai penerima FDI di Asia (ibid.). Hal ini menunjukkan bahwa upaya ASEAN dalam membuka dan langkah-langkah fasilitatif untuk investasi yang masuk ke wilayah ini telah diuntungkan dengan menjadi kawasan yang lebih kompetitif dan menarik untuk tujuan investasi. Kawai dan Naknoi (2015) menunjukkan bahwa industri yang berorientasi ke luar yang dilaksanakan di ASEAN dan upaya untuk mengintegrasikan dengan rantai pasokan Asia Timur dan produksi jaringan telah membuat ASEAN penting untuk perusahaan multinasional. Ini menunjukkan bahwa upaya ASEAN dalam integrasi perdagangan dan investasi yang mampu menghasilkan efek melengkapi yang memberikan manfaat lebih lanjut untuk perekonomian kawasan.

Peningkatan investasi yang masuk ASEAN dapat dikaitkan dengan kondisi ekonomi yang positif di wilayah yang membuat lingkungan investasi yang lebih nyaman bagi investor. Integrasi ekonomi telah mendorong kegiatan ekonomi di ASEAN, persepsi yang meningkat di kalangan investor internasional dan meningkatkan peluang investasi di wilayah ini telah membantu untuk menarik lebih banyak investasi yang masuk ke kawasan. Sebuah laporan oleh Sekretariat ASEAN dan UNCTAD (2015) menyebutkan "Berbagai survei terbaru dari perusahaan menggarisbawahi bahwa semakin banyak MNEs memiliki persepsi yang menguntungkan dari kawasan yang diterjemahkan ke dalam bentuk investasi". Oleh karena itu upaya ASEAN untuk membuka ekonomi dan memperkuat kebijakan untuk memastikan rezim investasi yang sehat di daerah melalui AFTA, AIA, ACIA dan pembentukan AEC telah membuat prospek investasi yang lebih baik untuk kawasan ASEAN.

Selanjutnya, ketahanan ekonomi ASEAN di tengah-tengah ketidakstabilan ekonomi global sejak 2008 membuat ASEAN sebagai tujuan investasi yang menguntungkan di kawasan Asia Timur. Hal ini juga didukung oleh survei terbaru dari perusahaan multinasional yang menyatakan bahwa

pembentukan AEC telah menjadi faktor yang semakin penting dalam keputusan investasi mereka di wilayah ASEAN (Intal 2015). Oleh karena itu, dapat disarankan bahwa efek dari integrasi ASEAN telah memberikan manfaat ekonomi, yang sejalan dengan harapan di bawah teori regionalisme baru. Masuknya FDI ke wilayah ini dapat meningkatkan kegiatan ekonomi kawasan dan pembangunan kawasan. Namun, seperti yang telah disebutkan di disertasi, terdapat tantangan dari manfaat yang sama antara negara-negara anggota ASEAN dalam proses integrasi yang layak untuk diingat untuk mengevaluasi keberhasilan integrasi.

## **Kesimpulan**

Sebagaimana disampaikan para ahli integrasi bahwa potensi manfaat integrasi regional dapat membawa hasil yang positif bagi perekonomian melalui peningkatan perdagangan dan investasi, ini juga telah menjadi tujuan ASEAN dalam upayanya melakukan proses integrasi. Selain itu, potensi manfaat dari situasi ekonomi makro ASEAN juga merupakan aspek penting yang membuat ASEAN mengejar integrasi yang lebih dalam dan lebih luas. Upaya ASEAN untuk mengintegrasikan pada dasarnya untuk menciptakan sebuah kerjasama yang saling melengkapi untuk perdagangan dan investasi di kawasan ini. Seperti perdagangan yang meningkat di kawasan diharapkan juga akan mendapatkan dampak positif bagi peningkatan investasi, dan sebaliknya. Dalam rangka untuk mendapatkan keuntungan ekonomi, ASEAN telah terus berupaya untuk menciptakan kawasan yang lebih terbuka dan fasilitatif untuk perdagangan dan investasi.

Dalam aspek perdagangan, dampak integrasi ASEAN telah menurunkan tarif di kawasan untuk meningkatkan perdagangan. AFTA dengan skema CEPT merupakan langkah besar ASEAN menuju penurunan tarif dengan komitmen oleh negara anggotanya, mengingat kegagalan upaya sebelumnya dalam integrasi diakibatkan komitmen yang terbatas dalam skema ASEAN PTA. Penghapusan hambatan tarif telah menaikkan perdagangan intra ASEAN mencapai 25% dari total perdagangan; Namun, persentase ini tetap relatif stagnan. Salah satu alasan untuk stagnasi lanjutan dari intra-trade berkaitan erat dengan NTB yang menghalangi perdagangan yang efisien di kawasan. Namun demikian, meskipun *intra-trade* relatif konstan, ASEAN mampu mendapatkan keuntungan lebih dari integrasi internal yang serta integrasi pada ekonomi global. Ini telah

ditunjukkan oleh kemampuannya untuk mengambil keuntungan dari rantai pasokan global produksi melalui peningkatan daya saingnya akibat proses integrasi.

Dalam konteks investasi, liberalisasi telah membuat kawasan ASEAN lebih menarik untuk tujuan investasi. ASEAN Investment (AIA) dianggap kesepakatan yang dimulai kemudahan rezim investasi di ASEAN. Penggantian AIA dengan ACIA (ASEAN Comprehensive Investment Agreement) membuat kawasan ASEAN lebih terintegrasi dalam fasilitasi dan perlindungan investasi yang masuk ke wilayah tersebut. Dampak dari AIA dan ACIA telah menyebabkan peningkatan yang luar biasa dalam aliran FDI intra ASEAN. *intra-investment* ASEAN telah menjadi kontributor kedua terbesar wilayah ini dari total investasi yang masuk ke ASEAN. Selanjutnya, tujuan untuk membuat kawasan ini lebih menarik bagi investor diluar kawasan terus menunjukkan sinyal yang positif, ke titik di mana ASEAN mampu mengungguli China dalam menarik investasi di tahun 2014. Prestasi ini adalah karena upaya integrasi ASEAN dalam perdagangan dan investasi, yang akibatnya membuat ekonomi makro kawasan itu sehat dan mampu menjadi salah satu tujuan investasi yang menarik di dunia.

Berdasarkan dampak dari upaya integrasi perdagangan, investasi dan ekonomi makro di wilayah ini, dapat disimpulkan bahwa ASEAN telah secara umum mendapatkan manfaat dari integrasi ekonomi yang lebih dalam dan lebih luas. Hasil ini sejalan dengan efek dalam teori regionalisme baru pada kawasan yang melakukan integrasi. Namun demikian, potensi menuai manfaat lebih masih ada. Misalnya, stagnasi intra-trade ASEAN pada 25% dari total perdagangan menandakan potensi yang lebih dapat diperoleh ketika NTB dihilangkan lebih lanjut. Selain itu, tantangan yang akan menjadi rintangan untuk pertumbuhan ekonomi yang berkelanjutan harus menjadi salah satu prioritas untuk menemukan solusinya. Tingkat perkembangan ekonomi yang berbeda antara anggota ASEAN masih merupakan tantangan besar dalam rangka untuk wilayah untuk tumbuh secara ekonomi pada kecepatan yang sama dan mampu menjadi lebih bersatu sebagai kekuatan ekonomi regional.





---

**Pengaruh Majalah Ilmiah Kampus  
Pengawasan terhadap Pengetahuan,  
Sikap APIP tentang Fraud dan Citra  
Organisasi**

**The Influence of Scientific Magazine  
“Kampus Pengawasan” to Knowledge,  
APIP Attitudes on Fraud and  
Organizational Image**

---

Nama : Dian Setyawati  
NIP : 197912191999032001  
Instansi : BPKP  
Tahun Intake : 2014  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Local  
Program Studi : Komunikasi Pembangunan Pertanian dan  
Pedesaan  
Negara Studi : Indonesia  
Universitas : Institut Pertanian Bogor (IPB)

Dalam upaya peningkatan transparansi dan akuntabilitas sebagai bagian dari sembilan Program Percepatan Reformasi Birokrasi, penguatan peran Aparat Pengawas Intern Pemerintah (APIP) menjadi penting untuk dikedepankan. Sesuai PP No 60 Tahun 2008, lembaga APIP yang terdiri dari Badan Pengawasan Keuangan dan Pembangunan (BPKP), Inspektorat Jenderal pada kementerian/ lembaga, Inspektorat Provinsi, Kabupaten dan Kota mempunyai peran antara lain: memberikan keyakinan yang memadai atas ketaatan, kehematan, efisiensi dan efektivitas pencapaian tujuan penyelenggaraan tugas dan fungsi instansi pemerintah; memberikan peringatan dini dan meningkatkan efektivitas manajemen risiko dalam penyelenggaraan tugas dan fungsi instansi pemerintah; serta memberikan masukan yang dapat memelihara dan meningkatkan mutu tata kelola penyelenggaraan tugas dan fungsi instansi pemerintah.

Berdasarkan pendekatan *Internal Auditor Capability Model* (IACM), kondisi saat ini menunjukkan bahwa sebagian besar APIP yaitu 85.23 persen atau 404 unit kerja masih berada di Level 1. Hal ini berarti APIP belum dapat memberikan jaminan atas proses tata kelola sesuai peraturan dan belum mampu mencegah korupsi; 14.56 persen atau 69 unit kerja APIP mencapai Level 2, dimana APIP mampu memberikan keyakinan yang memadai, proses sesuai dengan peraturan dan mampu mendeteksi terjadinya korupsi. Hanya 0.21 persen atau satu unit kerja APIP yang telah mencapai Level 3 dimana APIP telah mampu menilai efisiensi, efektivitas ekonomis suatu kegiatan dan mampu memberikan konsultasi pada tatakelola, manajemen risiko dan pengendalian intern. Hingga kini belum terdapat unit kerja APIP yang mampu mencapai Level 4 dimana APIP telah mampu memberikan jaminan secara keseluruhan atas tata kelola, manajemen risiko dan pengendalian intern serta Level 5 dimana APIP mampu menjadi agen perubahan. (Simanjuntak 2015).

Beberapa penyebabnya antara lain dari segi jumlah Auditor saat ini baru berjumlah 12.755 orang atau (27.39%) dari total kebutuhan nasional 46.560 orang, sehingga terjadi kekurangan 33.805 orang. Selain itu, kompetensi dan profesionalisme sumber daya manusia (SDM) belum memadai, seringnya mutasi tanpa kaderisasi, sehingga menunjukkan kurangnya komitmen pimpinan dalam memberdayakan APIP, anggaran dan sarana Teknologi Informasi (TI) belum memadai, maupun perencanaan yang belum berdasarkan prioritas/ risiko (Simanjuntak 2015). Selain itu, isu mengenai independensi juga menguat

khususnya pada pemerintahan daerah terkait regulasi dimana secara struktur eselonisasi berada pada Sekretaris Daerah sesuai pasal 216 UU 23/2014 padahal berdasarkan PP 60/2008 Pasal 1 angka 6 menyatakan Inspektorat Provinsi bertanggungjawab langsung kepada Gubernur (Santosa 2016). Hingga kini belum terdapat Undang-undang yang secara khusus mengatur Audit Internal Pemerintah, regulasinya masih tersebar pada beberapa kebijakan yang berpotensi tidak konsisten, tidak selaras maupun tidak operasional.

Berdasarkan data dari tahun 2009 s/d. 2013, BPKP telah membantu Kejaksaan, Kepolisian dan Komisi Pemberantasan Korupsi (KPK) dalam menghitung dugaan kerugian keuangan negara akibat korupsi (fraud) Rp. 10.149 triliun (Mardiasmo dalam Anugerah 2014). Indikator Indeks Persepsi Korupsi pada tahun 2015 juga menunjukkan Indonesia masih menempati urutan ke-88 dengan nilai 36, berada di bawah Malaysia dan Thailand. Masih tingginya tingkat kecurangan, khususnya korupsi di sektor pemerintah telah menimbulkan dampak sangat merugikan, dimana target pembangunan menjadi tidak optimal, rendahnya pelayanan publik hingga kesejahteraan masyarakat yang masih rendah.

APIP sebagai lembaga pengawasan internal pemerintah diharapkan mampu mendukung sistem pengendalian internal dan dituntut mempunyai tanggungjawab yang kuat dalam mendeteksi fraud, sehingga dapat mendeteksi fraud secara dini. Kompetensi APIP di bidang fraud sangat penting dimiliki dan harus terus-menerus ditingkatkan. Audit internal yang berkualitas akan mampu mendeteksi kecurangan (fraud) dan menginformasikan secara cepat kepada manajemen.

Erina et al. (2012) menyimpulkan kompetensi secara parsial maupun bersama-sama peubah integritas, obyektifitas, dan kerahasiaan berpengaruh terhadap kinerja APIP. Refdi (2013) menyatakan kompetensi secara parsial maupun bersama-sama peubah independensi, kepatuhan pada kode etik dan motivasi berpengaruh terhadap mutu audit. Kompetensi menjadi faktor nyata dalam mendukung kinerja APIP. Salah satu kompetensi yang harus dimiliki APIP adalah kemampuan mendeteksi kecurangan (fraud). Fuad (2015) meneliti persepsi auditor pada kantor BPK dan BPKP Provinsi Jawa Tengah mengenai tanggungjawab dalam mendeteksi fraud dan menyimpulkan bahwa faktor independensi dan kompetensi berpengaruh positif terhadap tanggungjawab auditor dalam mendeteksi kecurangan.

Salah satu unsur penting dalam mendukung profesionalisme auditor internal selain kerangka pengetahuan, pendidikan dan pelatihan, organisasi profesi, standar, kode etik, telaah sejawat adalah tersedianya majalah/jurnal yang berisi perkembangan pengetahuan teknis maupun artikel bermanfaat dalam bentuk features (Pickett 2003). Media seperti ini penting dalam membangun profesionalisme anggota, karena melalui media tersebut anggota dapat menyampaikan hasil riset, pemikiran, dan pengalaman yang masih berkaitan dengan a commonbody of knowledge profesi. Dengan demikian terbangun transfer knowledge dan berbagi informasi yang kuat antar anggota profesi, hingga setiap anggota dapat memperoleh pengetahuan terkini di bidangnya (Wibowo 2012).

Sebagian besar Hubungan Masyarakat (Humas) pemerintah maupun swasta saat ini banyak menggunakan media yang dikelola sendiri yang lazim disebut jurnal internal sebagai media komunikasi dan publikasi dengan khalayaknya. Media ini memberikan beberapa keuntungan bagi humas dibandingkan media massa pada umumnya dimana berita yang disusun harus melewati proses seleksi dan editing sehingga berpeluang mengalami reduksi atau bahkan tidak dimuat.

Pusat Pendidikan dan Pelatihan Pengawasan Badan Pengawasan Keuangan dan Pembangunan (Pusdiklatwas BPKP) merupakan salah satu unit kerja BPKP yang mempunyai tugas pokok melaksanakan penyelenggaraan, pembinaan, dan koordinasi kegiatan pendidikan dan pelatihan di bidang pengawasan. Visi Pusdiklatwas BPKP "Menjadi Lembaga Diklat Terdepan dan Terpercaya di Lingkungan Pemerintahan" berupaya menjalankan misi ketiga BPKP yakni mengembangkan kapasitas pengawasan intern pemerintah profesional dan kompeten. Pusdiklatwas BPKP melakukan pembelajaran yang dapat mempercepat pemenuhan kompetensi auditor di seluruh instansi pemerintah pusat dan instansi pemerintah daerah (Pusdiklatwas 2015).

Beberapa keberhasilan kinerja Pusdiklatwas antara lain, meraih sertifikat ISO 9001:2008 dari TUV Nord terhadap penerapan standarisasi proses kerja kediklatan sejak tahun 2007, memperoleh akreditasi A dari Lembaga Kebijakan Pengadaan Barang/Jasa Pemerintah (LKPP) untuk program Pelatihan Pengadaan Barang/Jasa Pemerintah serta seringkali menjadi tempat tujuan kegiatan studi banding penyelenggaraan diklat oleh lembaga-lembaga diklat lain (Pusdiklatwas 2015).

Humas Pusdiklatwas BPKP menerbitkan majalah ilmiah triwulanan Kampus Pengawasan (KP) pada tahun 2015 dengan tujuan menjadi jembatan komunikasi dan pengembangan profesi pada diklat auditor Pusdiklatwas BPKP dan seluruh kalangan APIP se-Indonesia. Selain itu juga sebagai sarana publikasi kinerja yang telah dicapai untuk memelihara citra positif organisasi. Sebagian besar konten majalah berisikan artikel yang bersifat ilmiah, sedangkan sebagian lainnya merupakan konten yang bersifat kehumasan khususnya reportase kegiatan Pusdiklatwas. Khusus pada edisi yang digunakan dalam penelitian ini, majalah KP mengangkat topik pencegahan fraud secara mendalam dan komprehensif. Majalah KP dengan oplah tiga ribu eksemplar didistribusikan langsung ke seluruh peserta diklat serta untuk memperluas jangkauan, majalah KP juga telah diunggah di Facebook komunitas APIP.

Jurnal internal (House journal) merupakan media yang diciptakan sendiri oleh organisasi/perusahaan untuk menjangkau khalayak tertentu dalam rangka mencapai tujuan-tujuan PR, publikasi yang didistribusikan kepada para anggota ataupun khalayak pendukung dari suatu organisasi seperti institusi-institusi profesional, universitas, komunitas profesi tertentu, serikat buruh, dan yayasan amal lazim disebut jurnal internal semi-eksternal. (Jefkins & Yadin 2014). Adapun majalah ilmiah merupakan terbitan berkala, terbit terus-menerus dengan judul majalah yang sama, untuk jangka waktu yang tidak dapat ditentukan dan dengan kala terbit yang tertentu pula. Setiap nomer terbitan memuat beberapa tulisan atau artikel, bisa dengan topik yang sama atau berbeda (Prawati 2003).

Berdasarkan permasalahan yang diuraikan, penelitian bertujuan untuk: (1) menguji pengaruh penggunaan media majalah KP terhadap efek majalah berupa pengetahuan dan sikap APIP tentang fraud, (2) menguji pengaruh penggunaan media majalah KP terhadap citra organisasi, (3) menganalisis pengaruh karakteristik pembaca, kebutuhan informasi, penilaian efektivitas majalah dan selektivitas terhadap efek majalah serta citra organisasi.

Sven Windahl dalam West dan Turner (2007) menyebut kombinasi dari teori *Uses and Gratifications* dan tradisi efek menjadi model *Uses and Effect*. Dalam teori *Uses and Effect*, kebutuhan hanya menjadi salah satu faktor dalam menentukan penggunaan media. Karakteristik individual, harapan dan persepsi terhadap media, serta tingkat aksesibilitas terhadap media memengaruhi keputusan penggunaan media.

Penggunaan media khususnya dalam bentuk majalah KP kepada APIP yang merupakan peserta diklat pada Pusdiklatwas BPKP diharapkan mampu meningkatkan efek majalah berupa pengetahuan dan sikap, serta citra organisasi berupa profesionalitas lembaga dan profesionalisme pengajar. Terdapat beberapa faktor yang lain yang diduga berpengaruh, yaitu karakteristik APIP, kebutuhan informasi, penilaian efektivitas media dan selektivitas. Hipotesis penelitian ini adalah 1) Terdapat perbedaan nyata efek majalah berupa peningkatan pengetahuan dan sikap APIP tentang fraud antara kelompok perlakuan dan kelompok kontrol; 2) Terdapat perbedaan nyata citra organisasi berupa peningkatan citra lembaga dan peningkatan citra pengajar antara kelompok perlakuan dan kelompok kontrol; 3) terdapat pengaruh nyata karakteristik APIP, kebutuhan informasi, penilaian efektivitas majalah dan selektivitas terhadap efek majalah berupa peningkatan pengetahuan dan sikap tentang fraud, serta citra organisasi berupa peningkatan profesionalitas lembaga dan pengajar.

## **Metode Penelitian**

Penelitian dilakukan dengan metode quasi eksperimen jenis Rancangan Kelompok-Kontrol (*Pre-test* dan *post-test*) Nonekuivalen atau Nonequivalent (*Pre-test* and *Post-test*) *Control-Group Design* dengan responden 80 orang terbagi dalam kelompok Dengan Pemberian Majalah sebanyak dua kelas dan kelompok Tanpa Pemberian Majalah sebanyak dua kelas dengan jumlah total masing-masing kelompok sebanyak 40 orang. Responden merupakan peserta Diklat Pembentukan Auditor Ahli dari Inspektorat Kab/Kota. Lokasi penelitian berada di dua lokasi berbeda, yakni tiga kelas di gedung Pusdiklatwas BPKP Ciawi Bogor dan satu kelas di Hotel Indra Jaya Puncak Bogor. Waktu penelitian berlangsung pada bulan Maret-Mei 2016.

Pengumpulan data menggunakan observasi, wawancara berkuesioner dan *focus group discussion* (FGD) dengan instrumen *pre-test* dan *post-test* berupa pilihan ganda untuk mengukur pengetahuan, serta skala Likert untuk mengukur sikap dan citra organisasi dan kuesioner penelitian menggunakan skala Likert. Evaluasi rancangan media menggunakan metode *face validity in house* dan *open house*. Validitas instrumen menggunakan analisis statistik *product moment pearson* 37 pernyataan valid (0.416 - 0.934) dan reliabilitas

menggunakan alpha Cronbach's dengan nilai reliabilitas masing-masing; karakteristik 0.561, kebutuhan informasi 0.893, penilaian efektivitas 0.838, selektivitas 0.467, sikap 0.810 dan citra 0.922. Analisis data menggunakan analisis deskriptif dan inferensial menggunakan uji Mann-Whitney untuk membandingkan karakteristik APIP, uji t dua contoh berpasangan untuk membandingkan hasil pre-test dan post-test serta analisis Regresi dengan Software SPSS untuk menganalisis pengaruh karakteristik APIP, kebutuhan informasi, penilaian efektivitas majalah dan selektivitas terhadap peningkatan efek majalah dan citra organisasi.

## **Karakteristik APIP**

Komposisi umur kelompok Dengan Pemberian Majalah mayoritas pada kelompok umur 35 - 38 tahun sebesar 47.5 persen dan kelompok Tanpa Pemberian Majalah mayoritas pada kelompok umur 39 - 48 tahun sebesar 37.5 persen. Jenis kelamin kelompok Dengan Pemberian Majalah sebesar 55 persen merupakan laki-laki sedangkan kelompok Tanpa Pemberian Majalah sebesar 65 persen merupakan wanita. Pendidikan responden mayoritas sarjana pada kelompok Dengan Pemberian Majalah sebesar 82.50 persen sedangkan pada kelompok Tanpa Pemberian Majalah sebesar 75 persen.

Adapun penghasilan responden kelompok Dengan Pemberian Majalah didominasi pada kelompok penghasilan antara Rp4.100.000,00 - Rp8.000.000,00 sebesar 40 persen sedangkan kelompok Tanpa Pemberian Majalah didominasi pada kelompok penghasilan antara Rp3.100.000,00 - Rp4.000.000,00 sebesar 42.5 persen. Komitmen organisasi pada unit kerja Inspektorat mayoritas pada kategori tinggi masing-masing kelompok sebesar 52.5 persen, komitmen profesi pada jabatan auditor mayoritas pada kategori sedang, kelompok Dengan Pemberian Majalah sebesar 62.50 persen sedangkan kelompok Tanpa Pemberian Majalah sebesar 57.50 persen. Motivasi meningkatkan kompetensi mayoritas juga pada kategori sedang, kelompok Dengan Pemberian Majalah sebesar 70 persen sedangkan kelompok Tanpa Pemberian Majalah sebesar 55 persen. Uji Mann-Whitney menunjukkan adanya perbedaan yang signifikan pada umur dan jenis kelamin.



## **Kebutuhan Informasi**

Hasil penelitian menunjukkan, indikator perkembangan pengetahuan di bidang pengawasan internal pada kategori tinggi (52.50 persen) dan kategori sedang (47.50 persen) sedangkan indikator perkembangan kebijakan dan peraturan pemerintah pada kategori tinggi (60 persen) dan kategori sedang (40 persen). Adapun indikator perkembangan profesi auditor internal pada kategori tinggi (52.50 persen), kategori sedang (45 persen) dan kategori rendah (2.50 persen) serta indikator hasil penelitian di bidang pengawasan pada kategori tinggi (50 persen), kategori sedang (45 persen) dan kategori rendah (5 persen).

## **Penilaian Efektivitas Majalah**

Penilaian efektivitas majalah secara keseluruhan pada indikator daya tarik pada kategori tinggi (30 persen), kategori sedang (67.5 persen) dan kategori rendah (2.5 persen). Pada indikator pemahaman pada kategori tinggi (22.5 persen), kategori sedang (75 persen) dan kategori rendah (2.5 persen). Penilaian efektivitas majalah pada indikator keterlibatan diri pada kategori tinggi (17.5 persen), kategori sedang (77.5 persen) dan kategori rendah (5 persen), untuk indikator penerimaan secara keseluruhan pada kategori tinggi (30 persen) dan kategori sedang (70 persen).

## **Selektivitas**

Hasil penelitian secara keseluruhan menunjukkan tingkat selektivitas responden cukup tinggi, dimana frekuensi membaca pada kategori sedang (40 persen) dan kategori rendah (60 persen), serta jumlah artikel yang dibaca pada kategori sedang (25 persen) dan kategori rendah (75 persen).

## **Pengetahuan APIP**

Peningkatan pengetahuan APIP dari 15 pertanyaan pada kelompok Dengan Pemberian Majalah 39 (rata-rata 0.98) dari pengetahuan awal 251 (rata-rata 6.28) termasuk kategori rendah. Pada kelompok Tanpa Pemberian Majalah justru terjadi penurunan 13 (rata-rata -0.33) dari pengetahuan awal 235 (rata-rata 5.88).

Hasil uji t berpasangan pada kelompok Dengan Pemberian Majalah dengan nilai thitung  $2.831 >$  dari ttabel  $2.042$  ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ), hal ini menunjukkan bahwa terdapat peningkatan pengetahuan yang nyata sebagai akibat pemberian majalah. Majalah KP mampu menjadikan responden sebagai APIP semakin mengetahui istilah red flag sebagai gejala terjadinya fraud, unit kerja yang melakukan penilaian tingkat risiko dan upaya mitigasi atas risiko kecurangan secara periodik, definisi fraud, faktor yang berkontribusi paling besar dalam mengungkap kecurangan dalam organisasi maupun perbedaan tingkatan korupsi sebagai salah satu bentuk fraud.

Namun peningkatan pengetahuan masih berkategori rendah (rata-rata  $0.98$ ) karena frekuensi membaca dan jumlah artikel yang dibaca masih rendah. Hal ini disebabkan jadwal diklat yang padat dan materi diklat yang dinilai cukup berat. Selain itu, sebagian APIP juga menilai daya tarik majalah masih harus ditingkatkan.

## **Sikap APIP**

Skor peningkatan sikap APIP dari sepuluh pernyataan pada kelompok Dengan Pemberian Majalah  $69.84$  (rata-rata  $1.75$ ) dari sikap awal  $1642$  (rata-rata  $41.05$ ) yang termasuk berkategori tinggi. Pada kelompok Tanpa Pemberian Majalah justru mengalami penurunan  $-1.34$  (rata-rata  $-0.03$ ) dari sikap awal  $1636.51$  (rata-rata  $40.91$ ). Hasil uji t berpasangan pada kelompok Dengan Pemberian Majalah mempunyai nilai t hitung  $3.077 >$  dari t tabel  $2.042$  ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). Hal ini menunjukkan terdapat peningkatan sikap yang nyata. Peningkatan sikap terutama pada keyakinan bahwa APIP harus mampu memberikan jaminan bahwa seluruh sistem pengendalian fraud berjalan efektif serta deteksi kasus korupsi berjamaah dapat ditingkatkan dengan mekanisme whistleblowing, jaminan bagi pengadu dan jaminan penanganan pengaduan secara transparan. Selain itu responden sebagai APIP juga semakin meyakini bahwa perubahan gaya hidup auditee harus menjadi perhatian APIP dan harus menjadi dasar evaluasi lebih mendalam terhadap sistem pengendalian atas risiko fraud.

Hipotesis pertama pada penelitian ini diterima. Hal ini terlihat dari adanya perbedaan pengetahuan dan sikap tentang fraud yang nyata pada APIP kelompok perlakuan dibandingkan kelompok kontrol sehingga dapat disimpulkan bahwa pemberian majalah KP pada kelompok perlakuan mampu meningkatkan efek

majalah berupa pengetahuan dan sikap APIP tentang fraud. Hal ini relevan dengan penelitian Yusnita (2015) yang menyatakan media booklet mampu meningkatkan pengetahuan tentang pembuatan pupuk organik cair pada anak-anak dan penelitian Labbe dan Fortner (2001) mengenai majalah lingkungan E/The Environmental Magazine yang menyimpulkan pelanggan menggunakan majalah sebagai alat memperkuat keyakinan dan nilai atau penggunaan untuk identitas pribadi, serta setidaknya untuk memperkuat kebiasaan yang telah ada.

## **Citra Profesionalitas Lembaga**

Skor peningkatan citra profesionalitas lembaga oleh responden dari tiga pernyataan pada kelompok Dengan Pemberian Majalah 3 (rata-rata 0.07) dari skor awal 529 (rata-rata 13.23) termasuk berkategori tinggi dan kelompok Tanpa Pemberian Majalah terjadi peningkatan 5 (rata-rata 0.12) dari skor awal 539 (rata-rata 13.48). Hasil uji t berpasangan pada kelompok Dengan Pemberian Majalah dengan nilai dihitung  $0.476 <$  dari ttabel sebesar 2.042 ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). Menunjukkan tidak terdapat peningkatan citra profesionalitas lembaga yang nyata.

## **Citra Profesionalitas Pengajar**

Skor peningkatan citra profesionalitas pengajar oleh responden dari dua pernyataan pada kelompok Dengan Pemberian Majalah 3 (rata-rata 0.07) dari citra pengajar awal 363 (rata-rata 9.08) termasuk berkategori tinggi. Pada kelompok Tanpa Pemberian Majalah justru mengalami penurunan -5 (rata-rata -0.12). Hasil uji t berpasangan pada kelompok Dengan Pemberian Majalah dengan nilai terhitung  $0.476 <$  dari ttabel 2.042 ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ), hal ini menunjukkan bahwa tidak terdapat peningkatan yang nyata pada citra profesionalitas pengajar.

Dari data di atas, maka hipotesis kedua pada penelitian ditolak. Hal ini terlihat dari tidak adanya perbedaan citra yang nyata pada APIP kelompok perlakuan dibandingkan kelompok kontrol, sehingga dapat disimpulkan pemberian majalah KP sebagai media internal semi eksternal pada kelompok perlakuan belum mampu meningkatkan citra organisasi, baik pada profesionalisme lembaga maupun pengajar. Hal ini berbeda dengan penelitian Pasaribu (2015) dimana media internal berupa portal mampu meningkatkan citra organisasi. Hal ini dapat diakibatkan adanya perbedaan karakteristik

dimana media portal khusus sebagai media kehumasan sedangkan majalah KP berfungsi ganda yaitu sebagai majalah ilmiah sekaligus majalah kehumasan dengan konten kehumasan yang masih minim.

Penelitian Kiousis et al.(2007) menyatakan terdapat beberapa atribut untuk mengukur pengaruh agenda-building dan agenda-setting pemberitaan di media massa terhadap reputasi perusahaan yang dapat menjadi rujukan dalam memperkaya konten kehumasan majalah KP yaitu meliputi produk dan layanan, kinerja keuangan, lingkungan tempat kerja, tanggung jawab sosial, visi dan kepemimpinan serta hubungan emosional.

## **Simpulan**

Terdapat perbedaan efek majalah berupa peningkatan pengetahuan dan sikap APIP tentang fraud secara nyata antara kelompok perlakuan majalah KP dibanding kelompok kontrol. Tidak terdapat perbedaan citra organisasi berupa peningkatan profesionalitas lembaga dan pengajar secara nyata antara kelompok perlakuan majalah KP dibanding kelompok kontrol. Terdapat pengaruh nyata karakteristik APIP, penilaian efektivitas majalah dan selektivitas kelompok perlakuan terhadap efek majalah, serta karakteristik APIP terhadap citra organisasi.

## **Saran**

Penggunaan bahasa ilmiah perlu diubah menjadi bahasa ilmiah populer disertai dengan peningkatan desain majalah untuk meningkatkan daya tarik. Meningkatkan isi kehumasan yang mendukung peningkatan citra organisasi. Mengunggah Majalah Ilmiah Kampus Pengawasan melalui website maupun media sosial, sehingga dapat menjangkau seluruh APIP yang tersebar di seluruh Indonesia. Perlu dilakukan penelitian lanjutan dengan metode eksperimen faktorial dengan variasi bahasa dan desain majalah untuk menggali lebih dalam lagi unsur-unsur yang memengaruhi efektivitas majalah.



---

# **Defining the Country Image of Indonesia Using Multimodal Analysis of Television Commercial: A Case Study of BKPM TV Commercial**

## **Menetapkan Citra Negara Indonesia dengan Menggunakan Analisis Multimodal pada Iklan Komersial di Televisi: Studi Kasus Iklan TV BKPM**

---

Nama : Galuh Candra  
NIP : 198610212010122001  
Instansi : BKPM  
Tahun Intake : 2015  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : Ma Communication And Language  
Skills  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : University Of Portsmouth

## ABSTRACT

The Indonesian government has taken a proactive approach through advertisement to unveiling investment potential. This paper aims to discuss the ways in which linguistic and non-linguistic modes are interrelated in representing Indonesia as a country image for the investors.

The research took BKPM television commercial in 2015 as an object. It employed multimodal analysis to discuss visual, audio and linguistic elements that portray Indonesia. The findings of this study have demonstrated that there are three elements of a country image, which represent Indonesia in the BKPM-text. Those country image elements are national characteristic, natural resources, and economic situation. Specific visual images, soundtrack, and linguistic signs illustrated these country image elements. The study clearly showed that these three elements of visual, audio and linguistic are profound elements employed in representing Indonesia as a country image. In addition, the findings of the study also demonstrated that as an investment commercial, it has lost focus in representing the country image for the intended audience.

## ABSTRAK

Pemerintah Indonesia telah melakukan pendekatan proaktif melalui iklan untuk mengumumkan potensi investasi. Makalah ini bertujuan untuk membahas cara-cara di mana mode linguistik dan non-linguistik saling terkait dalam mewakili Indonesia sebagai citra negara bagi para investor.

Penelitian ini mengambil iklan televisi BKPM pada tahun 2015 sebagai objek. Ia menggunakan analisis multimodal untuk membahas elemen visual, audio dan linguistik yang menggambarkan Indonesia. Temuan penelitian ini telah menunjukkan bahwa ada tiga elemen citra negara, yang mewakili Indonesia dalam teks BKPM. Unsur-unsur citra negara tersebut adalah karakteristik nasional, sumber daya alam, dan situasi ekonomi. Gambar visual, soundtrack, dan linguistik tertentu menggambarkan gambar-gambar elemen negara ini. Studi tersebut dengan jelas menunjukkan bahwa ketiga elemen visual, audio dan linguistik ini adalah elemen mendalam yang digunakan untuk mewakili Indonesia sebagai citra negara. Selain itu, temuan penelitian ini juga menunjukkan bahwa sebagai investasi komersial, ia kehilangan fokus untuk mewakili citra negara untuk khalayak yang dituju.



Many countries have turned to advertising as a method to promote themselves as an ideal location for investment. Indonesia for example, to promote its country to the investors, the Indonesia Investment Coordinating Board (BKPM) published its investment television commercial (TVC) that is still airing nowadays in several television channels throughout the world. There are many elements to consider in order to build the image of Indonesia as a country on advertising to attract the potential investors.

Taking all the above into consideration, this research will focus on what ways the image of Indonesia as a country is being represented in the television commercial published by Indonesia Investment Coordinating Board as one of Indonesian government strategies to attract their potential investors.

## **The Institution's Background**

BKPM (Badan Koordinasi Penanaman Modal) is the Investment Coordinating Board of the Republic of Indonesia, which is headquartered in Jakarta, Indonesia. As the key facilitator between business and government, the Indonesia Investment Coordinating Board is delegated to enhance domestic and foreign direct investment by creating conducive investment climate. In the regime of Indonesian government today, the focus of the economy is on the investment, particularly in foreign direct investment. The Public Private Partnership (PPP) investment is very echoed by the government (OECD, 2016). Attain to get the awareness of the potential investor throughout the world; the government published the TVC, which is currently airing on BBC and Bloomberg. Therefore, the investment TVC plays an important role in promoting Indonesia and should be reviewed whether it has met the criteria in representing the country.

## **Problem Statement**

Taking into account the enormous amounts of money spent on the TVC, both in producing cost and airing cost, it seems logical to assume that the producer attain to attract the audience attention to a certain extent. One question that needs to be asked, however, is whether the audience who watch the TV commercial that only lasts for seconds or minutes maximum could decode the messages. Given recent developments in the advertising, this unexplored area

of TVC can be considered as the area that requires further investigation. This research, which is mainly qualitative, takes into account both linguistic and non-linguistic elements in the discourse of advertising (Cook, 2001) in order to fully get the messages of the TVC. Therefore, a multimodal frame of analysis will be used as it enables the identification of multiple elements in meaning making in a TVC (Periasamy et al., 2015). In related to the multimodal method for analysing TVC, the video was viewed carefully and thoroughly several times to attain full understanding of the message. However, in order to maintain a clear focus, the research will not investigate the audience perspectives. Moreover, the research will be conducted ethically and the data gained from the TVC transcription will be treated confidentially.

## **Analysis**

The extract of BKPM-text comprises 4 Phases with 58 Shots of the storyline. The first Phase consists of 11 shots that show the setting scene orientation with the concept of building trust between the businessman and the paragliding officer. The second Phase consists of 39 shots presenting facts of the country which are shown through the journey of the paragliding itself; where it passes along the sea, rice fields, farm, factory, fish market, city and dockyard. Following the second Phase, the third Phase comprises 5 shots that still illustrate the facts within the concept of satisfaction between the businessman and the paragliding officer, while the last Phase covers 3 shots revealing the logo of the institution. The analytic categories in microanalysis approach are represented in four sections. The first section comprises the level analysis of Frame, Shot, Scene, Sequence, Phase and Sub-phase as visual frame. The second section consists of the sound feature, while the third section captures the ideational, interpersonal and textual function conveyed by visual message elements. The fourth and last section is concerned with intersemiotic relations.

## **The Visual Frame**

This chapter has demonstrated that many-detailed modality, such as camera angles; camera movements; colours and even facial expressions play an important role in building the messages to be conveyed to the viewer through

visual frame. Since the BKPM-text comprises not only visual but also audio element, it is now necessary to explain the course of the music and the soundtrack.

## **The Soundtrack**

In this section, music, sound and speech are grouping together on the idea that they all share features in common which provide the fundamental in transcribing them in a cohesive method rather than as wholly individual elements. In the transcription of the soundtrack, there is no need to apply musical notation since musical notation may not possibly covers the various elements in film text, such as sound, music and speech. Furthermore, the transcription focuses only to uncover the semiotic combination of different audio elements. From these findings, it can be seen that the soundtrack relates with other semiotic modalities in the text in order to generate their particular orientations to the theme of the texts. Moreover, it may be that visual frames and related body motion are likely to be unified with the musical background and the off-screen male narrator. Hence, it is now important to analyse visual message elements in details.

## **The Visual Message Elements**

As BKPM-text storyline tells about paragliding journey, the interaction between two main characters, which are the businessman and the paragliding officer, plays an important role. One of the interactions that stand out is the actors' gaze. Gaze can be defined in multifunctional function since it has ideational, interpersonal and textual functions of meaning and organisation (Baldry & Thibault, 2006). Figure 1 cover the first two sequences of BKPM-text, which are chosen as both participants have more interactions in these sequences at the time when they greet each other. It illustrates the ideational function of gaze in BKPM-text in terms of transitivity frames. This figure focuses on the concept of transitivity frame as a functional semiotic unit in which the interactions between actors, activity and contexts are recognised in gaze.

Moreover, the role of camera position and distance may also interact with body movements and gaze in certain ways that can create meaning. In addition,

this TVC might be shows the significance of the semiotics metafunctions. In this section, it has been explained that the interaction between shots in a video, particularly the participant's gaze in BKPM-text can generate meanings, one of which is the status of the participants. The section that follows moves on to consider the comprehensive descriptions of the intersemiotic relations of telefilm.

## **The Intersemiotic Relations**

The findings of this study suggest that the collocation and synonymy through iconographical symbolism play an important role in making meaning. The in frame text comfortable partners in Shot 14 and 15 for instance, appear at the same time as the narration starts. The word comfortable partners is likely to support the narration as an intersemiotic synonymy that the investors will have the comfortable working ambience since they will work with the professional and will be treat as an equal business partner. Furthermore, the portrayal of the businessman and the officer here depict the intersemiotic meronymy, which each of them represents the investors and the investment officers.

## **Audio and Linguistic Elements in TVC Can Provide the Potential Investors**

With regard to metafunctional theory, this study reveals that the interaction of gaze between the participants, in relation to other modality in visual message elements, have significance in constructing the participants' character and role. It is almost certain that the ideational function of gaze can describe the circumstances between the participants. Moreover, gaze can also be used as the interpersonal function to explain the relation between the participants. Additionally, as the textual function, it is likely that gaze can give the audience direction in interpreting the participants' intents by connecting the relation between the gazer and the object of the gaze.

Likewise, from the analyses of the soundtrack, it can be seen that the audio element of music, song and speech also interrelates with other semiotic modalities, such as the in frame text in order to create particular focuses to the theme of the texts. Additionally, it is almost certain that visual frames and

associated body movement are likely to be integrated with the background sound and the off- screen male narrator. The evidence presented thus far supports the idea that many-detailed modality play an important role in building the messages through visual frame such as setting, character and participant's role to be conveyed to the viewer.

Overall, the analysis in this paper has illustrated how multimodal elements construct the country image in a TVC by using multimodal analysis. In doing so, it has shed light on the possible significances that can be derived from the visual, audio and linguistic elements in a TVC. Furthermore, in relation to the multimodal method, the analysis has strengthened the significance of context in the interpretation of meanings. Moreover, this study has demonstrated that there are three elements of country image that represented Indonesia as a country image in BKPM-text. Those country image elements are national characteristic, natural resources and economic situation. In addition, the analysis has revealed the information of how the representation of the country through the visual, audio and linguistic elements in TVC can provide the potential investors with all the information needed, shape the country perceptions and add the country to the consideration sets.

As a recommendation for the future advertisement of investment, these results above would seem to suggest that the hard sell advertisement, which convey the messages intended to the audience in explicit ways, might be appropriate in representing the country image of the destination country since the message convey will be delivered in the same way as intended by the producer. The commercial would have been more interesting if it had included the business opportunity such as the competitiveness of the economic growth, the taxes rate, the requirements the investor may need to start a company, the labour cost or the period of time needed to license a new company. There would therefore, seem to be a definite need for having a preliminary research of the factors that might be desirable by the intended audience.

---

## **Exploring the Digital Diplomacy in the Indonesian Ministry of Foreign Affairs**

## **Menjelajahi Diplomasi Digital di Kementerian Luar Negeri RI**

---

Nama : Gina Anggraini  
NIP : 198209172009012002  
Instansi : KEMENLU  
Tahun Intake : 2013  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : MA Media and Public Relations  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : Newcastle University

## ABSTRACT

The birth of the Internet followed by the advent of social media has created the need for government communicators to this new technology. Scholars claim that the social media provides a new platform in government communication by eliminating media that use to act as the gatekeeper between officials and its public. The advantages of the social networking sites motivate the government to explore this digital media to engage with the public. This dissertation evaluates the utilisation and real impacts of social media in the Indonesian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA). Results indicate that this new media has not touch public widely yet only use by limited young, active, digital natives public. Data comparison from various sources shows that the implementation is still quite ineffective and the impact is still low. Although theorists point out the two-way communication benefit of social media, the achievement is still debatable. Challenges in using this tool are probably the root of this ineffectiveness. Therefore, beside summarizes the findings, this dissertation generates recommendations for the ministry in order to improve the usage of this digital media in the future.

Keywords: Government communication, public diplomacy, engage, Collaboration, interactive, two-ways, gatekeeper, media, social media, Facebook, Twitter, public

## ABSTRAK

Kelahiran Internet yang diikuti oleh kemunculan media sosial telah menciptakan kebutuhan komunikator pemerintah terhadap teknologi baru ini. Para ilmuwan mengklaim bahwa media sosial menyediakan platform baru dalam komunikasi pemerintah dengan menghilangkan media yang digunakan untuk bertindak sebagai penjaga pintu antara pejabat dan publiknya. Kelebihan situs jejaring sosial memotivasi pemerintah untuk mengeksplorasi media digital ini untuk terlibat dengan publik. Disertasi ini mengevaluasi pemanfaatan dan dampak nyata media sosial di Kementerian Luar Negeri Indonesia (MoFA). Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa media baru ini belum banyak menyentuh masyarakat luas namun hanya digunakan oleh masyarakat pribumi muda yang aktif, aktif, dan digital. Perbandingan data dari berbagai sumber menunjukkan bahwa penerapannya masih cukup efektif dan dampaknya masih rendah. Meski para ahli teori menunjukkan manfaat komunikasi dua arah dari media sosial, pencapaiannya masih bisa diperdebatkan. Tantangan dalam menggunakan alat ini mungkin adalah akar ketidakefektifan ini. Oleh karena itu, selain merangkum temuannya, disertasi ini menghasilkan rekomendasi bagi kementrian untuk memperbaiki penggunaan media digital ini di masa depan.

Kata kunci: Komunikasi pemerintah, diplomasi publik, keterlibatan, kolaborasi, interaktif, dua arah, gatekeeper, media, media sosial, Facebook, Twitter, publik



## Introduction

The increasing number of social media users in the last decade is astonishingly advance. In Indonesia, the rapid increase of the social networking sites users has grown from 34 million in 2011 to 79 million in 2014. This number indicates that the average growth of social media users in Indonesia from 2011 to 2013 is 40%. The source also predicts that the total users will continue to increase and will reach 109 million in 2017. The growth of the social media users increase along with the advance of the internet's infrastructure in Indonesia. Nevertheless, company as well as public sectors rally to use this digital communication tool to reach its public.

The most popular social networking site in Indonesia is still Facebook with more than 60 million users by the end of 2013 (GlobalWebIndex). This has placed Indonesia as number four for Facebook users in compare with other countries in the world. Impressively, Jakarta, the capital city of Indonesia, was named as the number one Twitter city in the world, according to Paris-based social media agency, SemioCast (2014). However, the data from InternetWorldStats (2014, cited in We Are Social, 2014) reveals that the social media penetration in Indonesia by the end of 2013 was only 15%. Nonetheless, as the infrastructure improves, observers believe that this number will gradually increase in the near future.

Accordingly, citizens have the ability to access diverse information unrelentingly and speak out their opinions. Therefore, the usage of social media is undeniably important in every company and institution, including government. In relation to this, government Public Relations has to plan and implement communication strategy that utilises the new media. Whereas, this digital medium offers communication and collaborative activities in a more timely and cost-effective ways to create good image and favourable public opinion. The benefits of social media has encouraged the Indonesian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA) to explore and optimise the use of social media, particularly, Facebook and Twitter. Whereas, scholars argue that these mediums have bringing out a new platform in disseminating information and policies as well as implementing two-way communication.

Currently, the Public Relations in Indonesian government institutions have utilise at least two social media tools as its communication means. However,

the effectiveness of the implementation of these new media in the public sector is still debatable. Therefore, this research attempts to explore the management of social media in government, particularly Indonesian MoFA, in its efforts to increase engagement with its stakeholders in a new interactive sphere.

Structurally, this dissertation is organised into four sections. First is the literature review that aims to elaborate the theoretical aspects of the research. The section examines theories about the role of government communications in democratic society by McNair. Then, it links to the Grunig and Hunt's four models (1984) to set common ground and find crossroads between the roles of government communications, Public Relations and public diplomacy as the tool of communication in foreign policy. Furthermore, the paper describes the social media as the new platform for government and public diplomacy in gaining trust and creating collaboration with the people. It also elaborates the best practices as well as failure of social media activities in commercial and political fields. Lastly, Habermas's theory on public sphere is correlated to the use of social media in government's communication efforts in creating a new public sphere that facilitates direct interaction with the public in democratic society.

Through analyses, the research attempts to answer the research questions on:

- How the Indonesian MoFA utilise the social media as the new platform to communicate and interact with its public?
- What are the real impacts of the ministry's social media to its audiences?
- What are the challenges and opportunities of the social media implementation in the Indonesian MoFA?

Finally, it concludes the analysis and contributes recommendations as valuable insights on to optimise the utilisation of social media for the Indonesian MoFA's communication division in upcoming years.

## **The Challenges of the Social Media Implementation**

The previous analysis proves the probability of challenges that arise through the utilization of this new media. This data compares the challenges face by Yudianto, as the administration of the tools and challenges state by other interviewees. It links those arguments with several literature in chapter two.

According to the findings, there are three challenges exist in the implementation

of the social media in Indonesian MoFA. First, there is no guidelines and rules to manage the Indonesian MoFA's social media. Yudianto says that the ministry has not create specific regulations in dealing with social media. Whereas, the importance of guidelines and ground rules are significant in order to effectively achieve the success of social media usage. Avery and Graham (2013) mention that ground rules are useful in 'addressing the risks and advantages of the social media strategy in public institution.' Bayuni argues that MoFA needs to state a policy guideline.

Secondly, as the consequence in the absence of guidelines, Indonesian MoFA has not engage the employee as part of the ministry's social media. After all, employees are important stakeholder in order to optimize the strategy. Theories outline that in public diplomacy, diplomats has to be more creative in listening and engaging with the public and one of the ways is by using the internet. Bayuni addresses that the United States of State Department and UK Foreign Office are encouraging the staff and diplomat to use the social media and setting outlines to post in social media.

Moreover, there is no sufficient staff in conducting the social media activities in Indonesian MoFA. Yudianto informs that there are only two staff that responsible in handling the ministry's social media platforms (Website, Facebook and Twitter). This is in contrast with statement from Briones et al. (2011) who argue that resources, such as time and staff should be one of the main concerns. Given the massive flow of information that come from 133 Indonesian's representatives all over the world, ministry should add resources in managing this new media. This also encourages the necessity to establish the participation of the employees, as stated in point 2, in order to add the human resources and achieve optimal result in the social media campaign.

## **Internet and Social Media Exposure**

Through the figure below, it reveals that each week, participants spend most of their times using Google, Facebook and websites. The YouTube and Twitter followed in the fourth and fifth place. Thus, Twitter is the less popular social media for the participants. If we retract the result to the reason participants use the social media, accessibility can be the reason why Google and website are the most popular online media. Because in those two platforms, endless information

can be retrieved anywhere at any possible time due to the accessibility nature of this searching engine. On the other hand, another noteworthy reason people use the online media is to share moments with their friends (16.78%).

Regarding the medium in gaining the information, participants mostly search the information about the ministry through the websites. The second most common tool to search ministry's information is the television, followed by newspaper. Facebook and Twitter are in the fourth and fifth rank. Moreover, radio is the least common media to gain the information about the ministry. Currently, in finding the information around MoFA, the data discovers that website, as the new media is picked as the first media for the participants in finding the information about the ministry. Thus, the opportunity of the engagement through new media is exist. The MoFA just need to embrace it and explore this tool more effectively. As mentioned by Bayuni, everyone will have to move into the online world and the technology basically made the traditional media kind of obsolete. Smith (2010) argues that the social media tools facilitate the government to communicate directly with the people without the involvement of media as the gatekeeper.

However, the survey reveals that there are relatively big proportions of people that still rely to the traditional media such as television and newspaper. This is probably the result of the way in which the MoFA usually disseminates its information to the public. Ranty acknowledges that social media considers not as the main tool and the MoFA and the ministry heavily relies on the traditional media such as newspaper, television, and the radio. Dixon (2010) claims that previously, public institutions depends on conventional media in order to distribute the information specifically newspapers, television, and radio.

## **Message and Audience Expansion**

From the data above, there are a few important findings regarding the ministry's issues. This table shows that participants are most likely interested in international issues (208 out of 293 respondents that answered the questions). The other subjects that interest the participants are the current domestic news (99 respondents) and job opportunity (66 respondents). Data shows that the international issues are not concerned by certain group anymore. More people are interested in this highly politics.

As in compare with the work fields, there are several interesting fact from the data. The public servants dominate all of the issue, except job opportunity. This is most probably because the public servants are already inside the organisation. Interestingly, most private sector employees are interested to look at the job opportunity issue (53.03% of the total respondents). Moreover, the students followed the interest on the work opportunity with 16.67%. These findings reveals that Indonesian MoFA is appealing as institution to work for. Whereas it is targeted by not only students, who are more likely looking for job, but also for people who already work, especially in private sector.

This data also shows that benefits of the social media is to gain relationship with various stakeholders. Whereas in Indonesia, the public of the MoFA expands widely through the archipelagic country. Stromback and Kioussis, (2011) state that political public relations is the process of organizing the efforts that aims to create and sustain mutual relationships with its main audience through purposeful message.

Schau and Gilly (2003) note that social, social media has potential to attract wide and boundless audience. In the same notion, scholar Ramadhan points out the importance of social media in stretching the public of the MoFA. In favour with this, Yudianto explains that the establishment of ministry's social media solely to boost the outreach of information to all stakeholders.

## **The Social Media Engagement in MoFA Indonesia**

This section is one of the most important data of the survey. In this part, the data reveals the effectiveness of the institution's social media engagement from several perspectives, including survey, interview, and content analysis. The data exposes that most participants are not friends of the MoFA in the Facebook and are not following MoFA's Twitter. Significant numbers of more than 78.43% are not friends with the MoFA's Facebook. Furthermore, data also shows that 86.41% of participants are not following the ministry's Twitter. These proofs that the ministry has not established a good conduct of the technology. In addition, media expert, Bayuni, also mentions that he follows MoFA's Twitter but does not find the account interesting.

## **Most Engaging Message**

Another findings indicate that content of the message is one of the important things to grab the people's attention. Simply Measured reveals that the most engaging post both in Facebook and Twitter is the news that was released on 24 July 2014 about the Indonesia's condemned against Israel brutal attack to the Gaza. This post has gained 35 likes, 1 comment and 6 shares. This intriguing international issue is one of the most popular issues in Indonesia due to the concern of the Indonesian people of this tragedy of humanity. Another post that attracts the users is the photograph competition as one of MoFA's activities that published on 18 August 2014, which has been generating 30 likes, 13 comments and 59 shares, the numbers is still growing.

Thus, it can be summarized that the international and human interest issues are the most interesting issues for the public. Bayuni outlines that the issues of the ministry currently expanding to human interest as foreign policy is not the domain of a few selected people anymore. Therefore, the needs to utilise the social media is paramount in order to engage with wider audience. However, the Indonesian MoFA has not formulate messages that could interest or motivate people's public (This will be elaborated in the measurement sections).

## **Facebook Vs Twitter**

Referring to the pictures above, it is argued that the used of MoFA's social media has not been optimal. Looking at the status in Facebook and tweets in Twitter, it can be analysed that there are no significant difference between the content of the website, Facebook and Twitter. They are similar in terms of content. It only repeating the same message in the same format. Although, the twitter is more active than the facebook in terms of total posts. This is in contrast with statement from the media expert, Bayuni, whereas he argues that the Facebook and Twitter should consider as two differefent tools which serve different purpose.

## **Recognising the Opportunities**

Based on the secondary research data, here are few opportunities that consider to be prominent in the future of the internet and social media in Indonesia:

Despite the low penetration of the internet users, Indonesia is now aiming on higher connectivity and increasing the bandwidth by “completing the Malaysia to Indonesia high bandwidth optical fibre submarine system and a new Australia-Indonesia- Singapore cable” (Deloitte, 2012 and IDG connect, 2012, cited in slideshare.net, 2014).

According to Androidcentral.com (2013, cited in Slideshare.net, 2014), the price for mobile data plans in Indonesia listed as one of the cheapest. More and more people, with different level of income will get the benefits of the internet easier than before.

Although TV is still the most popular source of information in Indonesia, internet growth considered to inclining speedily, especially if we compare it with other media such as newspaper, radio and magazine (Redwing Asia, 2012, Slideshare.net).

Digitalintheround.com (2012) also mentions, discussion over politics in social media in Indonesia has caught world’s attention. It proofs when the the news made headline all over the world as President of Indonesia took twitter to comment on the spying scandal which influenced the relations of Australia and Indonesia.

## **Conclusion**

Based on the discussion of data and analysis in the previous chapters, it could concluded that the Indonesian MoFA realizes the importance of establishing and maintaining relationships with the people, thus the Indonesian MoFA established the Information and Public Diplomacy division. Through these unit, the ministry is trying to engage with several constituents in order to disseminate the information, create interactive communication and maintain good relationships with its audiences. Although media and journalist are considered to potentially alter the information to the public, it is still the main tool in communicating with public, besides face-to-face interaction platforms such as seminar and assemblies consider to be effective but relatively costly and time consuming.

The birth of the social media as a dynamic and growing elements of communication technology takes the relationship between government and the public into a new sphere. Accordingly, throughout the research this new

tool has two sides of the coin. In positive terms, experts believe, this platform creates more prompt and cost-effective way in engaging with stakeholders. It also gives the opportunities for the government grow trust, cultivate more personal relationships and encourage collaboration through its two-ways communication occur with less alterations from the media as the gatekeeper.

However, since its establishment in 2010, the utilisation of social media in the Indonesian MoFA has not accomplished the purpose of it, which is to cultivate relationships and create collaborative interaction with the audiences by engaging two-way communication. Insufficient human resources and inavailability of proper guidelines pose challenges in the practices of this new media. Thus, instead of performing two-way communication by posting intriguing message or contending foreign policies, the social media implementation in the Indonesian MoFA only performs one-way communication which is the information dissemination activities. Moreover, in terms of engagement, analysis indicates, ministry's Facebook and Twitter account have not reach the audiences effectively. It only reaches small amount of Indonesian social media users, which are young adults, 18 to 34 years old, living in the urban area that are familiar with the technology (digital natives) and have easier access to it.

On the other hand, the social media also creates risks and threats. It is argued, social media puts the reputation of the user in an open and critical world of publics, giving the opportunities for them to convey positive, neutral, and even negative comments. Furthermore, the penetration of the social media is also quite low and it only targets limited group of people. Thus, the traditional media (television and newspapers) and conventional face-to-face interaction (assembly, public lecture, seminar), which are more familiar to various types of public, remain influential in public's media preferences.





---

## **Tax Compliance in Indonesia: The Role of Public Officials as Taxpayers**

## **Kepatuhan Pajak di Indonesia: Peran Pejabat Publik sebagai Wajib Pajak**

---

Nama : Abdul Rahman  
NIP : 197511122009021004  
Instansi : LAN  
Tahun Intake : 2012  
Tingkat Beasiswa : PhD Overseas  
Program Studi : Innovation of Governance  
Negara Studi : Belanda  
Universitas : University of Twente

Tax compliance and tax compliance problems in Indonesia are inseparable from the larger tax system. Indonesia faces structural problems with low tax compliance, as shown by its relatively low tax ratio (i.e. the ratio of tax revenues to GDP). Problematic tax compliance mainly occurs because of a difference between the availability of public goods-needed by taxpayers and public goods-actually provided by the state. This situation is exacerbated by tax corruption involving taxpayers and tax officials. As a consequence, the trust of taxpayers in government is low and this encourages non-compliance. Indonesia's efforts to improve its tax system have been realized by various tax reforms, which started in 1983, by changing the tax collection system from official assessment to self-assessment. Subsequently, tax reforms have included the reform of tax rates and tax bases of various taxes, as well as tax administrative reform. Unfortunately, these reforms have not improved tax compliance. Indonesia's tax ratio is still low, at around 12 percent. This means that the potential for improving tax compliance is still very large. This thesis addresses the problem of low tax compliance in Indonesia, focusing on the role of public officials as taxpayers. It aims to improve our understanding of perceptions of public officials of their tax compliance and the factors that influence it.

## **Research Method**

The main research question was formulated as follows. "How can Indonesia increase its tax compliance by focusing on public officials?" The sub-research questions derived from the main research question were:

1. What is the current state of affairs regarding tax compliance and tax reforms in Indonesia, compared to other countries?
2. What does the literature tell us about underlying factors for tax compliance, generally and specifically tax compliance by public officials?
3. How do public officials in Indonesia perceive their tax compliance being influenced by underlying factors such as the level of modernization of the tax administration system, tax sanctions, tax services and tax morale?
4. What are the key factors for improving tax compliance focusing on public officials?

Based on the main and sub-research questions, we first identified the relationships between the four main elements of tax reform and tax

compliance. We constructed the analytical framework, in which tax compliance is the dependent variable and the four elements are independent variables. We developed seven hypotheses regarding the partial and combined effect of the four elements on tax compliance. By considering the two groups of public officials within the study (government employees and state enterprise employees), we established eight more hypotheses regarding the comparison between these two groups concerning their tax compliance and the four elements that are relevant to tax compliance.

Next, we operationalized both independent variables and the dependent variable, by looking at various dimensions of the variables involved. We explained why a questionnaire (using self-assessment and perceptions of respondents) was chosen for, rather than direct measurement of the variables involved.

From the total population of almost 6 million public officials in Indonesia, a sample was taken of 400 respondents (with proportionate stratified sampling, resulting in 360 government employees and 40 state enterprise employees in the sample). Furthermore, it was explained why the actual 400 respondents were taken from the group of participants of STIA LAN, the national training institute for public officials in Indonesia. Subsequently, the structure and format of the actual questionnaire were elaborated upon. The actual survey was carried out in the summer of 2014.

Finally, we discussed the various types of analysis that will be used in the next chapter: descriptive analysis and verification analysis of hypotheses. The actual methods and tests involved (correlation and regression analysis and testing, path analysis) were discussed as well.

## **Result and Discussion**

The first question “What is the current state of affairs regarding tax compliance and tax reforms in Indonesia, compared to other countries?” was addressed particularly in chapter 2. Tax compliance and tax compliance problems in Indonesia are inseparable from the larger tax system. Indonesia faces structural problems with low tax compliance, as shown by its relatively low tax ratio (i.e. the ratio of tax revenues to GDP). Problematic tax compliance mainly occurs because of a difference between the availability of public goods-needed by taxpayers and public goods-actually provided by the state. This situation

is exacerbated by tax corruption involving taxpayers and tax officials. As a consequence, the trust of taxpayers in government is low and this encourages non-compliance. Indonesia's efforts to improve its tax system have been realized by various tax reforms, which started in 1983, by changing the tax collection system from official assessment to self-assessment. Subsequently, tax reforms have included the reform of tax rates and tax bases of various taxes, as well as tax administrative reform. Unfortunately, these reforms have not improved tax compliance. Indonesia's tax ratio is still low, at around 12 percent. This means that the potential for improving tax compliance is still very large.

The second question "What does the literature tell us about underlying factors for tax compliance, generally and specifically tax compliance by public officials?" was mainly addressed in chapter 3. We first discussed various perspectives on tax compliance problems, such as the economics of crime, tax morale and ethics, the relevance of a psychological contract, the importance of fair treatment of taxpayers, issues of democracy and tax compliance, tax compliance as social norms, and the so-called slippery-slope model. We were able to link most of these perspectives to four main factors affecting tax compliance: modernized tax administration system (MTAS), tax sanctions, tax services, and tax morale. We had a closer look at what the literature has to say about these four factors, how they have been subject to changes as part of tax reform in Indonesia, and how the relationship between each factor and tax compliance has been evaluated in the Indonesian context, in academic research. Subsequently, we focused on the role of public officials. In the scope of Indonesia's laws and social system, public officials are viewed as representatives of government and as role models ("father-figures") and change agents. We briefly discussed some literature on role models and change agents, such as social learning theory, according to which the behavior of public officials will influence the behavior of society, for example in fulfilling tax obligations. We found that to date no research has been done on tax compliance by public officials specifically.

The third question "How do public officials in Indonesia perceive their tax compliance being influenced by underlying factors such as the level of modernization of the tax administration system, tax sanctions, tax services and tax morale?" was addressed in chapters 4 and 5. This question was answered mainly by means of a survey study, involving 400 respondents working in the

public sector (as government employees and state enterprise employees). We found that public officials perceive their tax compliance as good, even though it public officials behave far from perfect: over the last two years 27 percent did not submit the annual tax return in time, and nearly 24 percent of the respondents indicated that they had been late in paying the income tax. We tested for differences in perception of tax compliance between various sub-samples (based on gender, age, educational level, and province of origin), but no significant differences were found.

The perception of public officials of the extent to which the Indonesian tax administration is modernized and of the level of tax services, was sufficient, but the perception of the two other main factors was bad. This can be linked to their views on the tax system in Indonesia. The majority of respondents indicated the importance of paying taxes, and the vast majority of respondents acknowledged their obligation to be compliant with tax laws, but the survey results also showed considerable dissatisfaction with the way the tax system is implemented in Indonesia. Respondents mentioned the government's failure in properly developing Indonesia, the misuse of tax revenues, failing tax reforms, and the gap between intentions as laid down in tax laws and actual implementation. Still, a large majority acknowledged that as public officials they are role models for other taxpayers.

In terms of correlations between the four variables and tax compliance, we found rather low (but significant) correlations with tax compliance for MTAS, tax services and tax morale, but no significant correlation for tax sanctions. Overall, the model performed in a limited way: the combined effect of the four variables on tax compliance was low. We found similar results when we looked at the two groups of public officials involved: government employees and state enterprise employees. Overall, state enterprise employees had lower scores on their perception of the five variables, but not all differences between government employees and state enterprise employees were significant.

The final question "What are the key factors for improving tax compliance focusing on public officials?" was addressed in chapters 6, by means of follow-up research. This follow-up research focused on two variables: tax sanctions and tax morale. It consisted of an on-line survey, in-depth face-to-face interviews, and a simulation game. The survey and interviews included respondents

from the private sector. For the follow-up research an analytical model was developed, with the two variables (tax sanctions and tax morale) and various dimensions of these variables (knowledge, understanding, and expectations for tax morale; rewards and punishment for tax sanctions).

We found that this model worked quite well, in terms of the model as a measurement model. However, as a structural (explanatory) model the captured effect was rather low, and further improvements and extensions are needed. We found that the model performed especially badly for government employees, but less so for state enterprise employees and private workers. This implies that –contrary to the findings for the larger model of tax compliance in chapter 5- there seems to be a difference between government employees on the one hand and state enterprise employees on the other hand (who resemble more employees from the private sector). The follow-up research also showed that rewards are potentially more effective in increasing tax compliance than punishment. Moreover, the kind of rewards that respondents favor relate to expenditure on services in the public domain (education, housing, health services). This illustrates the importance of the proper use of tax revenues, and more generally of the expenditure side of the government budget, for issues of tax compliance.

## **SUMMARY**

This thesis contributes to both theory and practice. It has implications for the research community in the field of taxation as well as for practitioners and decision makers in Indonesia involved in future tax reforms. The academic dimension is discussed in this section, the policy implications are discussed in the next section.

The thesis presents an exploration of perceptions of public officials regarding tax compliance and factors underlying tax compliance. The main contributions of the thesis are the following: 1) by means of extensive literature research it has identified four main factors for tax compliance: modernized tax administration system, tax sanctions, tax services, and tax morale. These factors have been put into coherent and comprehensive analytical frameworks or models. This was done first for the four independent variables and the dependent variable, and then for two selected variables (tax sanctions and tax

morale). These models were tested (as measurement models and explanatory models) with large groups of respondents; 2) it focused on the role of public officials as taxpayers, by looking at two specific groups: government employees and state enterprise employees (also in comparison to employees from the private sector); 3) as far as tax sanctions are concerned, by means of the simulation game, the thesis looked into the difference in potential impact (on tax compliance) between rewards and punishment.

Obviously, the thesis has limitations, which imply further research along the line of the three main contributions. First, the developed models performed in a limited way in terms of overall explanation of tax compliance. This implicates further research into potential underlying factors, as well as into improvement of measurement (that should go beyond the use of perceptions). Secondly, the thesis made clear that there are differences in tax compliance behaviour and factors underlying that behaviour between the groups of public officials and private workers, but further research is needed to clarify these differences. Thirdly, more research can be done into the potential difference between the use of rewards and punishment in raising tax compliance.

## **Recommendation**

This thesis provides information on how public officials, as role models and change agents in the tax system, perceive their tax compliance, as well as factors that potentially contribute to higher tax compliance, such as modernization of the tax administration, better tax services, more effective tax sanctions, and better tax morale. It is important that the Indonesian government, in its efforts to increase tax compliance, finds its own way to regularly monitor and evaluate these factors, not just for public officials as taxpayers, but for all taxpayers.

Based on the findings of the thesis, on our own observations, but also on specific input from respondents during the implementation of the research, there are numerous recommendations to be made for each main factor. We here highlight the most important ones.

Regarding the modernization of the tax administration, we recommend further refinement of the tax administration system, especially in terms of e-reporting/e-annual tax return with good data cooperation between banks, institutions/companies, and the tax offices. This would include the obligation to



submit annual tax returns only for personal taxpayers with independent work and private companies so that the administration process is more efficient; if there is sufficient cooperation between the various institutions, self-assessment and annual tax returns for taxpayers with salaries only are no longer necessary. This also implies that control processes can increasingly be done by means of data base analysis and comparison. Specifically for public officials, we recommend more transparency regarding their incomes; in principle, tax officials should publicly declare their incomes; assessment of their incomes should be done by external auditors and not by colleagues in the tax office.

Regarding tax services, we suggest to improve the one-gate service by computerization and connection by internet, and integrated e-annual tax returns. Basically, all tax services should be computerized and brought further in line with modern practices, following other sectors in society.

As far as tax morale is concerned, tax education could be integrated into all levels of education, and should also be part of employee training. Public officials, and tax officials more specifically, should be targeted more intensively in order to enhance integrity.

Regarding tax sanctions, we recommend a better use of (financial) rewards for compliant taxpayers, and rewards can best be linked to expenditure for public services, such as housing, education and health services. Basically, we suggest a better link between paying taxes and enjoying public services, or a reversed type of benefit taxation. Traditionally, with benefit taxation, the tax burden is determined by the level of benefits received from government expenditure. Here we suggest to make benefits from public services more dependent on (properly) paying taxes. Additionally, in terms of negative sanctions, we recommend better and more equitable implementation of the current set of sanctions, a progressive system for recurrent tax sanctions as well as the introduction of social sanctions.

Finally, this thesis has made clear that tax compliance issues cannot be separated from the overall public finances of Indonesia and the performance of the Indonesian government in terms of bringing welfare to its people. Tax compliance would benefit from more information on how taxes are used and from better use of taxes as such. To start with, the government (and the Indonesian tax authorities) should provide regular and transparent information on how tax

revenues are used. A better and more transparent use of tax resources does require strong commitment from the government, and such commitment is the primary tool to achieve a better tax system and more voluntary tax compliance in Indonesia.



---

## **Civil Service Reform in Indonesia on Human Resource Management Aspect**

## **Reformasi Pegawai Negeri di Indonesia dalam Aspek Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia**

---

Nama : Arif Widodo  
NIP : 198702092011011002  
Instansi : KEMENPAN & RB  
Tahun Intake : 2014  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : MA Governance and Public Policy  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : The University of Sheffield

## ABSTRACT

The main aim of this dissertation is to investigate the practice of civil service reform in Indonesia on human resource management (HRM) aspect and how this phenomenon is viewed from institutional theory perspective. This study uses the case study qualitative research as a method of inquiry and using the documents as well as interview as methods of data collection to understand the HRM practice in Indonesian bureaucratic system. The result found that HRM practices not yet fully ideal in supporting civil service reform programme because of some shortcomings such as appointing temporary employee become civil servants not based on competency, political intervention in determining of government officials, discrepancy in providing performance allowance, and the performance appraisal tool which is not objective and measurable. Furthermore, none of indicators of success bureaucratic reform such as Corruption Perception Index, audit opinion, and Government Effectiveness score has been achieved in 2014.

Finally, this study argues that the Indonesian government must stop appointing temporary employees to become permanent civil servants because it is not in accordance with the purpose of bureaucratic reform to create a competent civil servant that has integrity, strengthening merit system through the role of the Civil Service Commission (KASN), revising the performance appraisal system so that it becomes more measurable and there is coherence between the strategic planning of organisation and all individual performance contracts, and considering a cultural and social approach to gain understanding and supporting from the society related to civil service reform programme.

## ABSTRAK

Tujuan utama disertasi ini adalah untuk mengetahui praktik reformasi pegawai negeri di Indonesia mengenai aspek pengelolaan sumber daya manusia (HRM) dan bagaimana fenomena ini dilihat dari sudut pandang teori kelembagaan. Penelitian ini menggunakan penelitian kualitatif studi kasus sebagai metode penyelidikan dan penggunaan dokumen serta wawancara sebagai metode pengumpulan data untuk memahami praktik HRM dalam sistem birokrasi Indonesia. Hasilnya menemukan bahwa praktik HRM yang belum sepenuhnya ideal dalam mendukung program reformasi pegawai negeri karena beberapa kekurangan seperti menunjuk pegawai temporer menjadi pegawai negeri tidak berdasarkan kompetensi, intervensi politik dalam menentukan pejabat pemerintah, ketidaksesuaian dalam memberikan tunjangan kinerja, dan kinerja alat penilaian yang tidak obyektif dan terukur. Selanjutnya, tidak ada indikator keberhasilan reformasi birokrasi seperti Indeks Persepsi Korupsi, opini audit, dan nilai efektifitas pemerintah yang telah dicapai pada tahun 2014. Akhirnya, penelitian ini berpendapat bahwa pemerintah Indonesia harus berhenti menunjuk pegawai temporer menjadi pegawai negeri tetap karena tidak sesuai dengan tujuan reformasi birokrasi untuk menciptakan pegawai negeri yang kompeten yang memiliki integritas, penguatan sistem merit melalui peran Komisi Aparatur Sipil Negara (KASN), merevisi sistem penilaian kinerja sehingga menjadi lebih terukur dan ada koherensi antara perencanaan strategis organisasi dan semua kontrak kinerja individu, dan mempertimbangkan pendekatan budaya dan sosial untuk mendapatkan pemahaman dan dukungan dari masyarakat yang terkait dengan program reformasi pegawai negeri sipil.

## Introduction

In 2008, the government began to reform the civil service system through three government agencies as a pilot project (Ministry of Finance, State Audit Board, and Supreme Court). After that, civil service reform was held nationally in 2010. The civil service reform target in the human resource sector is the realisation that civil servants have professionalism, competency, neutrality, and integrity. There are several efforts to achieve those goals such as changing the recruitment, career, and remuneration mechanism for the civil servants. The Minister for Administrative Reform believed these changes will have a significant effect on the quality of human resource personnel. However, there was still encountered corruption practice on this process, such as the leaking of exam documents and bribery in civil servants recruitment process (Alamsyah, 2015).

In terms of promotion system, Ministry of Administrative Reform launched set of guidance for an open selection mechanism for high positions in government institutions in 2012. Some cities held open selections for the head of department position and for head of district. This new mechanism not only relied on seniority, but also was more based on the competence of candidates or participants, regardless their gender, ethnicity, or religion. However, there were some resistances from the society (Dewi, 2013).

Therefore, the civil service reform on Human Resource Management (HRM) aspect in Indonesia after governmental transformation—from authoritarian regime to democratic government or Reform Era—is the main interest and serves as the object of discussion of this dissertation.

Many efforts in reforming the civil service system in Indonesia deserve to be appreciated, but it is also important to disclose the limitations in implementing this programme. Some researchers, such as Prasojo and his colleagues (2007) and Tjiptoherijanto (2008), have tried to illustrate the bureaucratic reform process in Indonesia. However, only a few studies discuss how the bureaucratic reform process was viewed from the institutional perspective.

This study was inspired by the lack of similar studies about recent developments in civil service reform in Indonesia, especially after the government enacted the Grand Design Bureaucratic Reform in 2010, and the lack of objective and independent measurements of the government achievements in the bureaucratic reform programme. Hence, the purpose of this research is

to investigate the achievements or failures of HRM practices in pursuing civil service reform objectives, and which factors are influencing the effectiveness of this programme. Furthermore, this study is to try to explain how an institutional perspective can explain this phenomenon, and to give feedback to policy-makers in order to make better policies in the future.

The main research questions of this study are the following:

1. What are the HRM policies and strategies for civil service reform in Indonesia, and why did the policy-makers choose those HRM policies to achieve the civil service reform goals?
2. How is the HRM practice related to the civil service reform targets, and which factors are influencing the effectiveness or ineffectiveness of this programme?
3. How can an institutional perspective explain about civil service reform on HRM aspect in Indonesia?

A theoretical framework can serve as a guide for the researcher to design their researches because its function is a picture of the system, concept, theories, assumptions, and all territory that supports or informs the research (Maxwell, 1996, p.25). Furthermore, Miles and Huberman (1994, p.18) stated that a conceptual framework can be in a picture or narrative form. However, they argued that a graphic form is better to help the reader understanding.

This research is adapting the conceptual framework from The Harvard model of HRM (Beer et al, 1984), and is completed with HRM strategies from the Grand Design and the Strategic Planning of bureaucratic reform as illustrated on Figure 1. The reason for using this model is because there is the similarity pattern with the context of civil service reform in Indonesia. Public sector reform in Indonesia triggered the global financial crisis and pressure from the internal country to change the regime and reforming the bureaucracy. Then describe the policies chosen and evaluation criteria for achieving outcomes or that which Beer called "long-term consequences".

## **The Political System and the Civil Servant**

In the New Order Era, the governmental system was highly centralized under President Suharto. Golkar was the ruling party which always won in general elections from 1973 to 1999 in spite of electoral frauds. The Golkar party also



got support from the military and bureaucracy in the New Order Era. In the post-Suharto era or at the beginning of the Reform Era, there were fundamental amendments to the constitution such as limiting the authority of President, strengthening decentralisation, fixing the multi-party system, and completing regulations related to democracy and human rights.

The last amendment of the Constitution 1945 in 2002 regulates the separation of powers into five state institutions at the same level/parallel. In the legislative branch there is the People's Consultative Assembly (MPR) with a bicameral system which consists of the House of Representatives (DPR) and the Regional Representatives Council (DPD), the President as the leader of the executive branch, the Supreme Court (MA) and the Constitutional Court (MK) in the judicative branch, and the Audit Board of the Republic of Indonesia (BPK).

In the Reform Era, the President was elected by the people directly, with a term of presidency for five years that could only be renewed once. The President is the Head of State and also is the head of government; this role is currently held by Joko Widodo. The President as the head of government utilises the bureaucratic machine to implement state policies and programmes, and the civil servant (PNS) is the key element on overall of the public administration operation. However, not all people who work for the state are categorised as civil servants, such as judges, armed forces, and police.

In the previous era, the New Order regime increased the number of civil servants drastically, from 525,000 people in 1970 to about 2 million people in 1980, and the average growth of civil servants in 1980s was 25% (BKN, 2014). It reflects the attempt of the Suharto regime to strengthen bureaucracy as a political tool to maintain his power. However, after Suharto stepped down in 1998, Golkar party had no privileges anymore, and now civil servants were independent in choosing a political party.

In 2011, the government began to implement a zero growth policy for civil servants by delaying the recruitment of civil servants. Hence, the number of civil servants decreased from 2011 to 2013, and increased slightly in 2014 as illustrated on Table 1. The data from the Civil Service Agency (2014) informed that almost 40% of PNS are educational workers and in the second largest position are health workers (4%). Most of them are Bachelor graduates (40%) and senior high school graduates (28%), and only 4.3% have postgraduate education.

During the last five years the ratio between civil servants and population has decreased. Although there is no consensus among scholars about the ideal ratio between the number of civil servants and population, compared to other Asian developing countries, the number of Indonesian civil servants is relatively smaller, as shown in the ratios between civil servants and population in China (2.8%), Thailand (2.8%), and Vietnam (3.2%) (Schiavo-Campo, 1998, p.475). However, until now the Indonesian government keeps trying to reduce the number of civil servants.

## **Central-local Government Relations**

In the institutional analysis the focus is not only on who the actors are and what the regulations are, but it also takes into account the relationship between the actors. In terms of regional autonomy in Indonesia, Papua province has received a special quota (65%) from central government for local people or participants from Papua to be in the civil service formation or allocation. This policy was taken because the government considered that Papua is relatively underdeveloped compared to other provinces. In several regions, such as in the Konawe Kepulauan regency, and the Southeast Sulawesi province, there were demonstrations about the result of the civil service candidate selection process because many local people did not pass the selection, and they demanded that there is a special quota or treatment for local people, as applied in Papua.

In Konawe Kepulauan, the protest also was supported by the regent and local parliament members. They demanded that central governments appointed local applicants to be civil servants, but MoAR stayed with the decision that only participants who pass the selection test can be appointed as civil servants, regardless of where they come from (Angga, 2015). The local elites must know this regulation, and that there is no chance for them to become civil servants, but why did local elites show their support in front of many local residents who did not pass the selection? This attitude can be interpreted as the struggle for local residents' interests or as the popular actions of local elites to maintain their popularity and electability with their voters. This conflict also showed that there was a gap in education quality between regions in Indonesia and tensions of central-local government relationship.

Although Indonesia is a unitary state model, the spirit of decentralisation after Reform Era has given the local governments the independence to manage their local budgets, which 30 are mostly funded by their local resources. In addition, today the local leaders (governors, mayors, and regents) are elected through popular vote by their people. It makes the leader of regional governments think that they have the right to determine the civil servants in their regions. A similar attitude also seen on the implementing of performance allowances, as the head of region tended to ignore the request of central government to give performance allowance based on performance assessment and the amount of allowance was not too much different from other regions.

## **The Social Challenge**

As explained previously, the institutional matter is not only about the formal regulation and organisations, but also about social norms and structures. Since the government launched its guidance for selection to high positions (Echelons I and II) in government institutions, some regions such as Jakarta and Bandung held open selections for heads of departments and for heads of districts. In 2013, Jakarta governor appointed Susan Jasmine as a head sub-district of Lenteng Agung<sup>7</sup>. However, this decision triggered protests and demonstrations because the candidate who became the head of the sub-district was a woman who had a different religion from the majority of people in that area (Dewi, 2013). Rusli, one of demonstrators, said “we do not hate Susan, but her behaviour is just not suitable with the local customs” (Viridhani, 2013).

Local residents argued that the governor should consider citizens’ aspirations, including the demand to be led by a person who understands the local culture, and has the characteristics of the majority people in their region, not only because of her competency, managerial skill, or experience in bureaucracy.

What happened in Lenteng Agung shows that socio-cultural matters have relation with the civil service reform programme. The head of a sub-district is a career position which can be occupied by civil servants. Civil servants can be promoted, if they have good capability, and show their high performance regardless of their ethnicity, gender, or religion. However, this principle was challenged by the society in Lenteng Agung when some people were reluctant

to be led by the person who did not have the same attributes as they have. It is what Kinloch (1979) called as majority-minority relations, where the groups that have the power define the different parties with assumptions based on physical, social, cultural, and Lenteng Agung is a sub-district in south Jakarta which has Muslim majority population with patriarchal tradition.

In terms of sociological institutionalism, what happened in Lenteng Agung also showed the government policy clashing with local interests. Although some people in Lenteng Agung cannot speak on behalf the interest of all residents and their aspiration tends to be racial, the dilemma has come up. The government has to choose to retain the candidate who have been appointed based on objective selection or accommodate some local residents' aspirations to avoid conflict. This means that management strategy alone in civil service reform is not enough, and the government also needs a cultural approach and social approach to gain understanding and supporting from the society.

### **Ambitious Targets with Low Achievement**

The government formulated the purpose of bureaucratic reform into three points as illustrated in Table 5. Unfortunately, none of the targets have been met. The first objective is the realisation of clean government, with the indicators of the CPI score from Transparency International and the percentage of government institutions which got a WTP<sup>8</sup> from BPK. CPI in Indonesia in 2010 achieved 28 from the maximum score of 100. At that time it enacted the Grand Design of Bureaucratic Reform and had a targeted score 50 in 2014. However, the score did not increase significantly in 2014 (score: 34), which was still lower than other Southeast Asian countries such as Malaysia and Thailand (TI, 2010; 2014). It means that the public sector managed by the Indonesian government is still perceived to be prone to corruption. Furthermore, many government institutions especially in local governments did not get a WTP statement from BPK. It means that in more than half of the institutions the financial report is not reasonable or not according to the governmental system and accounting standards.

The second objective is the improvement of public service quality with the indicators of the public service integrity score from KPK and the Easy Doing Business Index ranking from the World Bank. The Easy Doing Business ranking by the World Bank group assesses how easy it is to start a business. The

weakest component for the Indonesian government based on the World Bank (2014) report are in dealing with construction permits, provision of electricity, registering property, getting credit, and paying taxes. All those things relate to the time, procedures and cost which are set and run by the government. Based on the interview, an official government said that these targets actually are not realistic. Besides that, corruption and lack of coordination between agencies still happened frequently, such as in the case of business permits, where the service licensing procedures are still cumbersome.

Differing from the international agency, KPK as a domestic independent agency which is concerned with eradicating corruption gave quite a good score of 7.37 for central government and 6.71 for local governments for the integrity of civil servants in delivering public services. However these scores are still not meeting the target.

The third objective is the improvement of capacity and accountability of bureaucracy, with indicators of the Government Effectiveness Index by the World Bank and the percentage of government institutions which got a good accountability score from MoAR. The Government Effectiveness Index has a scale from -2.5 (weakest) to 2.5 (strongest). In 2010 Indonesia had a score -0.20, but it declined to -0.24 in 2013 until now. This index takes a society perception about the commitment of government officials, the quality of policy formulation and implementation, public services, and independence from political pressures.

The last indicator is accountability of government institutions. Every year, each government institution has to submit a Performance Accountability Report of Governmental Institution (LAKIP) to MoAR. The MoAR will assess four aspect, planning (30%), performance measurement (20%), performance reporting (15%), performance evaluation (10%), and achievement (20%). Hence, the report consists of the strategic planning of organisations, targets, performance indicators, activities, and achievements. In 2014, the results did not meet the target, but more than half of government institutions have good accountability. However, Kasim (2013) argued that this report is very biased because that is a typical of self-assessment, and there is a tendency that the reports only talk about the good things of organisations.

## Conclusion

The Indonesian government has implemented a number of policies in HRM to support the civil service reform programme, such as fixing the recruitment system, creating a new performance appraisal system, open selection of high-level civil servants and giving incentives. Nonetheless, there are some inconsistency and shortcomings in those policies such as appointing temporary employees without open selection, space for political intervention in determining of government officials, and a striking discrepancy in providing incentives in the form of performance allowances.

In terms of pursuing civil service reform objectives, none of the six indicators of success bureaucratic reform have been achieved in 2014 because the lack of coordination between institutions, corruption, and the cumbersome and expensive public services. Indeed, human resource is not the only one factor that determines the success or failure of civil service reform. However, the quality of HRM in civil service system certainly has influence towards the process of civil service reform, and this research has shown that HRM practices still not yet fully ideal in supporting civil service reform programme.

The most effective factor in encouraging civil service reform process is the use of CAT as a method for the selection of civil servant candidates. The process of recruiting new civil servants also involves the State Universities Consortium and NGOs. It reflects the value of good governance, such as public participation or civil society engagement. On the other hand, the main factor that inhibits civil service reform on HRM aspect is civil servants performance appraisal system that is not fully objective and measurable which trigger patron-client practices that do not bring benefits for the institution.

The public sector reform, if it is viewed from institutional perspective, showed path dependency pattern at the beginning of Reform Era. Regardless of whether the requirement of the IMF loans is the right policy or not, the government does not have many choices except to implement the IMF prescriptions. It demonstrates the circumstance of path dependency as one of the features in historical institutionalism. In terms of rational-choice institutionalism some actors did use devious ways which seem legitimate to obtain personal gains in civil service system. Besides that, there is a phenomenon related to sociological institutionalism when the value and principle of government which

was manifested by appointing the head of sub-district based on selection of by competence was not accepted by local residents for reasons of custom and tradition.

---

**“Is The World Bank’s Model of Service Delivery Applicable in Decentralized Indonesia?”**

**“Apakah Pola Pemberian Layanan Bank Dunia Dapat Diterapkan di Indonesia yang Terdesentralisasi? “**

---

Nama : Ervan Arumansyah  
NIP : 198302182008031001  
Instansi : BAPPENAS  
Tahun Intake : 2014  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : Globalisation and Governance  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : Unversity of Hull



Intergovernmental organizations have a crucial role in solving global problems, and one such organization is the World Bank. For over three decades, the Bank has been one of the most important intergovernmental organizations. It has led the global development, particularly to against poverty in less-developed countries (O'Malley & Veltmeyer, 2006, p. 287; Vetterlein, 2012, p. 35).

The strategy of the Bank to solve the world's problems is changing over time. Marshall (2008, p. 58) argues that the contemporary Bank's view has been changed several times, and has resulted in three main categories of strategy: reconstruction, development and equity. Another explanation is from Frediani (2007, p. 134) who divides the characteristics of the Bank's strategy by several periods: 'modernization' in 1945-1973, 'basic needs' in 1974-1984, 'neo-liberal' in 1985-1999, and 'promoting opportunity, facilitating empowerment, and enhancing security' in the 2000s. As the last example, Alkire (2002, p. 183) explains that the Bank's strategy has followed development literature from the 'Basic Needs' approach to the 'Capability' approach of Amartya Sen.

Sen's approach has influenced the Bank's strategy fundamentally. This approach believes education and health services are the main factors to increase human capacity, and placing people at the centre of the development strategy is necessary (Marana, 2010, p. 2). This can be seen in the WDR 2004 when the Bank came up with the theme 'Making Services Work for Poor People'. In the report, the Bank obviously highlighted 'investing in and empowering people' as its strategy. It also re-emphasized basic service as the main factor to increase people capacity (Bank, 2004). The report describes that to provide better basic service, people should be the main centre of the relation between the people, policy makers, and service providers (*ibid*).

This model suggests that citizens could boost the providers to provide a good quality of services. The model promotes two ways called short and long route. The short route is a direct relation between citizens and providers, while the long route is an indirect relation that involves the policy makers who are responsible to deliver public services (Bank, 2004, p. 6).

Although the model has been in existence for more than one decade, it is still an important consideration to deliver public services to poor people. The model has been an influential instrument to improve the quality and quantity of public services for poor people, through empowering the people and increasing

the accountability of citizens, governments and providers (Holla, Koziol, & Srinivasan, 2011, pp. 1-2). Some recent studies have been conducted based on this model. Furthermore, in Washington DC on the 28th February and 1st March 2014, the ODI and the Bank conducted a seminar to re-call the original of this concept. The seminar was a 10th year anniversary celebration of it and a preparation for the post 2015 development agenda, which will emphasize the accessibility and quality of basic services (Foresti, 2014; ODI, 2014).

Some achievements have been noted since the implementation of this model. Kaufmann, Kraay, and Mastruzzi (2011) noted that the success of this model has been shown by the positive trend of composite measure for governance since 2004. All dimensions of this measure have been better, including peoples empowerment (voice and accountability) (Xu, 2013, pp. 2-4). MDG reports have also reported favourable results in public service indicators since 2004 (UN, 2014, pp. 4-7). Moreover, the Bank's 'Doing Business Indicator', which is believed to be the best indicator for measuring public service (Djankov, La Porta, Lopez-de-Silanes, & Shleifer, 2002, pp. 1-37), has been better (Xu, 2013, p. 4). Therefore, this model is believed still relevant to improve public services, especially in developing countries which suffer problematic public service issues.

However, some data show that most developing countries are still struggling with service delivery problems. The MDGs Report 2014 shows us that education and health problems in developing countries still dominate their development problems (UN, 2014, pp. 16-39). Ringold et al. (2012, p. 1) noted that most low and middle-income countries face similar public service problems to those the Bank noted in 2004:

"High rates of absenteeism among teachers and doctors; leakages of public funds intended for schools, health clinics, or social assistance benefits; and short ages and stock-outs of pharmaceuticals and textbooks"(Ringold et al., 2012)

Some scholars believe that the problems are not caused by the failure of the model, but by the developing countries which often face some difficulties to manage the model effectively. They argue that poor governance and institutional problems are the most crucial factors leading to inappropriate access to public service, especially for the poor and other disadvantaged community members

(ODI, 2014; Shah, 2005, pp. ix-x). Especially in the decentralized government system, which is commonly implemented in developing countries, the governance and institutional problems are more complex. Ahmad, Devarajan, Khemani, and Shah (2005, p. 23) argue that decentralization introduces a new form of accountability, which is between national and local policy makers, and it also changes the existing relationship between citizens and elected politicians. Therefore, some modification of the model should be internalized.

Indonesia is a decentralized country. It is the fourth most populous country in the world, and there are more than 300 ethnic groups with different cultures. Indonesian people live on more than 600 islands with various geographical conditions (BPS, 2013b). Hence, the local people's needs for public service might be varied. As a consequence, it is difficult for public service to be provided by only the single actor, the national government. Therefore, in terms of the model implementation, decentralization might be the best strategy. Dragging policy makers closer to the people to get better understanding what the people want, is the Gol's strategy.

In 1999, Indonesia switched its public administration system from highly centralized to highly decentralized (known as the big bang decentralization policy) (Hoffman & Kaiser, 2002; LLC, 2013, p. 25). Indonesia implements a functional assignment separation between government tiers, whereby the central government transfers some of its functions to lower government levels. Since then, the Gol has shared all government affairs with six exceptions (Indonesia, 2004b). For all decentralized affairs, the Gol shares its functional assignments with the local level. It means that Indonesia has an additional form of relation between central and local policy makers. Following Ahmad et al. (2005), this relation between government tiers is a new important form to be considered when implementing the model. Therefore, the Gol should seek a 'country specific' strategy to internalize this model

Unfortunately, only a few recent studies examine decentralization as an important factor changing this model. Even though the Bank also explains how relations between government tiers should be managed, the explanation is minimal. This study is dedicated to fill this gap by examining Indonesia's form of decentralization. It will try to analyse the applicability of the model in decentralized Indonesia.

Against this background, this dissertation comes up with two research questions: 1) are there some factors that affect the relation between poor people, providers and policy makers in decentralized Indonesia? And 2) can the Bank's model be effectively implemented by the Indonesian Government?

## **Research Methods**

This study is qualitative research which tries to analyse a social phenomenon descriptively. The qualitative method provides a great chance for the writer to describe some research findings (Bryman, 2012, p. 401); it allows the researcher to explain the process of the social phenomenon (Creswell, 2013; Hancock, Ockleford, & Windridge, 2007, p. 7); it is theoretically robust, but still provides flexibility in the process to drive back problem reformulation (Hancock et al., 2007, p. 6; Stake, 2010, pp. 39-46).

However, some weaknesses of qualitative research are embedded in this study. Firstly, the qualitative method is time-consuming (Hancock et al., 2007, p. 11; Stake, 2010, p. 29). Secondly, it is difficult to replicate and generalise (Bryman, 2012, pp. 405-406). Finally, because it is believed to be too subjective, there is a problem with reliability (Bryman, 2012, p. 405; Lin, 2009, p. 179).

To deal with all those problems, the qualitative researcher is allowed to create some strategies (Creswell, 2013, p. 187). As a solution for the first problem, the writer has used secondary data as the main data of this study, and performed triangulation (analysing other documents). This is convenient for the researcher in terms of time (Creswell, 2013, pp. 191-192) and will benefit the writer due to the short duration of the research. For the second problem, to generalise across social settings, the researcher has included a large sample. Flick (2009) argues that combining inductive and deductive approach will enrich the research result. Finally, the writer uses checking and grading materials offered by Lin (2009) as a solution for the last problem.

As mentioned above, this study emphasizes secondary data as the main data. Besides observation and interview, qualitative data sources could include documents (Bryman, 2012; Creswell, 2013, pp. 543-561; Hancock et al., 2007, pp. 19-20). Furthermore, Bryman (2012, pp. 544-554) explains the various types of documents which could be used: personal documents, official documents deriving from the state, official documents deriving from private sources, mass-

media output, and virtual documents. This research draws on documents such as Indonesia's laws (Law No. 12/2003, Law No. 25/2004, Law No. 32/2004, Law No. 33/2004, Law 17/2014, GR No.38/2007, and GR No. 19/2010), the Gol's documents (Bappenas', BPS', MoEC's, MoF's, MoHA's, and MoNE's documents), The Gol's reports (IDI, Ombudsman, GDS report), NGO reports, reports of Indonesia's development partners (the World Bank, the UN, the UNDP), some early research, and some mass-media output.

However, the document analysis method has some weaknesses. The main limitation is the reliability of the data. Lin (2009, pp. 179-181) argues that to ensure the data reliability, the researcher could check the data in two ways. The first way is by doing an interview with the relevant person. The next way is by comparing the sources of data with the contemporary publication or examining the data and the facts which occur after that. Furthermore, Lin (2009) explains that the second way could be done by four strategies: checking the consistency of text description, matching the description with physical evidence, comparing the content of documents with historical background of the locus, and studying the author's background when the document is formed. Lin (2009) also propose grading of data reliability.

This study also uses thematic coding method for data analysis. Silverman (2006) argues that thematic coding is a tool of qualitative research used for structuring varied and unorganized data. In the first stage, the writer makes codes to label specific issues from every document. In the second stage, all of those codes are analysed and reassessed into more generalised and larger categories, which represent the main findings.

## **Conclusion**

The Indonesian experience shows that to implement the Bank's model, some considerations about country characteristics are needed. It means that the model might not be appropriate to be directly adopted, and different countries might need different modifications.

In the decentralized Indonesia, the model might be applicable to be implemented; however there is a need to consider some aspects deeply and widely. The democracy system and decentralization regulation have been formulated by the Gol. People's participation has become an important

consideration in Indonesia's development. Nevertheless, some problems have accompanied the Government's efforts. Some aspects, such as the culture of democracy and the setting of decentralization, might need to be considered carefully by the Government to support the implementation of the model. The implementation of the model with an unsuitable democracy culture and decentralization setting might mean that services cannot be delivered effectively to poor people. Furthermore, the situation might be exploited by some local elites for their interests. In other words, the applicability of the Bank's model in the Indonesian context should be supported by some aspects, especially democracy and decentralization setting.



---

## **Mengoptimalkan Program Penilaian Kebutuhan Pelatihan untuk Meningkatkan Kualitas Sumber Daya Manusia di Kalimantan**

## **Optimizing Training Needs Assessment Program to Improve the Quality of Human Resource in Kalimantan**

---

Nama : Ika Retna Ningrum  
NIP : 198503232008042001  
Instansi : LAN  
Tahun Intake : 2012  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : Master's Program of The Graduate  
School of Governance Studies  
Negara Studi : Jepang  
Universitas : Meiji University



The Republic of Indonesia, which is widely known as Indonesia, is a country located in the Southeast Asia Region with 237.6 million people as of May 2010 according to the Statistical Office Board (2014). Indonesia comprises around 17,000 islands with five major islands, which are Kalimantan, Papua, Sulawesi, Sumatera and Java respectively. With hundred millions of its people, around 4.5 million people among them are working in the government sector. As stated in *informasicpnsbumn (2013)*, Mr. Tumpak Hutabarat, Chief of Public Relations division of National Employment Agency said that as of 31 December 2011, there are 4,570,818 civil servants. 925,848 are working for the central government, while 3,644,490 are working for local governments. In Kalimantan Island itself, which has become the subject of this research, there are approximately 300,000 civil servants. This total number of civil servants is the total of 5 Provinces in Kalimantan Island, which are: East Kalimantan, West Kalimantan, Central Kalimantan, South Kalimantan, and North Kalimantan.

When bureaucratic reform took place in Indonesia, the Indonesian government has had to improve the structure of its bureaucracy, both in terms of enhancing the quality of civil servants and developing a modern and efficient government system. Especially in the term of enhancing the quality of civil servants, now Indonesia does not only need a quantity of civil servants, but also their qualities. Civil servant's quality has become important because it is a determining factor in the process of national development. According to Tjiptoherijanto (2007), in order to achieve a country's goal, which is to improve its citizen's standard of living, the characteristics of civil service or bureaucracy as an important agent in a government need reform, 'both in relation to its institutional aspects as well as in relation to its moral issues'. He continued that in the case of Indonesia, the civil service is considered 'slow; lacks transparency, accountability, and initiative; and is sometimes corrupt' (Tjiptoherijanto, 2007, Abstract). Since democratization and decentralization era, Indonesia has confronted a variety of new developments which makes the task to reform is significant.

Since decentralization (the autonomy era), which was marked by the enactment of Law Number 22 Year 1999 about Local Governance, central government of Indonesia has delegated more authorities to local governments to govern their own regions. In the past, during the centralization era, many

of local resources went to the central government so that the balance of the standard of living in the whole country could be achieved. But on the other side, local governments considered this as an unfair policy, since many of the locals argued there were more disadvantages than advantages of such a system. So, with the enactment of Law Number 22 Year 1999 about Local Governance which was then revised with the Law Number 32 Year 2004 about Local Governance, a change of paradigm has occurred in local government, which was originally oriented more to centralize than to decentralize, so that the local government can implement their own autonomy. Translated from the Law Number 32 Year 2004 about Local Governance (2013), it is stated that decentralization is the delegation of authority from the central government to local government, while local autonomy is defined as the right, authority, and obligation of the autonomous region to manage its own governance and local needs based on the existing law. Local autonomy and decentralization demand the increase of public service quality in order to realize the living standard of the community and to increase regional competitiveness which will contribute to the success of regional autonomy. This delegation of authority includes the authority for locals' human resources development. As one of the most important aspects in the development of the local governments' organizations, policies taken regarding human resources development must get special attention, it shall be made in a considerable way and needs continuous capacity building to be able to deliver public services needed by the people.

With 4.5 million people working as civil servants, Indonesia needs good approaches to improve its human resources qualities. This can be started from each government organization. The qualified and professional personnel are very essential, not only for the performances in their individual tasks, but also for the organization as the whole. Therefore, the competencies of the individual must be a part of the whole development management program in an organization and must be integrated carefully. The ability of taking policies to determine the appropriate employee development programs is another important aspect to be considered by each organization. It inevitably requires professionalism of personnel managers in every organizations' human resource divisions, especially in the Provincial Civil Service Agencies. For that reason, the need for knowledge and skills to be able to function well as planners and managers in the development of civil servants competencies are essentials.

By having professional planners and managers, it is expected that the education and training program that is given to the civil servants can gain the actual benefits not only for the needs of the individual itself but also for the needs of the organization. When the objectives of the training are mismatched, then it is not just about wasting the time and money, but also becoming the obstacles to excellent public services. One way to deal with this problem is by having the right Training Needs Assessment (TNA) first. The right training needs assessment program can lead to the effective capacity building program to improve the quality of the human resource and to increase the satisfaction on public service delivery.

TNA itself can clearly identify training needs and the results of training appropriately, so training conducted actually appropriate to the needs of the individuals, their positions, and organizations. Therefore, through this training officers can be prepared for performing TNA in their organization. National Institute of Public Administration (NIPA) as an institution that has a role in fostering and organizing education and training for civil servants uses this approach as one of the methods to improve the quality of civil servants in Indonesia. In NIPA, TNA itself was established in the Decree of Head of National Institute of Public Administration Number 5 Year 2003 about the Guidelines of TNA training which is then being substituted with the Regulation of Head of NIPA Number 3 Year 2013 about the Guidelines of TNA training.

Although there has been efforts to introduce this TNA program, many obstacles still stand in its way. As translated from Monitoring and Evaluation of NIPA office Samarinda (2012), it is stated that the implementation of TNA has not been conducted very well, even though the understanding of TNA itself has been quite sufficient; analyzed from the distributed questionnaires, it is stated that there has not been much implementation of TNA in the organizations where the alumni belong. Another problem is that the bureaucratic reform that has been implemented needs quick reactions from all sectors of governance to support its implementation in which one of its efforts is to have qualified personnel in each government unit.

In the Indonesian government sector, especially in Kalimantan region, TNA has not become very popular. The training and education program in this region has not been using any specific approach. So, since its founding in 2005,

NIPA office Samarinda that covers Kalimantan region has tried to introduce this method as a way to contribute to improve the quality of human resources in Kalimantan. This method started to be introduced in 2008, but it has not been able to achieve its goal. There may be many reasons for this, such as the fact that the previous NIPA's decree about TNA had 146 training hours. These long hours of training were not very convenient for the trainees. Another reason is the awareness of the heads of local institutions about the objectives and the advantages of TNA for their organizations. Considering the importance of TNA, the researcher would like to know more about what have become the constraints in this program. Based on that experience, researcher is interested to do a study in "Optimizing TNA Program to Improve the Quality of Human Resources in Kalimantan".

To answer the questions, the researcher used the qualitative method. In this qualitative method, interview was used as an instrument to collect the data. The respondents were chosen by random sampling from the participants of TNA training that had been administered by NIPA office Samarinda. Interview was used in this research because the researcher wants to gain more information that will be given by the respondents. Interview was applicable in this research because the numbers of respondents were not many.

To limit the discussion in this research, human resources term used in this research refers to those who work in the public sector area. They usually called as public servants or civil servants. This limitation and terminology used in this research is explained in Chapter II. This research also limited its scope in Kalimantan. It is because the researcher works in National Institute of Public Administration (NIPA) office Samarinda, which has responsibility in guiding the administrative policies for 5 provinces in Kalimantan. This research also only focuses on the insights from the participants of TNA training. The modules that becomes the reference in this research is from the Decree of Head of NIPA Number 5 Year 2003 which is the previous regulation, before it was substituted with the Regulation of Head of NIPA Number 3 Year 2013.

## **Reasons for not Implementing TNA**

A chance to share the knowledge gained from a training can be used as a way to keep what participants have got from a training. If the participants may get a

chance to share their knowledge, there are many benefits that can be gained. They can give more information to other colleagues about the training they were in. Another benefit is that if the program of the training can be implemented and is suitable for the organization. This knowledge sharing time can be used as a way to introduce the program, so that the program can be proposed to be implemented in that organization.

If the participants got no chance to share the knowledge they gained from the training, there will be no chance for them to introduce the training program, so there will be no follow up for the program. And this could also be cause the participant who joined the training to put little or no focus on the training because they felt that they had no responsibility to share their experiences after the training. This kind of situation still can be found in many government institutions. The needs of leader who pays attention to the performance of his staff is required. It is because the performance of his staff will define the performance of the organization. The leader needs to encourage his employee to give a report after a training program and if possible to share it with other colleagues in order to at least spread the knowledge to those who do not have a chance to join the training. By doing so, it is not only the participant who gains benefit from the training. After all, the training was given by the organization, so it must also be expanded for the importance of the organization.

In any organization, the existence of a good management enables coordination. It is one important aspect to ensure the achievement of its vision and mission. It is because through coordination, all units in that organization can have the performance according to their tasks and functions that will support the vision and mission of the organization that then will lead to the effectiveness of the organization's performance. If there is a lack of coordination within the organization, the situation like overlapping of tasks and function would likely happen. One unit and other units would only want to find a program to be conducted in their unit and the organization will not be able to perform properly. Such a conflict of interest often occurs in an organization. To minimize the conflict, an organization's meeting coordination needs to be done to clarify the tasks and functions that shall be managed in each unit in the organization.

This coordination can also be managed to reduce the promotion and rotation system that is not based on a correct analysis. A civil servant must be

ready to be positioned in any place that is assigned by his organization. But sometimes, a civil servant feels very comfortable in one position, so he will not be willing to be positioned in a new position. A promotion and rotation system that is based on the correct analysis will be generally beneficial not only for the individual but also for the organization. Without an analysis, a rotation system will not be beneficial either for the staff member or the organization. For the staff member, it is not considering the readiness of the staff member that is being rotated, which sometimes can cause unsatisfactory feelings in that staff member. If this happens, he might not feel motivated to be working in the new place. For the organization, it can cause the lost of qualified staff member that performed well in the organization. In this case, it becomes a hinderance of TNA implementation in an organization because the alumni that shall implement what he has gained from the training program were not able to do so because he was promoted to another organization. These becomes the disadvantages for the organization. Not only for the organization, this situation is also not good for the alumni because he cannot implement the knowledge and skill that he gained from the training program, because he needs to adapt to a new working place and that TNA is not becoming the priority for the organization where he is promoted to. With the good coordination, the promotion and rotation system can be communicated efficiently beforehand, in which would be more beneficial for the staff and also for the organization. For the staff, he can be aware that he must be prepared for promotion or rotation anytime, and that he needs to prepare himself with the knowledge and skills to be positioned at any place. For the organization, through its human resource division must prepare and guide every staff member to be able to have good competence in performing any tasks and that the organization must not be dependant to one special staff to do certain tasks. From the data of TNA also, the organization through its human resource division can acknowledge the right person for the right position before it promotes or rotates the staff to the other position in the organization.

Budget, which is an estimation of revenue and expenses to run a program can become an issue when it is not well planned. According to one TNA's alumni conditions, this problem caused the TNA program not to be implemented in his organization. This case can occur when the organization identifies other programs that are more urgent and suitable to be conducted for the certain fiscal

year. Here too, coordination can be considered essential in communicating the needs of implementing TNA program. In proposing a program, the provision of detailed and accurate information about the program is considered a necessity. A commitment from the leader is also considered important in order to get approval for the implementation of a program. A commitment from the leader is also important in having a chance to share the lessons from any development program with other colleagues who have no chance to join in any development program.

## **Reasons for Implementing TNA**

Managing human resources is aimed at maximalizing the performance of manpower in the organization, how they are responsible, and how they may have contribute to the organization. This function needs special attention because it relates to people. If human resource management is implemented without a good approach, it may cause many effects such as: lack of skill, knowledge, and attitude; less productivity; unmotivated civil servants; unprepared civil servants in facing new tasks or policies; unfulfilled job requirements; organization stagnancy; no data source of human resources in the organization as mentioned by the sources as the reasons in implementing TNA. Even though there are many other things that can be caused by the non existence of unappropriate human resource management in an organization.

Lack of skill, knowledge, and attitude may happen because after several years of working, especially someone who works in the same position for a long time, it can cause boredom and lessening of motivation. For that reason, suitable development programs are needed for each individual in the organization. And to find it out, TNA can be used to collect the data to get the analysis of what is needed by the individual, his position, and for the organization. If the organization has found what is needed by the components in it, the organization may be able to find the development program that would match the needs of the staff member. And if that has been done, the staff member would feel motivated when he must be involved in a development program. With an improvement in skill, knowledge, and attitude, employees are prepared to perform the new tasks and policies.

In an organization, special requirements are needed to fill a certain position. With TNA, this can be managed through data that has been collected to look for what is needed by that position and who the right person to take it. By that, the goal to have the right person for the right position can be achieved.

## **Advantages of Implementing TNA and Disadvantages of not Implementing TNA**

The findings clearly support that a good human resource management system may contribute to the improvement of human resource's quality. For that reason, an approach like TNA is needed because it benefits organization in many ways. In achieving the goal of an organization, human resources who know their job and how to do it well are essential. In order to maintain or improve employees performance in their positions there must be an effort such as finding out whether they would need a training or a non training program or any other development program and that can be done by implementing an approach such as the TNA program. From the TNA analysis, the needs of the employee can be tracked which will support the achievement of the organization's goal.

Making a developing program map is also considered as an advantage of implementing TNA. Through a developing program map, the organization can issue a policy that has considered all the data such as having the right person in the right place, and also have the right person in doing the right job. By utilizing TNA, the data of human resources can be compiled to create a developing program map for the needs of the organization. A developing program map can also be utilized to clarify career path. This may also be applied in the promotion and rotation system. By having a developing program map, the career level of an employee can be directed from the time he/she registered in the organization until the last day of his/her career. It happens often that an employee has difficulties adapting in his/her new position when he/she is promoted or rotated. It is because he/she needs to jump from one position to another position that requires a totally different skill from what he/she is capable of doing before. Or if this condition happens, the organization can prepare skills that are required before promotes or rotates personnel to another positions. In this way, everyone in the organization can become qualified and perform well in achieving organization's goal.



When systems in an organization have performed well, the components in it will also experience good performances. Civil servants will be more motivated because they know that they will get rewards or punishments based on their performances. They will also be more motivated because they can always improve their quality because the organization is keeping their data and managing it well in order to know the needs of its human resources so that training programs will be delivered to the person who needs it. Because the training program is delivered to the right person, they will also feel motivated in the training. And when one of the most important components in the organization which is its human resources, has performed well, it will impact on the whole organization which will in turn support the organization in working well.

From the interviewees, it was found that there may be some disadvantages when TNA is not implemented in an organization. Lack of information about human resources' potential and weaknesses in the organization could be mentioned as two disadvantages. Organization may have difficulties in tracking the performance record of its employee if their human resources system is not well managed. It may also pick the wrong person to fill a position or perform a task. So, it is common to put someone in a position based on the length of time he/she has been working for that organization, and that he/she would get trained after he/she took the position. This condition is not beneficial for those who put great effort in their work or for those who are really capable in performing the task. By not having an appropriate management in its human resources division, it will also have problems in identifying weaknesses in the organization, so, it may not be able to take the preventive measures to overcome organization's problem.

For any training organizer, before administering a training program, there must be some requirements that need to be fulfilled by the applicants that intend to join the training program. But for some government's training institutions, this condition is sometimes ignored. The reasons are various, one of it is that the organization needs the training, but the intended training targets are not available (have to work out of the office) so the organization would choose any one available to join the training with expectation that after the participation, this person would be able to share the lesson learned from the training to his/her colleagues. This will cause no problem if the expected results

are gained, but if the alumni of that training cannot share the knowledge and skill after the training, it will be a waste of time not only for the organization but also for the alumni of the training.

If there are mismatches in selecting the participants that can join in a training program, especially for the technical training which really needs special knowledge and skill, it will affect the learning process as a whole. It is because the lesson given may not be suitable for the participant or that the participant will not be able to follow the learning process well. This may not only be the disadvantages from the side of the organizing committee, the sending organization would also not be able to achieve the training's goal. It may happen because the participant that is sent cannot get the benefits from the training program.

Another disadvantage is that, without TNA, the organization may suffer from the lack of sufficient information on the strengths and weaknesses of human resources in that organization. It will also hinder the information of what developing programs are needed by the organization and its staff members. The effect of it is that the organization may not notice the training or development program that will be needed for the improvement of the organization.

From all the advantages that has been shown, the greatest advantages of implementing TNA is that the organization can perform well. Moreover, this research has also identified some disadvantages as has been mentioned on above explanation if the organization does not implement TNA, in which the greatest disadvantages is that the training program is not delivered to the right target.

This research has shown that TNA is useful even though there are some hinderances in implementing it. In the next section, some recommendations are described to be able to optimize the implementation of TNA program. It is well expected that this research, through its findings and recommendations may assist NIPA office Samarinda in optimizing the implementation of TNA program in Kalimantan. This research also expected to be able to help Kalimantan in improving the quality of its civil servants in the future.



---

**Analisis Belanja Modal Jalan, Irigasi,  
dan Jaringan pada Dinas Pekerjaan  
Umum Energi dan Sumber Daya Mineral  
Kabupaten Magelang**

**Analysis of Capital Expenditure on Roads,  
Irrigation, and Networks at the Public  
Works, Energy, and Mineral Resources  
Department of Magelang**

---

Nama : Riska Rinjaya  
NIP : 198610132010122001  
Instansi : KEMENDAGRI  
Tahun Intake : 2015  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Local  
Program Studi : Keuangan Daerah  
Negara Studi : Indonesia  
Universitas : Universitas Gadjah Mada

## ABSTRAK

Penggunaan konsep *value for money* dalam penganggaran belanja pemerintah bertujuan supaya peningkatan pelayanan dan kesejahteraan masyarakat dapat tercapai dengan jumlah anggaran yang terbatas. Analisis penganggaran belanja terutama belanja modal jalan, irigasi, dan jembatan merupakan metode untuk mengetahui terjadinya efisiensi atau indikasi inefisiensi/pemborosan penganggaran belanja pemerintah daerah khususnya biaya non konstruksi.

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menganalisis selisih dan proporsi biaya konstruksi terhadap belanja modal pada tingkat program dan jenis pekerjaan belanja modal jalan, irigasi, dan jaringan. Selain itu, juga untuk menganalisis perbedaan antara biaya konstruksi dengan belanja modal dalam penganggaran belanja daerah. Alat analisis yang digunakan untuk menjawab pertanyaan penelitian tersebut adalah proporsi belanja dan uji beda rata-rata.

Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa persentase biaya konstruksi terhadap belanja modal terendah pada Program Pembangunan Drainase/ Gorong-Gorong sebesar 74.18% dan persentase terendah pada jenis pekerjaan Pembangunan Drainase dan Trotoar di Ruas Jalan Magelang – Kaliangkrik serta Magelang – Kopeng sebesar 45.27%, serta tidak terdapat perbedaan yang signifikan antara belanja modal dengan biaya konstruksi yang berarti penganggaran belanja daerah terkait belanja modal jalan, irigasi, dan jaringan sudah tepat serta efisien.

Kata kunci: belanja modal jalan, irigasi, dan jembatan, uji beda dua rata-rata, efisiensi belanja modal konstruksi.

## ABSTRACT

The use of the value of money concept in government budgeting can be achieved with a limited budget. Budgeting analysis of highway, irrigation and bridge spending is a method to determine the flow or measure of inefficiency / waste of local government budgeting. This research is intended to analyze the difference and operational cost. In addition, also to analyze the difference between the cost of construction with capital expenditure in analyzer tool used to answer that question is. The results showed that the cost of construction of buildings and infrastructure at 74.18% and the percentage of the type of work Drainage Construction of Roads and Sidewalks in Magelang - Kaliangkrik and Magelang - Kopeng amounted to 45.27%, and can't be changed significantly between capital expenditure at a cost construction which means local budgeting, irrigation, and networking are appropriate and efficient.

Keywords: capital expenditure of roads, irrigation, and bridges.

Salah satu pilar tegaknya perekonomian suatu negara yaitu adanya akuntabilitas atau pertanggungjawaban atas setiap dana yang dikelola oleh para pemangku kekuasaan kepada masyarakat. Tuntutan masyarakat atas akuntabilitas dan transparansi pengelolaan keuangan muncul karena ada amanah yang dipercayakan masyarakat untuk mengelola sumber dayanya. Oleh karena itu, muncul tuntutan agar pemerintah memperhatikan value for money dalam menjalankan aktivitasnya, yang berdasar atas tiga elemen yaitu ekonomi, efisiensi, dan efektivitas.

Setiap tahunnya pemerintah daerah membuat rencana keuangan tahunan yang tertuang dalam Anggaran Pendapatan dan Belanja Daerah (APBD) yang telah disetujui oleh Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah (DPRD). Perencanaan dan Penganggaran APBD tertuang dalam Undang-Undang Nomor 25 Tahun 2004 tentang Sistem Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional dan Undang-Undang Nomor 17 Tahun 2003 tentang Keuangan Negara. Berdasarkan undang-undang tersebut Kepala Satuan Kerja Perangkat Daerah (SKPD) selaku pengguna anggaran menyusun Rencana Kerja dan Anggaran SKPD yang berpedoman pada Rencana Kerja SKPD. Rencana Kerja dan Anggaran serta Rencana Kerja SKPD akan disampaikan kepada DPRD sebagai bahan pertimbangan penyusunan Rancangan APBD (RAPBD) untuk disahkan menjadi APBD.

Salah satu indikasi keberhasilan otonomi daerah dan desentralisasi menurut Mardiasmo (2002: 29) adalah terjadinya peningkatan pelayanan dan kesejahteraan masyarakat (social welfare) yang semakin baik, keadaan tersebut akan dicapai apabila pemerintah memperhatikan konsep value for money. Dalam proses penyusunan sampai implementasinya, Anggaran Pendapatan dan Belanja Daerah (APBD) memiliki berbagai permasalahan, menurut Tuasikal (2008) salah satunya yaitu pengalokasian sumber-sumber pendapatan daerah yang diperuntukan untuk kepentingan publik, baik alokasi dana untuk belanja langsung maupun tidak langsung. Hal tersebut penting karena banyak pengeluaran pemerintah daerah, misalnya untuk belanja modal rata-rata masih dibawah 30% dari yang disyaratkan. Permasalahan seputar alokasi belanja tersebut menjadi lebih parah bila kewenangan pemerintah daerah secara mandiri dalam pengelolaan keuangan daerah tidak mampu mendorong pertumbuhan ekonomi masyarakat lokal.

Belanja modal menurut Peraturan Menteri Keuangan Nomor 127 Tahun 2015 tentang Klasifikasi Anggaran dapat dipergunakan untuk enam hal, yaitu Belanja Modal Tanah, Belanja Modal Peralatan dan Mesin, Belanja Modal Gedung dan Bangunan, Belanja Modal Jalan, Irigasi dan Jaringan, Belanja Modal Fisik Lainnya, serta Belanja Modal Badan Layanan Umum (BLU). Pemborosan atau inefisiensi yang terjadi pada APBD khususnya pada Belanja Modal di bidang konstruksi bermula dari proses penyusunan anggaran. Belanja Modal Konstruksi terdiri dari biaya konstruksi dan biaya non konstruksi yang biasa dikenal dengan Administrasi Proyek (AP), selama ini tidak ada nilai yang pasti dan wajar dalam penyusunan anggaran AP sehingga hal tersebut dapat mengakibatkan inefisiensi atau pemborosan anggaran (Ritonga, 2012: 88).

Dinas Pekerjaan Umum Energi dan Sumber Daya Mineral Kabupaten Magelang menjadi salah satu Satuan Kerja Perangkat Daerah (SKPD) di jajaran Pemerintah Kabupaten Magelang yang mengemban tugas untuk melaksanakan pelayanan pada bidang pekerjaan umum dan penataan ruang. Dinas Pekerjaan Umum Energi dan Sumber Daya Mineral Kabupaten Magelang dalam melaksanakan tugas dan fungsinya mengedepankan pada pelaksanaan urusan pemerintahan daerah di bidang kebinamargaan, keciptakarya, pengairan, penataan ruang, energi dan sumber daya mineral.

APBD yang dirancang setiap tahunnya oleh Pemerintah Kabupaten Magelang diharapkan dapat menunjang pertumbuhan belanja daerah guna meningkatkan kesejahteraan masyarakat melalui pembangunan sarana dan prasarana umum. Dinas Pekerjaan Umum Energi dan Sumber Daya Mineral Kabupaten Magelang telah merencanakan program dan kegiatan belanja modal konstruksi yang dituangkan dalam DPA – SKPD. Penelitian ini membahas mengenai pengaruh biaya konstruksi dan biaya non konstruksi dalam penganggaran belanja modal konstruksi khususnya belanja modal jalan, irigasi, dan jaringan.

## **Rumusan Masalah**

Tingginya nilai belanja modal memunculkan anggapan bahwa sektor konstruksi rawan penyimpangan dan korupsi, hal tersebut didukung pendeknya umur aset dan rendahnya kualitas bahan yang digunakan. Belanja modal di bidang konstruksi terdiri dari biaya konstruksi dan non konstruksi, penentuan biaya non konstruksi berdasar persentase belanja modalnya serta belum ada penentuan



yang wajar dan pasti dalam penganggarnya. Tingginya biaya non konstruksi menyebabkan inefisiensi anggaran serta alokasi program dan kegiatan yang tidak mengarah pada kepentingan publik.

Berdasarkan latar belakang masalah yang disampaikan, DPA – SKPD belum dimanfaatkan untuk menganalisis penganggaran biaya konstruksi dan non konstruksi terutama pada belanja modal jalan, irigasi, dan jaringan. Hal ini dapat membantu pemerintah daerah dalam mengendalikan dan mencegah terjadinya inefisiensi dalam penganggaran belanja daerah, karena pemborosan APBD khususnya pada belanja modal di bidang konstruksi berawal dari perencanaan dan penyusunan anggaran.

## **Metode**

Penelitian bertujuan untuk menjembatani penelitian akademis yang berorientasi pada teori sehingga dapat diaplikasikan dan bermanfaat bagi objek penelitian tersebut. Penelitian ini menggunakan metode deskriptif kuantitatif melalui studi kasus dengan melakukan penelitian yang rinci dan mendalam terhadap objek yang diteliti.

## **Metode Pengumpulan Data**

Pengumpulan data dilakukan dengan menggunakan teknik mencatat, menyalin, dan mengopi data yang tersedia di Dinas Pendapatan Pengelolaan Keuangan dan Aset Daerah (DPPKAD) Kabupaten Magelang, serta Dinas Pekerjaan Umum Energi dan Sumber Daya Mineral Kabupaten Magelang.

## **Variabel Penelitian**

Variabel yang digunakan dalam penelitian ini diperoleh dari penganggaran belanja modal pada Dokumen Pelaksanaan Anggaran yaitu biaya konstruksi dan belanja modal. Pengujian dilakukan dengan membandingkan antara kedua variabel tersebut menggunakan uji beda dua rata-rata.

## **Hasil Dan Pembahasan**

Pembahasan penelitian mengenai analisis belanja modal terlebih dahulu harus memperhatikan data belanja modal konstruksi jalan, irigasi, dan jaringan yang

berasal dari Dokumen Pelaksanaan Anggaran Dinas Pekerjaan Umum Energi dan Sumber Daya Mineral Kabupaten Magelang sebagai sumber data penelitian.

## **Hubungan Variabel yang Diamati**

Variabel yang digunakan dalam penelitian ini diperoleh dari biaya konstruksi dan belanja modal. Kedua variabel tersebut didapatkan dari program dan jenis pekerjaan yang berkaitan dengan belanja modal jalan, irigasi, dan jaringan yang dilakukan oleh Dinas Pekerjaan Umum Energi dan Sumber Daya Mineral. Selisih antara belanja modal dengan biaya konstruksi adalah biaya non konstruksi, pengujian antara dua variabel tersebut dilakukan dengan uji perbedaan dua rata-rata untuk melihat pengaruh biaya non konstruksi dalam penganggaran belanja modal jalan, irigasi, dan jaringan.

## **Pembahasan**

Belanja pemerintah adalah pengeluaran yang dilakukan oleh pemerintah dalam rangka menjalankan fungsi pemerintahan dan untuk memperoleh aset yang akan digunakan untuk memberikan pelayanan kepada publik. Dalam mengalokasikan anggarannya, pemerintah diharap dapat menggunakan sumber daya yang terbatas untuk memperoleh barang atau jasa yang memberikan dampak optimal pada peningkatan pelayanan publik.

Terbatasnya anggaran mengakibatkan pemerintah melakukan efisiensi, hal ini sangat penting dilakukan supaya tujuan pemerintah dapat dicapai dengan menggunakan dana yang terbatas tersebut. Kinerja belanja biasanya diukur dalam kaitannya dengan konsep value for money yang menekankan pada pengukuran ekonomi, efektivitas, dan termasuk efisiensi. Tuntutan publik terhadap efisiensi belanja pemerintah menunjukkan peningkatan yang signifikan selama beberapa tahun terakhir, hal ini dikarenakan besarnya uang yang digunakan untuk belanja pemerintah dan fakta bahwa uang tersebut berasal dari rakyat. Peningkatan tuntutan terhadap efisiensi belanja pemerintah disebabkan oleh anggapan bahwa tingkat kebocoran keuangan negara yang terjadi melalui belanja pemerintah sangat tinggi.

Infrastruktur dapat mendorong pertumbuhan ekonomi melalui berbagai cara, pertama infrastruktur dapat meningkatkan produktivitas karena dapat berperan dalam mengatasi hambatan pertumbuhan ekonomi dengan cara

menciptakan kondisi yang lebih baik bagi produksi swasta dan mengurangi biaya operasional perusahaan. Kedua, infrastruktur mendorong pertumbuhan ekonomi melalui penciptaan hubungan lintas sektoral dan memfasilitasi alokasi sumber daya sehingga dapat menciptakan konvergensi antara daerah. Ketiga, peran infrastruktur berbeda dalam setiap tahap pembangunan ekonomi. Investasi infrastruktur dalam jumlah besar diperlukan bagi negara dengan kegiatan ekonomi rendah dan iklim investasi buruk sebagai pendorong utama pertumbuhan ekonomi. Pada tahap ekonomi selanjutnya, ketika orientasi produk berubah tidak lagi hanya memenuhi kebutuhan daerah sendiri tetapi mulai melakukan ekspansi ke daerah lain dan mendorong realokasi investasi swasta.

Infrastruktur merupakan roda penggerak pertumbuhan ekonomi karena dipandang sebagai faktor utama pembangunan nasional dan daerah. Studi di Amerika Serikat menunjukkan bahwa tingkat pengembalian investasi infrastruktur terhadap pertumbuhan ekonomi sebesar 60%, elastisitas PDB (Produk Domestik Bruto) terhadap infrastruktur di suatu negara antara 0,07 sampai dengan 0,44. Hal ini berarti bahwa kenaikan 1% ketersediaan infrastruktur akan menyebabkan pertumbuhan PDB sebesar 7% sampai dengan 44% (Haris, 2009).

Kemajuan suatu daerah salah satunya dapat ditinjau dari pertumbuhan ekonomi yang baik, salah satu faktor yang memengaruhi pertumbuhan ekonomi adalah investasi yang dikeluarkan oleh pemerintah daerah sebagai stimulus ekonomi melalui pengembangan dan perbaikan infrastruktur guna memberikan peningkatan kesejahteraan masyarakat. Demikian halnya dengan Pemerintah Daerah Magelang yang tahun 2016 melaksanakan 11 program yang diuraikan dalam 211 jenis pekerjaan yang berhubungan dengan belanja modal konstruksi jalan, irigasi, dan jaringan.

Analisis biaya konstruksi yang dilakukan pada penelitian ini selain bertujuan untuk mengetahui efisiensi penganggaran belanja modal konstruksi, juga dilakukan guna mendukung upaya pemerintah daerah dalam membelanjakan anggarannya untuk hal-hal produktif dan mengalokasikan belanjanya untuk program-program layanan publik. Pemerintah daerah seharusnya memiliki kecenderungan untuk menggunakan anggaran belanja langsung, terutama untuk proporsi belanja modal yang lebih besar dibandingkan

dengan belanja pegawai maupun belanja barang dan jasa. Hal ini bertujuan untuk meningkatkan kualitas output sehingga fungsi anggaran sebagai alat distribusi, alokasi, dan stabilisasi dapat berjalan dengan baik.

Berdasarkan analisis proporsi biaya konstruksi terhadap belanja modal pada tingkat program didapatkan persentase tertinggi sebesar 99.19% dan persentase terendah sebesar 74.18%, sedangkan pada tingkat pekerjaan didapatkan bahwa persentase tertinggi sebesar 99.93% dan persentase terendah yaitu 45.27%. Alasan tingginya proporsi belanja pada pekerjaan Pembangunan Drainase dan Trotoar di Ruas Jalan Magelang – Kaliangkrik serta Jalan Magelang – Kopeng hingga nominal belanja modalnya dua kali lipat lebih besar dibandingkan biaya konstruksinya adalah tingginya biaya non konstruksi.

Perbedaan dua variabel yaitu belanja modal dan biaya konstruksi diuji menggunakan Mann-Whitney U Test yang bertujuan menentukan signifikan tidaknya perbedaan rata-rata antara dua set data pada uji non parametrik. Apabila melihat perbedaan nilai antara belanja modal dengan biaya konstruksi terlihat selisihnya tidak terlalu besar, namun bila dilihat hasil dari selisih dan proporsi biaya terhadap belanja terlihat perbedaan yang mencolok. Oleh karena itu, perlu dilakukan uji beda rata-rata untuk mengetahui tingkat signifikansi perbedaan kedua variabel tersebut. Mann-Whitney U Test dilakukan sebagai alternatif dari independent sample t test yang merupakan uji non parametrik untuk membandingkan mean dua kelompok data. Hasil analisis menunjukkan bahwa nilai  $Asymp. Sig > \alpha$  atau  $0.068 > 0.05$ , sehingga tidak didapatkan adanya perbedaan yang signifikan antara belanja modal dengan biaya konstruksi atau dengan kata lain penganggaran biaya non konstruksi pada belanja modal jalan, irigasi, dan jembatan sudah tepat dan efisien dalam penganggarnya.

Pemerintah daerah harus menjaga supaya tetap mempertahankan tingkat efisiensi anggaran sebagai wujud penyelenggaraan pemerintahan yang berdaya guna, berhasil guna, bersih, bertanggung jawab, dan transparan. Selain itu, pemerintah daerah harus mempertahankan perencanaan anggaran yang sesuai dengan kepentingan masyarakat sehingga sasaran yang telah ditetapkan dapat tercapai dan mencerminkan kepentingan masyarakat. Hal ini dikarenakan perencanaan yang baik dapat menjadi tolok ukur bagi keberhasilan pemerintah dalam merealisasikan kepentingan masyarakat.

## **Kesimpulan**

Berdasarkan hasil penelitian dan pembahasan telah diuraikan sebelumnya, dapat ditarik simpulan sebagai berikut.

Persentase biaya konstruksi terhadap belanja modal terendah pada Program Pembangunan Drainase/Gorong-Gorong sebesar 74.18% dan persentase terendah pada jenis pekerjaan Pembangunan Drainase dan Trotoar di Ruas Jalan Magelang – Kaliangkrik serta Magelang – Kopeng sebesar 45.27%. Hal ini dikarenakan tingginya biaya non konstruksi pada jenis pekerjaan tersebut.

Berdasarkan uji beda rata-rata antara dua variabel menunjukkan tidak terdapat perbedaan yang signifikan antara belanja modal dengan biaya konstruksi. Hal ini berarti penganggaran belanja daerah terkait belanja modal jalan, irigasi, dan jaringan sudah tepat serta efisien.

## **Saran**

Berdasarkan kesimpulan dan implikasi di atas, maka saran yang dapat diberikan untuk topik penelitian sejenis atau pun bagi pemerintah daerah, yaitu:

- perlu dilakukan penelitian lebih lanjut mengenai analisis belanja modal lainnya seperti belanja modal peralatan dan mesin, belanja modal bangunan dan gedung, maupun belanja modal aset lainnya;
- perlunya perhitungan rasional dalam melakukan alokasi anggaran untuk memenuhi aspek efisiensi dan penghematan dalam penganggaran serta realisasi belanja daerah;
- pemerintah daerah diharapkan dapat mengalokasikan atau menggunakan dana masyarakat (public money) secara efisien agar menghasilkan output maksimal (berdaya guna) atau dengan biaya (input) minimal diperoleh hasil (output) yang diinginkan.

---

## **Menanggapi Perubahan Iklim: Integrasi Kebijakan dan Sektor Kehutanan Indonesia**

## **Responding to Climate Change: Policy Integration and The Indonesian Forestry Sector**

---

Nama : Yogi Suwarno  
NIP : 197506092000021001  
Instansi : LAN  
Tahun Intake : 2011  
Tingkat Beasiswa : PhD overseas  
Program Studi : Global Governance  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : University of Birmingham

## ABSTRAK

Literatur tentang integrasi isu lintas sektoral, atau integrasi kebijakan, tidak banyak memberi perhatian pada bagaimana proses pembuatan kebijakan memungkinkan adanya integrasi kebijakan dan juga rintangan saat ini. Ada juga sedikit bukti tentang bagaimana kementerian sektoral menanggapi isu-isu *crosscutting* dan bagaimana mereka terpengaruh oleh tekanan untuk menangani masalah tersebut, termasuk yang dipromosikan oleh agen 'bersaing'. Perubahan iklim menghadirkan isu penting dan penting untuk diintegrasikan ke dalam banyak bidang kebijakan publik. Banyak kementerian dan departemen pemerintah ditugaskan untuk menanggapi mitigasi dan sasaran adaptasi perubahan iklim.

Kehutanan merupakan sektor kunci dalam membangun respons terhadap perubahan iklim dan karena itu menyelidiki mengenai bagaimana pembuat kebijakan dan proses pembuatan kebijakan merespons perubahan iklim dapat menjelaskan integrasi isu-isu lintas sektoral. Tesis ini melaporkan penyelidikan tentang bagaimana Kementerian Kehutanan, Indonesia, telah menanggapi perubahan iklim dan ke dalam pengaturan organisasi yang dikembangkan sebagai tanggapan terhadap perubahan iklim. Penelitian ini mengembangkan kerangka inovatif untuk analisis integrasi kebijakan, menghasilkan kesimpulan sehubungan dengan proses kebijakan, pengaturan organisasi dan pengaruh aktor kunci, termasuk juara kebijakan dan spanduk batas.

## ABSTRACT

Literature on the integration of cross-cutting issues, or policy integration, has given little attention to how policy-making processes allow for policy integration as well as present barriers. There is also little evidence of how sectoral ministries respond to crosscutting issues and in what way they are affected by pressure to address such issues, including those promoted by 'competing' agencies. Climate change presents a significant and important issue for integration into many areas of public policy. Many government ministries and departments are tasked with responding to climate change mitigation and adaptation objectives.

Forestry is a key sector in building a response to climate change and so an investigation into how policy-makers and policy-making processes have responded to climate change can shed light on the integration of cross-cutting issues. The thesis reports on investigation into how the Ministry of Forestry, Indonesia, has responded to climate change and into the organisational arrangements developed in the response to climate change. The research developed an innovative framework for the analysis of policy integration, generating conclusions in relation to the policy process, organisational arrangements and the influence of key actors, including policy champions and boundary spanners.



## Introduction

This research has an overall purpose to contribute to an understanding of how policy integration can take place in a sectoral policy making. The researcher seeks to understand how a cross-cutting issue can be incorporated into sectoral policy making and the extent and implication as results of responding to such changes. This research is based on the following rationale:

Firstly, this research is informed by the postulation that climate change can be viewed as a cross-cutting issue. Climate change is inevitably occurring, not only scientifically established but also increasingly recognised and experienced by many sectors, that makes it a cross-cutting issue that cuts across multiple sectors. It has put the global environment at risk such as temperature rises, precipitation changes, sea-level rise, droughts and floods in an unexpectedly manner, as well as biodiversity loss that threat the entire human's life (see Stern, 2007). Such impacts have made climate change an issue that cuts across many sectors. Climate change is further observed that it affects a number of socioeconomic-related sectors including energy (Mitigation, 2011, Schaeffer et al., 2012), health (Haines et al., 2006, Shindell et al., 2012), agriculture (Fischer et al., 2005, Fischer et al., 2002, Parry et al., 2004), and forestry (Watson, 2000) and many others.

The characteristic of cross-cutting issue can also be looked at governance at international level, where climate change issue has been addressed through a number of institutions, including conferences, conventions, agreements, schemes, world leaders forum, multi- and bilateral cooperation and so on (see Okereke et al., 2009, Yamin and Depledge, 2004). Most of these invite participation from both advanced and less-advanced countries.

Those from advanced countries and donor institutions are encouraged to provide financial and non-financial resources to the more vulnerable and most affected countries. This aid roughly can be divided into two approaches: mitigation and adaptation, that may be channelled to sectors that are considered important (Klein et al., 2005). The aid has consequently affected the sectoral policy making of affected countries at domestic or national level. In this regard, climate change issue has been relatively institutionalised by international regime and addressed by majority of countries. United Nations, World Bank, and EU are among institutions promoting climate change policy in both international and

national jurisdictions. It is also well documented in many policy arrangements. UNFCCC, Kyoto Protocol and series of Conferences of Parties (COPs) are major international arrangements in addressing climate change.

Secondly, having noted that climate change can be considered to be a cross cutting issue, it must be further noted that cross-cutting issues are hard for governments to effectively deal with. Governments have tried different approaches, including various organisational arrangements, such as setting up inter-ministerial groups, newly established ad-hoc institutions and other approaches (Indrarto et al., 2012, Resosudarmo et al., 2013). These efforts do not always meet with success. The arrangement of addressing climate change is more complex than addressing one sectoral issue at national level. Thirdly, in addition, the literature on how policy-making takes place is almost silent on policy integration, so it is not clear how sectoral policy-making responds to, is threatened by or ignores cross- Kyoto Protocol is a following international treaty that sets binding obligations on developed countries to reduce carbon emissions. COPs is a series of conferences held periodically to assess any progress in dealing with climate change. Cutting issues. Although there is little literature on policy integration in policy-related theory, a number of literature indeed address policy integration, or at least approach the term with related concepts, such as policy coherence, cross-cutting policy making, and policy coordination. Peters (1998), for instance, has provided an insightful perspective of how administrative narratives should approach coordination. Peters (1998: 296) argues that coordination is "... an end-state in which the policies and programmes of government are characterized by minimal redundancy, incoherence and lacunae". Other related concepts, such as inter-governmental management (Agranoff, 1986), or holistic government (6, 1997, Leat et al., 1999, Wilkinson and Appelbee, 1999) and collaboration (Gray, 1989, Huxham, 1996), address issues that cut across multiple levels of governance and thus encourage an integrated approach in dealing with the issue.

Lastly, in the developing world, integrating policy may face a number of challenges and contextual problems. The effort of climate change mitigation is particularly associated with reducing deforestation. The forestry sectors are having to incorporate climate change concerns and objectives into their policy and practice. The issues are often linked to various sectors and dimensions,

from poverty or sustainable development issues (Banuri, 2009, Stern, 2007, Brundtland, 1987), social vulnerability (Adger, 1999, Bohle et al., 1994) to biodiversity loss (Change and Watson, 2002, Lovejoy, 2008, Singh et al., 2014). Addressing these issues clearly needs a more integrated approach involving wider and expanded sectors, rather than a more fragmented approach within a single sector. In essence, climate change has become an issue that goes beyond one particular sector (see Stern, 2007, Bappenas, 2010, Nilsson and Nilsson, 2005).

Moreover, it becomes a major challenge and a necessity for policy-makers to address climate change in policy-making at all levels (Urwin and Jordan, 2008, Nilsson and Nilsson, 2005). This also makes climate change an issue that cuts across various sectors and results in the issue being a common policy agenda item for multiple sectors (McCarthy, 2001, Stern, 2007).

As a cross-cutting issue, climate change needs to be integrated into sectoral policy. Different arrangements have been set up within governments to enable integration. Yet different meanings and perceptions of policy integration within an organisation could lead to different arrangements and changes. This research is, therefore, to seek the meaning of climate policy integration within a sector (or organisation), and subsequently to examine the organisational implication that may occur when the integration is at stake.

There are some challenges that may enable or impede the process of integrating policy. The impetus of policy being integrated is mainly derived from political commitment in agenda setting (Lafferty and Hovden, 2003). The first factor that enables this happened is to putting the issue into political agenda (Levy, 1992, Lenschow, 2002, Jordan and Lenschow, 2008). Studies on (environmental) policy integration in EU level and specific countries like Germany, Norway, Sweden, UK, USA, and Australia, not only emphasise funding issues but also how to cope with multilevel problems and institutional bottlenecks (Lenschow, 2002, Jordan and Lenschow, 2008). In recent studies, developing world also found it difficult, not only struggling to establish proper climate change institutional arrangement, but also dealing with other pressing agenda like poverty, health and so on (Held et al., 2013). Thus, putting a cross-cutting agenda into sector's priority list could be very challenging to realise, as different sector has different interests and goals. The rearrangement of resources and

the interruption of achieving organisational goals are consequences that most likely to occur.

In addition, institutional capacity and other conflicting interests may be problematic. This institutional capacity includes administrative instrument, budgeting, development strategies and policy appraisal and strategic assessment which play important role in successful integration (Jordan and Lenschow, 2008). Finally, the number, size, and structure of organisations involved matters, particularly when it comes to co-operation and coordination between organisations. Larger organisations or sectors may not have willingness to cooperate with their smaller counterparts due to their rigidity and rules conformity (see Gore, 1993, Pandey and Moynihan, 2005).

There are, then, multiple challenges and opportunities that face the integration of cross-cutting issues in sectoral policy-making. This research investigates the challenges of integration for climate change in the sectoral policy area of forestry in Indonesia, examining the influence of the organisational arrangements as well as a range of enabling factors and constraints.

## **Compatibility and Coherence of Issues**

Literature on policy making addresses the idea of policy coherence as opposed to policy conflict. Policy integration is about to incorporate policy issue into sectoral policy making that is not necessarily similar to each other. The incoming cross cutting issue that is imposed by law has forced the sector to make adjustment in their sectoral goal, one of which by making sectoral policy compatible and coherent with the cross cutting issue.

From an examination of official reports, policy documents and other related sources, it is clear that the MoF and other central government ministries and agencies that are in charge of governing the forestry sector as a whole have been carrying out the predetermined sectoral mission at both national and local level that is in line with climate change as the cross cutting issue. The ultimate goals of forestry governance have been directed to protecting the forest resources and making the most of economic values of the forest<sup>28</sup>. Making a better plan on forestry development and protecting forest from any forms of destruction and degradation are undoubtedly consistent with climate change agenda. Two government regulations on forest planning (GR 44 Year

2004) and forest protection (GR 45 Year 2004) have outlined and translated these goals into more detailed policy. These are followed by the issuance of a number of policies at ministerial level and local government level. From this point, the policy direction of the forestry sector has shown that its structure supports the efforts of addressing climate change, or at least contributes to the agenda of climate change in the sector.

The role of the forestry sector in addressing climate change has been acknowledged further by the enactment of Presidential Regulation Number 61 Year 2011 in the National Action Plan on GHG that invites the MoF, as the central government forest authority, to be part of national climate governance along with other ministries. This action plan guides the MoF to take certain tasks on improving forest governance at the local level by establishing the so-called Forest Management Unit (FMU), rehabilitating degraded forest, protecting forests and controlling forest fire, as well as undertaking forest protection and developing conservation areas. The term “carbon” is recognised officially as part of the MoF’s mandates in forestry governance. Forests are seen as carbon sinks and enabling sequestration and thus the MoF is assigned to protect and keep forest sustainable.

In the context of achieving sectoral objectives, the coherent ideas between sectoral and cross-cutting issues is the supporting factor of integrating policy. The idea of sustainable forest management (SFM) is believed by majority of informants to be consistent with the effort of addressing climate change in the sector. Defining sustainability in sectoral forestry objectives is in agreement with the means of addressing climate change. The MoF, therefore, may claim to continue its forestry policies and conduct its activities achieving its sectoral goals without having any clear conflicting issue with the climate change agenda.

## **Political Commitment**

Politics has a critical role to play in paving the way for government to exercise public policy (see Peters, 1987, Baumgartner and Leech, 1998, see Kettl, 2014). When politics is in favour of certain circumstances, then the administration is likely to proceed and translate this into policy and practice.

This applies to the case of addressing climate change in Indonesia, when the Gol has officially declared its support to climate change agenda by

pledging reduction on carbon emission in Pittsburgh in 2009 and then renewed recently in Paris in 2015. This was seen as the political commitment at highest level from the country to the international community that become a basis for climate change agenda for entering domestic policy making. This was followed by the enactment of a number of laws and government regulations in favour with mainstreaming climate change in sectors.

Without such political commitment at international level, it would be unlikely the policy making process at domestic level to adopt and mainstream climate change agenda into sectoral work. This is the second influence on policy making from the presence of cross cutting issue.

## **Polity and Institutional Complexity**

In relation to complexity of polity and institutional, the ministry and other government agencies are bound by higher institutions that guide how policy should be made within sectors. The law number 12 Year 2011 concerning making rules outlines and guides government agencies in making rules. Any rules and regulations at ministerial level should be in accordance with the broader regulation. Regulating sectoral issues and addressing cross cutting issues are part of national development policy design that is outlined in the mid-term development planning (RPJMN) and the long-term development planning (RPJP). The recognition of climate change agenda began by the enactment of Law Number 6 Year 1994 concerning the ratification of UNFCCC. This ratification law is the first legal basis for national development policy to address climate change across numerous sectors at national and local level.

However, when it comes to arrangements at national level where various ministries beyond the MoF are working on forestry governance, conflicting interests may arise between them. This is because forestry is seen as a land-based sector that may involve numerous institutions beyond the MoF. The ministry cannot govern forestry sector all alone, instead it should include other related institutions, especially the partnering ministries and agencies at central level to do so. The presence of numerous agencies in climate governance has created competition between agencies and ministries. The MoF has to deal with many institutions in governing forestry sector. For example, in terms of national planning, the MoF has to comply with the Bappenas. When it comes to

deforestation problem, the MoF should deal with the REDD+ managing agency. So do other institutions. Such arrangement clearly made policy integration of a cross cutting issue much more difficult and multi faceted.

A number of policies at national level and ministerial level have been enacted in accordance with the effort of addressing climate change. At national level, law on UNFCCC ratification is the evidence of climate change recognition by the state. Other sectoral laws are, to some extent, in agreement with the idea of addressing climate change. The GoI has also outlined the importance of addressing climate change by the issuance of the NAP GHG that force sectoral ministries to cope with climate change issue in respective sector, as well as a number of government regulation concerning climate change and forestry sector. The MoF also produce some important ministerial regulations like carbon development mechanism, REDD and carbon licensing.

## **Budgetary Challenges**

The allocation of budgets also presents a challenges in addressing climate change in the sector. Although forestry sector is known for its major contribution to carbon emission, the forestry sector does not necessarily receive a significant portion from the budget. Meanwhile some international-based funding has also taken a part in forestry sector addressing climate change. REDD+ funding mechanism conducted by the UN and other institutions, for example, have been part of government's effort to deal with deforestation. The increasing REDD+ related fund from abroad has a particular effect on the attitude of policy makers in forestry sector. In addition, beside this particular budget allocation, in the past the MoF had been managing a reforestation fund of US\$ 5.8 billion since it was established in 1989. This financial governance in forestry sector was aimed to learn lessons from this reforestation fund.

## **Organisational Arrangement and Silos**

In terms of organisational arrangements, government had responded to cross cutting issue by either establishing new institutions or distributing the task of addressing the issue to the existing ministries. In the early chapter it is discussed that the establishment of a sectoral ministry should comply with Law

39 Year 2008 on State Ministry. There are three graded groups recognised by the law. The first two tiers are among the strongest ministries and established based on certain sectoral law, and thus it would not be easy for government and parliament to abolish them. The least tier is the weaker one. Based on this categorisation, the MoF is labelled as a second tier ministry whose affairs of forestry sector are clearly instructed in the 1945 Constitution.

In relation to addressing climate change within the forestry sector, the Gol decided to distribute the climate-related tasks not only to the MoF as the national forest authority, but also to a separate arrangement that involves a number of institutions at both ministerial and non-ministerial forms. There are at least two other institutions that were assigned similar tasks on forestry sector as nearly as powerful as a ministerial level institution in dealing with climate change issue i.e. the REDD+ Agency and the National Council on Climate Change. In addition, the other related ministries exist that altogether are mandated by the national action plan made by government. This arrangement has created certain implications on the issues such as managerial autonomy, resources and line of accountability. The first issue deals with the way newly established organisations cope with coordination and communication with sectoral ministries. Secondly, a competition between institutions in obtaining resources is also problematic. This includes how organisational arrangements at central level should cope with silos mentality in which each ministry is trapped by its sectoral functions and internal identity. Finally, having more than one institution in forestry governance has made the line of accountability of each institution more complicated than ever before.

## **Enabling factors and Constraints**

Lastly, the enabling factors and constraints for policy integration are defined such as political commitment, ownership and awareness, closeness of the issue, as well as financial and resources dimensions. Political commitment includes organisational arrangements, institutional context and competing agenda, ministries as silos as well as the roles of champions and boundary spanner.

On the other hand, the degree of ownership and awareness of the issue may encourage policy integration. Ministries and agencies which have certain degree of ownership and awareness to the issue may create chances for policy



integration. The lesser the ownership and the awareness they have, the smaller chances for policy integration they would make.

Meanwhile financial and resources dimension embrace budget, institutional capacity and other related resources. Lastly the political and governance context comprises integrity and accountability of the related institutions and the ownership of and awareness of the issue, as well as decentralisation context that is happening at local level.

## **Reflections on the Research Work**

Although the research employs a qualitative approach, the quantitative approach is also important for the research. It would give different and enriching insights of what is being researched such as showing trend of particular figure. However, the availability of relevant data might be challenging. Some official sources were highly reliable, but others were not. The researcher often found data from foreign institutions were more reliable and reflect longer period of time.

In addition, designing semi-structured interviews based on the analytical framework at the beginning aimed to help the interview sessions in a more guided and directed manner. Yet discussing policy issues with policy actors could not be run in that way, and thus, often the discussions were more flowing when the interview was relatively loose from the predetermined structure.

In relation to such reflections, this section sets out further reflections on the analytical framework by stepping back from the results of the study and critically reflects on the entire research, as it is an important requisite in all types of research, especially in the qualitative one (see Finlay and Gough, 2008). This reflection is undertaken in order to provide objective insights on the research by the researcher.

---

## **Bureaucratic Reform in Indonesia: Reorganization of Central Government (Case Study)**

## **Reformasi Birokrasi di Indonesia: Reorganisasi Pemerintah Pusat (Studi Kasus)**

---

Nama : Yudiantarti Safitri  
NIP : 198309272006042004  
Instansi : LAN  
Tahun Intake : 2012  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : Master's Program of The Graduate  
School of Governance Studies  
Negara Studi : Jepang  
Universitas : Meiji University

## ABSTRACT

The bureaucratic reform program started implementation in 2007 in Indonesia, and there are eight areas of change in this program: organization, procedure, regulation, human resources, control, accountability, public services, and mindset and cultural apparatus. However, the society is pessimistic about this program since there are no visible results that they can see from the bureaucratic reform program. Moreover, as Gerald Caiden in an article in the Jakarta Post has argued, "Administrative reform in the third world is almost beyond realization"... the fact is "administrative reform does not stand by itself, but is very much bound and related to political, cultural and, definitely, law enforcement reform. Fundamental institutional, social and cultural transformations are necessary" (Caiden, 2012). Therefore, there is need for fundamental institutional reform such as reorganization of central government in Indonesia, to make an effective and efficient government.

This research focuses on organization change area as one of the change area in the bureaucratic reform program. The objective of this change area is to achieve clarity of function and correct size of the organization. To obtain the results, it needs the tools or guidance to carry out this change area. Also, it is necessary to analysis the function of each Ministry. If there are functions that are still ambiguous in ministries and non-ministry institutions, it will cause overlapping in the ministries and non-ministry institution. For that reason, it is necessary to find the overlapping in the central government organizations, before doing the reorganization of central government.

## ABSTRAK

Program reformasi birokrasi mulai dilaksanakan pada tahun 2007 di Indonesia, dan ada delapan bidang perubahan dalam program ini: organisasi, prosedur, peraturan, sumber daya manusia, kontrol, akuntabilitas, layanan publik, dan pola pikir dan perangkat budaya. Namun, masyarakat pesimis dengan program ini karena tidak ada hasil yang dapat dilihat dari program reformasi birokrasi. Apalagi, seperti yang dilaporkan Gerald Caiden dalam sebuah artikel di Jakarta Post, "Reformasi administrasi di dunia ketiga hampir tidak dapat direalisasikan" ....

Faktanya adalah "reformasi administrasi tidak berdiri dengan sendirinya, tapi sangat terikat dan terkait dengan reformasi penegakan hukum politik, budaya dan pasti. Transisi kelembagaan, sosial dan budaya mendasar diperlukan" (Caiden, 2012). Oleh karena itu, diperlukan reformasi kelembagaan yang mendasar seperti reorganisasi pemerintah pusat di Indonesia, untuk membuat pemerintahan yang efektif dan efisien.

Penelitian ini berfokus pada area perubahan organisasi sebagai salah satu area perubahan dalam program reformasi birokrasi. Tujuan dari area perubahan ini adalah untuk mencapai kejelasan fungsi dan ukuran organisasi yang benar. Untuk mendapatkan hasilnya, diperlukan alat atau panduan untuk melakukan perubahan area ini. Selain itu, perlu dilakukan analisis fungsi masing-masing Kementerian. Jika ada fungsi yang masih ambigu di kementerian dan lembaga non kementerian, jika ada fungsi yang masih ambigu di kementerian dan lembaga non kementerian, maka akan terjadi tumpang tindih di kementerian dan lembaga non kementerian. Oleh karena itu, perlu ditemukan tumpang tindih di organisasi pemerintah pusat, sebelum melakukan reorganisasi pemerintah pusat.

In this research, the author focuses on the organization change area as one of the change areas in bureaucratic reform program. The bureaucratic reform program is associated with thousands of overlapping processes between the functions of government. Indonesia has 34 Ministries, and 30 non-Ministry Institutions. Ministry of Empowerment Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform realize that there is some overlapping between these central government organizations. To solve this problem, the government puts organization as one of the points in the bureaucratic reform program. The objective of this area of change is to correct the function and size of the organization. This area of change is in line with the basic idea of Good Governance, which is to make government more effective and efficient.

However, there are no clear tools that can be used to implement this area of change and to achieve the expected result. There are some regulations published by Ministry of Empowerment Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform to evaluate the function and the size of government organizations, but these regulations only focus on evaluating the internal organization and not inter-organizations. Consequently, there is still overlapping of functions that exist among the organizations.

The objective of the reform especially in the organization change area will be not achieved while the problem of overlapping still exists in the government organization. The aim of reform is to make government more effective and efficient, and to change big government in to small government. Indonesia has been trying to implement bureaucratic reform program, and some organizations tried to do vertical reorganization. However, overlapping still occurs in central government organizations. This can be seen from research done by NIPA in 2005.

In 2005 National Institute of Public Administration (NIPA) carried out research on overlapping in Indonesia, with research topic "Efficiency and Effectiveness in Government Organization" (in Indonesian language). The purpose of this research was to determine the efficiency and effectiveness of subdivision both in internal organization and among others organizations in terms of tasks and functions. In this research the government institution's efficiency and effectiveness was reviewed from two perspectives. Firstly, it was done by document analysis of the tasks and functions of the locus research.

The document analysis was looking for the overlapping of tasks and functions in internal organizations and between organizations. Secondly, the surveys and interviews were carried out to collect the information about the implementation of tasks and functions of the ministry in the local government.

There were some findings from research done by NIPA, and the results were: First, there were tasks and functions that were interconnected between subdivisions in the Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry for Political, Justice, and Security Affairs. Second, there were tasks and functions that were related between subdivisions in the Ministry of Industry and Ministry of Trade. Third, there were tasks and functions that were related between subdivisions in the Ministry of Religious Affairs and Ministry of Education. Fourth, there were similarities between some subdivisions in the Ministry of Home Affairs and subdivisions in others ministries. Fifth, there was overlapping of tasks and functions between subdivisions in the Ministry of Industry and Ministry of Forestry, Ministry of Trade and Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Trade and Ministry of Forestry, and Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration and Ministry of Public Works. Based on the research, all tasks and functions that were related between the ministries needed to be coordinated in order to make it more efficient and effective.

Above all, in the previous research done by NIPA, the research focused on the similarities of tasks and functions in some ministries. The findings from the research only mentioned that there were tasks and functions that were connected between ministries and there was a need for coordination between the ministries. The findings were not clear enough to establish which tasks and functions were overlapping, and why the overlapping can happen between the ministries. Also, the research was carried out in 2005, and today there are so many changes in the government. However, the research mentioned that it needs additional research and analysis of what they already found.

Based on those results before reorganizing the central government organizations, there is a need for a study about which functions and tasks overlap between organizations and from what aspects we can identify that the functions and tasks in the ministries and non-ministry institutions are overlapping. In order to get the information, this research has find out the overlapping in central government in Indonesia by looking for the programs, clients, and policies in each ministries and non-ministry institutions.

This research focuses on organization change area of the bureaucratic reform program in Indonesia. As mentioned above, the expected results of the organization change area are to correct the function and size of the organization. To obtain the results, it needs the tools or guidance how to carry out this change area. Also, it is necessary to analyze the function of each organization. If there are functions that still are not clear in ministries and non-ministry institutions, it will cause overlapping in the ministries and non-ministry institutions. For that reason, before doing the reorganization of central government, it is necessary to find the overlapping in the central government organizations. Therefore, the objectives of this study are:

1. To know the extent of bureaucratic reform implementation (program) especially in the organization change area in Indonesia.
2. To find the tools or guidance to identify the overlapping between organizations in central government.
3. To make the plan of reorganization in central government.

### **Analysis of Programs, Clients, and Policies Overlap**

Based on policy analysis it is recognize that there was overlap in one regulation regarding bureaucratic reform that produced by these two organizations. Each ministry has a function to formulate and establish regulation in their job area. In the implementation sometimes there is a similar regulation produced by different ministries. In this research, the author found similar regulations produced by the Ministry of Empowerment of State Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform and MoHA. The regulation produced by the Ministry of Empowerment of State Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform was ministerial decree KEP/61/M. PAN/6/2004 regarding Job Analysis. Meanwhile, MoHa produced ministry regulation number 4 year 2005 regarding job analysis for a Ministry of Home Affairs and local governments.

From the Performance Indicator Report (*LAKIP*) of the Ministry of Empowerment of State Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform, and National Institute of Public Administration, there is not much information that can be analyzed. Especially for *LAKIP* of NIPA, there is only little information and no details about the program that is run by NIPA. However, there is a similar program mentioned in the program from the Ministry of Empowerment of

State Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform. The program was reformulating government regulation draft number 101 year 2000 regarding training and education for civil servants.

There is overlap in one regulation regarding bureaucratic reform produced by these two organizations, which is between ministry regulation number 33 year 2011 regarding job analysis guidance and Head of NCSA regulation number 12 year 2011 regarding job analysis implementation guidance.

Based on policy analysis, author cannot find any regulation overlapping between these two organizations. As already been discussed above, the Ministry of Home Affairs produced regulation number 4 year 2005 regarding Job Analysis for Ministry of Home Affairs and local governments. In 2011 NCSA published a similar regulation: Head of NCSA regulation number 12 year 2011 regarding job analysis implementation guidance. The content of the regulation formulated by NCSA is similar to the regulation formulated by the Ministry of Home Affairs. Moreover, in 2012 MoHA published ministry regulation number 35 year 2012 regarding job analysis for Ministry of Home Affairs and local governments. The difference between the regulations produced by NCSA and MoHA is, the regulation that established by MoHA are intended for MoHA, Province, and Regency/City to carry out the job analysis in their job area

From the analysis the Ministry of Empowerment of State Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform is completely overlapping with both MoHA and NCSA, and partially overlapping with NIPA. It is indicated there is something wrong in the function of the Ministry of Empowerment of State Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform. The problem derived from these findings is who actually has the responsibility in managing the program?

## **Identification of Overlap Problems in the Organizations**

Based on the findings above, we can see that from four organizations only one pair of organizations that do not overlap that is MoHA and NIPA. It is indicated that there is no coordination and clarity of the functions of each organization in carried out the program. The similarity of functions impacts the similarity of results that they want to achieve. Also, by observing the overlapping on regulation, there is no coordination between the organizations in composing the regulation. It makes each organization repeating in making same regulation.



Furthermore, the overlapping of policies between three organizations: Ministry of Empowerment of State Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform, MoHA and NCSA become interesting findings. Based on analyses all these three organizations produced same regulation regarding job analysis. Since the Ministry of Empowerment of State Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform already made this regulation to support bureaucratic reform program, MoHA and NCSA should not make similar regulation. Also based on the function of each organization (see appendix 4,5,6,and 7), Ministry of Empowerment of State Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform has the responsibilities of bureaucratic reform matters, and regulation regarding job analysis is one of bureaucratic reform necessity in implementing organization change area.

Considering the function and responsibility (see appendix 4,5,6, and 7) of the organizations, it seems that there is no limitation in the scope of job of these organizations. The functions are broad and did not write with clear explanation, it causes different interpretation in each organization and the possibilities in making similar program are high.

## **Existing Condition of Reorganization Implementation**

Reorganization is the general activity that is performed by government (Peters, 1992), and Indonesian government has its own method on carrying out the reorganization. In 2007, the Ministry of Finance as one of the pilot projects of bureaucratic reform programs, implemented vertical reorganization in their organization structure. Also, in the 2013 NIPA following the Ministry of Finance steps to restructuring their organizations, from five departments to three departments. However, both these organizations only did vertical reorganization not horizontal reorganization, it causes the overlapping still occurs between central government organizations. The Ministry of Empowerment of State Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform realized the problem and stated it in grand design of bureaucratic reform program year 2010 "doing bureaucratic reform means must facing of the problem with the thousands of overlapping between the functions in government offices". To manage this problem organization matter is put as one of change area in bureaucratic reform program.

To support the organization change area, there is a policy made by government as guidance in implementing the reorganization, the policies related is ministry regulation number 33 year 2011 regarding job analysis guidance. The

objective of regulation number 33 year 2011 are; first, to assist and facilitate the central and local government agencies in conducting job analysis with the formats that will be included in the formulation of the results of job analysis to reorganization, staffing, management, and oversight and accountability. Second, to assist the central and local government agencies in personnel organize as well as providing feedback for refinement of the organization, governance, oversight and accountability. We can see that one of the aims of the regulation is to reorganize the organizations. However, the results of the analysis only focuses on vertical reorganization and not on horizontal reorganization.

With the guidance number 33 year 2011, the organization only focuses on reorganizing on their own organization. Meanwhile, the real problem is that overlapping occurred between the organizations. In other words, government needs to merges or abolish some organizations since there are overlapping between the organizations. One way to start reorganization is to use another tools or guidance to find the overlaps between the organizations and decided which organization must be merges or abolish, for example the models of overlapping that already used in this research can be used to find the overlaps between the organizations.

From the findings, we can see that by the analytical framework of this research overlapping among central governments organizations can be found. Accordingly, the analytical framework and models of overlapping in this research can be used to analyses overlapping between organizations. After the overlapping is found, the priority of which organization will be merged or eliminated can be decided from the models of overlapping itself. For example, when the COL model is identified in one organization, that organization must make it a priority to cooperate with the organization in the COL model to reorganize in order to eliminate the overlap.

## **The extent of bureaucratic reform program (organization change area) in Indonesia**

The Ministry of Finance, as one of three of the pilot projects of the bureaucratic reform program, had already implemented the reorganization of their organizational structure. Moreover, in the 2013 NIPA followed the Ministry of Finance steps for restructuring its organizations, and reduced its departments

from five to three departments. However, overlapping still occurs in central government organizations. The problem is caused by the ambiguity of the function in organizations. To make the organization more effective and efficient, it is important to clarify the function. So, it is important to find the tools or guidance to implement the organization change area.

The Indonesian government should review the function in each central government organization, and there should be no ambiguity of function in each organization. Also, there should be a review of how the implementation of the function was accomplished by the organization. Most importantly, if the reorganization only focuses on the internal organization, the overlapping between central government organizations will continue to exist. As mentioned before in Chapter 4, there has been no change in the government cabinet system since the new order era (1968). This indicates that there is no serious consideration in overcoming this problem. In the meantime, Indonesia is in a period of change, so the reorganization is an essential thing to do. Garnet (Cited in Chackerian, 1996) supports this need when he argued that reorganization occurs because of some conditions are changing in the country or in the world.

## **Tools to identify overlapping in central government**

The analytical framework and models of overlapping in this thesis are used to find the overlapping in ministries and non-ministries institution. There are three models of overlap that are used for analyses, the models are decided if there is overlap in programs, clients, or policies. The models are:

1. No overlapping (NOL) = if not one of the criteria overlap
2. Partially overlapping (POL) = if one or two criteria overlap
3. Completely overlapping (COL) = if three or all criteria overlap

These models of overlapping can be one of choice to identify overlapping in central government. The application of analytical framework and models of overlapping revealed some findings of overlapping in four central government organizations. According to the models, overlapping is caused by; the similarity in function, and the function of ministers of coordination did not working. Therefore, the implications are; some programs overlap, and there is a lack of coordination, and overlapping in regulations produced by ministries. These are

only symptoms of overlapping problems. This research suggests that the root cause is in the law regarding central government organizations functions.

The government should review the cabinet system, especially the distribution of ministers into three groups that divides in the cabinet. The purpose of divides the cabinet into three groups is not clear and there is some incongruity in law number 39 year 2008. In Article 4 it is mentioned that each minister has certain matters in governance affairs, namely: governance affairs which is the list of ministry is stated in the law of Republic Indonesia year 1945, governance affairs that the scope of their work are stated in the law of Republic Indonesia year 1945, and governance affairs in order to enhance sharpening coordination and synchronization of government programs.

But, in Article 14 it is mentioned that the President can create a ministry of coordination for the synchronization and coordination of miniserries issues. We can see that there are two statements of "coordination and synchronization". This causes there overlaps of ministry grouping on the President Decree number 24 year 2010. They are the coordinating ministry has the function to assists the President in synchronizing and coordinating on their job area; and the state minister or young minister has the function of governance affairs in order to sharpening coordination and synchronization of government program.



---

## **Secular Party and Religious Policies in Indonesia**

### **Partai Sekuler dan Peraturan Agama di Indonesia**

---

Nama : Hasna Azmi Fadhilah  
NIP : 199106272010102001  
Instansi : KEMENDAGRI  
Tahun Intake : 2014  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : Mres in Politics  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : University of Essex

Sama halnya dengan negara-negara demokrasi lainnya, Indonesia memisahkan ranah kekuasaan dan agama. Walau demikian Indonesia tetap menjamin kebebasan penduduk untuk memeluk dan menjalankan ritual agama yang mereka anut dan percayai. Tidak hanya muslim yang mendapatkan hak tersebut, pemeluk agama lainnya, seperti: kristen, katolik, hindu, budha, dan konghucu juga diberikan kebebasan yang sama. Meski islam sendiri adalah agama mayoritas, tetapi Indonesia, berbeda dengan Arab Saudi maupun Iran, tidak menerapkan hukum syariah sebagai konstitusi nasional. Meski demikian, usaha untuk menerapkan hukum islam sempat beberapa kali diupayakan dan menjadi agenda politik. Namun, dukungan penerapan hukum syariah selalu mengalami kegagalan dalam meraup suara minimum di parlemen.

Berbeda dengan kenyataan di tingkat nasional yang menunjukkan kurangnya gerakan untuk mendukung konstitusi islam, di level yang lebih rendah, di tingkat provinsi dan kabupaten/kota, dukungan untuk menerapkan hukum syariah semakin menguat. Provinsi Aceh, yang dikenal dengan nama Serambi Mekah, menjadi pionier dengan menjadi provinsi pertama yang menerapkan hukum islam dan mendeklarasikan diri sebagai provinsi syariah pada tahun 2001. Mengikuti Aceh, Jawa Barat dan Sulawesi Selatan, pada tahun berikutnya juga menerbitkan peraturan daerah (perda) berdasarkan agama. Bahkan kedua provinsi ini jauh lebih 'agresif' dan selanjutnya menerbitkan lebih banyak perda yang jumlahnya melampaui perda yang diterapkan oleh pemerintah Aceh.

Melihat fenomena ini, banyak pihak menuding partai-partai islam dan para ulama sebagai dalang dibalik maraknya perda syariah. Namun bila ditilik lebih jauh, ternyata inisiator perda agama di daerah adalah partai sekuler, yakni Golongan Karya (Golkar) dan Partai Demokrasi Indonesia Perjuangan (PDI-P). Meski tidak segegar Golkar, PDI-P di beberapa daerah seperti Jawa Barat turut berkoalisi dengan Golkar dan partai lain untuk mengesahkan perda syariah. Menurut Buehler (2011) enam puluh persen dari total seluruh perda agama berawal dari inisiatif Golkar sendiri dengan dukungan suara mayoritas. Sisanya merupakan hasil koalisi Golkar dengan partai-partai lain, termasuk PDI-P. Kenyataan ini kemudian menimbulkan pertanyaan: motif apakah yang membelakangi partai sekuler untuk mengusulkan kebijakan yang bertolak belakang dengan landasan partai. Salah satu faktor yang diduga melandasi

hal ini ialah keinginan partai sekuler untuk merengkuh lebih banyak suara dari kalangan religius dan dari sisi Golkar sendiri, membalas kekalahan dari PDI-P yang telah menggagalkan prestasi konsisten Golkar selama era kekuasaan Soeharto. Bila hipotesis ini benar, dapat dipastikan bahwa provinsi yang menerapkan perda syariah akan menjadi lumbung suara bagi partai sekuler seperti Golkar.

Untuk mengetahui dampak inisiatif perda agama oleh partai sekuler terhadap dukungan kepada Golkar, Penulis menggunakan survey pemilu tahun 2004 yang diperoleh dari proyek kompilasi pemilu global yang dijalankan oleh the Mershon Center for International Security Studies, Universitas Ohio Amerika Serikat. Survey ini dipilih karena kebijakan perda agama mulai bergulir dan jumlahnya mencapai posisi tertinggi pada tahun 2003, setahun sebelum pemilu legislatif digelar. Selain itu, hasil survey dari dua pemilu terakhir, yakni 2009 dan 2014 belum dapat diakses oleh publik. Dengan menggunakan teknik kuantitatif, Penulis juga menggunakan model statistik: regresi logit dan probit dengan variabel binari sebagai variabel dependennya.

## Hasil

Melalui program *stata*, hasil regresi logit dan probit menunjukkan bahwa pemilih yang berdomisili di area yang menerapkan perda syariah memiliki kecenderungan untuk memilih Golkar. Hasil tersebut konsisten, bahkan ketika model lain diujicobakan, termasuk melibatkan variabel kontrol ke dalam model. Koefisien 'tinggal di provinsi dengan perda agama' memperoleh nilai  $p$  di bawah 0.01 yang menunjukkan bahwa hasil uji hipotesis sangat signifikan.

## Kesimpulan dan Saran

Dari hasil yang diperoleh, sangatlah jelas bahwa memperkenalkan perda agama berdampak positif terhadap jumlah suara partai sekuler pada pemilu legislatif pada tahun 2004. Meskipun memperoleh hasil yang signifikan dan konsisten, untuk perkembangan selanjutnya, variabel dan pertanyaan survey perlu ditambah, terutama untuk mengontrol variabel penting lain yang belum terindikasi dengan baik dari model yang ditunjukkan dalam tesis ini.





---

## **Beyond Rhetoric: Examination of The Feasible and Realistic ASEAN Political-Security Community**

## **Melampaui Retorika: Pemeriksaan Komunitas Politik-Keamanan ASEAN yang Layak dan Realistis**

---

Nama : Reza Reflusmen Junior  
NIP : 198312062008011004  
Instansi : KEMENLU  
Tahun Intake : 2011  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : MA in Politics and Security  
Negara Studi : Britania Raya  
Universitas : University of Bradford

## ABSTRACT

This dissertation will put focus on the Association of Southeast Asian Nations' (ASEAN) policy of building an ASEAN Political-Security Community (APSC) in 2015. Basis of this dissertation comes from the lively dynamic of the ASEAN's policy for political-security development. The APSC is one part of the three pillars in ASEAN community building, grounded on the ASEAN Charter as the legal basis. The community building has been a topic of discussion among ASEAN Leaders in every summit meeting since 2009. This shows how crucial the community building issues among ASEAN countries

The ASEAN policy in creating a political-security community considered as a reflection of the changes in the internal situation of its member. This dissertation will try to provide a critical examination of ASEAN political-security community undertaking; followed by a relatively detailed examination and assessment of progress in some selected issues areas which are representative of key dimension of developing a political security community; followed by an assessment of the process so far, and its prospects for the future.

This dissertation concludes with the findings, that the APSC policy is relevant in order for ASEAN to adapt with the changing dynamics in political and security in the world, in the region, and in domestic situation of respective ASEAN Member Countries. It is also important for ASEAN to increase greater involvement of the community in the decision making process, in addition to the need of greater commitment from each member countries to the realization of the policy.

Keywords: ASEAN, ASEAN Community, ASEAN Political-Security Community, APSC, ASEAN Charter, APSC Blueprint, Bali Concord II, Treaty of Amity and Cooperation (TAC), Southeast Asia, Indonesia, human rights, terrorism, counterterrorism, democracy, ASEAN Summit

## ABSTRAK

Disertasi ini akan memusatkan perhatian pada kebijakan Asosiasi ASEAN untuk membangun Komunitas Keamanan Politik ASEAN (APSC) pada tahun 2015. Dasar disertasi ini berasal dari dinamika dinamis kebijakan ASEAN untuk pengembangan keamanan politik. APSC adalah satu dari tiga pilar dalam pembangunan komunitas ASEAN, yang didasarkan pada Piagam ASEAN sebagai dasar hukum. Pembangunan masyarakat telah menjadi topik diskusi di antara para Pemimpin ASEAN di setiap pertemuan puncak sejak tahun 2009. Ini menunjukkan betapa pentingnya isu pembangunan masyarakat di antara negara-negara ASEAN. Kebijakan ASEAN dalam menciptakan sebuah komunitas keamanan politik dianggap sebagai cerminan dari perubahan situasi internal anggotanya. Disertasi ini akan mencoba memberikan kajian kritis terhadap usaha keamanan politik ASEAN; diikuti dengan pemeriksaan dan penilaian yang relatif rinci mengenai kemajuan di beberapa bidang isu terpilih yang merupakan dimensi kunci pengembangan komunitas keamanan politik; diikuti dengan penilaian proses sejauh ini, dan prospeknya untuk masa depan. Disertasi ini diakhiri dengan temuan, bahwa kebijakan APSC relevan agar ASEAN dapat menyesuaikan diri dengan dinamika perubahan politik dan keamanan di dunia, di wilayah ini, dan situasi domestik masing-masing Negara Anggota ASEAN. Penting juga bagi ASEAN untuk meningkatkan keterlibatan masyarakat yang lebih besar dalam proses pengambilan keputusan, selain kebutuhan komitmen yang lebih besar dari setiap negara anggota terhadap realisasi kebijakan tersebut.

Kata kunci: ASEAN, ASEAN Community, ASEAN Political-Security Community, APSC, ASEAN Charter, APSC Blueprint, Bali Concord II, Treaty of Amity and Cooperation (TAC), Southeast Asia, Indonesia, human rights, terrorism, counterterrorism, democracy, ASEAN Summit

## Introduction

The Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN), the sole example of the regional grouping in the Southeast Asian region, is a comprehensive nation-state cooperation consisting of ten member states. It initially comprised of five member states: Indonesia, Malaysia, the Philippines, Singapore, and Thailand, when it was declared in Bangkok, Thailand, 8 August 1967. Now ASEAN also includes Brunei Darussalam, Vietnam, Lao PDR, Myanmar, and Cambodia as the latest member. ASEAN once aimed to consolidate the original five members to build and strengthen the resilience from external influence. Now, after 40 years in existence, the ASEAN is commanding itself to build a people-oriented organization. The intention was declared to reach one community goal in terms of politics, security, economy, and socio-cultural.

The ASEAN community aspiration was formally announced in Bali, Indonesia, in 2003, under the Declaration of ASEAN Concord II, also known as Bali Concord II. This event was historic in ASEAN existence as it turned out to be a starting point for the association to achieve future integration (Xinhua, 2003). The ASEAN community goals design is within three pillars: ASEAN Security Community (later on formed as ASEAN Political-Security Community), ASEAN Economic Community, and ASEAN Socio-Cultural Community. The basic elements of the communities within these three pillars, respectively, are:

1. To create a community that exclusively resides on the peaceful settlement of disputes, uses a comprehensive security approach, comprising national and regional resilience.
2. To establish both a single market and single production base by 2020, with strategy in achieving the economic community with two fundamental approaches which are grouping integration and enhancing economic competitiveness.
3. To carry out joint measures to improve human resources development, reduce unemployment, cope with environmental destruction, and tackle communicable diseases such as HIV/AIDS and SARS (Xinhua, 2003).

## **ASEAN Political-Security Community**

This dissertation will put focus on the Association of Southeast Asian Nations' (ASEAN) policy of building an ASEAN Political-Security Community (APSC) in 2015. The basis of this dissertation comes from the lively dynamic of the ASEAN's policy for political-security development. There is also a purpose to investigate a unique political-community in ASEAN since author found shortage of literature that discuss the political and security community in one single term. The main objective of this policy is to establish a sustainable peace and justice in the Southeast Asian region (MFA Indonesia, 2010, p. 20).

The seriousness of ASEAN to create a political-security community was written in a more detailed action plan. In 2004, they agreed on a Vientiane Action Programme (VAP), a six-year plan that builds up for the realization of the ASEAN community and also a follow-up program from the Declaration of ASEAN Concord II (Xinhua, 2003). The security community as embodied in the VAP is a statement of an aspiration by ASEAN countries to achieve peace, stability, democracy, prosperity in the region, in order for them to achieve peace with one another and with the world at large. APSC subscribes to the principles of comprehensive security, which acknowledges the strong interdependencies of the political, economic and social life of the region.

The political-security commitments were crystallized under a blueprint that spells out the technical activity that needs to be undertaken in order to achieve the community goals. The ASEAN Political-Security Community Blueprints are said to be the guideline of the member states in order to achieve the political-security community goals. The blueprint consists of 14 priority areas such as, promotion and protection of human rights, dispute settlement mechanism, cooperation on the Treaty of Amity and Cooperation, disaster management and emergency response, cooperation to tackle non-traditional security issues, strengthening ASEAN centrality in regional cooperation and community building, promoting regional cooperation to maintain peace and stability. It also includes mechanisms of implementation, financial resource mobilization, communication plans for national and regional level, and review mechanisms (Secretariat, 2012).

In achieving the end goals, some concrete steps have already been taken by ASEAN. On the promotion of human rights, in 2009, ASEAN established the

ASEAN Inter-Governmental Commission on Human Rights (AICHR) and they also concluded the Declaration on the Conduct of Parties in South China Sea which was negotiated with China from 2002. In addition, the establishment of the ASEAN Maritime Forum and bold initiative of Indonesia in 2011 as ASEAN Chair in finding resolution to Thailand-Cambodia dispute proves that some community sense is under formation (Nguyen, 2011).

However, with a number of examples above, is a political-security community a realistic and feasible policy to undertake when ASEAN is still mixed with several internal disputes among the member states? Would that (the political-security community) be another of the ASEAN's 'rhetoric' or it could be executed and implemented?

## **ASEAN Political-Security Community: A Thorough Response to the Crisis**

The emphasis on political-security community in this dissertation is grounded on the change of posture adopted by ASEAN after the Asian deep crisis in the mid-1990s. There was a restoration of vision of ASEAN after a bunch of debacles among regional leaders, pointing fingers to their compatriots for 'poisoning' the spirit of ASEAN. The examples of these were the relations between Indonesia and Singapore and Singapore and Malaysia, among others. Indonesia's President B.J. Habibie once acknowledged Singapore as 'a little red dot on the map' as a response to Singapore's Senior Minister Lee Kuan Yew, who feels that Habibie's appointment disturbed the financial markets. The economic crisis undoubtedly exacerbated the tensions within these neighboring ASEAN countries, and has introduced an element of uncertainty as to whether they can be resolved amicably (Ahmad and Ghoshal, 1999, pp. 763-764). The Asian crisis had become an impetus, a turning point, when the people and leaders of the Asia-Pacific countries were nudged into soul-searching. This era, as emphasized by Manea (2009), was an era of re-orientation. In relation to this, the reorientation impacted the movement of ASEAN. The Bali Concord II and the VAP marked these turning points and transformed the language of ASEAN from a self-defined 'concert of nations' (ASEAN Visions 2020).

There was also a reinforcing movement as a response to the crisis. The assertive middle-class demands for increased participation in economic and

political decision-making. They also crave for more humane governance, not only through transparency and accountability of the regimes in power, but also better communication between the state and the people. The sense of openness in society, with the most apparent feature particularly in Indonesia, authors argue, has strongly reflected in the ASEAN's arena. As Weatherbee (2005) and He (2008) argue, the 9<sup>th</sup> ASEAN Summit in 2003 marked the active comeback of Indonesia to the regional debates. Indonesia was motivated to re-claim a leading role in shaping the region's future as a reassertion of Indonesian primacy in Southeast Asia after the breakdown of Suharto's regime (Manea, 2009, p. 40). Therefore, putting the context of Indonesian reform (*reformasi*) in ASEAN spheres has been the basic premise to build political-security coherence ASEAN even though the inclusion of political community and security community into a political-security community worth to be questioned.

To assess the course taken by ASEAN in their policy of creating a political-security community, this dissertation will employ a vast amount of literature that specifies its subject as the ASEAN political-security discourse. There are robust academic literatures that give details about it. Henderson (1999) has summarized the interplay of the opportunities and challenges that ASEAN faces as well as how it altered the balance of power in the Cold War period. Alagappa (ed, 1998) explained how individual Southeast Asian countries' internal politics and security influenced the construction of politics and security in ASEAN. Later, Acharya (2001) draws the line of the history of the ASEAN Way and how it defines a so called 'security community' in ASEAN.

Another follow up to that debate by contemporary scholars on ASEAN embarks another substantive discussion on the ASEAN security, arguing that the security community could only be achieved if ASEAN takes into account the perceptions of the community or the people (Collins, 2007). Collins (2007) sees that in order to achieve its community goal, ASEAN should be able to absorb the view of the 'people', the community itself, by giving a proper leeway for them to express their minds to foster political-security development (Collins, 2003, p. 223).

After taking closer examination based on the critical argument in the literature, then it is noteworthy to familiarize what was or what is going on in the recent dynamic in ASEAN. To be able to give the current features of the ASEAN's



work, some information will be added from a range of sources. This dissertation will touch on the involvement of the ASEAN Chair in the Thai-Cambodia dispute and Myanmar issue, the conclusion and further discussion on the South China Sea, as well as the ASEAN effort after Nargis cyclone in Myanmar. With explanations on the recent undertaking, then it would help to assess progress toward a political-security community.

## **The APSC Blueprint: The Elements And Its Respective Progress**

The APSC Blueprint was formally entered ASEAN lexicon in the 14<sup>th</sup> ASEAN Summit, February 2009 in Cha-am Hua Hin, Thailand. Under the term “Cha-am Hua Hin Declaration on the Roadmap for the ASEAN Community (2009-2015).” ASEAN leaders tasked relevant ASEAN sectoral bodies and the Secretary-General to implement the APSC Blueprint, and, subsequently, report it regularly (ASEANSEC, 2009). The APSC Blueprint consists of three parts: (i) Introduction, (ii) Characteristics and Elements of the APSC, and (iii) Implementation and Review Mechanism. The core of the APSC lies on the second part: characteristics and elements of the APSC. According to the blueprint, these characteristics and elements are inter-related and mutually reinforcing. It also shall be pursued in a balanced and consistent manner. To effectively realize the APSC, the blueprint stated as an action-oriented document with a view to achieving results and recognizes the capacity and capability of the ASEAN member to undertake action stipulated (Secretariat, 2012, p. 6). Based on ASEAN Secretariat Information Paper released on the 26 March 2012, there are 14 elements / priority areas within the APSC Blueprint. Author will briefly explain each element / priority area as well as its progresses.

1. ASEAN Human Rights Body
2. Dispute settlement mechanism
3. Guidelines on the accession to the Treaty of Amity and Cooperation (TAC) and efforts to get EU/EC and the US to accede to the TAC
4. Strengthening regional disaster management arrangements
5. Enhanced cooperation to fight human trafficking and people-smuggling
6. Establishing ASEAN Fisheries Consultative Forum to combat illegal, unregulated and unreported fishing

7. Enhancing interaction between defense agencies and CSOs in combating non-traditional security issues
8. Development of forward-looking ARF Vision Statement to enhance relevance of ARF that remains ASEAN-driven
9. Contributions of ASEAN Member States to peacekeeping operations
10. Enhance cooperation on SEANFWZ including on getting nuclear weapon states to accede to SEANWFZ Protocol
11. Development of rules of procedure, communication plan and matrix of focal points of sectoral bodies under APSC to coordinate implementation of Blueprint
12. Narrowing the development gap to support the CLMV in the process of building the APSC
13. Implementation of the Declaration on the Conduct of Parties in the South China Sea (DOC)
14. Promote inter-faith and inter civilization dialogues

## **Conclusion**

APSC, supported by ASEAN Charter, has garnered all ASEAN previous commitment and grappled all ASEAN member countries to support its full implementation. APSC has succeeded in putting several 'untouchables' issues in ASEAN history such as democracy, human rights, and border, in paper. The striking feature was that APSC could hold the commitment of implementation from each ASEAN member states. However, whether APSC would last only in rhetoric or would go on to full execution and implementation is questionable. Therefore the question becomes the research question in this dissertation.

In conclusion, the research in this dissertation demonstrates that APSC policy is needed by ASEAN as a response to the changing dynamics. Setting 2015 as APSC ultimate goal in implementation functions was aimed to keep all member countries stay in track. Ideally, with implementing all points in the blueprints, ASEAN should able to fulfill its declared goals. It is evidenced that APSC is not rhetoric as there are many examples of how it implemented. Each member countries has tasked its relevant bodies to support and work on the issues under the APSC policy. However, ASEAN is facing problem in full implementation. Several factors that contribute to this are: the reliance

of external funding to implement the action lines, the lack of capable human resource, incoherence of the action lines with member states domestic target, limited participation from the civil society, among others.

However, these arising problems may be tackle as long as all ASEAN government giving its full commitment and attract involvement from the public for its implementation. Greater people involvement encourages community formation because it creates plurality in decision making, a precondition to achieve a political-security community. Therefore, to examine the realistic and feasibility of the APSC policy, ASEAN required stronger cohesion and, based on author personal assessment, full commitment of each member states for the realization. It was evidence that current ASEAN is working hard to maintain its relevance in the region and responsive to regional issues. However, with the growing number of issue that need to be resolved, the goals to achieve a political-security community in 2015 will occur over the course of many decades.

---

## **Political Dynasty: an Anomaly of Democracy in Post-Suharto Regime in Indonesia**

## **Dinasti Politik: Sebuah Anomali Demokrasi Rezim Pasca-Suharto di Indonesia**

---

Nama : Teguh Ilham  
NIP : 198909302010101002  
Instansi : KEMENDAGRI  
Tahun Intake : 2014  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : MA Political Science  
Negara Studi : Poland  
Universitas : University of Warsaw

Pilkada langsung sebagai bagian dari proses demokrasi dan desentralisasi di Indonesia, sayangnya, telah memicu munculnya oligarki lokal di beberapa daerah. Fenomena ini pada gilirannya merusak apa yang sebenarnya ingin dicapai oleh demokrasi itu sendiri, yaitu distribusi kekuasaan dan kesempatan yang adil bagi masyarakat untuk berpartisipasi dalam politik. Hingga saat ini, fenomena dinasti politik masih menjadi perdebatan yang menarik, apakah ia sejalan dengan demokrasi karena tampil dalam panggung politik adalah hak setiap orang ataukah dianggap bertentangan karena dominasi politik oleh satu atau beberapa keluarga secara tidak langsung menghambat kesempatan bagi warga negara lain untuk berpartisipasi dalam pemilihan.

Tak dapat disangkal, terdapat beberapa politisi terkemuka dan populer di dunia yang berasal dari keluarga dinasti politik. Beberapa dari mereka adalah Aung San Suu Kyi, pemenang Hadiah Nobel dari Myanmar. Dia merupakan seorang putri bungsu pemimpin Aung San yang berusaha gerakan untuk membangun demokrasi di negaranya. Di Kanada ada Justin Trudeau, anak tertua dari mantan Perdana Menteri Pierre Trudeau, yang terpilih sebagai Perdana Menteri pada usia yang relatif muda. Walaupun beberapa contoh politisi yang berasal dari keluarga dinasti politik tersebut mempunyai rekam jejak yang bagus, namun yang perhatian utama dari pembatasan dinasti politik adalah potensi penyalahgunaan kekuasaan karena dominasi keluarga dalam politik seperti apa yang terjadi pada dinasti Bhutto di mana tiga presiden yang berasal pada dinasti tersebut tersangkut skandal korupsi besar-besaran dan penyalahgunaan kekuasaan.

Di Indonesia, perdebatan mengenai dinasti politik sangat dinamis. Undang-Undang Nomor 12 Tahun 2015 sebagai landasan terhadap pencegahan munculnya dinasti politik akhirnya menjadi batal demi hukum setelah penggugat yang berasal dari keluarga dinasti politik yang merasa dirugikan akan adanya undang-undang ini mengajukan *judicial review* ke Mahkamah Konstitusi. Akibatnya, pemerintah sebagai konseptor undang-undang ini gagal meyakinkan hakim mengenai kebutuhan untuk membatasi keluarga dinasti. Para hakim menerima argumen penggugat bahwa ketentuan tersebut berpotensi melanggar prinsip kebebasan dasar dan hak asasi manusia untuk semua warga negara untuk mengambil bagian dalam pemerintahan - seperti yang dinyatakan dalam konstitusi Indonesia. Mereka menolak argumen

pemerintah yang berpendapat bahwa keberadaan politik berbasis kekerabatan melanggar kesetaraan dan menutup kandidat nondinasti politik yang potensial untuk berpartisipasi dalam politik lokal karena dominasi beberapa dinasti politik akan sumber daya, baik finansial ataupun jaringan.

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk meneliti masalah munculnya dinasti politik lokal setelah jatuhnya Suharto rezim otoriter di Indonesia. Hasil diskusi menunjukkan bahwa ada tiga faktor utama yang memfasilitasi munculnya beberapa keluarga untuk mendominasi politik lokal di beberapa daerah yaitu lemah institusionalisme pihak (supply side), yang permisif dari pemilih (sisi permintaan), dan masalah dengan aturan dan hukum (sisi regulasi). Pada akhirnya, penelitian ini menunjukkan bahwa ukuran langsung yang harus memperhitungkan adalah optimasi peran pemerintah sebagai regulator untuk meminimalkan kerentanan pelanggaran pemilu yang biasanya dilakukan oleh pemain lama untuk mengabadikan dinasti mereka. Penguatan institusionalisme pihak, terutama melanggar sistem oligarki pencalonan nominasi yang cenderung mendukung orang kaya, calon dinasti tanpa mempertimbangkan track record mereka, sayangnya, menderita kemunduran setelah pembatalan undang-undang anti-dinasti oleh Mahkamah Konstitusi (MK). Selain itu, mendidik para pemilih akan lebih menjanjikan bagi kesehatan demokrasi itu sendiri meskipun akan memakan proses yang panjang dan sulit.

## **Runtuhnya Rejim Otoriter Suharto**

Berakhirnya rejim Otoriter Suharto yang telah berkuasa selama kurang lebih tiga dekade tidak serta merta membawa Indonesia menjadi negara yang benar-benar demokratis. Proses yang dibutuhkan oleh Indonesia untuk benar-benar menjadi negara dengan demokrasi yang terkonsolidasi cukup panjang. Ikrar Nusa Bhakti membagi fase-fase proses demokratisasi tersebut menjadi empat fase, yaitu *pre-transition*, *liberalization*, *democratic transition*, dan *democratic consolidation*.

Fase *pre-transition* ditandai dengan krisis moneter yang melanda Indonesia pada tahun 1997. Hal ini menimbulkan protes dari mahasiswa dan menuntut diakhirinya rejim korup Orde Baru. Mereka menuntut munculnya pemerintahan yang transparan dan akuntabel yang berdasarkan nilai-nilai demokrasi dan keadilan. Namun demonstrasi tersebut direspon pemerintah

dengan penculikan dan penghilangan aktivis mahasiswa. Tindakan pemerintah ini kemudian memancing protes yang lebih besar hingga ke kota-kota lain di Indonesia. Kekacauan akhirnya berakhir dengan mundurnya Suharto sebagai presiden dan menunjuk BJ. Habibie sebagai penggantinya. Dilantiknya BJ. Habibie sebagai presiden merupakan awal fase *political liberation* yang ditandai dengan dijamin nya kebebasan berpendapat, diselenggarakannya pemilu yang bebas dan adil, dan pemberian hak-hak yang lebih besar kepada daerah-daerah untuk mengelola pemerintahannya sendiri melalui desentralisasi. Proses selanjutnya, yaitu fase *democratic transition* tidak berjalan dengan cukup stabil karena banyak elit yang menganggap bahwa Habibie merupakan bagian dari kroni Suharto sehingga menurunkan tingkat kepercayaan mereka. Saat ini Indonesia masih berada pada fase ini karena belum stabilnya demokrasi Indonesia.

Runtuhnya rezim Orde Baru Suharto dan dimulainya Reformasi membawa angin segar kepada masyarakat Indonesia, terutama mereka yang berada di daerah. Hal ini karena berubahnya konfigurasi pemerintahan yang sebelumnya bersifat Jakarta sentris sekarang bergeser menjadi daerah sentris. Dengan adanya kebijakan desentralisasi dan otonomi daerah, pemerintah daerah mempunyai kewenangan yang lebih besar dalam mengelola daerahnya, baik dari segi administrasi, keuangan, dan politik.

Banyak perubahan yang dibawa oleh proses desentralisasi ini, salah satunya mekanisme pemilihan kepala daerah yang semula para kepala daerah merupakan orang-orang pusat semenjak tahun 1999 mereka dipilih secara demokratis melalui lembaga DPRD, dan terus berkembang hingga tahun 2005 mereka pada akhirnya dipilih secara langsung oleh rakyat. Desentralisasi terlihat sebagai suatu keajaiban demokrasi bagi rakyat Indonesia, khususnya bagi mereka yang jauh dari Jakarta. Meskipun desentralisasi telah membuka kesempatan yang lebih besar bagi mereka untuk secara aktif berpartisipasi dalam politik, namun ia tidak terlepas dari berbagai potensi negatif yang dibawanya, yaitu munculnya 'orang kuat' daerah yang menjelma menjadi pemimpin politik dan mengkondisikan daerahnya dengan segala kelebihan sumber daya yang mereka miliki agar kerabatnya dapat terpilih sebagai suksesor ataupun terpilih pada posisi politis lain. Fenomena inilah yang kemudian menjadi dilema dalam sistem politik Indonesia, di suatu sisi mereka terpilih melalui pemilihan langsung

yang sah, di sisi lain keterpilihan mereka seringkali semata-mata karena kemampuan sumber daya yang mereka punyai, terutama kemampuan finansial sehingga calon lain yang lebih kapabel susah untuk terpilih.

Langgengnya fenomena dinasti politik di Indonesia tidak terlepas dari berbagi faktor yang kerap terjadi, di antaranya pilkada berbiaya mahal dan penguasaan elit lokal dan desentralisasi korupsi. Mahalnya biaya pilkada langsung meliputi biaya yang harus dikeluarkan oleh pemerintah sebagai penyelenggara pemilu ataupun biaya yang harus dikeluarkan oleh kandidat untuk 'sewa perahu' dan keperluan kampanye. Di beberapa kota besar, seperti Surabaya pemerintah mengeluarkan biaya sekitar 71 miliar pada pilkada 2015 lalu, sedangkan biaya yang dikeluarkan untuk pilkada Jawa Timur bisa jauh lebih banyak. Biaya yang dikeluarkan oleh para kandidat juga tidak kalah fantastis. Agar bisa dinominasikan dalam pencalonan, mereka harus membayar uang 'sewa perahu' kepada partai politik yang akan mengusung. Hal ini sudah menjadi rahasia umum walaupun secara normatif, perbuatan ini dilarang. Biaya yang dikeluarkan oleh kandidat akan jauh lebih besar jika mereka menggunakan jasa *political marketing*. Mereka menyewa jasa konsultan politik untuk mengatur strategi bagaimana memenangkan pilkada. Biayanya juga sangat besar, berkisar antara 100 juta hingga puluhan miliar rupiah.

Selain itu, mahalnya biaya pilkada terutama yang dikeluarkan oleh kandidat juga mempunyai keterkaitan dengan potensi negatif lain dari pilkada, yaitu munculnya dominasi elit lokal terhadap politik. Mereka, kelompok elit ini adalah 'orang kuat' di daerah yang memegang kendali ekonomi, keamanan, dan politik. Penguasaan elit tertentu atau *elite capture* sangat berbahaya. Menurut Mokherjee, ada tiga ancaman serius yang dibawanya. Pertama, ancaman korupsi, dimana para elit lokal dan kelompok-kelompok dinasti tersebut menggunakan alokasi dana dari pemerintah pusat untuk kepentingan pribadi mereka demi memperkaya diri untuk melanggengkan kekuasaan keluarga. Lebih lanjut Prud'homme dalam penelitiannya di Eropa Timur menemukan bahwa desentralisasi dapat mempermudah terjadinya korupsi, dan usaha untuk memberantasnya lebih sulit dilakukan pada pemerintahan yang terdesentralisir. Kedua, alokasi dana yang tidak efisien dan tepat sasaran, dimana kebanyakan program dan kebijakan dari pemerintah lokal cenderung untuk kepentingan pelanggengan dinasti politik daripada untuk kepentingan publik. Terakhir, dinasti



politik menghasilkan institusi yang lemah dan buruk. Putnam berpendapat bahwa dinasti politik menghasilkan patalogi birokrasi seperti patronase atau favoritisme, kroniisme, dan nepotisme. Semua ancaman-ancaman tersebut akan menyebabkan kegagalan dalam menciptakan pemerintahan yang baik (*good governance*) sebagai tujuan utama dari desentralisasi itu sendiri.

## **Munculnya Dinasti Politik di Indonesia**

Munculnya dinasti politik di Indonesia tidak terlepas dari sejarah panjang munculnya orang-orang kuat daerah (*local strongmen*). Mereka pada awalnya merupakan elit-elit di daerah yang mempunyai koneksi dengan rejim Orde Baru. Runtuhnya rejim otoriter Orde Baru tidak serta merta membuat mereka lenyap. Akan tetapi mereka mampu untuk menyesuaikan dengan sistem demokrasi dengan cara mengikuti prosedur pemilihan umum. Secara umum, para *local strongmen* ini berasal dari dua asal yang berbeda, berakar dari masyarakat (*rooted in society*) dan berakar dari negara (*rooted in the state*). Terdapat dua contoh dinasti politik sebagai representasi sempurna dari kedua jenis asal dinasti tersebut, yaitu Dinasti Ratu Atut Choisyah (Atut) di Banten bagi jenis yang pertama dan Dinasti Yasin Limpo di Sulawesi Selatan bagi jenis yang kedua.

Dinasti Atut di Banten berasal dari ayahnya, Haji Chasan Sochib, seorang *local strongman* yang memulai bisnis nya di Banten pada tahun 1960's. Perusahaan nya mensuplai logistik untuk Kodam VI Siliwangi. Karena kemampuan nya dalam membangun relasi, dia mendapatkan banyak keuntungan, salah satu nya mendapatkan banyak proyek-proyek besar. Di Banten, Chasan Sochib tidak hanya terkemuka dalam aspek ekonomi, tapi dia juga mempunyai posisi yang kuat di tengah-tengah masyarakat. Dengan begitu dia mampu untuk mengontrol kelompok-kelompok masyarakat, salah satunya kelompok keagamaan yang mempunyai pengaruh yang kuat di sana.

Dengan pengaruh nya yang kuat itu lah hingga pada akhirnya dia membentuk dinasti politik keluarga nya di Banten. Usaha nya kemudian berhasil menempatkan putri nya, Ratu Atut sebagai wakil gubernur Banten yang pertama pada tahun 2002 mendampingi Djoko Munandar. Ratu Atut tiga tahun kemudian menjadi gubernur setelah Djoko terjerat kasus korupsi. Pada pilkada selanjutnya Atut kembali ikut pilkada dan memenangi pemilihan. Sejak saat itu berbagai anggota keluarga nya satu persatu mulai tampil dalam pilkada

di Banten. Setidaknya hingga saat ini ada 13 anggota keluarga Ratu Atut yang telah berhasil memenangi pilkada. Selain Dinasti Ratu Atut, terdapat juga beberapa dinasti lain yang juga yang berasal dari masyarakat, seperti Teras Narang di Kalimantan Tengah, dan Zulkifli Nurdin di Jambi.

Selain berakar dari masyarakat, terdapat juga dinasti yang berasal dari negara dengan salah satu contoh dinasti yang terkuat adalah Dinasti Yasin Limpo di Sulawesi Selatan. Berbeda dengan dinasti Atut, dinasti ini berasal dari pegawai pemerintah yang mentransformasikan diri mereka menjadi elit lokal. Munculnya dinasti Yasin Limpo di Sulawesi Selatan tidak dapat dipisahkan dari pengaruh Bapak nya, Muh. Yasin Limpo yang merupakan seorang aristocrat lokal yang berkarir sebagai tantara. Latar belakang militer Muh. Yasin Limpo sangat membantu karir nya dalam pemerintahan. Fasilitas-fasilitas yang diterima nya ini sangat membantu nya untuk memulai membangun dinasti politik di Sulsel sehingga sampai saat ini ia telah berhasil menempatkan 13 anggota keluarganya dalam berbagai posisi politis di Sulsel. Selain dinasti Limpo, terdapat juga berbagai dinasti lain juga juga tumbuh dari institusi negara, seperti dinasti Sjachroedin di Lampung yang merupakan pensiunan polisi, dan dinasti Irianto M.S Syafiuddin di Indramayu yang merupakan anak dari seorang pahlawan.

Munculnya dinasti politik di Indonesia dapat dijelaskan dengan beberapa situasi yang berkontribusi terhadap mendominasi nya beberapa keluarga yang menempati jabatan politik di satu wilayah. Salah satu factor nya adalah kegagalan partai politik untuk menawarkan calon alternatif yang memiliki integritas, pengetahuan, dan pengalaman kepada para pemilih. Masalah ini ditemukan di sebuah partai politik dengan institusionalisme partai lemah. Di sisi lain, kondisi pemilih yang masih permisif yang memiliki kecenderungan untuk mentoleransi politik uang dalam pemilu dan keberadaan dinasti politik sebagai hal yang normal juga merupakan faktor yang mendukung tumbuh suburnya dinasti politik.

Proses membentuk sebuah dinasti politik bukan lah suatu proses yang singkat. Berkembangnya jaringan kekerabatan dalam politik dimulai sejak pendahulu memenangi pemilihan. Pada langkah pertama, politisi memperkuat fondasi dinasti mereka dengan melakukan berbagai macam manipulasi, seperti politisasi birokrasi, menempatkan anggota keluarga pada posisi strategis pada

organisasi kemasyarakatan, dan politik gentong babi (*pork barrel politics*). Mereka juga akan berusaha mengumpulkan kekayaan baik dengan cara yang legal maupun illegal agar calon penerus dinasti politik bisa mudah untuk memperoleh kekuasaan. Langkah selanjutnya dimulai ketika para kerabat yang akan diproyeksikan sebagai suksesor politik mulai diperkenalkan kepada publik. Mereka biasanya dipromosikan dengan cara menempatkan mereka sebagai pimpinan pada organisasi-organisasi kemasyarakatan. Secara tidak langsung hal ini akan membuat masyarakat mulai mengenali mereka.

## **Memberantas Dinasti Politik di Indonesia**

Meskipun beberapa negara sukses dalam melewati hukum anti-dinasti dalam derajat yang berbeda, upaya pelarangan di Indonesia cukup menantang. Undang-Undang Nomor 8 tahun 2015 tentang Pilkada untuk membatasi keluarga dinasti untuk mencalonkan diri dalam pemilihan yang disahkan pada 2013 telah membawa angin segar sebelum pada akhir penggugat menantang ketentuan ini ke Mahkamah Konstitusi dan Hakim menemukan bahwa undang-undang anti dinasti politik ini bertentangan dengan Konstitusi. Salah satu alasan kekalahan pemerintah dalam pengadilan adalah kegagalan terdakwa untuk meyakinkan pengadilan dengan argumen yang kuat.

Meskipun Mahkamah Konstitusi melalui putusannya No. 11-17 / PUU / 2013 telah memungkinkan kembali para kerabat dari keluarga dinasti untuk mencalonkan diri dalam pilkada, masih ada beberapa langkah-langkah alternatif yang dapat dicari untuk mengimbangi hukum yang tidak berpihak dalam membatasi ruang bagi politik dinasti. Pertama, mengubah *demand-side* (pemilih) sehingga mereka tahu dan memiliki kemauan untuk memilih calon yang memenuhi kriteria integritas. Kedua, mendorong *supply-side* (partai politik) sebagai gerbang untuk mendapatkan tiket konstitusional untuk mengusulkan calon yang ideal dalam pemilu. Terakhir, mendesak *regulatory-side* (pemerintah) untuk memastikan semua pihak mematuhi semua peraturan dan meminimalkan penipuan pemilu.

---

**Leaving the Bridge, Passing the Shelters:  
Understanding Homeless Activism through  
the Utilization of Spaces within the Central  
Public Library and the IUPUI Library in  
Indianapolis**

**Meninggalkan Jembatan, Melewati  
Tempat Perlindungan: Memahami  
Aktivisme Tunawisma melalui  
Pemanfaatan Ruang di Dalam  
Perpustakaan Publik dan Perpustakaan  
Universitas di Indianapolis**

---

Nama : Karim  
NIP : 198206012008031001  
Instansi : BAPPENAS  
Tahun Intake : 2012  
Tingkat Beasiswa : Master Overseas  
Program Studi : Applied Anthropology  
Negara Studi : Amerika Serikat  
Universitas : Indiana University-Purdue University  
Indianapolis

The IUPUI campus is located very close to the downtown area, and some homeless people often use its facilities in the IUPUI Library and the Campus Center. This enabled me to conduct observations of the homeless frequently. The term 'downtown' became a new vocabulary word that I had almost never used in my daily life before I came to the United States as a graduate student. Downtown Indianapolis, the heart of the State of Indiana, has its own uniqueness including a diversity of attractive sites, museums, and restaurants well beyond my expectations. Based on the website *Livability.com* (2011), Indianapolis has one of the best downtowns in the United States as indicated by an interesting quote which reads "the city that will give you the big-city experience minus the actual big city". Unlike New York City, Chicago, or Washington DC, three other cities I have visited, which are all characterized by a fast rhythm of life, large crowds, and a very high cost of living, Indianapolis offers a cheaper cost of living and a relatively comfortable and quiet urban experience, including amazing bike routes created by the Indianapolis' recently constructed and privately funded Cultural Trail System.

### **A Turning Point: The Eviction of the Irish Hill Homeless Camp**

The Irish Hill homeless camp, once the biggest campsite in Indianapolis, was located around the area under the CSX railroad tracks at the corner of South Davidson and East Maryland Streets. Once "home" to 67 people, city officials evicted the residents in late summer of 2013. On a morning at the beginning of April, 2014, more than six months after the eviction as temperatures outside were getting warmer, I visited the site to see if there were any new developments or renovations of the railroad bridges that had been done, as those were the reasons that had been given to justify forcing the homeless out of the camp. What I saw there was nothing except fresh human feces, vodka and other alcohol bottles, plastic bags, and personal belongings scattered on some spots outside the fenced area of the two street bridges. Some homeless people still have a sense of belonging to their former "home" and still use that area as a place to stay during the night. Looking into the history of the place suggests that this is not surprising because the site apparently has a long association with homeless people.

I have not been able to trace where the name of Irish Hill came from and who the first residents of the camp were. However, a YouTube video entitled *A History of Irish Hill*, uploaded by "indystpatsvideos" in March 3, 2011, asserts

that Irish Hill is the name of the neighborhood. Moreover, based on records from the Indianapolis Historic Preservation Commission, Steve Campbell (2011) notes that the history of Davidson Street can be attributed to the name of Governor Noah Noble. As the fourth governor of Indiana, he was a major landowner in early Indianapolis and owned much of the land that now encompasses the Near Eastside area near downtown. Dorman Street was named after Gov. Noble's grandson, Dorman Davidson who was born in October 26, 1841, of his mother Catherine Noble Davidson. In November 1865, the Davidson family platted the area bounded by the railroad on the west, St. Clair Street on the north, Oriental Street on the east, and Michigan Street on the south as "Davidson's Heirs' Second Addition" and "P.A. Davidson's Addition", named for Preston A. Davidson.

## **Homeless Activism: From the Campsites to the Library Buildings**

As Spradley (1979: 25) has pointed out, "the success of doing ethnography depends, to a great extent, on understanding the nature of the relationship between ethnographers and informants to produce a cultural description". I realized that building relationships with homeless informants is a complex process; when I first began my fieldwork, I became very frustrated about how to make homeless people willing to talk with me. As time went by, once I was able to make friends with one of the homeless individuals, the snowballing approach began working effectively. It was not easy to engage them in conversation at first because they did not really know who I was, even when I introduced myself and showed my legal identification. Trust is the keyword and one of the first ways to build trust is by approaching somebody who is not homeless but who is close to their "life circle," such as an outreach manager or staff member of one of the agencies, people from churches, and a few Central Library staff members. Some of the homeless people whom I talked to without a referral or endorsement from people they knew were willing to talk to me, but later I realized that they were not telling me the truth; for example when I asked about where they lived, they did not admit to me that they were actually homeless.

In discussing homeless activism, I used the title "leaving the bridges, passing the shelters." The idea behind this title refers to complicated issues faced by homeless people both in the campsites (especially in the case of

the Irish Hill homeless camp), and in the homeless emergency shelters. The main reason homeless people are organizing and engaging in homeless activism may be a form of protest against the ways the homeless emergency shelters are supposedly “helping” the homeless. There are some crucial facts I discovered beyond the “shelters’ dilemma” (as I discussed in the earlier chapter). I categorized two main triggers that have inspired homeless people, especially in the case of Maurice Young, to engage in activism in the form of fighting for passage of an “Indiana Homeless Bill of Rights”. The first one is that they were inspired by other states (Connecticut, Rhode Island, and Illinois) that have already passed the Homeless Bill of Rights. Maurice learned information about these bills mostly from a computer in the IUPUI Library. The second reason was because of the experiences faced by homeless people, including the eviction of the homeless campsites (especially when they have to leave a place they considered “home” such as the Irish Hill bridge), dealing with the emergency shelters, and finding themselves in difficulties because of the limited availability of public spaces due to “anti-homeless rules and policies” in Indianapolis.

Above all, it is important to note that both the Central Library and the IUPUI Library have become favorite spaces for homeless people to use as “alternative day shelters”, not only because they are also forced to leave the real shelters, but also because they found that the library buildings “give” them space they can use to organize their activism.

In this context, I will discuss some examples of homeless people who live neither in shelter nor in campsites, but in the gazebo of Military Park during the night, and who have “privatized” spots on specific floors in the Central Library, as well as establishing their own “office” in the IUPUI Library where they can actualize their own ideas about homeless activism. Military Park is an interesting place because it is located a little distance away from the crowded business traffic in downtown Indianapolis, but still within easy walking distance both to the Central Library and the IUPUI Library. It is a safe and quiet place surrounded by the IUPUI campus buildings, the downtown canal and the Indiana State Government building.

## **Meeting Basic Needs: Comparing the IUPUI Library to the Central Library**

In dealing with the daily basic needs of homeless people, during the six months since the eviction, Maurice has been able to organize some churches and

agencies to come to the IUPUI Campus Library to provide food for homeless people who come there almost every day, including those who usually stay in the Central Library, but who come to the university library only for the food. He uses the IUPUI Campus Library as his “office” to organize everything he plans. Compared to the Central Library, using the campus library provides Maurice with several advantages.

The first is location and time. The IUPUI Library is closer to Military Park where he and others I call “homeless intellectuals” stay during the night than it is to the Central Library. They have to leave Military Park at 6:30 a.m. every day and the IUPUI Campus Library opens at 7:30 a.m. and closes at 9:00 p.m. during the weekdays and 6:00 p.m. during the weekend, but during the school semester the campus is open until midnight. On the other hand, the Central Library has a daily schedule from 10:00 a.m. to 8:00 p.m. on weekdays and Noon to 5:00 p.m. for weekend hours.

The second reason is that the IUPUI Library has fewer rules for visitors. Everybody who has a student ID card, as Maurice does, can use computer and internet facilities for free without restrictions on time of use. The Central Library, on the other hand, applies certain automatic restrictions for the length of computer usage. Maurice and his friends can use computers in the campus library as long as they want to, from its opening until closing time. If they are not students, they can use the computers for a daily charge of \$1.00. Maurice is currently advocating for getting a \$1.00 charge for one week instead of each day because it is still too expensive for the homeless to spend \$30.00 per month for the internet. There is no restriction on taking naps in the campus library, which is one of the most important things for the homeless due to the lack of sleeping time when they are on the street, city parks, campsites, or even in the shelters. Their appearance in the campus library will also not be supervised or monitored by security guards, unlike in the Central Library.

The third advantage is that the IUPUI Campus Library has somewhat better facilities. Many computers are always vacant and they can use them without having to queue up at any time when they come. Almost every homeless person both in the Central Library and campus library has a Facebook account, so computers with internet access have become essential facilities they use daily. The IUPUI Campus Library also has some good-quality couches on every level of the five-story building, two microwaves located on first floor, several vending machines in some strategic spots, a cafeteria on



the lower floor, TV rooms and sofas on the second floor, and more restrooms than in the Central Library. It is also close to the Natatorium with its olympic swimming pool and the IUPUI sports complex which have shower facilities that they can use at any time during the day. When they need more TV Channels to watch, some of the homeless people also go to the Campus Center located just a short distance from the library.

Maurice says that homeless people in the IUPUI Campus Library are easier to manage than those who are in the Central Library because most have jobs, and they do not go to the shelters, do not drink alcohol or use drugs, and they have no criminal backgrounds. Some of them, especially who move back and forth between the Central Library and the campus library, may have some degree of mental illness but they have never caused problems, at least during the last two years since they have been there. In order to keep the library building clean and avoid a crowded situation that can result in a ban from coming to the library, the feeding program is usually held in the lobby corridor of the Kelly School of Business just on the right side of the elevator. This is a kind of an “underground” movement because in the city, people or agencies cannot feed the homeless in public spaces without having a permit from the city and the only agency that has one is the Pour House. Other than this campus library feeding program, Maurice has made a list of food resources where the homeless can go to get their free food, but some of these agencies are quite a distance away.

## **The Indiana Homeless Bill of Rights**

As someone who has acquired some level of legal expertise, something he thought was important for building his relationship with the campus community, Maurice has now developed a relationship with Dr. Mary Provence. This began after the eviction from the Irish Hill camp, when he was invited to give a presentation to a Social Work class taught by Dr. Provence. Since then, this collaboration has allowed Maurice to connect to broader academic networks in the Indiana University system and other academic institutions in Indianapolis. He was also invited by Dr. Shelly Landis who teaches the class on Community Organizations at Indiana University School of Social Work.

Maurice met Dr. Provence for the first time in 2012 at an event coordinated by Rebuilding the Wall (RtW), a non-profit and faith-based community organization initiated by Dr. Provence and her husband Chris. Located at Guilford Avenue, Indianapolis, RtW

was established in 2001 and focuses on providing the opportunity for homeownership through the renovation of vacant inner city properties for low income families in Indianapolis. All of the board members and the core staff members of this organization are community residents who live within a small area northeast of downtown.

As a result of positive responses from the students and the need for understanding the current social issues in Indianapolis, Dr. Provence continued her collaboration with Maurice for another class in Spring 2014, especially because she was interested in knowing what Maurice had done at the Irish Hill homeless camp and about his goals in fighting for the rights of the homeless.

Throughout the spring semester, Maurice has worked with Dr. Provence and her students in the Social Welfare and Practice class to build and organize resources for passing the Indiana Homeless Bill of Rights. Through this effort, Maurice also proposed that the 26th of August (the day of eviction of the Irish Hill) be commemorated as a "Homeless Awareness Day." For Dr. Provence, the idea of collaboration with Maurice cannot be separated from her background as a social activist who used to go to the streets as an outreach worker for homeless people and low-income families. Inspired by a book titled *the Anatomy of Peace* by the Arbinger Institute (2006) that she uses in every class she teaches, she found that social problems are rooted in the way people see other people, regardless of the social and economic status they have in society. For her, this book is very relevant for addressing the issue of homelessness from the perspective of social work.

This book is just astounding and it's useful in any level in social work because it teaches its idea that people are people. But when we have conflict, it is because we are usually viewing the other person as someone who's in our way. They are obstacles, or they are vehicles. Somebody can use them until we get what we want. We are far from way of that relevance and don't even acknowledge their existence. All human complexes come down to that. We also have the service providers that sometimes use them as a vehicle to get a pay check, and that's a problem. For me, social workers whether in micro, meso, or macro level need to fundamentally understand that and make sure that they have a heart of peace and I told my students that from the beginning.

## **Conclusion**

As neoliberalism becomes the order of almost every single pulse of a city's life, public spaces are quickly becoming merely a "piece of pie" in the politics

of privatization (Mitchell 1995). As a result, with few exceptions, homeless voices have been absent from the discourse concerning their presence in public libraries (Valado 2006).

The presence of a large but somewhat invisible number of homeless people in the public library, as well as in the university library, is only one of the unavoidable impacts of neoliberalism that has a long history and correlation with the homeless sheltering industry. Their presence in Indianapolis libraries specifically is a consequence of the eviction of the Irish Hill homeless camp in Indianapolis, but also a reflection of neoliberal downtown development policies, along with the widespread adoption of “anti-homeless” rules and policies. Surprisingly, even though the Indiana

Bill of Rights, Section No. 6 says that there is “No state money for religious institutions: No money shall be drawn from the treasury, for benefit of any religious or theological institutions,” the homeless shelters in Indianapolis are mostly operated by religious institutions, receiving and spending millions of public and private dollars every year, while only a small number of homeless people are housed.

If the main goal of the city, service providers, and any related agencies is moving the homeless out of the streets and out from under the bridges, and if both the “housing first” and the shelter first policies are incapable of housing them, then it remains a challenge for policy makers and other related parties to redesign the agenda of ending homelessness. I would not argue that all of the efforts that have been undertaken to date to address and to solve the problems of homelessness are necessarily wrong, but we can at least ponder the current level of homeless activism as an authentic critique that has emerged from the grassroots to see that there is something wrong with these efforts that needs to be fixed.

I found that for a long period of time, there was a commonly believed consensus manifested in many levels of policies and programs for ending homelessness, which says that homeless people are just passive clients in need of help and support. It is true to say that they need such assistance but my study of homeless activism tells us that they also can be active agents who have ideas, values, and a “culture” that can be used as a new stepping stone to solve the problems of homelessness. The bans or restrictions that prevent homeless people from living under street bridges and in other public spaces, along with the hardships of shelter living, have forced homeless people to be resourceful in

finding alternative forms of housing, like the libraries. This ethnographic study has shown how these spaces have given rise to forms of homeless activism that demonstrate how dynamic the lives of homeless people can be.

Based on my ethnographic investigation, I now understand why one of my informants, a security guard in the Central Library called the homeless people “zombies”. They are smelly and in many cases I developed a coughing spell when I started to talk with them. They can seem delusional, sick, and “strange” because they are constantly living in fear and uncertainty of not knowing where they are going to sleep during the night and what food they are going to eat during the day. They may be sleepy because they slept poorly or did not sleep at all.

They act like zombies because they have been conditioned and treated like zombies in whatever spaces they find to live. For a significant number of homeless people, dealing with mental health issues, substance abuse, and alcohol addiction is a chronic situation that cannot be solved solely by housing programs or criminal justice approaches. They may even face worse situations, like being sent to prison, when their presence on the street, city parks, university buildings, malls, and other public spaces is regarded as undesirable and their voices in the shelter systems and in decision-making about issues of homelessness are inaudible. For most, living on the street is not their choice. Rather, it is an impact of undeniably complex socio-economic and political processes and activities that adapt Herbert Spencer’s concept of “survival-of-the-fittest”, where the rich and the powerful have more privilege to expand their leverage but the poor have few choices to survive and therefore are left to die on the street. Through ethnography of “wait a minute,” all of those issues gave me a new understanding of who they are and why the homeless exist.

Homeless activism as practiced by Maurice, Michael, and Dave, also serves as a satire of as well as a “swat” at the service providers, the agencies, and the government who have authority to manage resources and to reach out to local agencies in pursuing the goal of ending homelessness. The Central Library and the IUPUI Library bear no guilt if they are not following the mission and the struggle to reach out to local agencies. However, the ways the Central Library collaborates with other related organizations to tackle the issue of homelessness and to provide both intended and unintended services to the homeless are crucial to keeping the public library public.

Moreover, the concept of “extending our reach” initiated by the American Library Association can also be used as an alternative to move beyond “business as usual” efforts and existing “pseudo-cooperation” run by a wide array of organizations that purport help homeless people. The fact that both the public library and the university library cannot be eliminated from discussions of homelessness suggests that now is the right time for these institutions to play more important roles by becoming active agents to help contribute to the goal of ending homelessness. For many reasons, libraries are considered as the only safe and reliable spaces where the homeless can organize themselves, to escape from fear and harassment, and to keep what Maurice calls their “self-actualization.” They can be used as a starting point to change the narratives—the perceptions, stereotypes, and predominant discourses—and treatments—including a wide range of social, medical, psychological, economic, cultural, and spiritual approaches—as well as the policies— management, rules, and laws— about homelessness.

What I am sure of and what I have learned about homeless activism, especially in the case of Maurice, is that he is not fighting for his organization, for his groups, for his family, or even for himself. Instead, he is fighting against injustice, rules, structural violence, and the criminalization of homelessness that hinder people from access to their rights. I call his activism to advocate homeless people’s rights using IUPUI Library as his office, as the longest office job in the world. He works from 7:30 a.m. to 11:30 p.m., seven days a week, an extraordinary job than can be done only by an extraordinary person. As Maurice said, he and other homeless people can survive without agencies that claim to have a goal to end homelessness, but those agencies cannot survive without the homeless. Their funding, their beds, their meal services, and the lives of their employees always depend on the number of homeless people they serve. But more importantly, if the churches, the faith-based agencies, and people feel sorry, for the homeless, and always have an initiative intended to help the homeless, then why do they let people stay outside and slowly die on the street? As Maurice said, “Jesus was homeless; can you live in His home while you neglect people who live like Jesus?”

# SPIRIT

Scholarship Program for Strengthening  
Reforming Institutions

IBRD Loan No. 8010-ID

## Bunga Rampai Tesis/Disertasi

Tema:

# Sosial dan Politik

Buku *Bunga Rampai Tesis/Disertasi Program Beasiswa SPIRIT, Tema: Sosial dan Politik, Kelompok: Ilmu Sosial* ini merupakan buku keempat dari sembilan buku yang akan diterbitkan pada tahun 2017, sebagai salah satu upaya mendiseminasikan karya tulis ilmiah yang telah diselesaikan oleh karyasiswa penerima beasiswa SPIRIT. Materi tesis/disertasi dibagi menjadi tiga kelompok, yaitu Ilmu-Ilmu Ekonomi, Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial, dan Ilmu-Ilmu Alam dan Interdisiplin. Dasar pembagiannya adalah disiplin keilmuan (*tree of science*) dan keseimbangan jumlah materi tesis/disertasi yang ada.

Tujuan dari penerbitan serial buku ini, pertama, menyebarluaskan hasil-hasil penelitian tesis/disertasi agar dapat direplikasi atau diadopsi di tempat kerja karyasiswa; kedua, sebagai *benchmark* pemanfaatannya di instansi pemerintah lain; dan ketiga, merupakan bagian dari upaya mendokumentasikan kegiatan SPIRIT, dalam bentuk terbitan ilmiah buku ber-ISBN sehingga dapat disebutkan oleh karyasiswa dalam resume masing-masing. Versi cetak serial buku ini dapat di akses secara *online* [www.pusbindiklatren.bappenas.go.id](http://www.pusbindiklatren.bappenas.go.id)

Serial buku ini diharapkan dapat menggambarkan manfaat dan kontribusi positif Program SPIRIT terhadap peningkatan kapasitas SDM sebagai *participating agencies* baik dari sisi keterampilan teknis, manajerial, dan kepemimpinan aparat pemerintah, dan dalam melaksanakan reformasi birokrasi di instansi masing-masing. Program SPIRIT juga diharapkan dapat berkontribusi bagi pencapaian sasaran prioritas nasional dalam meningkatkan kinerja instansi pemerintah yang ditandai dengan berkurangnya praktik korupsi, kolusi, dan nepotisme, serta meningkatnya kualitas pelayanan publik.



ISBN 978-602-1154-92-2



9 786021 154922